Godly Tales

Short Narratives in Transatlantic Protestant Culture, 1620-1740

Inauguraldissertation

zur Erlangung des Akademischen Grades

eines Dr. phil.,

vorgelegt dem Fachbereich 05 – Philosophie und Philologie

der Johannes Gutenberg-Universität

Mainz

von

Martin Seidl

aus Frankfurt/M

Mainz

2014

Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations

The following abbreviations have been used for frequently cited texts. In the bibliography as well as the quotations from fifteenth- to eighteenth-century texts, the original spelling, italics and capitalizations have been preserved. All Bible quotations are from the King James Version.

TG	Beard, Thomas, and Thomas Taylor. *The Theatre of Gods Judgements: Wherein is represented the admirable Justice of God against all notorious sinners, great and small, specially against the most eminent Persons in the world, whose exorbitant power had broke through the barres of Divine and Humane law.* London: 1648.
TR	Defoe, Daniel. *A True Relation of the Apparition of one Mrs. Veal, The next Day after Her Death to one Mrs. Bargrave At Canterbury*. London, 1706.
ST	Glanvill, Joseph. *Saducismus Triumphatus: Or, Full and Plain Evidence Concerning Witches and Apparitions. In Two Parts. The First Treating of their Possibility, The Second of their Real Existence*. London, 1681.
JL	Janeway, James. *Mr James Janeway's Legacy to His Friends: Containing Twenty Seven Famous Instances of Gods Providences in and about Sea-Dangers and Deliverances; with the Names of Several that were Eye-witnesses to many of them. Whereonto is added a Sermon on the same Subject*. London, 1674.
WP	Johnson, Edward. *Johnson's Wonder-Working Providence, 1628-1651*. Ed. J. Franklin Jameson. New York: Scribner's, 1910.
CC	Mather, Cotton. *Compassions Called for: An Essay of Profitable Reflections on Miserable Spectacles. To which is added, a Faithful Relation of Some Late, but Strange Occurrences that call for an awful and useful Consideration. Especially, the Surprising Distresses and Deliverances, of a Company lately Shipwreck'd on a Desolate Rock, on the Coast of New-England*. Boston, 1711.
HD	Mather, Cotton. *Humiliations follow'd with Deliverances: A brief Discourse on the Matter and Method, Of that Humiliation which would be an Hopeful Symptom of our Deliverance from Calamity. Accompanied and Accommodated with a Narrative, of a Notable Deliverance lately received by some English Captives, from the Hands of Cruel Indians. And some improvement of that narrative. Whereto is added A Narrative of Hannah Swarton, containing a great many wonderful passages, relating to her Captivity and Deliverance*. Boston, 1697.
MC	Mather, Cotton. *Magnalia Christi Americana: Or, the Ecclesiastical History of New-England, from Its First Planting in the Year 1620 unto the Year of our Lord, 1698*. London, 1702.

MP Mather, Cotton. *Memorable Providences Relating to Witchcrafts and Possessions: A Faithful Account of many Wonderful and Surprising Things, that have befallen several Bewitched and Possessed Persons in New-England* …. Boston, 1689.

TD Mather, Cotton. *Terribilia Dei: Remarkable Judgements of God, on several sorts of Offenders, in several Scores of Instances; among the People of New-England. Observed, Collected, Related, and Improved; in Two Sermons, at Boston-lecture in the Month of July 1697*. Boston, 1697.

TP Mather, Cotton. *The Threefold Paradise of Cotton Mather: An Edition of "Triparadisus."* 1727. Ed. Reiner Smolinski. Athens: U of Georgia P, 1995.

IW Mather, Cotton. *The Wonders of the Invisible World: Observations as well Historical as Theological, upon the Nature, the Number, and the Operations of the Devils. Accompany'd with, Some Accounts of the Grievous Molestations, by Daemons and Witchcrafts, which have lately Anoy'd the Countrey, and the Trials of some eminent Malefactors Executed upon occasion thereof: with several Remarkable Curiosities therein occurring* …. Boston, 1693.

IP Mather, Increase. *An Essay for the Recording of Illustrious Providences, Wherein an Account is given of many Remarkable and very Memorable Events, which have happened in this last Age; Especially in New-England.* Boston, 1684.

WD Mather, Increase. *Wo to Drunkards. Two Sermons Testifying against the Sin of Drunkenness: Wherein the Wofulness of that Evil, and the Misery of all that are addicted to it, is discovered from the Word of God*. Cambridge, 1673.

J Winthrop, John. *The Journal of John Winthrop, 1630-1649*. Ed. Richard S. Dunn, James Savage, and Laetitia Yeandle. Cambridge: Belknap, 1996.

Introduction

This study surveys the intersection of transatlantic Protestant culture and the formal development of short narratives in the seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries in British North America. Firstly, I argue that – contrary to the critical consensus – the short narration of this period was neither 'formless' nor 'didactic,' but develops complex narrative strategies to accommodate increasingly competing theological and scientific world-views. Secondly, this formal development was not linear or initiated by specific authors, but shaped by a "network of intentions" that spans across the Atlantic (Hall 2008, 4). My study builds on previous scholarship on the materials aspects and processes of publication in the transatlantic world. It shows how competing intentions, for example, theological arguments, entertainment or the empirical recording of the supernatural, can be traced through the exchange and adaptation of narrative patterns that are mostly contained in larger textual bodies or collections. Using a wide range of British and colonial sources, like Thomas Beard's *Theatre of Gods Judgement* (1597), Cotton Mather's *Magnalia Christi Americana* (1702), as well as a variety of sermons, diaries, broadsides and other cheap prints, this study demonstrates that short narratives move freely through different types of publications, both religious and secular, and across the Atlantic (cf. Hall 1989, Walsham 2003).

Short narration becomes integral to a variety of publications and genres because it allows to combine argumentation and theology with individual experience in a condensed and entertaining manner. Even when quoted in or adapted to Protestant prints, narratives rarely refer to God or include overt moral commentary. Instead, they use a succinct and entertaining style that does not shy away from sensational details nor ironic puns. In contrast to traditional didactic genres such as the parable or the fable, short narratives in transatlantic Protestant texts heavily rely on individual experiences, culled from letters, local news, hearsay, as well as first-hand observation, or witnesses whose credibility is attested to by the writers. On the one hand, these narratives evoke emotions that can be used for both religious and entertainment purposes. On the other hand, they approximate the empirical methods of observation and recording of experience developed by natural philosophers and the Royal Society. As a result, a complex narrative structure evolves that is evident in Protestant texts and accommodates different influences ranging from providential theology to the advent of

empirical science.

While Puritan New England has enjoyed a sustained critical interest in Early American Studies, "the history of early American short fiction remains to be written," as Robert Marler observes (435). So far, Protestant texts have been examined in terms of their content and what they disclose about communal or individual practices of piety, historical events or theological disputes. However, a large part of these texts consists of narrative passages that have so far been studied separately by folklorists, historians, and literary scholars and have mostly been called providence tales.[1] The term has been applied to relations of God's interaction with humans as well as popular narratives of marvelous and uncanny events. Such narratives not only proliferated in a transatlantic market of cheap prints and collections, but also in sermons and edifying literature.[2] While David D. Hall and Alexandra Walsham distinguish several sub-genres according to their content, for example, judgment and wonder stories, these definitions do not explain how and why these narratives were incorporated into sermons and secular entertainment literature. Thus far, these narratives have been examined exclusively according to their generic affiliation or religious content, yet few scholars have considered how form and content interact, both on the level of the narrative but also on the level of the embedding text. Why do so many texts include narratives? What are their sources and influences? Lastly, how can we study these narratives within the context of their production and publication without projecting back our contemporary notions of literary quality?

To answer these questions, my approach complements the existing scholarship on Protestant writing by applying narratological terms to the subject. By using both spatial and temporal comparisons it offers an alternative to linear and national trajectories of literary and religious history. Furthermore, I situate this examination in new considerations about

---

1 See, for example, the studies by Richard Dorson (1950, 1967, 1973), David D. Hall (1989, 1995), Alexandra Walsham (2003), Alfred Weber (1985, 1987), James Hartman (1995, 1999), Dorothy Baker (1994, 2007) and James Egan (2012). As a generic term, the providence tale has been applied retrospectively and covers a variety of literary forms, contents, and contexts of publications. The term usually demarks individual or communal experiences of divine interventions as well as popular narratives of marvelous and uncanny events, which have been called 'providences' in contemporary records; for example, Increase Mather's *Essay for the Recording of Illustrious Providences* (1648; cf. Hartman 1999, 21; Weber 1978, x). In a sermon or a collection, however, a providence tale can acquire the same function as an exemplum, namely to illustrate a theological point (see chapter one).

2 Religious and book historians like David D. Hall and Alexandra Walsham have shown how stories of strange and supernatural events have been collected, produced and read on both sides of the Atlantic (cf. 1989; 2003). Walsham identifies specific motifs and formulae of providential literature, such as the divine judgment of sinners that were common to both, religious and secular prints. Mostly titled 'relation,' Walsham further shows how these prose narratives drew on conventions from the medieval *de casibus* tragedies and homiletic exempla and Hall dubs them "wonder stories" to connect them with a transatlantic interest in miraculous and strange events (cf. Hall 1989, 88, 112-114; Walsham 73, 80, 104).

the transatlantic circulation of texts, ideas, and even narrative structures that define the period. In doing so, I want to achieve a grounded interpretation of the way narrative and form interact in various contemporary media. Therefore, this study begins by relating the content and structure of the short narratives to the text that contains it as well as to the conditions of its publication and dissemination. Secondly, it follows a contextual approach by showing how formal patterns relate to cultural changes and react to communal, theological, and scientific developments that not only become an impulse for storytelling but also for shaping a story in a certain way. As the following example will show, I argue that narratives contain specific structures, such as cause and effect relationships, appeals to emotions and manipulations of narrative time, that strengthen the community of believers, defend it against skepticism from within and political attacks from without and turn recent or historical events, folklore and individual experience into godly tales. The pervasive use of short narratives and the development of new formal patterns thus rises from the need to make sense of individual and communal experiences as well as to incorporate new scientific theories and discoveries into existing narrative accounts of communal life.

The following narrative from Cotton Mather's sermon *Terribilia Dei* (1697) provides an example of the way religious texts structure and employ short narratives:

> A man, in our *Narragansett*-Country having set his Dog to mischief his Neighbours Cattle deny'd the Fact, with Imprecations … [and] used the Name of the Great God in his Imprecations, *That God would never let him stir out of that place, if he did the Thing*. The words were scarce out of his mouth, but he sunk down Dead in the place and never stirred any more. (*TD* 35)

As part of a list of similar cases, this narrative relates how a sinner invokes the name of God and dies immediately in a manner that resembles his infraction. On the level of plot, the close temporal succession and congruity between the curse and his death that fulfills it results in a causality between invoking the name of God and the man's death. This structure is outlined at the beginning of the sermon in which Mather expresses the doctrine of divine judgments as a plot pattern that can be recognized (cf. *TD* 16). Validated by a number of similar cases, this plot becomes an exemplary warning against sin and induces the fear of God in the audience, which Mather calls the basis of religion (cf. *TD* 6-9). However, this narrative structure can also be directed against religious dissenters as well as enemies of the colony, as John Winthrop's journal demonstrates (see chapter one).

While the narratives in *Terribilia Dei* resemble those from earlier collections like Thomas Beard's *Theatre of Gods Judgements* (1597), Mather integrates their plot pattern into his formulation of the doctrine of providential interventions. By establishing a causal

relationship between sin and punishment through narrative means, Mather allows his audience to recognize and experience divine interventions in local as well as historical events which in turn should evoke fear of God that leads to a pious lifestyle. By relating the providential theology to narrative devices, this study shows how narratives become crucial to impart doctrines and enact the direct relationship between humans and God. My argument is that narratives become exemplary not through their content but through plot patterns that establish causal connections and allow to reconstruct and experience divine interventions and are thereby able to build and delimit a community of faith.

In New England sermons, collections and journals, narratives become objects of meditation and devotional practices as well as devices to comprehend and record the colonial experience. Scholars agree that reading and writing are crucial to the practice of Protestant piety. Evolving in the context of a vibrant market for devotional and other religious prints, early modern Protestantism has even been described as a "transnational set of ambitions, movements, conversations and technologies" rather than a set of creeds or a national ideology (Traister 608; cf. Hambrick-Stowe 187-188). Meredith Neuman's (2013) recent study has shown how New England sermonsare shaped by the oral interaction between ministers and churchgoers and yet also contain poetry and narration. Further, Mathew Brown's (2007, 2010) investigations of Protestant book culture and Andrew Cambers's (2011) study of reading in English Puritanism have described the many ways in which believers interact with books and read them as part of private as well as communal devotional routines. Among other critics, Hall maintains that the direct relationship to God in Protestantism encourages believers to record their experiences and circulate them; thereby debunking the myth that class hierarchies are demarked by fault lines of literacy and literary production (cf. 2008, 10). Together, these studies demonstrate that William Haller's claim that Protestant preaching has exerted an "incalculable influence on the development of popular literary taste and expression" (21) remains relevant and that religious texts provide a basis for studying the various forms and applications of narratives in early modern writing.[3]

In regard to Protestant texts, this study will show, firstly, that short narratives become godly tales as they endow theological arguments, for example, about God's interventions in human affairs, with a narrative structure. Secondly, I propose that these structures become

[3] For the influence of religious literature on the development the novel, see Michael McKeon (1989), Hartman (1999), and Dawn Coleman (2013).

increasingly complex as the narratives are also shaped by the different ways of publication and transmission as well as the writers' reaction to theological, scientific, and political developments. Thirdly, I argue, as narrative and productive structures travel and adapt to different purposes of writing. For example, the cause and effect relationship of a judgment narrative that is established by a sermon can then be applied to local news as well as the experience of believers. It becomes a structure of thought that is in turn evident in the narrative structure of a diary entry. By marking the socially unacceptable behavior, cause and effect relationships of sin and punishment creates a community out of those who hear or read the sermon and apply this pattern to their moral experiences and behavior.

By focusing on religious texts and their use of narrative structures, *Godly Tales* demonstrates that Protestants actively shape the form and functions of seventeenth century short narratives. For the purpose of this study, a religious text constitutes any form of writing that relates to theological concepts and encompasses print as well as scribal publications. All of the surveyed texts have been discussed as products of a Protestant culture; examples include the sermons of Increase and Cotton Mather as well as John Winthrop's journal that demonstrate God's involvement in colonial affairs. Using the term short narrative should avoid the fallacy of projecting backwards modern expectations about storytelling and art for art's sake. In particular the latter sensibilities, formulated by Edgar Allan Poe, have so far contributed to a critical neglect of early short narratives as quaint and formalistic storytelling. However, these short narratives do not represent the origin of American literature or of the modern Short Story but rather hint at the cultural forces, historical models and transatlantic exchanges that have shaped their form. Accordingly, this study traces the religious influence on literary culture through the exchange of narratives, and more specifically plot patterns, as well as through other formal devices that occur in personal, secular, and religious texts. Focusing on a selection of representative English and American texts that contain narratives, this study traces the ways in which narrative devices in sermons, journals, histories, and collections adapt to their respective context of publication and how they are related to the practices of Protestant culture.

By the late eighteenth century, magazines became the place for exchanging, copying and adapting short narratives that carried a variety of genre descriptions, among them 'essay,' 'sketch' and 'tale.' While some scholars argue that the terms have been used interchangeably, others locate each genre on a scale that ranges from descriptive, as in the sketch, to a dominance of narrative passages, as in the tale (cf. Ahrends 3; Link 345). The tale originally refers to oral storytelling, it has come to denote a "literary composition cast

in narrative form" with the intention to "interest or amuse" from the thirteenth century onwards and as a modern critical term ("tale"). According to the *Oxford English Dictionary*, the tale also acquired a more derogatory meaning as "a fiction, or falsehood" in that was still common in the seventeenth century. As a result, early modern Protestant prints use 'relation' or 'story' for narrative passages and Cotton Mather associates the 'tale' with gossip and idle storytelling (cf. 1693, 7). While Mather denounces oral storytelling for the purpose of entertainment and exchanging local information, his publications take many stories of local or sensational events for the purpose of religious edification and theological argument. 'Tale' features in the title of this study as it alludes to the various processes involved in creating the short narration that is examined here, like the use of plot patterns and embedding to transfer hearsay into an instructive example of divine intervention.

Ranging from personal letters and diaries to various types of print publications, the scope of this study already indicates the problem of defining what a short narrative is and what distinguishes it from longer narratives. Incidentally, this continuous to be an issue for short-fiction scholarship to this day (cf., for example, Beevers 20). Instead of focusing on its length, this study regards the contextual quality of the short narrative as central to its function and form. Short narratives, for the purpose of this study, are thus narratives that are not published individually but as parts of books, collections, tracts, and sermons. Central characteristics of the short narrative are that they usually revolve around a limited set of actions and figures with clearly marked textual boundaries. Those boundaries are provided by introductory sentences and messages derived from the narrative as well as the death of the character and conclusion of the action surrounding her or him. Sometimes they comprise only a few printed lines, sometimes they are an episode isolated from a larger narrative, like the history of New England or a particular incident in the course of a person's life. To investigate their historical use, this study relies on the contemporary notions of what constitutes a narrative. Another indicator is that a self-contained narrative unit can be isolated and republished in a different text. To trace shifts in form and function over time, this study compares different versions and uses of narratives in British and North American printed texts, published between 1620 and 1740, a period of massive political and religious turmoil, especially in the Massachusetts Bay colony.

Hall and Walsham rightly point out that religious and secular providential prints intermingle from the mid-sixteenth century onwards, fueled by growing reading publics and their interest in strange and supernatural stories for instruction and entertainment. This demand was answered by sermons and providence collections as well as a variety of

anonymous chapbooks, broadside ballads, and other cheap prints on both sides of the Atlantic. All of these culled their narratives from historical works, court records, folklore, and gossip; so that religious and hack writers used essentially the same sources and even copied one another (cf. Walsham 26). Thereby, providence tales draw on the same stock of local stories and legends that medieval friars have used to illustrate their sermons (cf. Schlauch 1966, 399-400). As a result, godly tales differ from popular ones not through their content but in the way they function within a religious text. While Hall and Hartman maintain the continuous use of exempla in New England sermons, both do not distinguish between long and short narrative forms and define providence or wonder tales very broadly as a story of God's intervention in human affairs (cf. Hall 1995, 29; Hartman 1999, 1). Instead of outlining thematic connections, my study shows how narratives illustrate Protestant dogma through their narrative structure and their relation to the embedding text.

Apart from this relationship of doctrine and narrative structure, providence tales have also been connected to the rise of empiricism and the challenges of skeptics and materialists. James Hartman regards detailed accounts by credible witnesses as a prime marker of all providence tales and extends the scope of the genre to captivity and apparition accounts (cf. 1999, xi, 4). Similarly, scholars like Reiner Smolinski and, most recently, Sarah Rivett (2011), have asked for a reassessment of the relationship between Protestantism and the new science. On the one hand, Protestant theologians like Cotton Mather have supported investigations into the laws and purposes of nature as they add to God's glory and scientists like Isaac Newton have regarded the Bible as God's word and devised explanations for its miracles (cf. Smolinski 2010, 78-88). On the other hand, skeptics like Baruch Spinoza have challenge the authority of the Bible and proposed to separate science and religion. To accommodate scientific advances and counter skeptic and materialist attacks, Hartman argues, Cotton Mather incorporates the requirements of empirical data collection into his reports of providential interventions, apparitions, and witchcraft (cf. 1999, 5-7). The use of empirical methods not only serves as proof for the existence of the spiritual world, and hence God, but also shows that Protestants were searching for ways to investigate the workings of the soul, the devil, and other invisible agents on a rational basis that distinguished them from spiritists (cf. Rivett 6; Winship 1994, 93-105). Instead of being mutually exclusive, ministers like Joseph Glanvill and Cotton Mather regarded scripture and science as complementing each other in the investigation of the nature of God and the invisible world (cf. Mather 1721,

iv).[4] However, the demands of empirically recording sense impression are at odds with the overarching patterns of biblical doctrines and their representation in narrative structure. Rather than a thematic continuity, my study inquires how narrative devices change and adapt to these different purposes.

While previous scholars of providence tales suggest a continuity of themes and forms from medieval to early modern times, this study outlines three distinct formal phases in which providential plot patterns are established, challenged, and dissolved in the seventeenth-century Protestant texts. Rather than a stable generic category, *Godly Tales* shows how the form of providential short narratives develops through the interaction of transatlantic writings, theological concepts, and scientific innovations. In this religious space, oral stories become part of manuscript and print culture through letters, sermons, and collections in which they acquire the plot patterns of divine punishments or preservations. As Cotton Mather's example demonstrates, narratives can construct a causality that relates to the doctrine of the embedding sermon and that can subsequently be applied to the audience's own experience. While divine judgments link a specific sin with a corresponding punishment, merciful deliverances are either related to the believers' prayer or their piety and good deeds in general. Additional narrative means are necessary to establish this plot pattern when the actual events bear out a different cause for the positive outcome. Cotton Mather's treatment of Hannah Dustan's captivity and flight, for example, adds a layer of narrative commentary and biblical allusions in which her killing of a Native American family becomes part of a divine plan rather than the brutal act of an individual. Lastly, accounts of strange and supernatural phenomena rely on the perception of witnesses whose detailed reports relate events without being able to establish causal connections or relate them to a divine plan.

As Hall and Richard Dorson point out, the testimonies of the witchcraft trials or reports of ghost appearances often take up plots and motif from folklore that serve as explanations where biblical or providential models fail (cf. 1989, 76-87; 1967, 30-35). Instead of unambiguous plots, their emphasis on individual perception translates into the use of first person narrators who investigate events and the credibility of other witnesses on behalf of their readers. Changing attitudes towards the belief in providence, like a waning

[4] While Mather often emphasizes the harmony of science and religion, Smolinski argues that faced with the difficulty of upholding the accuracy of biblical descriptions that defy explanation, he leans towards "separating the letter of the Word from its spirit" (2010, 111). For Cotton Mather's scientific interests and his engagement with Enlightenment ideas, see Beall and Shryock, Smolinski (2007; 2010, 77-112), Solberg (2010), Winship (1994), Wise (2010).

of piety in New England and an increase in skepticism, become manifest in the use of narrative devices and allow to show more precisely how short narratives interact with early modern culture.

Tracing the movement and appropriation of narrative form across the Atlantic, this study also provides empirical support for the current redefinition of American literature as a network of cultural exchanges across temporal and geographical boundaries. Until the 1980s, many scholars exclusively focused on New England literature and elongated its influence on subsequent centuries (cf. Gura 2000, 599-600). Since then, transatlantic, hemispheric and transnational approaches have replaced a literary history tied to the nation and acknowledged that, as a "literary and cultural entity (as opposed to a historical or geographical one), New England too has been shaped by various linguistic and cultural, hemispheric as well as transatlantic, influences." (Schweitzer 579, cf. 580). Similarly, scholars regard New England Puritanism no longer as a uniform religious group that vanished with the Enlightenment but rather as a set of beliefs and practices that take part in the transatlantic development of Protestantism. In his own writings, Cotton Mather addressed Protestants worldwide and was an active promoter of ecumenism (cf. Stievermann 2010, 25-9). Through the various intermediaries in the process of recording, editing, and printing, a communal authorship developed that Hall calls a "network of intentions" (2008, 10-3; cf. Scheiding 2010, 132-33).

As transnational and comparative approaches provide a new frame of reference for the study of colonial America, they seek to establish methods and criteria that visualize cultural exchanges and networks of textual production. As Susan Gillman and Kirsten Gruesz note, binary comparisons potentially still take the U.S. as a center for comparison. Instead, they argue for an approach that "moves its center of analysis" and regards the materiality of texts as they pass through time and space through translations, editions, and adaptations (28-9). Because of this multi-national exchange of people, goods and ideas, Paul Giles compares the colonial period to the globalized world order of today and Michelle Burnham regards it as a world-system in which Protestants participate spiritually as well as materially (cf. Giles 21; Burnham 2007, 11) Among the transnational studies of American literature along these lines, however, most have focused on novels from the nineteenth century onwards, rather than the highly popular short narratives of previous centuries.[5] According to the dominant

[5] Though not a contemporary term, I use short narrative to indicate my focus on stories that are embedded in texts rather than published individually and do not carry any generic marker in the seventeenth century.

critical opinion, the short story originates in the nineteenth-century, and previous narrative forms are often discounted as inconsequential for its development because of their formless simplicity, didacticism and lack of literary merit (cf. Pattee 1; Voss 3; Scheiding and Seidl 2011, 75-76; Weber 1987, ix).[6] As a result, seventeenth- and eighteenth-century narratives remain absent from histories of American literature and the short story. By regarding Protestant culture as a network of texts, this study emphasizes the historical context of forms that have often been obscured by the search for 'origins' of literary genres or notions of art and literature that developed two centuries later.

A Narratological Approach to Seventeen-Century Short Narration

In the wake of transnational and transatlantic reappraisals of seventeen-century text-making, formal approaches allow describing seventeenth-century texts on their own terms and independent of normative definitions or critical projections (cf. Cahill 612-3; White and Drexler 488). To avoid paradigms like the search for an origin or a national identity that have informed previous studies of Puritanism, this study situates New England texts and the development of narrative patterns and plots within the transatlantic literary exchanges among Protestants and draws on contemporary descriptions of their form and function. Fredric Jameson argues that an analysis of narrative form can reveal the social processes and ideological inscriptions that frame the production of each text (cf. 2009, 84). Much like the new formalist approach to poetry, this study argues that "surface *is* depth, and all formal choices are potentially part of the argument" of narratives (Duplessis 66). Accordingly, by analyzing both the form of seventeenth-century narratives and their uses and functions in Protestant culture, this study participates in the expansion and diversification of narratology from a text-oriented to a contextual and intermedial approach (cf. Nünning 2004).[7] It combines a diachronic analysis of plot patterns with the history of their publication, adaptation, and movement. For that purpose, I analyze the ways in which narratives are integrated within a text and how they are mediated through the use of narrative voice and

---

[6] While some thematic or generic relations to the short story of the nineteenth century have been stated, most critics regard the short story as originating in the nineteenth century with roots in legend, myth and oral folklore rather than seventeenth- and eighteenth-century print culture (cf. Baker 5). For theories and histories of the short story, see Brosch (2007), Lohafer and Carey (eds. 1989), March-Russell (2009), May (1995; ed. 1997), Reid (1977); for the American short story, see Basseler (2011), Bendixen and Nagel (eds. 2010), and Scofield (2006).

[7] See for example the survey of narratological approaches, especially those that combine contextual with textual analysis in Marie-Laure Ryan (ed. 2004), Jan Alber and Monika Fludernik (eds. 2010), and Vera Nünning (ed. 2013).

focalization. While these critical terms have been developed in the twentieth century, they allow to describe the structure of historical narratives as well and are complemented by contemporary descriptions of plot types and the intentions of narratives, for example from the sermons of Increase and Cotton Mather.

While narrative categories like plot, time, and narrative voice allow describing narratives from different cultural backgrounds and periods, the choice of specific devices and their function are always related to a specific historical and cultural context. Establishing plot patterns, for example, implies an interpretation of events and shows that narrative means are not neutral conveyors of a story. In the narrative from Cotton Mather's *Terribilia Dei,* the causal relationship between sin and punishment grows out of the Protestant belief in God's direct intervention and communication of his will. It is likewise related to the Calvinist emphasis on leading a holy life that separates believers from the depravities of the world. These correlations between narrative form and theology provide the basis for my study of New England religious texts and a concretization of cultural approaches to narrative. "In alliance with a cultural view," Gabriele Helms argues, narratology "enables us to identify and understand cultural experiences translated into, and meanings produced by particular formal narrative practices" (14). The terminology of structural narratology, which distinguishes, for example, between different narrative tempi, can be used as tools for describing plot patterns in seventeen-century short narratives and as an empirical basis for analyzing their relationship to changing attitudes and beliefs among Protestants on both sides of the Atlantic (cf. Nünning 2004, 356).

To study these interrelations, Nünning proposes to combine the tools of structural narratology with the study of culture and argues that both approaches have increasingly overlapped in recent decades. For example, cultural studies have adopted narrative models and terminology to describe the construction of social reality and Nünning complements this "narrative turn" in cultural studies on the one hand with a "cultural turn" in narratology (cf. Nünning 2004, 354). As the two perspectives converge, Astrid Erll argues, "the literary text is not to be conceived as outside, above, or below, but rather as an integral part of its cultural context" (Erll 91). How a text interacts with the surrounding culture, in this study the religious community of Protestants with its shared beliefs and conventions of writing and publication, requires a specific angle of analysis that is here provided by the doctrine of providence and the specific narrative devices of plot, framing and mediation related to it. Rather than a specific method, cultural narratology has served as an umbrella term for a variety of studies that have matched narrative form with a cultural perspective, but often

also a political one (cf. Nünning 2000, 360). Feminist and Marxist approaches claim, for example, that narrative forms reproduce power relations or 'mirror' the workings of ideology (cf. Lanser 1986; Jameson 2009). In a similar vein, chapter one shows how narrative devices establish a providential worldview but also register challenges and how writers adapt to them in chapters two and three. For example, if events that do not fit a providential plot pattern, they have to be explained or commented on by the narrator. Likewise, the influence of the new natural sciences becomes visible in the application of empirical methods of observation and collection of data in the narratives.

If transatlantic Protestantism can be described as a set of beliefs, technologies, and practices, as Bryce Traister proposes, the interaction of all three can be seen in the various ways in which narratives are exchanged, adapted and used in different methods of publication (cf. 608). Hall proposes a de-centralized concept of authorship as the basic premise for the study of New England literature: multiple intentions and authorships create a 'network' rather than a work (cf. Hall 2008, 4; cf. Gillman and Gruesz 230). This network becomes evident in the way texts are published as well as in the transmission and adaptation of narratives before they become part of a published work. Protestants participated in a vibrant transatlantic print market, as devotional texts became steady sellers throughout the seventeenth century, and Cotton Mather alone produces more than 450 books and pamphlets. Typical of seventeenth- century prints, Mather often combined material from previous publications and drew on a wide network of correspondents that furnished him with information about local events. In addition, printers and publishers changed manuscripts as they saw fit, shortened and repackaged them in cheaper editions to gain profit out of them and accommodate market demands. Even larger is the number of texts that circulated as copies or in manuscript publication, among them John Winthrop's journal that was published in 1790 after having been shared—and potentially altered—for 140 years. However, most of the exemplary narratives of local events in sermons or collections "were originally told by individuals not usually recognized as authors—ordinary people ... relying on others to record and publish their narratives" (cf. Sievers 2006, 748). Once they entered Protestant print culture, they were freely copied, quoted and adapted to different goals and types of publication. As a consequence, tracing religious influences through a narrative analysis does not mean reconstruction of the 'original' intention of the author, but rather how Protestants interact, shape and transmit individual narrative devices and stories.

Like cultural narratology, the concept of emplotment originates out of an interdisciplinary approach that sees storytelling as a universal human activity and a method

to order and represent human experience. According to Paul Ricoeur, "[a plot] draws a meaningful story from a diversity of events or incidents ... it transforms the events or incidents into a story," while Hayden White suggests that, by way of emplotment, "a story is gradually revealed to be a story of a particular kind" (1984, 65; 1975, 7). According to Ricoeur and White, emplotment results in creating a 'whole' out of disparate elements, a cognitive and temporal unit that provides an explanation of how and why things happened (cf. Ricoeur 1984, 67). Emplotment and its contextual dimension are especially useful for analyzing seventeenth-century short narrative since most of them do not offer much description or characterization, but concentrate on a sequence of events, like the example from *Terribilia Dei*. At the same time, their plots express causal relationships that correspond to Calvinist beliefs as well as God's universal history. By linking God's interventions in individual lives and the community at large, "Puritan historiography […] tried to establish an attitude of reverence and to secure the achievements […] of the founding generation" (Engler and Scheiding 1998, 16-7). McKeon likewise refers to the formal influence of "overarching patterns" of salvation history for example, that offer a plot pattern for genres like the spiritual biography (cf. 90). Providential plots not only relate to patterns found in the Bible and history but also to divine history and the place of the individual and the Protestant community in it, which explains why they were so relevant for recording individual as well as communal experience in histories like the *Magnalia* and the autobiography by John Dane and Winthrop's journal.

By ordering events, an emplotment also implies a logic in their succession which is either motivated by causal links between events or a teleology, a final goal towards which they all contribute. Fludernik argues that "[e]mplotment [...] brackets the intentionality […] of apparently sequential actions on the teleological structure of narration" (Fludernik 1996, 321). As such, providence tales also participate in the rationalization of the doctrine of Providence (cf. McKeon 124). Emplotting a sequence of events as an act of God and mirroring his universal plan, narratives make this Godly agency accessible to human rationality by constructing causal relationships or using everyday circumstances and people as their subjects. Yet to understand why certain events happen and the logic of their sequence, the readers sometimes have to know the ending of the story, or regard it from the perspective of a larger pattern, like a divine plan, or simply as accidental. While the judgment plot in Mather's sermon is an example of causal motivation, narrative episodes in histories like Edward Johnson's *A History of New England* relate to New England's place in God's providential history and therefore a larger pattern beyond the scope of individual narratives.

Plots are also difficult to localize on the narrative surface, as they reside on a deeper level of the narrative structure and are not tied to a single formal device or linguistic marker. Instead, they emerge from a combination of them and can also be established retrospectively through a narrative commentary as in Cotton Mather's rendering of Hannah Dustan's flight as a divine deliverance. For the purpose of this study, emplotment is defined as the ordering of events into an intelligible pattern that can be recognized by the audience. To describe the ways events are linked in seventeenth-century narrative, this study first analyzes the temporal and causal structure of events as well as indications on the level of content or the embedding text that, for example, establish a causal relation between events or a specific interpretation of the story.

In order to form a plot, various narrative devices have to align, for example, the representation of time and how a sequence of events is established to which the narrative voice also contributes. Consequently, the second is the way a narrative is mediated by the narrator and the use of focalization. This distinction of the instance that tells and the one that sees goes back to Gérard Genette whose outline of narrative situations furnishes the basis for my description (cf. 188-94, chap. 5). While narratives like the exemplary judgment from *Terribilia Dei* are straightforward third-person accounts, shifts in narrative voice and focalization occur as providential plots become the subject of argument and the narrative structure, in turn, more complex. When relating providential deliverances, for example, the voice of a first-person narrator intersects with editions and emendations by other narrative instances. The theological discourses included in Hannah Swarton's captivity account have been ascribed to Cotton Mather who also narrates and comments on the story of Hannah Dustan. In order to show how providential plots are challenged or upheld, and with them the shared belief in God's direct interventions, narrative voice and focalization are crucial to identifying interventions that are at odds with the emphasis on individual perception in first-person accounts.

While seventeenth-century narratives freely cross linguistic and geographical boundaries, they are mostly published as part of larger texts and collections. Without claiming to be exhaustive, this study analyzes narratives embedded in sermons from English and New English ministers, diaries, collections from Thomas Beard's *Theatre* and Increase Mather's *Essay for the Recording of Illustrious Providences* (1684) to Joseph Glanvill's *Saducismus Triumphatus* (1681), as well as historical accounts like Johnson's *Wonder-Working Providence* (1628-1651) and the *Magnalia* (1702). In order to distinguish narrative from other types of discourse, this study regards short narratives as self-contained series of

events that revolves around a particular group of characters.[8] They have been recognized by contemporary readers and writers as independent units as the frequent reprinting or quoting of stories in other contexts indicates. Mostly, narratives reoccur in different contexts while their boundaries are clearly marked and recognized by contemporary audiences. Likewise, the embedding text often indicates how a narrative should be understood or which functions it assumes in specific contexts of, for example, a sermon or a historical account. To account for these different types and purposes of publication, my study traces the movement of selected narratives, for example, between diaries, sermons, and collections. Since their earliest recording, stories have often appeared as part of cycles or collections whose frame reduplicates the oral situation of storytelling. However, the questions why embedding is "persistent in so many traditions and times, starting with ancient epics to modern times" and how it "relates to the overall plot" are out of grasp of the formal structures analyzed by narratologists that mostly refer to narratives embedded in other narrative frames but not the arguments of sermons or the loose sequence of a diary (Herman 2006, 347).

A study of embedding also brings to light the literary practices and distributed authorship in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. To account for the various intermediaries involved in the process of transmitting, editing and printing narratives, I will analyze the publication history as well as well as the way narratives are embedded in and commented on by a text. Through emplotment and embedding, these narratives acquire specific functions that are often indicated in the surrounding frame, as in the example of *Terriblia Dei*. I concentrate on the way the subject of a narrative is explained or taken up in the framing argument. Going beyond the surface level of narration, this focus of analysis includes paratextual elements as well, for example, the quotation marks that indicate a literal quotation of the source in many seventeen-century texts, or the asterisks and marginalia used by Increase Mather for quoting or referring to narratives. They become material markers of the diverse reading of Protestants as well as the ways they draw on and functionalize narratives for a variety of purposes and publication types, such as sermons, pamphlets, treatises, and histories.

As many of these intentions are directed at specific audiences, either the Protestant

---

[8] Since "narrative is a concept broader than genre," as Marie Laure Ryan (2004, 6) remarks, this plot-driven definition of short narratives serves as an umbrella term and mainly distinguishes short narratives from individual publications. The plot driven and structural definition allows to identify narratives on the textual surface that have also been recognized as such units by contemporaries, for example by calling them a "story" or "relation" and republishing them in other texts. For the distinction between narrative and other types of discourse, see Herman (2006, 86-100) and Ryan (2004, 2-8).

community or specific groups in New England, I approach narrative as an interaction between text and reader. Post-structural narratologists have placed the reader's experience at the center of their definition of narrative (cf. Ryan 2010, 590; Fludernik 1996, 22). Rather than by its plot, Fludernik argues, the audience recognizes a narrative through the portrayal of human experience (1996, 18-19). This reconstruction of the narrative and its structure is also the basis for the various effects assigned to narratives in seventeen-century texts. Whether illustrations of doctrine, exemplary warnings or models for imitation, narratives acquire a pragmatic dimension that extends beyond the text and into the lives of its audience. As part of sermons and mirroring the structure of Protestant doctrine, the exemplary plot patterns divine judgment and deliverance acquire are meant to influence the lives of their readers. If readers, for example, adhere to the same pattern by praying if they face a danger, but also by producing similar narratives, they transpose this plot pattern from the textual to the pragmatic level by putting it into action with the ultimate goal to glorify God. At the same time, the ways in which events are recorded and interpreted as divine acts influence the recording of experience, for example in diaries or histories that this survey studies. As complementary text types to the religious writings that outline providential plot patterns and their functions, they show how individuals react and re-construct the pervasive narrative structures of the time. Together, emplotment, narrative mediation, and embedding allow to analyze the form as well as the religious function of a narrative and to regard them as part of an interaction between text and audience as well as between Protestant writers from both sides of the Atlantic.

The Subjects and Formal Development of Protestant Narrative

The comparison of different stages in the formal development of transatlantic Protestant texts, ranging from patterns of medieval exempla to empirical description, shows how the providence undergoes a change from an unquestioned belief into a concept that has to be explained and empirically proven. In loose chronological sequence, the chapters follow the increasing complexity of short narratives and the movement of plot types, devices, sometimes even specific stories, across the Atlantic. This formal development further corresponds to the subjects and subgenres treated by each chapter, as they analyze stories of divine judgments, deliverances and the supernatural. Each thematic cluster, in turn, relates to specific historical moments in the history of New England, which can be political events as well as changes in church membership or the Salem witchcraft trials. On a more global

scale, the narratives relate to the emergence of new Reformed groups, such as the Quakers, as well as scientific ideas, like empiricism.

The first chapter demonstrates how the plot of a divine punishment becomes a pattern that connects writings from both sides of the Atlantic and at the same time continues the tradition of exemplary narratives that reaches back to classical antiquity. Fifteenth-century Protestant collections already prefigure the arrangement of narratives according to different sins, which is then taken over by Thomas Beard, Samuel Ward's *Woe to Drunkards* (1622) and Mather's *Terribilia Dei*. Increase and Cotton Mather's sermons, however, no longer authorize the claim that God punishes specific sins by extensively quoting the biblical or historical precedents, but deduce this pattern from contemporary English and New England examples. These highly mobile narratives serve as illustrations of biblical warnings as expounded by the embedding sermon. Through their shortness and simple structure, they reduce ambiguity and establish a plot pattern that is validated through history as well as biblical examples and can thus be applied to contemporary events.

The New England sermons *The Doctrine of Divine Providence* (1684) and *Terribilia Dei* outline a narrative pattern that interprets events as divine acts and communications. A judgment by God, they argue, can always be recognized by the congruity between sin and punishment, as well as their close temporal sequence. This congruity is exemplified when the man invokes a curse upon himself and his speech anticipates the manner of his punishment. Negating his mischief, he swears that "*he might never stir from the place*, *if he had so done"* and dies on the spot, stirring no more as Mather remarks pointedly (*TD* 35). By establishing a narrative definition of the judgment, Mather forgoes the need for a biblical genealogy and instead provides criteria to recognize them in contemporary events. Without voiding or questioning biblical authority, this shift indicates the emergence of an additional source of authority: individual experience and its representation in narrative form. In *Terribilia Dei*, Mather complements his exposition on the benefits of fearing God with judgment narratives that aim to evoke repentance in sinners and affirm believers in trusting God's justice. By consequence, a narrative structure becomes crucial to express the doctrine whereas the narratives themselves follow this pattern to impart the message of the sermon to the audience.

The use of exemplary judgments and their structure are deeply rooted in Calvin's theology and his emphasis on Christian living. The sermons by Ward and Mather participate in the Calvinist tradition that sees the responsibility of leading a holy life and working out one's salvation with the individual. Negating the institutionalized logic of salvation inherent

in Catholic sacrament, Calvin emphasizes the everyday practice of Christian virtue and provides a host of detailed guides for holy living. While Calvinist Puritans searched their lifestyle for marks of election, communities were similarly eager to ascertain their status in God's plan of salvation. The resulting collections of mishaps and accidents that befall critics or mockers of the colony were interpreted as divine punishments and emplotted accordingly. By abstracting patterns of divine action from contemporary events, Puritans revert the way in which exemplary models were established before, namely by drawing on the authority of the Bible or history. Since the beginning of the Reformation, providential tales also aims to show the superiority of the new church and Puritans have also used them against other denominations, such as the Quakers that were persecuted in Massachusetts. Between the two groups, a war of narratives evolves in which each group tries to construct causal connections that demonstrate how God punishes the other.

Providential narratives also perpetuate the memory of God's interventions on behalf of his people, especially in times of crisis, and are an important part of colonial histories and journals. As the second chapter shows, deliverance narratives initially apply the logic of the judgment tales, but reverse its direction: Instead of punishing a specific sin, God answers the saint's prayer for deliverance. John Calvin outlines the dogma of divine salvation in the *Institutes of Christian Religion* (1536), which becomes a narrative pattern and even anticipates the situations like sea danger or captivity that the colonists experience. As Dorothy Z. Baker argues, the individual experiences of God's life-saving interventions complement the biographies of the colonial leaders in the first volume of the *Magnalia* (cf. 15). At the same time, then, narratives in the *Magnalia* as well as Edward Johnson's *A History of New-England* (1654) multiply and document the colony's experience of God's help. Though published in London, both histories use exemplary deliverance plots as indicators of God's continuing favor towards New England. Both begin to establish providential history separate from that of England and answer critics from within as well as without. While the ministerial authority has faced mounting pressure from the more secular colonists as well as English officials, these two histories revolve around narratives that affirm their place in a Godly plan of salvation and render the inhabitants of the colonies characters in this drama. Yet this providential interpretation upheld by narrative patterns met with increasing indifference or unbelief in the face of political turmoil and the wars between the colonists, Native Americans, and the French.

On the formal level, the second chapter continues the analysis of transatlantic narrative patterns by focusing on complications of their exemplary function in stories of

deliverance from shipwreck and captivity. So, the story of Major Gibbons' sea deliverance has been recorded on both sides of the Atlantic, but the English version in James Janeway's *Legacy for his Friends* (1674) offers the more pronounced providential interpretation. In Increase Mather's *Illustrious Providence*s, Gibbons' own contribution to the rescue of his ship balances the divine interventions in keeping the crew from starvation in the absence of the biblical references and perspective that Janeway provides. The sea deliverances in *Illustrious Providences* contrast individual experience with the patterns established by Johnson who only counts the number of ships that have safely arrived in New England to demonstrate God's favor of the colony.

Similarly, after King Philip's war accounts of the safe return of captives abounded, but needed additional narrative devices to uphold providential interpretations. Since Mary Rowlandson's *The Sovereignty and Goodness of God* (1682), most captivity narratives were written by mixing observations of Native American life with the self-reflexivity which marks other forms of Puritan writing, such as the jeremiad and the spiritual autobiography. Cotton Mather's recording of Hannah Dustan's captivity and violent flight, by contrast, is told by a third-person omniscient narrator whose commentary attempts to recast it as a providential deliverance. Taken captive by a Native American raiding party, Hannah Dustan kills a Native American family in order to escape. When the story resists emplotment as a providential deliverance and faith in New England's divine mission was waning, the narrator introduces biblical parallels that not only justify Dustan's actions, but also place her in a succession of heroines of faith, setting her up as an example for the rest of New England. Using direct speech again to anticipate the ending, the narrator turns one Native American's mockery: "If your God will have you delivered, you shall be so," into a prophecy by stating: "And it seems, our God would have it so to be" (*HD* 45). By conflating biblical language and narrative discourse, Mather's story likens Dustan to the biblical Hannah, whose fervent prayer leads to the birth of the prophet Samuel, and Jael, who kills Sisera, the commander of Israel's enemy, in his sleep. Following political and religious crises, New England sermons uphold the causality of divine deliverances in the plots through interventions in the narrative structure and mediation.

Consequently, the shared belief in providence that has so far carried exemplary judgments and deliverances can no longer be taken for granted but has to be established through subjective experience. Rather than proven by accumulative patterns or biblical evidence, God's interventions are experienced individually by the first-person narrators and vicariously by the audience. Accordingly, the captivity narrative that has often been

interpreted as a frontier and multi-cultural experience and the first literary genre in America uses the same emplotment patterns that already mark the judgments in Protestant collections of the previous centuries. As Mather acknowledges the Native American wars as a punishment for the colony's failure in Christian living and piety, he nevertheless uses the returning captives as instances of God's mercy towards his colony, regardless of the actual circumstances. Scholars like Alfred Weber, David D. Hall, and James Hartman have maintained that the captivity and the sea deliverance present typical providence tales that can be traced back to the earlier exempla. Yet, in this chapter, I argue that the very elements on which the exemplary function of judgments is based disintegrate in the face of an epistemological and cultural crisis of the belief in providence.

Finally, the third chapter demonstrates how narratives of strange and supernatural events discontinue providential emplotment patterns as they incorporate the empirical methods of the new science. By the end of the seventeenth century, skeptics used the increasing influence of empirical scientific description to challenge the concept of providence and its explanatory function for human experience, a process that had already begun in the Anglican Church with the Restoration (cf. Guyatt 42; Smolinski 1995, 47). Explorations, scientific discovery, and a new focus on rational investigation and empirical methods all questioned the existence of God and the veracity of the Bible. While most scholars and scientists of the time still regarded God as the inventor and prime mover of the universe, Thomas Hobbes and Baruch Spinoza, among others, called for a separation of theology and science, and emphasized the existence of matter in opposition to the spiritual world that could not be observed (cf. Wise 228). As a consequence, scholars and theologians alike attempted to find evidence for the invisible world. Instead of biblical precedents or providential emplotment patterns, these narratives of the strange and supernatural rely on scientific standards and the witness's reliability for authorization. Narratives of ghosts or apparitions in Joseph Glanvill's *Saducismus Triumphatus* and Mather's *Magnalia*, for example, apply empirical methods that rely on sensory data and a narrative structure that follows the steps of uncovering and interpreting the evidence for apparitions. Glanvill records his own search for a natural source of the sounds and movements in a first-person narrative interspersed in the third-person account of the case of the Tedworth drummer. The first-person narrator acts as an investigator and tests different hypothesis on the readers' behalf, much like Daniel Defoe's narrator in the *True Relation*.

Instead of determining the individual's or the community's place in God's universal plan, accounts of supernatural events try to prove the existence of the spiritual world. For

this purpose, even catastrophic events like the witchcraft trials in Salem indicate the existence of dark forces and by extension that of God as well. While the plots of divine judgments and punishments are, at least initially, related to biblical and historical precedents, apparitions completely depend on one witness's account and are not supported by other sources of authority. Cotton Mather's report of Joseph Beacon's vision consequently focuses on authenticating details and on the credibility of the witness. In contrast to the drunkard or faithful believer that appear as stock characters in exemplary plots, Mather repeatedly calls Beacon a well-accepted and pious member of the community and acute observer. The movement towards the individual and subjective culminates in Mather's use of personal experience as empirical proof of the invisible world.

The story of Joseph Beacon also demonstrates how much the function of a narrative can vary according to the context of publication, ranging from a loosely related digression to part of an argument for the existence of the spiritual world. Mather first publishes it right before the trials records in *Wonders of the Invisible World* (1693) but without relating it to their content or the descriptions of witchcraft that the book also contains. Yet the story also appears together with other supernatural accounts in the *Magnalia* and as evidence of the 'second paradise,' a place between heaven and earth which the souls of the deceased inhabit before they enter eternity in *Triparadisus*. While on the one hand, Mather's narrative reflects the shift from a self-evident notion of providence to a hostile climate in which the pure existence of God has to be verified, it also secures a relevant position for Puritan thought in the emergence of a new scientific discourse on the other. Contrary to notions of Mather as a narrow-minded conservative, he emerges as a scholar-theologian engaging with contemporary scientific discourse by exploring material and spiritual phenomena for the glory of God (cf. Wise 242). At the same time, Mather and his fellow ministers forge a narrative understanding of providence or its empirical observation through continuously adapting strategies of emplotment and narrative mediation.

Taken together, the study of narrative structure in early modern Protestant texts reveals both how these devices become subject of transatlantic exchanges, and adaptation and how they interact with changing attitudes towards providential theology. Going beyond the broad and thematic definition of providence tales, a diachronic perspective reveals three stages in this process of adaptation and interaction within Protestant culture and localizes the effects of Calvinist doctrine, exemplary functions, and empirical observation in narrative form. As a result, this study demonstrates the crucial role of narrative as it imparts doctrine, records experience and defends Protestantism against religious dissenters and skeptic

materialists. By tracing the networks of publication and exchange of narratives, for example between John Winthrop's journal and providence collections by James Janeway, Increase and Cotton Mather, it participates in the critical reappraisal of figures like Cotton Mather who evolves from the "last Puritan" to an enlightened theologian-scholar. Instead of placing him at the beginning of an American national literature or tracing his reception in subsequent centuries, this study views Mather, among others, less as an author of tales but as a mediator who collected, shaped and published narratives that become godly tales through their structure and the interpretation of the surrounding text.

Chapter 1

The Exemplum and Puritan Ways of Text-Making

When Increase Mather published two sermons as *Wo to Drunkards* in 1673, he borrowed the title of a 1622 British sermon by the Puritan minister Samuel Ward and the narrative below from the 1648 edition of Thomas Beard and Thomas Taylor's *Theatre of Gods Judgment*.

> A Butcher in Hatlingfield hearing the Minister inveigh against drunkenesse, being at his cups in the ale-house, fell a jesting and scoffing at the Minister and his sermons. As hee was drinking, the drinke or something in the cup quackned him, and stuck in his throat, that he could neither get it up or down, but strangled him presently. (Ward 22, *TG* 557)

While Mather explicitly quotes from Beard, the narrative he refers to has originally been part of Ward's sermon and before Beard included in an additional chapter to Beard's *Theatre*. Using these three interrelated texts as a starting point, this chapter traces the structure and circulation of exemplary narrative patterns in transatlantic Protestant writing.

Most definitions agree that an exemplum is a short narrative that illustrates a moral precept. In order to show what is 'exemplary,' these narratives operate within a Protestant community of shared beliefs and values. In religious literature, exempla accordingly consisted of "edifying tales of judgments upon sinners and mercies shown to the pious" (Thomas 93). However, medievalists have also used the term exemplum for short narratives in general. While the exemplum always constitutes a "minimal narrative form," Fritz Kemmler states that "it will be necessary to differentiate between the term 'exemplum' denoting the function of a 'text' on the one hand, and, on the other, denoting formal properties of a 'text'" (Kallweit qtd. in Kemmler 160, 60). Walter Haug even argues with regard to German medieval literature that the exemplum exists only as a function, not as a narrative form. According to Haug, all forms can become exemplary if endowed with a moral and didactic function (cf. 1993, 8). Klaus Grubmüller agrees by calling the exemplum not so much a genre as an analogical operation: it does not contain a moral or value judgment but stands as an illustration in analogical relation to its context. The exemplum is drawn from an outside source into an argumentative or narrative context as an illustration and thereby helps to come to a value judgment instead of entailing one (cf. Grubmüller 2009,

71).

In the sermons, journals and church histories of New England, two strands of exemplary narratives converge. In Greek, the Platonic "paradeigma" is an inductive standard or model given by a higher, i.e. divine, authority and influenced the use of exempla in medieval sermons. This "archetype derived form a transcendent source" whose authority lifted a specific instance above others and made it illustrative of the abstract and universal principle that stands behind it (Gelley 1, cf. 2). By contrast, Aristotle uses the three narrative genres of fable, parable and historical examples to collect instances that point towards a principle, which he then develops in his argumentation (cf. von Moos 82). While the principles illustrated by the Platonic exemplum rest on a shared understanding of values and authority, Aristotle's exempla operate on a different level as they illustrate or support a text's argument but could also be used for a different purpose (cf. Gelley 1). According to Alexander Gelley, "at the start of the Western philosophical tradition appear two kinds of exemplarity, one primarily oriented to a pragmatic function, to rhetoric, the other to a cognitive principle and to ontology" (1995, 1-2). While their different levels of operation should not be neglected, both types of exemplarity have mingled in medieval literature and can still be found in colonial New England. What nevertheless unites the two traditions is their function to illustrate or prove a moral argument which is related to the narratives by way of analogy or simile (cf. Gelley 1995, 3). As a result, scholars agree to define the exemplum rather by its function than as a genre of its own (cf. Engler and Müller 1995, 9; von Moos 2006, 107).

In New England, a similar understanding is echoed by Cotton Mather, who distinguishes between "idle" storytelling and dangerous "Romances," on the one hand, and the "Remarkables of God," on the other hand, that have to be recorded for posterity (cf. Mather 1693, 7, 11; Daniels 19). Prefacing Mather's *Magnalia*, John Higginson draws a parallel between the "Historical way" in which God's acting towards his chosen people was documented in the Bible and "the considerable Persons and Actions found among them [the New England Puritans]," that "cannot but afford Matters of *Admiration* and *Admonition*, above what any other Story can pretend unto" (*MC* n.pag.). Higginson establishes a continuum from sacred history to narrating what happened to later generations of believers, endowing Mather's writing with an authoritative precedent as well as with the same usefulness and effect ascribed to the Bible.[9] In his *Winter-Meditations*, Cotton Mather's

[9] The Bible's status as the authoritative basis for all types of historical narratives is well documented.

explicitly rejects "Idle Things such as the *Telling of Tales*" (1693, 7). To both Higginson and Mather, the use of narrative should further God's glory by recording his providential interventions or prove of practical value by teaching and strengthening the believer. These intentions remind us of the origins of exempla as illustration devices in sermons and teaching in general.

Introduced to Christian preaching by Pope Gregory I (c. 540-604) in his *Dialogues* (593) and *Homilies* (591-592), exempla were collected for a long time before they found their way into the preaching of the mendicant friars. Gregory the Great recommends the use of "short narrative and descriptions … in order to support, illustrate, and prove moral laws and religious doctrines in a more concrete way, so that they became comprehensible to listeners of all social classes" (Koch 82). Yet preaching remained restricted to a small number of bishops and clerics and the dominance of the "pedantic arguments" of scholasticism marginalized the use of exempla. Nevertheless, exempla were brought together in Latin collections following Gregory's lead but not used until Dominican and Franciscan wandering friars preached vernacular sermons that simplified dogma with narrative illustrations (cf. Mosher 13). The thirteenth century saw the preparation of larger numbers of Latin exempla collections in Europe but Jacques de Vitry's narrative illustrations of his *Sermones Vulgares* (written between 1228-1240 while serving as a Cardinal in Rome) still remained an exception (cf. Mosher 10-11, 13; Crane xl).[10] Yet, once the license to preach was extended to the mendicant orders, as Joseph Mosher's survey of the exemplum in English literature shows, "the stories which had been accumulating in the cloisters, reposing in Latin collections and treatises … were now poured out in the vernacular by the enthusiastic friars who overran Europe" (Mosher 85, cf. Crane xix).

In turn, Thomas Crane argues that the use and sources of exempla in the public sermons of the wandering friars change in response to their audience. While Latin exempla collections drew on biblical, classical and patristic writing, the exempla used by the friars mirror the contemporary and popular interest in oral fables and folk tales which also shifts their function from edification to entertainment. Preaching openly to gatherings on markets

---

As Elmer Holifield states, "[m]ost literate New Englanders would have assumed that the archetypal historical narrative, from which all other ones derived their meaning, was the Bible" (42). Protestant and especially Puritan exegetical practice stressed the historical dimension of the biblical text over allegorical readings and the conception of divine providence established a continuation of God's dealings with the Israelites to the present New Englanders (cf. Holifield 42; Obenland 101).

[10] Mosher categorizes these collections according to the way they order the narratives and whether or not they explain their moral. He also finds great similarities in their "manner and matter" as they largely rely on a limited stock of sources, such as saint's lives, Gregory's *Dialogues* and other patristic writers (cf. Mosher 6-7).

and other places throughout the countryside, "[t]he popular character of the audiences modified essentially the style of preaching, and it became necessary to interest and even amuse the common people who had gradually become accustomed to a [more and more secular] entertaining literature" (Crane xx). Elaine Lawless stresses the fact that narratives could adapt to local conditions and preferences due to the extemporaneous character of these sermons (cf. 54-55). Similarly, Margaret Schlauch presents Geoffrey Chaucer's *Pardoner's Tale* from the Canterbury cycle (late fourteenth century) of the "few contemporary accounts of their delivery" (1966, 399). In the Prologue, the Pardoner explains how he gains people's money because they like to hear and are affected by his old and memorable tales: "I cite examples, many a one, Out of old stories and of time long gone, For vulgar people all love stories old; Such things they can re-tell well and can hold" (Chaucer "Pardoners Prologue" 1:105-10). Rather than a moral tool, Chaucer's Pardoner employs popular old stories to increase the appeal of his sermon out of monetary reasons.

In order to reach a wide lay audience, Franciscans and Dominicans used Latin collections of exempla as well as "popular and traditional stories from the people themselves" for their impromptu sermons, which in turn entered into collections of their own (Lawless 54). Yet from the Middle Ages to early modern times, religious literature has developed different uses and functions of short interspersed narratives to which the term exemplum has been extended without the necessary differentiation. While older scholarship has regarded the exemplum as an umbrella term for all kinds of narratives in medieval homiletics, van Moos argues that it neglects the difference between those in the argumentative tradition and others employed for evoking the audience's interest and a favorable reception. Instead of mirroring or illustrating a theological principle, the narratives of the mendicant friars served as diversions and were not seldom humorous or bawdy, drawing on legends, folklore, and local events (cf. von Moos 109). From the thirteenth century onwards, Dominican and Franciscan vernacular collections assembled the most popular and effective exempla, mostly from local folklore (cf. Lawless, 54-55). By drawing on local news, legends and hearsay, Protestant exempla collections in England and its North American colonies preserve the forms and subjects of oral storytelling in religious literature which in turn influenced later forms of short narration (cf. Hartman 1999, 10-12). "[A]necdotes, fables, narratives of all kinds are offered as examples for general truths or principles" (Gelley 3). Likewise, John of Garland's thirteenth-century definition emphasizes the exemplum's closeness to the tale, i.e. an oral story (cf. D'Agata D'Ottavi 17).

When used to illustrate a sermon, an exemplum occupies a middle position between

the moral principle that it illustrates and the alteration of behavior it seeks to effect in the audience, which is the pragmatic function of the exemplum (Gelley 2-3). This "ethical transformation" takes place when readers imitate the actions or virtues narrated in the exemplum. Thereby, the narrative represents its subject as exemplary and, on the pragmatic end, turns it into a model to be imitated by "propagating itself" (Gelley 3). Related with the authority of the Bible and by an ordained member of the church, "[e]xempla were presumed to be true, or supposedly true events of human experience and therefore supposed to prove the validity of any moral rule and religious idea to which they were applied" (Koch 82). The exemplum illustrates "by way of different substance," presenting the moral precept in action so that it is easier recognized and understood by the audience (Gelley 3). Still, the exemplum strives not for a mimetic representation but to make the readers imitators of the example presented. Alexander Gelley has called this the proleptic nature of the exemplum: it is oriented towards a conclusion that lies outside the narrative realm. On the one hand, the exemplum aims at "a truth or principle" but also at "an interlocutor" for whom the narrative is fashioned and who then acts according to this truth or principle (Gelley 2-3).

Exempla particularly lend themselves to an analysis that combines their narrative and contextual features. As most of them are short of necessity, to either fit into a sermon or a larger collection, they are by nature contextual because of their relationship to the embedding text. As shown above, they illustrate what is stated more explicitly in the context and their relationship to this context is one of analogy though on different discursive levels. So, Medieval Latin or vernacular sermons explain or derive a specific doctrine from scripture or other theological writings but illustrate its practical application or the consequences of not heeding it with narrative exempla. These in turn always constitute an act of borrowing, be it from classical writings, natural histories, biographies, and other news or political records or hearsay. Next to the wide formal variety, of "heterogenous 'sorts of texts'—from brief quotations of historical (biblical) personages... to more or less detailed narratives," the exemplum draws on a multitude of sources, often mixing narratives of original pagan and Christian origin (Kemmler 154; cf. Walsham 71).

Exempla are contextual because they extend beyond the realm of the narrative, both for their functioning and their authentication. When an exemplum is used to illustrate a dogma, it relies on the mutual understanding of its truth as it does not provide alternatives or ways to think about the applicability of the dogma but applies it. However, this relation is far from simply analogical as the illustrative function of the exemplum means that it does not necessarily restate the maxim it illustrates but rather implies it in the narrative. In

pragmatic terms, instead of representing reality, the exemplum aims to shape the world to what is narrated. The exemplum projects certain types of behavior or moral qualities beyond the narrative itself by making them exemplary and paradigmatic. Lastly, the exempla is only accepted as such because it is authenticated through its similarity to received authorities, be it to the life of Christ in a typological relation or historical, mythical or legendary instances that are part of the hearer's or reader's world and place the exemplum in a tradition of other texts from which it derives its authority, like the Bible for Christians. These multiple layers of cultural meaning and pragmatic dimension call for an analysis that goes beyond describing formal entities. An analysis has to address all three, the sources an exemplum draws on, the cultural consensus it needs to operate and the projection beyond the narrative realm that comes with the pragmatic-didactic function of the exemplum.

The Exemplum in English Protestant Sermons

The thirteenth century did not only see the publication of various exempla collections but also of many Latin sermon manuals that explained their use. In England, a very influential sermon manual *De modo artificioso predicandi* was written by Alexander of Ashby (fl. 1220) who builds on and applies Gregory's notion of what makes an effective sermon and his recommendation of narrative exempla. Ashby relates the art of the sermon to ancient rhetoric and describes the exemplum as a crucial part of the effect of a sermon "to edify the audience and to have the hearers leave the sermon thinking about what was said" (Kemmler 71, cf. 73). When Fritz Kemmler compares St. Andrew's legend with an exemplary account of one of his prayers in one of Ashbury's model sermons, the "*Legenda aurea* presents but the bare outlines of the narrative—I am tempted to call it a 'plot summery' [whereas] ... Alexander of Ashby's version ... offers a wealth of details" (Kemmler 74-75). The narrative elaboration of otherwise dry reports also contributes to the two rhetorical goals that exempla pursue according to Alexander of Ashbury: *delectatio*—though "of a useful kind"—and *utilitas* (Kemmler 76).

The sources of individual homiletic exempla and collections were, apart from hagiography and the church fathers, already mixing religious and folkloric material. The *Gesta Romanorum*, probably the best known collection of that kind, was translated into English during the fifteenth century, leaving out some of the more "frivolous tales" of the Latin original (Schlauch 1963, 82). The same is true for the distinct tradition of the judgment tale in English literature and homiletics. Historians have named Thomas Beard's *Theatre of*

God's Judgements (1597) the "grandfather of a distinctive and uniform genre of judgment books" (cf. Walsham 67). As one of the best known and influential collections of judgments in early Modern England, it was nevertheless neither thoroughly Puritan nor originally English, as Walsham demonstrates. Instead, Beard seems to have been rather opposed to Oliver Cromwell and did not belong to the Puritan establishment (cf. Walsham 70). Most of its contents are translated from the French Calvinist minister Jean Chassanion's *Des grands et redoutables jugements et punitions de Dieu* (1581) who is himself indebted to the Lutheran Andreas Hondorff's *Promptuarium Exemplorum* (1568).[11] Together, these books drew on a variety of "pagan, classical, and patristic writers, Italian humanist scholars and medieval Catholic monks" including Pliny, Socractes, Ovid, Josephus, Lutheran ministers and local chronicles (Walsham 71). Rather than establishing a protestant version of exempla, these authors continued the longstanding dialectic of "'official doctrine and folkloric consciousness,' between the ecclesiastical and the oral" in the narratives of Catholic itinerant preachers (Gurevich qtd. in Walsham 71-72). While the folkloric elements of a "culture of wonder" spreading from England to the colonies has already been documented by the detailed studies of Keith Thomas, Alexander Walsham and David Hall, the transmission and diachronic development of the narrative structures that mediate these stories have so far been neglected.

The transatlantic use and adaptation of exemplary narrative structures can best be studied when comparing the treatment of an issue of holy living like excessive drinking that has been treated by religious and didactic texts. From English broadsides, for example *Looking Glass for Drunkards* (1670), and Samuel Clarke's *Mirror or Looking Glass to Saints and Sinners* (1671) to sermons, pamphlets and the nineteenth-century temperance tracts by Benjamin Rush and others in North America, the subject has been taken up not only by religious but also socially didactic texts.[12]

It is no coincidence that a subject of life style features as prominently in early modern texts but rather an effect of the Reformation and more specifically the Puritan emphasis on holy living. While gluttony, one of the seven deadly vices in the Catholic Church, is most often associated with food, the emphasis on a holy lifestyle elevates alcoholism to a major

---

[11] According to Walsham, Hondorff's *Promptuarium Exemplorum* was "[t]ranslated into Latin as *Theatrum historicum* by Philip Loncier in 1575 and running through some thirty editions before 1687" (70-71).

[12] See for example, Margaret Ezell's "Looking Glass Histories" for a number of broadsides directed against drunkenness (2004). Benjamin Rush, *The Drunkard's Looking Glass or Moral and Physical Thermometer*. (Philadelphia, 1810); Marson Locke Weems, *The Drunkard's Looking Glass*, 3rd ed. (Philadelphia, 1814).

concern of radical Protestants. According to the doctrine of predestination, formulated in England for example by John Wycliffe in the fourteenth century, salvation depends entirely on the favor of God's election. In the sixteenth century, John Calvin regards a holy lifestyle as a visible distinction of the elect, and Puritan teaching emphasizes moderation as a hallmark of the Christian (cf. Hesselink et al. 1997, 83). Based on Paul's exhortation to "be not conformed to this world," Calvin infers that the believers' dedication to God shows in a way of living that separates them from their surroundings: "The great point, then, is, that we are consecrated and dedicated to God, and, therefore, should not henceforth think, speak, design, or act, without a view to his glory" (Rom 12:2; Calvin vii, 7). Calvin lists ungodliness and worldly lust as the biggest obstacles for holy living and states the principle of moderation in the application of worldly goods and amenities. He advises against both indulgence and austerity as God has provided things like wine for the human good. "We must, therefore, observe a mean, that we may use them with a pure conscience, whether for necessity or for pleasure" (iii, 31). Instead, he urges the believer to strive for sobriety, righteousness and lastly godliness that "separates us from the pollutions of the world and connects us with God in true holiness" (vii, 9).

The emphasis on separation also carries over into the Puritans' distancing themselves from the Anglican Church and its 'papist' rituals remaining from Catholicism.[13] Increase Mather deliberately cites the custom of "*Health-drinking*" as a pagan rite that has been endorsed by the Catholic Church even though some of the church fathers have been against it (1673, 31). The emphasis on moral living that runs through Puritan sermons on both sides of the Atlantic acquires a specific turn. While the institutionalized salvation in the Catholic Church is passed on via sacraments, continuous repentance, and absolution, Puritans who embraced the Calvinist belief of predestination had to work out and receive their assurance of grace individually. Moreover, as the status of one's election was never clear beyond all doubt, they had to continue to live holy. To show what was expected of a saint and, conversely, what punishment awaits sinners was the subject of many sermons and their use of illustrations. The exemplary narratives used for that purpose did not only circulate orally or in other print publications, such as anthologies and broadsides, but also drew on medieval exempla collections and records of ancient history, mingling Christian and pagan figures and events.

---

[13] In his *Institutes of Christian Religion*, Calvin repeatedly attacks the Roman Catholic doctrine of salvation and repentance as well as the sacraments, especially the doctrine of 'transfiguration' (see especially book 4).

Thomas Beard's *Theatre of God's Judgements* demonstrates this practice of combining disparate sources as it arranges narratives of alcohol abuse into a section together with unlawful gestures, idleness, gluttony, dancing and "other like dissoluteness" (427). Similar to a sermon, Beard indicates Bible passages in the margins to support his argument or cites directly, for example, Paul's admonition from Romans 13:53 to "*walk honestly, not being given to glutenie and drunkennesse, chambering and wantonesse*" (427, emphasis original). As consequences of drunkenness, Beard lists "the loss of time and mispence of goods, the grieuous diseases and pangs of the body, and dulling and besotting of the wit … [and] may other great evils spring depend and wait thereupon, as whoredomes, adulteries … quarrels, debates, murders" (427). This argumentative paragraph is followed by a list of biblical and historical instances that show some of these consequences. While each of them is lifted out of a narrative context, Beard handles them rather as references than as narrative exempla. Still, they can be treated as exempla, which, according to Alexander of Ashby could simply consist of a reference to an exemplary character without much narrative detail (cf. Kemmler 74-75).

The biblical and historical figures chosen for that purpose range from the biblical story of Noah, whose drunkenness "not onely discovered his owne shame, but also was the occasion of that cruell curse which the Lord sent upon … *Ham*" to anecdotes about Alexander the Great, among others, who "slew in his friends at the table in his drunkennesse, whom in sobriety he loued deerest" (*TG* 427-28). Beard's narratives move from biblical to secular history and the structure of a quick reversal that befell eminent figures through their abuse of alcohol is best illustrated in the exemplary emplotment of Holofernes' death: "Whilest *Holofernes* besottes his senses with excesses of wine and good cheare, *Judith* found means to cut off his head" (*TG* 427). In contrast to the story of Noah or Alexander, the narrative is tightly structured around the temporal and causal relationship of events. This connection first of all shows in the syntax. The initial "[w]hilest" links Holofernes' death to his drunkenness, which is portrayed as a process of dimming his senses through this temporal adverb. This device is typical of providential punishments both in English popular ballads of the time as well as collections such as Beard's, as Walsham explains by using an example from a different genre: "[T]o enhance the teleological link between cause and effect" formulations like 'presently' and 'straight away' are typical formulations of the temporal proximity of sin and punishment (Walsham 76). So, in the sixteenth-century ballad of Jasper Coningham, the Scottish gentleman who denies the truth of Christianity is consumed by a circle of flames "[n]o sooner had him spoken / this foul and blasphemous

thing" (qtd. in Walsham 76).

Losing control of one's senses is regarded as a natural consequence of drinking and presents the prerequisite for Holofernes' death by the hands of Judith. The construction of the narrative excludes other possible explanations indicated by the biblical text, namely that God has given Holofernes into Judith's hand and wants him killed to avert danger from the country and punish him for his atrocities and blasphemy. By focusing on the excessive use of alcohol as the sole reason for his death and neglecting the other explanations contained in the biblical passage, the narrative is emplotted as an exemplary warning.

From the 1631 edition onwards, the *Theatre* contains an appendix with sections of contemporary examples of specific sins. The section on drunkards is most likely lifted from *Woe to the Drunkard* as the examples and their order corresponds exactly to Samuel Ward's sermon. As Beard's first edition, published 1597, was in large parts a translation from the French anthology by Chassanion, he explicitly extended his anthology in subsequent years with material from "*Sacred, Ecclesiastical and prophane* Histories" as the title of the editions following 1631 explains. While Walsham places Ward's sermon, which was reprinted at least three times between 1622 and 1627, in the tradition of Beard's collection of judgments, its use of contemporary examples in turn is used to extend the scope and actuality of Beard's collection (cf. 67, 74). In the manner of Puritan sermons, Ward begins with a Bible passage from Proverbs 23 and "opens" it in relation to the central subject of alcoholism. Instead of a doctrine that falls into separate arguments and is supported by further references to Scripture, Ward uses parts of the Bible passage as springboards for argumentation that follows a rather associative pattern rather than Ramist logic.[14] "Woe to whom is strife" is the second segment of the passage that Ward uses to void preconceptions like the "fellowship&friendship" in drinking and sayings like "Drunkards take no harme" (6). Instead, "wine is a rager … and setts you a quarrelling, &medling" and "many are the mishaps and untimely misfortunes" as drunkards pretend to drink to health but receive "all kinds of deseases, infirmities, deformities … dropsies, headaches" (Ward 6). Moving from the general to the particular, Ward relates the negative effects of drunkenness to enforce a rational weighing of consequences: "Look upon these woeful effects and evils of drunkenness, and looke not upon the Wine" (Ward 7).

---

[14] Peter Ramus' philosophical tracts triggered a wave of similar books on logic and rhetoric that represented the first major reformation of the Aristotelian system (cf. Fox und Woolf 2002, 5). By separating logic (naked reasoning) and rhetoric (ornamentation), some critics have argued, Ramus influenced the 'plain' preaching style of Puritanism and its use of exemplary illustrations and simple axioms rather than complex syllogisms (cf. Sleeper 517-18).

Even though not forbidden by the Mosaic Law, Ward regards drunkenness as worse than other misbehaviors as it often leads to further sins and is not easily overcome (cf. 15, 17). In sum, it violates all commandments by bringing about a total transformation of anyone who "in his right wits and sober moode seems religious, modest, chast, courteous [...and] in his drunken fits swears, blasphemes, rages [...] commits folly, knows no difference of persons or sexes, becomes wholly at Satans command" (Ward 16). Ward highlights the drastic consequences of drunkenness by stating that the stories of immediate deaths following blaspheming and swearing are "rare" compared to the sudden judgments on drunkenness. While the general reckoning of each person's sin takes place on judgment day and leaves time to reform, drunkenness, according to Ward, is often already punished on earth (cf. 17-18). It "is so odious to [God] that he makes it selfe, Justice, Judge and Executioner, slaying the ungodly with misfortune, bringing them to untimely shameful ends" (Ward 18). With this statement, Ward justifies the often mechanistic plots of exemplary judgments by arguing that alcoholism is one of the infractions that are punished right away in anticipation of the Day of Judgment. Instead of introducing a God who is dispensing his wrath, the punishments of drinking are to a large part consequences of this sinful practice. These consequences can be felt as God withdraws his protecting hand or allows for the death of a sinner. Accordingly, drinking and its punishment are related causally and thereby anticipate the plot of the majority of narratives that follow in the central section of the sermon.

Each exemplum begins with a short epithet that describes the protagonist by his profession and the location where the action takes place, mostly a tavern. The form varies from rash speeches that are followed by a judgment to proverbs, as in the case of the landlady who induces three men to drink the three outs "Wit out of the head, Money out of the Purse, Ale out of the Pot" and is struck "speechlesse" and dies two days later (20). Ward uses the same type of emplotment that already marked Beard's earlier historical narratives:

> A Butcher in Hatlingfield hearing the Minister inveigh against drunkenesse, being at his cups in the ale-house, fell a jesting and scoffing at the Minister and his sermons. As hee was drinking, the drinke or something in the cup quackned him, and stuck in his throat, that he could neither get it up or down, but strangled him presently. (Ward 22, *TG 557*)

Ward's exemplum combines drinking with other wrongs, as the butcher abuses the minister and continues his sinful habit of drinking despite all warnings. The protagonist is only characterized by his profession, which places him between the lower order and the merchant middle class, his habitual drinking, "being at his cups," and his attitude towards the minister (Ward 22, *TG 557*). Like Beard's biblical and historical examples above, the narrative is

emplotted as a judgment by implying a cause and effect relationship between the butcher's actions and his death. Through the temporal structure of the narrative as well as its embedding, the reader has to reconstruct this causal link that is not explicitly stated nor commented on by the narrator. After a short analeptic reference to the previous hearing of the sermon, the whole narrative concentrates on what happens in the ale-house. The temporal pronoun "as" indicates the simultaneity of the butcher's scoffing and drinking with his sudden death by choking. To underscore the exemplary pattern, the narrative also establishes a relation between the kind of death and the sin committed: the punishment afflicts exactly the part of the body he uses for scoffing and drinking.

Conscious of this pervasive emplotment pattern, Ward exclaims: "What then, take wee pleasure in thundering out Hell against Drunkards? Is there nothing but death and damnation to drunkards?" (36). Ward's series of contemporary exempla is accordingly followed by historical exempla that should encourage drunkards to reform. These historical witnesses describe their own experience with drinking and why they subsequently or generally refrain from it. Mixing pagan and Christian, even patristic, figures, they endorse abstention by force of their historical "greatness," which is not explained but merely called up as a background. By way of historical anecdote, Cyrus, the great Persian king, refuses to drink wine because "he saw it metamorphose men into beasts" whereas Augustine and Paul represent the Christian tradition by urging temperance (cf. Ward 35, 43). As a way of overcoming the temptation of drinking, Ward even cites an anecdote from the life of the Catholic saint Donatus that could stem right out of medieval legend.

Samuel Ward's sermon *Woe to Drunkards* demonstrates how oral narratives pass into writing and become exemplary through their emplotment and framing. Based on what he heard from credible witnesses, Ward assembles cases of punished drunkards from his local Suffolk and their topicality is emphasized by the fact that he removes all names, first, "for the kindreds sake still living," and secondly, to avoid libel charges (Ward 29; cf. Walsham 2003, 109). Through the closing frame that is appended to all narratives, their way of transmission becomes apparent as well as Ward's role as investigator and publisher. Repeatedly, Ward relates how the events have reached his knowledge and cites witnesses as well as places and dates that provide his stories with an authenticating background. He invites the readers to inquire for themselves, if they doubt his statements. For example, a typical narrative begins by stating dates and places and varies the typical introductory sentence accordingly: "*Anno 1619*, A Miller in Bromeswell, coming home drunk from Woodbridge" and ends with the names of individual witnesses such as Sir Anthony Felton,

"the next gentleman and justice" who attests to the incident involving the landlady, or Master Russels, the town major, who chases three drunkards away, one of whom offers resistance and is later found dead with his knife still in his hand (Ward 20, cf. 23). References to the transition from oral reports to writing are given in the closing frame of the relation of man who passed out and died after drinking a whole bottle of "Canarie Sack," which was "witnessed at the time of printing hereof the same servant that stood by him in the Act" (Ward 27).

The frame also introduces Ward as a first-person narrator whereas the accounts themselves are related in a third person voice and zero-focalization. He investigates the above mentioned case of the drowned miller in person: "I was at the house to inquire of this, and found it to bee true" (Ward 21). In addition to investigating, the first person narrator also selects and evaluates the narratives. Chosen to illustrate "Gods Judgements against Drunkards," their truth becomes equally important upon deciding what to publish and what not (19). While "sundry sufficient witnesses" corroborate one account, in other cases, Ward dismisses reports—which he nevertheless summarizes—as unreliable: "This I have often heard, but have no certain ground for the truth of it" (23). Throughout the section, narratives are arranged consecutively without a specific introduction, many of them have an appended end frame that specifies witnesses and their relationship to the events reported to underscore their credibility (cf. 23). With regard to the overall effect of the narratives as deterring examples, Ward also chooses to omit certain details even if they are closely connected with the judgment on drunkenness. When a drunken man fell and "broke himself all to pieces … the occasion and circumstances of his fall so ridiculous, as I thinke not fit to relate, lest in so serious a judgement" (24). Ward not only transmits but also investigates and censors the narratives according to his purposes as the teller. All of these processes become evident through the use of a first person narrative voice and remind us of the situation of oral storytelling.

At the same times, these frames introduce the passage from Ward's discourse to the various narrators, a technique that is often used in literary recreations of oral storytelling (cf. Brown 1987, 63). A typical folklore cycle would consist of several storytellers who would take turns to spin their yarn. Changing the setting from a social gathering to a church and embedding what has formerly been told in a written sermon, Ward participates in the gathering contemporary local narratives and using them as exempla first adopted by the mendicant friars in their wanderings through England. As Walsham insists, the content of these narratives does not considerably vary from the outrageous stories of strange deaths

and gruesome happenings that furnished the contemporary yellow press of broadside ballads, chapbooks and other cheap print formats (cf. 50, 75-76).

Ward describes his collection in three ways that are closely related to their use and function as exemplary narratives. First, he hints at the sheer number of God's judgments that would become evident if they were recorded in a faithful and objective manner. If all "such dismal events [with] which God hath avenged this sinne" were collected in England, their number would soon produce a large volume (cf. 19). Yet even the small collection that Ward furnishes out of his "owne notice and certaine knowledge" should have a deterring effect: "How terrible a Theater of Gods Judgements against Drunkards, such as might make their hearts bleed and relent, if not their eares to tingle to hear of some … remarkable examples of Gods Justice" (19). As authentic and factual records of God's punishments, the following narratives illustrate the sinful nature of drinking. Accordingly, they act as an intra-textual analogy to Ward's argument, showing the effects of drinking for ordinary people from the neighborhood in self-contained narrative units. Secondly, these narratives serve an exemplary purpose by aiming at the opposite of imitation in their extra-textual function, namely deterring people from following the example of the sinners. A 'Theater' could hereby either refer to an overview or "conspectus" of the various punishments received by drinkers or the dramatic quality of these narratives that enact divine punishments and present them through this sermon. So, the judgment unites intra-textual analogy with the contrary pragmatic function of deterring readers from imitation. In Ward's own words, it would be an offense "to conceale them from … whom they may happily keep from being the like" (19). Thirdly, this effect can only be achieved through the emotions evoked in the heart of the reader or hearer. The empathy and terror evoked by witnessing the drunkards' fate should bring about a turn in the reader's heart to abandon this practice. Stressing the social and individual cost of this habit, Barry Levy sees Ward's sermon as an indication that English Puritans were already long "concerned about religious and social declension" (14).

In his sermon, Ward transfers oral narratives into written exempla because of their emotional impact. However, he regards their inclusion in a printed sermon as less effective than their oral presentation. As reading isolates the sermon from its original context as part of a service and from the divine power believed to be at work in preaching, "a Sermon read [is] … of lesse life and force in Gods ordinance and in its own nature, then preached" (40-41). Here, Ward differentiates between different ways of reception and assigns them different degrees of divine and persuasive power. Aware of this limitation, Ward even considers the affective impact of his sermons as too weak to expect any behavioral change

from drinkers themselves but rather aims to "stirre up the Parents and Masters … to prevent it" (41). As a consequence, Ward develops different applications of his sermon for drinkers and their friends and family (cf. 41-43).

At the same time, the printed sermon creates what Michael Warner calls the "third sense of *public*: the kind of public that comes into being only in relation to texts and their circulation" (413). On one level, Ward's sermon and use of narrative exempla creates a public around the shared belief in the sinfulness of alcohol abuse. The lurid stories about the deaths of drinkers have been shared among neighbors and form a local community of storytellers. Combining the interest in local people with their extraordinary deaths and their graphic description, these stories are evidence of an Elizabethan 'culture of wonders' (cf. Hall 1989, 72; 1995, 36). Ward employs what Cotton Mather would later denounce as idle tales and gossip and transfers them into an emplotment that carries an exemplary function. Through their tight formal structure and embedding in the sermon's argument, the narratives leave no room for ambiguity or different interpretations. From the doctrine down to the syntax of its examples, the sermon aims to avoid the emergence of a counterpublic, to use Warner' terminology that resists this type of social control. Instead, with their printing and circulation, for example, through the inclusion in Beard's *Theatre*, these narratives create a wider public and a community of godly readers. By distinguishing between drinkers and their parents, superiors, ministers and other related persons, Ward actually creates an additional level of personal publics that are still general enough to encompass a great number of people. Ward charges the parents, for example, to use their authority and love to keep their children from drinking and encourages ministers to be "sober Watchmen" over their flock (42; cf. 41).

To show which effect his published sermons could have, Ward draws on a concept of reading as a way of internalizing the message of a text. While reading may impact the audience less than hearing a sermon, it was nevertheless considered as one of the "duties of the pious man" (Cambers 243). Surveying images of Puritans, Cambers finds a divergence between the various forms of sociability that include listening to sermons, prayer and discussion and the depiction of the godly as solitary readers (cf. Cambers 251). Still, reading was mostly a collective activity, as sermon notes were shared with family and neighbors, pious books were read aloud, but if individual piety was to be measured and demonstrated the individual reader was its most common representation (cf. Cambers 260). Exemplified by John Bunyan's life-story, the Puritan tradition relates the reading and understanding of a text with metaphors of "eating" and "internalizing the lessons of the text" (Bertsch 3). With

its digestion, a text becomes "part of the reader … because the reader's emotional and sentimental responses to a work cause them to internalize its moral lessons" (Bertsch 3). The value of a book is consequently not so much determined by its factuality but by its ameliorating effect on the reader's moral decisions (cf. Bertsch 3). This effect, in turn, is closely tied to the text's ability to evoke the emotional responses that Ward addresses. Puritan believers consequently saw reading as an "attempt to channel the Holy Spirit into one's heart" but also as a measuring stick for their status of salvation, as they carefully documented what they had read (cf. Cambers 260). The Puritan use of exemplary narratives is based on the text's ability to move the hearer's or reader's heart rather than convince through argumentation. Even though Ward summons biblical support and vivid imagery in his argument—as in his comparison of the spiritual and bodily danger of drinking to a "three-forked" sting of a serpent or dragon and the "brutish and bestial manner" in which drunkards die—he distinctly ascribes the power to "make their hearts bleed and relent" to narrative exempla (Ward 9, 18-19).

Emphasizing their authenticity, truthfulness, geographical and temporal proximity, Ward presents his narratives to the drinker as a vicarious experience of the death or punishment that awaits him. By directly addressing a type, the drunkard, and presenting a stable emplotment throughout, these narratives project the potential future of every perpetrator of the same vice. "Drunkard, that which hath befallen any of these may also befall thee" (Ward 30). As they elaborate typical habits of drinkers from all social classes—"[s]ome of these were young, some were rich, some thought themselves as wise as though"—the narratives offer them the opportunity for identification and recognition of their sinfulness but also document the drinking habits of the time (Ward 30). According to Ward, this identification and the future projected by the narratives should effect an emotional reaction and moral reaction: "if thou hatest such ends, God give thee grace to decline such courses" (30). While the heart of a sinner is regarded as cold and unmoved, an emotional reaction to these narratives can effect an inward and outward change, as it allows to receive grace and repent as well as to form resolutions supported by the terror and hatred of sin and love for goodness (cf. Ward 10, 19, 30).

As part of a series of narratives that all deal with punishments received by drinkers, the narrative is cast into a specific interpretative frame. While none of the narratives explicitly ascribes the punishment to God or introduces him as an actor, the framing sermon interprets the actions in the narrative as a sin and a punishment, implying a causal relationship between the two. The reduction of narrative time and scope, i.e. the shortness,

minimizes potential ambiguities, such as other explanations for the deaths. Through the lack of elements that would allow a different interpretation, the narratives become exemplary judgments. Yet it is in the frame and often even the introducing or ending paragraph that Ward establishes the authority for this interpretation. Especially as he recasts contemporary people and events into judgments, Ward's use of narrative creates a need for authorization in order to be regarded as examples of divine punishment. By quoting biblical instances and historical figures as warnings against drunkenness and its detrimental effects on one's soul and status of salvation, Ward's sermon provides this interpretative frame. Likewise, the credentials that introduce or end each narrative, naming witnesses and places, certify that events happened exactly in the way rendered in the narratives. In sum, both types of frames, the theological text as well as the confirmed narrative structure support the interpretation of events as exempla of God's wrath against drinkers. In the context of the sermon, they are regarded as models not to be followed and at the same time narrative analogies for Ward's argument that drinking is followed by divine punishment (cf. 19, 30).

The Transatlantic Development of Exemplary Plots

In the same year that saw the publication of his collection *An Essay for the Recording of Illustrious Providences*, 1684, Increase Mather voices New England's understanding of divine intervention in a collection of six sermons by different ministers entitled *Doctrine of Divine Providence*. While *Doctrine of Divine Providence* describes judgments as the process of recovering meaning out of seemingly unconnected events, Cotton Mather's *Terribilia Dei* elaborates how reading judgments impacts the individual believer's life. Both the stages of production and reception are thus reflected by New England ministers who also reveal narrative as a construct.

The first sermon of *Doctrine of Divine Providence* endows providence with a narrative logic: historical events are not contingent but intended actions by God that serve a specific—if sometimes hidden—purpose and stand in a cause and effect relationship with human behavior. It states that God's providence affects the whole earth and its creatures at all times and in all regards. Mather further dismisses any contrary perceptions or notions of hazard as "[t]hose things which as to men are the most Contingent and fortuitous, the Lord has a over ruling hand of providence therein" (11). The sermon further establishes the difference between general providence and special dispensations. Following Calvin's distinction, providence generally means God's upholding of the natural world according to

the laws he created for it whereas a special providence occurs outside these patterns and acquires a specific meaning and commands attention from the believers (cf. Walsham 21). As "Magnalia Dei," special providences communicate Gods' anger or benevolence as "preservations and deliverances" (Mather 1699, 12). In the narrative logic outlined above, "eminent judgments" function as follows: In order to show which sin awoke God's anger, the sinner is often punished in the moment of committing it. Firstly, this implies a temporal coincidence of sin and judgment with a stark compression of narrative time and secondly, the causal connection between act and punishment. To effectively deter others, these actions of God are "eminent in respect of the circumstances of it as it overtakes men in the very act of sin … [and the] greatness, terribleness of them" to any witnesses or hearers (Mather, 1699, 14).

To explain the theological basis of providence, *Doctrine of Divine Providence* draws on the Calvinist conception that God intervenes in human affairs to communicate with believers and sinners. Puritans participate in a "continuum" of Protestant doctrine, uniting high and low church as they regard God as actively involved in human affairs even though his actions are not always to be clearly discerned. Yet, as God "will not leave the wicked unpunished," a corresponding turn to the worse can hint at his anger towards a sinner (Calvin iv, 292). In addition, Calvin strongly condemns alternative methods to determine the meaning of events or their cause, turning against the common practice of divination and astrology as well as concepts of fate and fortune: "how few are there who ascribe them to the ruling providence of God—how many imagine that they are casual results produced by the blind evolutions of the wheel of chance?" (i, 59). He thereby attacks the efforts of sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century "learned culture" to search for hidden patterns behind seemingly random events (cf. Winship 1996, 11).

Generally, Renaissance knowledge proceeds by analogy, meaning that deducing patterns of divine action from the Bible, such as helping believers and punishing sinners, and transfer them to the present constitutes a well-accepted logical operation (cf. Winship 1996, 11). By constantly drawing this analogy to the Bible where everything is worked by God and fits into his plan, even the most unlikely events could be seen as dispensations of providence not yet deciphered. Consequently, Winship states that "Calvin conquered contingency and its anxieties by focusing all initiative in God" and making his secret plan the final rationale where all other explanations fail (1996, 12, cf. 11). By seeing "God's sovereignty" at work in every occurrence, Calvin called for a different view of reality and established a doctrinal departure from Catholicism by removing "all intermediaries between

God and humanity" like the saints, the angels and the Virgin Mary and stating that God directly communicates through his providential interventions with believers and unbelievers (Winship 1996, 10-12). As Calvin maintains, these communications are especially visible in deliverances of believers and judgments of sinners: "[H]e so arranges the course of his providence, as daily to declare, by the clearest manifestations, that though all are in innumerable ways the partakers of his bounty, the righteous are the special objects of his favour, the wicked and profane the special objects of his severity" (i, 56). For Calvin, special providences that show God's mercy and judgment are easier to decipher as they apply to specific groups, which are easy to distinguish. By contrast, the exact relationship between cause and providential action is far more difficult to establish in the variety of ways everybody is affected by God's general providence. Endowing such a specific dispensation with a communicative function also raises the question as to what effect is intended by narrating a specific sequence of events as a punishment for sin or as a demonstration of divine favor for a believer. The act of interpreting events as providences endows them with a narrative logic of cause and effect as well as with a pragmatic dimension for the reader or hearer.

Cotton Mather's sermon *Terribilia Dei: Remarkable Judgments of God* (1697) explicitly describes the emotional effect attained by emplotting events as an exemplary judgment: "*The Judgments of God* in *Former Ages* … should make us *Afraid* of the *Sins* which procured those Judgements" (17). Mather explains his conception of history as a didactic tool by quoting from Paul first letter to the Corinthians: "*All these things happened unto them, for examples, and they are written for our Admonition*" (1. Cor. 10:11 qtd. in *TD* 17). Without explicit reference to typology, Mather lists examples of God's punishment of the Israelites with the exhortation to "Remember" (*TD* 18). History and memory can evoke the same guarding fear against sin as contemporary judgments that always have a representative function: Instead of all Sinners, only a few are judged in this visible way to deter the rest (cf. *TD* 19). "As, if one Drunkard in a Town be Drowned, it is a Loud Sermon to all the Bruits about the Town, to be Afraid … in all Special Judgments of God upon any Offenders … there is that Voice from Heaven to all such Offenders (*TD* 20)." Likewise, in a late sermon referring to the execution of various criminals, Mather affirms that the recording judgments is an assignment from God: "[t]he Glorious GOD Expects, that we do the best we can, to make this a *Profitable & Servicable* Spectacle; and that our Foolhardy Sinners, Knowing the *Terror* of the Lord, may be *Dissuaded from going on still in their Trespasses*" (Mather 1723, 20).

In his actualization of the judgment pattern for New England, Cotton Mather is careful to differentiate between judgments on sinners and the sufferings that believers may also be subjected to. The difference is important because Mather understands judgments as having a specific, calculated effect on the reader.[15] Throughout *Terriblia Dei*, Mather reiterates the emotional response that each judgment, biblical or contemporary, should evoke in his readers: "There are Astonishing Judgments, dispensed by the Hand of God, upon others in this World; and with a very Trembling Fear, we should be Afraid of those Judgments" (*TD* 14). To Mather, fear is not only an emotion but also the only acceptable attitude to approach God. "Without … some fear, no real Religion can be exercised" and Mather delineates different expressions of that "Fear of the Lord." First, it is a "Reverent Respect and Regard" for God's name and an endeavor to live holy, as it was also endorsed by Calvin, "A Studious Concern and Caution to *Avoid* all the sinful *Evil* by which the Law of God is *Transgressed*" and to "Reply like *Joseph I dare not Commit such Things, for I Fear God* (*TD* 6). Conversely, "the *Anger of God* should be the Terror of our Souls: We should rather incur any Miseries than procure that *Anger* which the strongest Mountains cannot stand before; and count it a *fearful Thing to fall into the Hands of the Living God*" (*TD* 6). Yet it could also denote a "filial care" a service and devotion to God with the consequence to "Renounce the *Service* to all our *Idols* … And we must now so *Devote* our selves unto the *Service* of God …In the *Fear of God*, we must *Worship* Him, who is *Worthy to be Feared*" (*TD* 7). This fear has many facets and maintaining it is again tied to judgment tales that illustrate what happens if this fear of God is lacking (cf. *TD* 9).

Defining what constitutes a judgment in the first sermon of *Terribilia Dei*, Mather already thinks of it as a narrative structure held together by the congruity, temporal and spatial relation of sin and punishment. In order to decide whether events constitute a divine judgment, Mather says, one has to weigh the following categories: time, place and the resemblance of two actions, the sin, and the punishment.

> A Judgment of God, for Sin, must be clothed with some convincing circumstance and Character upon it felt, Reasonably to speak its being so, before we may venture to call it so. There must be something in the *Time* of it, or in the *Place* of it, or in its Resemblance to the Fault for which it comes, or in the Confession of the person Chastised, (*TD* 16).

Through the use of this terminology, the judgment becomes a narrative that can be recognized by its particular structure that in turn prompts, as Mather has it, "the Conscience

---

[15] Poe would later define the "prose tale" as a "tale of effect" (cf. 1972, 3-5). However, Mather neither called his narrative tales nor was he interested in an aesthetic effect on the reader but rather a pragmatic one on his congregation.

to say, *These are the plain Signature of a Judgment for some Sin, in the Stroke now given by God*" (*TD* 16). It is by the rational recognition of "some convincing circumstance," a temporal and spatial coincidence and resemblances between two events that the consciousness is moved and a godly sign recognized (*TD* 6). The recognition of pattern can only be substituted by the confession of the sinner, revealing a causal relationship between two events that cannot be established by outsiders. The emotional and religious effect of fearing God is tied to a structure of temporal and causal relations that make a narrative a judgment and an instrument to instill this fear through illustrating the anger of God. "Unto the *Fear of God*, we are by the consideration of His *Judgments* to be Awakened: and we should therefore be struck with a very *Trembling Fear* of those *Judgments*" (*TD* 9).

In *Terribilia Dei*, the repetitive structure of each paragraph—devoted to a particular sin—opens with variations of "The Judgments of God ... should make us afraid" (*TD* 10, 12, 14). This structure is mirrored by the collection of exempla that constitute a sermon on their own, titled "The Second Sermon." They are introduced as "a more Entertaining Recapitulation of the Divine Judgments (*TD* 26). In the next paragraph, Mather gives a number of models from history on how to react to these judgments. By implication, the reader is asked to do the same through vicariously experiencing what God has done in cases of other sinners and "work out his own salvation with fear and trembling." Mather thereby employs both kind exempla that Alexander of Ashby describes in his sermon manual (cf. Kemmler 74). First, Mather uses the Mauritian emperor as a character with "exemplary qualities:" he humbly recited the words of Psalm 119 in reaction to the catastrophes that had overtaken his family. From this exemplary man, Mather draws a parallel to all readers who "have ever now and then those calamitous Things before our Eyes in our Neighborhood, which ... we must pronounce The Right Judgements of a Righteous God ... And I must now ask you to take some notice of those Judgments" (*TD* 27). The second kind of exempla consists of a short narrative of God's judgment on a sinner, which does not entail an explication but stands as an illustration of the consequences of a specific sin as in the examples from Beard and Ward. Increase Mather's use of the narrative quoted at the beginning of the chapter shows his fluency in the earlier tradition as well as the transatlantic stability of the plot pattern and its exemplary function. Increase Mather explicitly links his sermon *Wo to Drunkards* to Beard and Ward's use of judgment narratives against the sin of excessive drinking. That Mather knew Ward's sermon is established by David Hall and also visible in his allusion to Ward's title and in quoting a narrative from Ward (cf. 1989, 275; *WD* 12). Mather further quotes from and refers to *The Theatre of God's Judgements* in

various places. Attributions to "Dr. Taylor" show that Mather used the 1648 edition composed by Thomas Beard and Thomas Taylor, "two eminent doctors of divinity," according to the title page.

Through his different framing and presentation of the story, Increase Mather becomes a commentator who takes the plot apart and explains its function. Mather cites Beard in the margin and refers to his, respectively Ward's, narrative as follows: "I have somewhere read, that a … a profane Drunkard that was in the Congregation went out and scoffed … and God smote him by a strange Providence, that he died forthwith, even whilest he was deriding the Sermon … Will you provoke God to jealousie? Are you stronger then he?" (28). Instead of placing the action in the ale-house and implying both, the drinking and scoffing as possible reasons for the sudden death through close temporal succession, Mather's narrative preserves the original chronology of the story and uses description and commentary to explain its function as a judgment. The man is caught in the act of scoffing, not drinking and while the judgment coincides with his mocking of the minister, it is directly distributed by God and called a "strange Providence" in Mather's description. While it is already stated and dramatized through the use of punctuation, the narrator once more expounds the temporal coincidence of sin and punishment to establish the reason for the judgment. In contrast to showing how the man's actions provoke the punishment, Mather's version already characterizes him as a "profane Drunkard" before he starts mocking the sermon.

This difference between the story and the way it is told in different contexts hints at the connection between a plot and its exemplary function. While Ward and Beard aim to reveal a specific series of events as a divine dispensation, Mather simply alludes to one of their examples as an argument for a different point. Earlier on, he has already established that drunkenness is a sin and as such often followed by judgments. In this particular passage, he exhorts his readers to adhere to the warnings of their ministers and to not discard or take them light-heartedly as they would thereby mock God and his Holy Spirit. Beard, by contrast, tries to establish a pattern by assembling narrative after narrative that all follow the same pattern. Fusing historical and contemporary examples in the various editions of *Theatre of God's Judgements*, Beard establishes a historical continuity where the teleological conception of history, based on the Christian history of salvation, would not allow deducing such a recurring pattern from merely a few loosely connected instances. In contrast to its previous embedding in Ward's and Beard's collections, Mather quotes the narrative not as part of a sequence of similar events but to illustrate his argument. Hinting at the persistent

abuse of alcohol, Mather is rather concerned about the effectiveness of sermons and the narratives they employ, when he states that "you have been sadly and solemnly warned against this Evil, and not in a word or two, but by Sermon after Sermon" (22). While Ward asserted the authority of the sermon and the social control it exerts when preached in public in contrast to the printed text, Mather is more wary of its effectiveness for social control. His use of stories extends beyond warning against alcohol abuse but tackles the attitude with which the sermons and the exemplary judgments in them have been received and heeded by their audience. This disregard for ministerial teaching and the rules of moral living present, in Mather's words, an offense against the Holy Spirit. Similarly, its shows human pride, which is also addressed in *Wo to Drunkards* as a social evil. Thus, Mather's sermon reveals exemplary narratives as a tool to strengthen clerical authority and maintain social order (cf. Hall 1989, 97; Obenland 99). If humankind lifts itself above the teachings that explicate the will of God, the narrative represents the course of judgment this action will lead to.

Regarding its form, the narrative in question presents a case in which the story-level of a narrative remains intact whereas its discourse-level is changed. The emplotment is weakened—the alehouse and the man's drinking are missing—whereas the commentary function of the narrator is strengthened. With less action and more description, the same story becomes an exemplum not so much against heavy drinking but against disregarding God's law and the ministers that propagate it via their sermons. The specific function of maintaining social and religious order, integrated into the discourse of a sermon, becomes one of the two ways exempla are used in early modern Protestant writing. The first way is the aggregation of narratives in thematic sections, a principle which also applies to Ward's sermon, as his collection transfers easily into Beard's anthology. Here the similarity of subject, namely each action attributed to a specific sin, and the pattern that emerges out of the sequence of sin and punishment are the most important features that are not compromised by a differing degree of detail and elaboration in each narrative but marked by the absence of narrator commentary or even the reference to God as an actor in the dramas they portray.

The argumentative exemplum, by contrast, illustrates a certain statement that is contained in its frame and allows for a less obvious emplotment. The point that is illustrated in the narrative can be additionally made by the narrator and mixes argumentation and narration. The underlying story remains the same, yet the narrative is no longer emplotted as judgment for drinking but for scoffing on the discourse-level. Each way of framing also entails a particular handling of the embedded narratives. Both, a section of similar narratives in a text or single ones integrated into the argument may use similar material from historical,

patristic writings and contemporary, probably oral stories. Anthologies like Beard's synthesize a large amount of material according to its similarities to point to a pattern that is bigger than the individual narrative. Argumentative frames like Mather's sermon, by contrast, cite their material carefully to establish a reliable base for argumentation and rely more on commentary and explanation to bind the exemplum into their argument.

By different ways of embedding and allusion, Increase Mather uses the analogical and illustrative function of exempla to support his argument enhanced through the possibilities of print. Without recounting the narratives in detail, he builds an argument out of several sources, sometimes by retelling a narrative in his own words sometimes by merely alluding to examples collected by Beard and Ward. For example, Mather argues that their excesses have reduced many drinkers to poverty through a note in the margin. At once applying to his audience's experience and simultaneously referring those who fail to be acquainted with such an incident to Beard's collection, Mather asks: "How many have you known that once had * considerable Estates, … but … [they] have soon been consumed" (*WD* 8). The asterisk points towards a short paragraph that is indented into the main body of the text from the left margin and contains a reference to Beard's revised and enlarged 1648 edition of *Theatre of God's Judgements* with page numbers and the summery of a case in which a man loses his inheritance of £ 30.000 through "drunken and debauched courses" (*WD* 8). On those pages, Beard and Taylor recount the story of a rich heir with a voracious appetite for luxury, fine food and drink until all his money is spent (Beard 1648, 110-11).

While printed Puritan sermons often used the margin for Bible references or to draw attention to a particular argument, Mather makes use of it for quoting exemplary narratives from various European sources. This web of narrative borrowing and transmission includes other examples from Ward's *Woe to Drunkards*, which he explicitly cites as his source but also Reformed theologians from Germany, for example. They are indicated in the text through a variety of typographic signs, like the asterisk or a Roman numeral. By way of illustration, for example, Mather connects his analogy between drinking and poisoning through a narrative from Ward: "I have read (i) about a Drunkard, that when he was drinking there happened to be a Spider in the Pot, which he was not observing, was poisoned and died immediately. Believe it so it is, there is Soul-Poison in your Cup, there are Spiders in your Pots, though you know it not" (12). In his summary of Ward's narrative, Mather emphasizes the connection between the poison of the actual spider and the metaphorical poisoning through drinking. However, the plot structure of the exemplary narrative becomes secondary to its analogical function as the episode illustrates the state of a drinker's soul that is

continually poisoned if not saved by repentance (cf. *WD* 12).

These two examples show how Increase Mather uses the narratives from Beard and Ward as illustrations of his argument. Embedded as short summaries into the argument or cited in the margins, the exemplary emplotment stays intact but is only secondary to the illustrative or analogical function. In contrast to his European sources, Mather further merges narration and argumentation by commenting on and explaining the emplotments contained in the original narratives through their embedding and narrative mediation. Arguing that drunkenness so impairs the judgment that it opens the door to commit other sins, Mather mentions a "sad Example" from Lonicerus, a German scholar and Lutheran theologian, whom he cites in the margin (13). The following synopsis is divided into two parts that are bridged by a commentary that once more entails Mather's argument. In the first part, the Devil tempts a man to commit one of three sins—drunkenness, adultery, and murder—out of which the man opts for drunkenness as the lesser evil. "Now that was the subtilty of the Devil who knew that if he drew him into Drunkenness, he should be likely to prevail with him to commit the other abominations also" (*WD* 13-14). The second part illustrates exactly this maxim, as the man "defiled his Neighbours Wife [and]... murthered her Husband." The summary of the narrative provides an actualization what is otherwise only an abstract argument. The simple structure of the narrative also alludes to other types of storytelling, for example, the folkloric figure of the devil and the three choices, which are reminiscent of the fairy tale. The man is not further characterized and his at first reasonable deliberation is foiled by the superior wit of the tempter, emphasizing the serious repercussions of drunkenness. Up to this point, Mather uses the same arguments against alcohol abuse brought forth by Beard and Ward, by regarding it as self-destructive and sinful. Yet, Mather proceeds to extend the narrative logic of the judgment tale from individuals to the community. At the same time, Mather establishes a relationship between individual narratives and God's universal history of mankind, likening the patterns of what McKeon terms the individual and overarching narratives prevalent in religious thought and writing for other countries as well (cf. 90-2).

In the framework of that history, Increase Mather compares the roles of New England to that of Israel, which heightens the sinfulness of any excesses committed in New England. In contrast to a secular nation, such infractions against biblical law and Christian conduct are especially severe in a colony erected as an outpost of the purified church. He stresses the availability of godly laws and teaching in New England "For men that live in Gospel days and Gospel Ordinances to practice deeds darkness is shameful and horrible. And this sin is

aggravated by where you live: What? To be a Drunkard in New-England...Will you be drunk in Zion? Will you be Fools in Israel?" (*WD* 27). Hence, Mather interprets various calamities and natural events as judgments on the community for their way of living, relating Israel's Assyrian captivity with recent fires and rainstorms in New England (cf. *WD* 23-24, 27). Reiner Somlinski argues that while scholars have assumed that Increase and Cotton Mather regarded Boston as the New Jerusalem, their millennial expectation was actually more guarded and that they looked forward to the coming of a new age when the political and clerical authority of New England was embattled (cf. 1990, 358, 37-3). Consequently, the reference to Israel highlights the common mission of Israel and New England as beacons of reformation and communities based on Christian principles and a strong religious leadership.

Mather traces these judgments from biblical to contemporary examples and its extension from the family to the community. Noting that "Drunkards bring a curse upon their Children" and are "the woeful procuring Cause of many Public Calamities in the world," Increase Mather sees a broad interrelationship between public and private narratives of sin and their judgment (22). While New England should have been the place of godly comportment and sobriety, it now receives judgments like the other European countries (cf. *WD* 23). For example, Mather regards the advancing Ottoman empire as a judgment on the "European Nations not only … to punish them for their Idolatry and Superstition … but also … for all their Profanities, Luxuries, Drunkenness" and particularly laments the fate of "Poor miserable *Germany*" that "hath bled for its sins" (*WD* 23).

Speaking of his local Boston, Mather endows the great fire in Boston with a providential interpretation as a judgment for drunkenness. He exhorts his readers to "Remember the sad Fire … And where did that Fire break forth? Began it not in an Ale-house? As if the Lord should from Heaven point with the finger... I am displeased with you because of your excessive drinking" (*WD* 24). While this cause and effect relationship is put forward by a series of questions, it nevertheless establishes the local concurrence typical of other exemplary judgments. The fire breaks out at the very place where sin is committed, mirroring the many instances of drinkers who died on the spot in pubs and alehouses collected by Ward (cf. 22-6). The causal relationship developed out of this locality is inferred rather than obvious and presents a contested practice even at that time. Anglican theologians, for example, claim that providence is by nature unfathomable. Even English Puritans have started to doubt their interpretations of 'special' dispensations following the end of Oliver

Cromwell's Commonwealth.[16] Whether its interpretation has been disputed or not, by remembering the accident as a divine communication Increase Mather is certainly in line with what Puritan New England saw as the major purpose of narrative: to remember instances of God's admonition and greatness (cf. *WD* 24).

The dramatic quality of conceiving God's judgments as a 'theatre' draws attention to the fact that the narratives enact rather than only illustrate their exemplarity. Contemporary meanings of 'theater' are a public display or, especially when used as a book title, "A book giving a 'view' or 'conspectus' of some subject" ("theatre"). As Margaret Ezell's survey of English broadside that warn against drinking shows, they invite readers to identify themselves with the sinner and experience the awe and terror by describing the repercussions of drinking. Similarly, the titles chosen by Beard and contemporary broadsides that frequently entail the terms 'theater' or 'mirror' indicate that the audience should vicariously experience the consequences of vice, either by seeing themselves in the events portrayed or through their dramatic and exhaustive representation. Still, broadsides and collections like Beard's *Theater* represent different narrative and reading strategies. While narrative exempla describe the deaths of drinkers in graphic detail, the broadside offers snippet or a final state, from which the readers can reconstruct or furnish the story from their experience. Snippets like "Consumes estates" or "empties purses" represent a final state, from which a plot and individual events can be deduced, much like the narrative from Ward's sermon that Mather refers to. In the manner of what Renate Brosch terms "projective reading," readers fill out the storyline with frames that include the typical situation and prices in an alehouse and possible personal knowledge or experience of like cases (20-22).[17] Actual narratives are referenced at the bottom of the page through a list of biblical passages: "Now here is Holy Scripture, woeful Experience, and the Convictions of the Conscience plainly testified to, which are so many Witnesses against the professed Christians who are guilty of so odious a Sin … they will prove effectual, to warn them to forsake the same." The additive thrust of these enumerations renders the vice even more dangerous and abject. At the same time, they use the same events portrayed in narratives used by Beard or the Mathers with the difference

---

[16] During the Restoration, many English Puritans distanced themselves from the "apocalyptic providentialism that had swept the nation during the Civil War," exemplified by John Wilkins' 1649 *Discourse on the Beauty of Providence* or Stephen Charnock's 1680 *Treatise of Divine Providence* (Guyatt 42, cf. 44). With respect to the abrupt end of Puritan reign and Cromwell's failed predictions, they asserted the "limited reach of human observation" and the difficulties of interpreting providence correctly (Guyatt 42).

[17] Brosch defines projection in the context of reading a short story as a process of "extrapolation or constructing analogies" (my translation) that provide the information missing in the text from the reader's knowledge of the world to understand a given situation (20).

of having the reader provide the narrative links of cause and effect to the specific states.[18]

On the one hand, collections like Beard's *Theater* offer a systematic overview of different sins and their judgments and his title corresponds to other books of learning, for example Thomas Forde's *Theatre of Wits Ancient and Modern* (1660) or *A Theatre of Wars between England and France* (1698). In their titles, 'theater' serves as a metaphor for comprehensiveness. On the other hand, the term 'theater' also served as a metaphor for the world and its deep structure. Especially popular during the Baroque period, of roughly 1500 to 1700, the hidden structure of the world as a theater harks back to the concept of 'theatrum mundi' of classical antiquity (cf. Schock ix). It also separates surface and interior, i.e. the world as it appears and the deeper workings behind it, the "obscured or removed real world" (West 7). Calvin, according to William N. West, uses the 'theatrum' metaphor to describe God's omnipresence and hidden workings that are too great for human comprehension but offer glimpses of him: "This magnificent theater of heaven and earth replenished with numberless wonders, the wise contemplation of which should have enabled us to know God" (Calvin ii, 293). Compiling exemplary judgments as a 'theatre,' could refer to a comprehensive account as well as their function to visualize God's dealing with sinners in their narrative structure. All of the narratives show the world to be the place where God is acting out his judgments on sinners.

The allusion to 'theatre' also highlights the structural principle of exemplary plots and how their understanding depends on a shared worldview. They relate actions and judgments as their consequences through temporal relationships that become causal through the interpretation by clergymen that in turn influence collections like Beard's or the broadsides. Making visible the hidden rules and workings of God's power on earth, these narratives enact what a drunkard could expect from providence and what society expects from its members, as a form of "Godly republicanism," to borrow Michael Winship's term (2012). The social dimension and intended effect of exempla are primarily carried by their emplotment, demonstrating how ideology, in this case the Calvinist concept of Christian living, influences form. The representation of a paradigmatic sin and punishment enacts the very process by which such a sin becomes morally wrong and its punishment exemplary. Exemplary emplotments rely on the one hand on authoritative sources for their maxims, like the Bible, and, on the other hand, turn specific sequences of events into exemplary

---

[18] See for example the mentioning of 'consumed estates' in Beard (1641, 110), *WD* (8) and many broadsides, like *The Looking Glass for Drunkards. Or the Good-Fellows Folly* (1674-1679).

judgments through their way of telling them. If these instances of drunkenness were not combined with the sudden deaths of the protagonist in close succession and causal relationship and narrated and published as part of sermons, they would not have been perceived as judgments. Neither does God appear as an actor in any of the narratives. Yet as they are framed by scriptural warnings and arguments against each specific sin, the narratives dramatize the sudden tragedies that befall each sinner as judgments of heaven. Conversely, they are conceived as judgments based on similar instances in the Bible and the many scriptural condemnations of alcohol abuse cited in the framing sermons.

In *Wo to Drunkards*, Increase Mather follows this circular logic of exemplarity in which patterns derived from an enumeration of similar events correspond with biblical warnings. Starting out with scriptural evidence, he assembles reasons for the sinfulness of drunkenness from different discourses and already quotes exempla from Beard that show its negative consequences, like the losing of estates and paving the way for other sins (cf. 8, 13-14). In a later passage, though, Increase Mather states that the "woeful judgments that have ever followed" excessive drinking show that it must be a sin (22). Narrating events as exemplary judgments allows in turn to make these judgments evidence for the sinfulness of an action. While this enactment draws on and creates a social consensus about what is regarded as exemplary and worth imitating, its authority, in the Platonic sense of paradigm also depends on a divine act that elevates one example over another, marking a specific instance as normative. Contained in 'example' is also the word 'sample:' "take out a part to stand for the whole" (Gelley 2). Rather than its own authority, the exemplum always has a representative function that depends on another source of authority. On the one hand, the exemplum could be verified through its direct analogy with a paradigmatic text like the Bible. In an argumentative text, on the other hand, that uses exempla as a "hypothetical body of evidence," the "whole" for which the exempla stand and from which they draw their authority is less clear (Gelley 2). Consequently, Scanlon argues that exempla enact the very process that endows them with meaning and authority (cf. 34). All the references to well-known figures or events serve to create a common ground on which the narrative bases its explication of a moral so that the precept illustrated is likewise accepted and mutually agreed upon.

The Adaptation of Exemplary Narratives in Religious, Historical, and Personal Writing

While not deviating largely from the pattern provided by other judgment tales, incidents of cursing established an even closer analogy between an act and its punishment through the character's speech. Cursing is among the sins advised against in various Puritan sermons as well as in judgment anthologies. Beard lists cursing along with blaspheming and swearing as one of the sins that violate the third commandment. There are of course cases in which a curse is justified, namely when uttered by God or on his behalf by a man of the church as in the biblical usage of 'curse,' describing a punishment for sin, or in its additional meaning of excommunication (cf. "curse"). Hence, the power attributed to a curse rest on its nature of a divine judgment, even if it pronounced by humans (cf. Jay 2). Outside of religious contexts, "[t]he original potency of the term, like that of charm and spell, derives from belief in word magic and the authority behind the words" (Hughes 115). Most anthologies, ballads and other cheap prints relate to this older understanding and concern themselves with cursers who call up something evil on themselves. The influence of word magic diminished in early Modern times due to the advance of skepticism and Protestantism's ban of superstitious and magical beliefs. Its influence on storytelling remains nevertheless intact or is simply re-interpreted as a divine punishment. Hall finds a typical curse like "the Devil take you" at the bottom of many narratives published in collections like Beard's or cheap prints in France, England, and Germany (1989, 74). In many examples, the devil makes a personal appearance in a "range of guises" such as black bears and dogs (cf. Hall 1989, 74).

In his *Theatre of God's Judgment*, Beard gives a number of historical examples of cursing that revolve around the appearance of the devil. The first example from a sermon by Luther on first Corinthians introduces typical features and plot patterns of exemplary judgments. Firstly, it starts with a quick characterization of the protagonist as "a naughtie-packe of a most wicked life," whose effect on his speech is immediately visible: "every word he spake almost, the devill was at the one end … [or] the Divell was in his mouth" (*TG* 185). Instead of a name or occupation, the defining characteristic is the man's penchant for invoking the devil's name in his cursing around which the narrative revolves. The description already links the beginning and end of the narrative as his cursing occurs frequently when "hee chanced to tread awrie, or to stumble" (*TG* 185). After this general backdrop, the narrator switches to the particular instant and slows down the narrative time from a compression of several years. "it happened, … as hee was upon a time passing over

a bridge, hee fell down and in his fall gave these speeches, Hoist up with an hundred divels: which he had no sooner spoken, but the divel whom he called for … twas at his elbow to strangle him and carrie him away with him" (*TG* 185). The temporal coincidence of action and consequence points towards the sin that is punished. In addition, the evidence compiled in the characterization marks the protagonist as a repeating offender who continues his cursing against better knowledge and the moralizing efforts of his neighbors. According to Beard's introduction, God leaves those who call up the devil to this fate and makes him the executor of the punishment. The devil appears and strangles the man by the very throat that was formerly filled with curses. The narrative thus introduces a logic of cause and effect by the temporal structure and the administration of a punishment to that part of the body instrumental in committing the sin. Sin and its punishment thus become part of a narrative structure that revolves around a single protagonist and establishes these causal connections through the presentation of events and their temporality. The main quality of the character becomes exemplary in a negative way, with the pragmatic function of acting as a warning or deterrent. Through the concentration on the central cause and effect relationship, the text corresponds to Kemmler's definition of the exemplum as a "minimal narrative." As other short narratives or Matthew's normative definitions of the later short story, the narrative revolves around a single character and subject that are presented as a closed temporal unit and through a limited set of events.

A historical example from the same section shows how this exemplary emplotment can be enlarged with a specific cultural background, in this case, the status of the Lord's Supper in Catholic and Reformed theology as well as folkloric elements that emphasize that contrast. A priest from the German town of Forchenum near Bamburg defended the pope and his understanding of the Lord's Supper and pledges his soul to the devil if he were wrong. Citing the eleventh chapter of Corinthians,

> he used these or such like blasphemous speeches: O Paul, Paul if thy doctrine touching the receiving the sacrament in both kinds be true, & if it be a wicked thing to receive it otherwise, the devil might take me & … if the popes doctrine concerning this point is not true, then am I the devils bondslave, neither do I fear to pawn my soul upon it … till the devil came indeed transformed into the shape of a tall man black & terrible …, took away the old priest being his devoted bondslave. (*TG* 190-1)

As in the first example, the speech represented here is pivotal in connecting sin and punishment. The priest continues to "blaspheme" and call up the devil "till" he appears, explicitly linking act and punishment. His reported speech also represents the near unity of narrative time and narrated time, as it lacks narrative intrusions and takes up as much time

in the narrative as in reading it. Summarized by the narrator, the consequences are shown in the appearance of the devil, visible to the churchgoers and even attempting at taking away another member of the Catholic clergy (cf. *TG* 190). Connected to the priest's speech, the punishment for invoking the devil's name also extends to the defense of Catholic doctrine, as the attack of another prominent church member underscores. While the narrative follows the same narrative logic of Luther's exemplum, it also contains elements of history writing and folklore. On the one hand, the priest's characterization is more detailed and, in contrast to the first narrative, does not anticipate his sin but makes him easily identifyable through his physical appearance and the mentioning of the place and time. He is reported as being "crooked … in both body and minde, through age and evill conditions" without mentioning a specific sin (*TG* 190). The narrative metaphorically links bodily appearance and inner condition, which then gives way to his blasphemous invocation against Reformed doctrine. Secondly, the devil's appearance as a black man, accompanied by noises, wind and visions, draws on folkloric sources. Independent of the priest's fate, the narrative goes on to relate these different sensory perceptions of the congregation repeat themselves over a period of time, along with the narrow escape of the Bishop. From the basic structure of sin and punishment in Luther's sermon to the influx of folkloric conceptions of the devil, these narratives already hint at the variety of the exemplary tradition in early modern Europe.

In the second sermon of *Terribilia Dei*, Cotton Mather assembles narratives that deal with curses coming true without the appearance of the devil. As Richard M. Dorson notes in respect to early American folklore at large, European mystical figures such as dwarfs and fairies remain bound to their locality and did not easily transfer to the new world and their function was mostly concentrated in the figures of the devil and witches (cf. Dorson 1973, 14-15). As in other judgment tales, Mather concentrates on the sinful act as the cause for death by relating them either to specific words spoken, the same parts of the body affected that were instrumental in the sin—namely the speech organs—and the temporal proximity of the two. In contrast to Beard's exempla, the devil does not appear and justice seems to be of a more mechanistic sort.

The first example underscores the power of words, if God's name is appealed to and at the same time, the punishment could apply to the man's mischief and lying.

> A man, in our *Narrangasett*-Country having set his Dog to mischief his Neighbours Cattle deny'd the Fact, with Imprecations, *That he might never stir from the place*, *if he had so done*. The Neighbour … expressing himself troubled at his Impudent Lying, this *Atheist* hereupon used the Name of the Great God in his Imprecations, *That God would never let him stir out of that place, if he did the Thing*. The words were scarce out of his mouth,

but he sunk down Dead in the place and never stirred any more. (*TD* 35)

The narrative follows the exemplary emplotment pattern also found in Beard' *Theatre*. It only sparsely characterizes the protagonist and the other characters involved. In addition, the events are related by a third person omniscient narrator that largely stays invisible, save the formulation "our Narrangasett-Country" that locates the action in the narrator's and readers' vicinity. The narrator also evaluates his characterization of the protagonist as an "Atheist" in reaction to the former calling on God's name. The main exemplary emplotment is bound together by the thrice repetition of "stir no more," the first two uttered by the protagonist, the last one an ironic commentary on his death by the narrator.

Another of Cotton Mather's narratives follows the same pattern but contains additional framing elements that refer to and explain its function. Mather opens the frame with a maxim that partly follows from the preceding narrative but also introduces the following: "So they who Curse others terribly wound themselves in the Recoil. You shall hear an Example" (36). The section deals with "Rash Speeches," comparable to what Thomas Beard calls cursing and assembles narratives that follow a similar pattern:

> A Debauch'd Fellow, had *Cursed* the Excellent man, Governor *Prince*. The Governour Laid before the Transgressor, the Great Sin he had committed; and with a Grave, Holy, Awful Admonition, besought him to consider that Scripture in Psalm 109- 17, 18. *As he Loved Cursing, so let it come unto him, as. He delighted not in Blessing, so let it be far from him. As he clothed himself with Cursing, like as with his Garment, so let it come into his Bowels, and like Oyl into his Bones*. Quickly after this, a direful Cancer smote this man; the Cancer appeared first in his Lip, and so it Eat away his Flesh, ad his Jaw, down to his Throat; where with Inexpressible Torments, it kill'd him. Behold, O man; *If thou desirest Life*; *keep thy Tongue from Evil*! (*TD* 36)

As in Beard's *Theatre*, the narratives revolve around a speech that anticipates what happens as a judgment immediately afterwards. Invocations of the devil or imprecations trigger the according punishment on the speaker. However, this exemplary story narrates the consequences as coming out of the warning by a righteous man. From the beginning, the epithets used for each character establish a contrast between the curser and his object, the Governor. The maxim of the frame is thereby mirrored in the speech of the Governor, who tries to convince the debauched fellow of the seriousness of his guilt through the biblical passage that compares cursing to a garment and oil, covering the body of the sinner. The narrative compresses events to render the disease and death in its final sentence. Significantly, the cancer appears "first in his Lip" to proceed to the jaw and the throat and metaphorically "eats away his Flesh" in a drastic description that links the punishment to the body parts connected with the sin of cursing. The congruity between sin and punishment

established by these narratives mirrors the above example by Beard as well as the medieval tradition of judgment tales (cf. *TG* 185; Walsham 77).

A similar type of congruity is established in judgments on curses and imprecations that revolve around a central speech in which the sin is committed and prefigures the punishment that the cursers bring on themselves. The curse divides the narrative in two parts with the initial sentence charactering the protagonist and quickly summarizing events that precede the narrative. The outcome, in turn, is mainly prefigured by the protagonist's speech and follows it immediately. This pattern is evident though slightly modified in some of the narratives in Cotton Mather's *Terribilia Dei*. For example, "I have known a weary *Mother* say, *She hopes that this is the last Child she shall ever have*" or the case of a "Lewd Young Man, being dissatisfied with the Service where he lived … said, *He had rather be in Hell then in his Masters House*" both start with a characterization that also delivers the motivation for the protagonists' imprecations (*TD* 34, 35). Other narratives, like the two quoted at length above, render the curse as an answer to admonition against a previous action of the character. The characterization and the speech are highlighted through italicization, a common typographical device for emphasis in Puritan prints though not always employed consistently (cf. Round 80). At the same time, the narrator renders the speech in indirect discourse while retaining characteristic expressions that come to bear on the ensuing punishment as well.

Swearing or invoking the devil's or God's vengeance in an oath are sins that consist of a speech act rather than an action but has consequences on the level of plot. It revolves around the protagonist's repeated and similar imprecations and their fulfillment in the last sentence. Trying to add strength to his protestation of innocence, "this *Atheist*," as Mather emphasizes, "used the Name of the Great God in his Imprecations," calling up a supernatural response as the man calling the devil in the exemplum that Beard quotes from Luther. Here as elsewhere in his works and especially the *Magnalia*, Mather delights in puns and playing with similar sounds and double meanings of words.[19] So, the death of the man from *Narrangasett*-Country is described in the same words that he used in his imprecation. After he vows *That God would never let him stir out of that place, if he did the Thing* … he sunk down Dead in the place and never stirred any more" (*TD* 35). While many of the judgments related by Beard, Ward, and the Mathers end with the death of the offender, incidents of

[19] Examples abound in all the different types of Cotton Mather's writing. The *Christian Philosopher*, for example, calls gravity "a weighty Argument for the Being of God" (xxi). His fondness of word play is also repeatedly remarked by critics and reviewers of his works.

swearing and imprecations produce either especially graphic or ironic descriptions as they fit the manner of death to the instruments or contents of the speech. They draw on a tradition of exempla that extends back to the middle ages, as Walsham argues, in which "sinners are afflicted in the actual limbs and organs they have so monstrously misused" and "perjurers die with blackened tongues" (cf. 78). The effect is mostly shocking and intended as a deterrent as in the second narrative by Mather, whereas the first example offers an ironic twist by matching structure and content, the discourse and the story level.

Two types of embedding characterize a changing attitude towards exemplary from medieval times to seventeenth-century Protestant writing. Beard and, to some extent, Ward, trace the providential judgments as a plot pattern through history as a way of providing it with an empirical basis. Through this "accumulation of example," as Paul Budra phrases it, the plot pattern is proven to exist and represent a divine intervention (Budra 305). In his analysis of medieval plays, Budra finds that the "reversal of situation from good to bad," the fall from power and riches to ruin, constitutes such a plot that is transferred from the so-called *de casibus* tragedies to Christian historiography (Budra 305). From the biblical narrative of Adams fall to the "immediate past of the author," such historiographies would strive to prove the existence of such a pattern by as much evidence as possible (Budra 305). Instead of stressing the typological relationship between biblical and later examples, these narratives seek to establish a pattern by showing its prevalence in different sources and centuries. At the same time, exempla relate to God's plan of salvation. Judgment narratives anticipate God's reckoning with sinners on judgment day and are thus related to his history with humanity at large. Instead of postponing their closure to the end of times in a teleological plot, they mirror God's plan on earth on a small scale and bring it to its ending with the death of sinners.

While individual narratives can mirror the divine plan for humanity at large and obtain their authenticity and relevance from it, their collection in sections of similar pattern and content hints at a shift in the understanding of how history evolves. God's plan for salvation provides a teleological blueprint and deviates from earlier cyclical notions that see history as a sequence of returning events. So, every narrative that recreates an aspect of God's plan for saints and sinners brings it to its ending in the death or deliverance of each and subsequently creates a pattern that can be traced through history. Budra hints at the influence of Luther who propagated a linear conception of history with the result that events not simply repeat themselves (Budra 304). Each pattern has, therefore, to be carefully proven before it can be said to describe the workings of history, divine or other. With their emphasis

on exact observation and documentation, the collectors of exempla apply an empirical approach as all events could be potentially significant if they belong to a recurring pattern. Yet the distinction between historically important and unimportant events can only be made from hindsight (cf. Budra 304). Beard's and Ward's collections of providences apply both methods as they verify that their relations correspond to patterns of divine action through biblical and historical precedents, and, at the same time, create detailed and well documented accounts of individual cases.

The New England sermons by Increase and Cotton Mather, by contrast, show a different relationship with the historical precedent in their handling of transatlantic stories and forms. Though both cite contemporary and historical European exempla, they provide framings that render whole sections with similar narratives unnecessary. Instead, as in the example of Increase Mather, the sermons explicitly state the patterns derived from the collections by Beard and Ward and the narrator highlights elements of the plot rather than relating it as a whole. By naming historical figures and other Protestant texts, the Mathers rely on their audience to recognize what they allude to and insert these narrative illustrations into their argument. As evidence of a transatlantic network of Protestant texts dealing with providential judgments, this use of exempla shows that the cultural consensus on which their understanding rests remains intact throughout the seventeenth century. Building on the shared belief in the immediate divine punishment of a sin, both Mathers elevate this narrative pattern to the central doctrine of their sermons. By establishing a causal relationship between sin and punishment, their argument is deeply interwoven with its narrative illustration. Taking up cases from New England, both ministers exhort their audience to heed these examples and go through a process of reform that is outlined, for example in *Terribilia Dei*, as a sequence of emotional reactions to the narratives or an exemplary figure that goes through this process in the framing.

The emplotment patterns developed by empirical collections of sins and punishments are cited and adapted by New England sermons that in turn conceptualize providence in narrative terms. While Hartman's definition of the providence tale, for example, regards empirical elements as proof for the influence of the new materialist science, their form could also be explained as the attempt to verify patterns out of the mass of historical events and a narrative expression of how Calvinists viewed the mechanics of providential interventions (cf. Hartman 1999, 2-4). Endowed with the specific configuration of exemplary judgments, these narratives as well as their intended effects on the reader are demonstrated in exemplary fashion in the interaction between frame and narrative, as the sermons transmit as well as

develop the European form and function of the exemplum.

Providential interpretations and plots were not limited to religious texts in early modern Protestant writing but structured the recording of experience on all levels of society. Documents of New England life, like John Winthrop's *Journal* and John Hull's "Memorable Providences in Relation to the Country" participate in the exemplary emplotment of events as signs of providence and divine judgment in particular. Hull's memoir records personal and public events in different sections without strict chronology and has remained a manuscript until its publication by the American Antiquarian Society in 1857. Starting out as a private journal, John Winthrop's entries range from the weather and farming conditions to political controversies and wars. Winthrop turned his journal into a history and wrote longer sections from hindsight from the early 1640s sections onwards and reached a large audience by circulating his manuscripts among friends and neighbors though his work was not printed until 1790 (Dunn und Yeandle 1996, xiii; Armstrong 2007, 23).[20]

Both, Hull and Winthrop record events as judgments against sins that were already treated in the sermons and anthologies discussed above but also what they perceive as political and spiritual attacks on New England. They thereby correspond to the patterns established by sermons, such as the punishment of drunkards, but omit their theological explanations or Bible references. For example, John Winthrop reports the incident of a man fetching sack, a cheap dry and sweet wine imported from Spain or Portugal, on the Lord's day: "he and a boy, coming back in a canoe, (being both drunk) were driven to sea and never heard of after" (*J* 143). John Hull records the story of George Broome who "was brought drunk into his house late in the evening, and laid upon a bed, but in the morning, found dead (being the Lord's day morning). He was, with some other company, late that night in a wine-cellar, and, in his lifetime, a tippling" (199). Similar to religious exempla, the characters' death or disappearance is connected with actions that indicate even more than one sin. In his succinct report, Winthrop mentions that Cowper's commercial expedition took place on the Lord's Day as the tailor in Hull's memoir drinks on the eve of the Sabbath, and establishes a relationship between the passenger's drunkenness and their loss at sea through his interspersed comment. As a main difference to religious works, both arrange events into an

[20] Hall and Richard Dunn comment on the practice of scribal publication in which manuscripts were circulated among friends and family rather than printed (cf. Hall 2008, 29-30; Dunn 1984, 186). While Winthrop's records of public events in New England and their providential interpretation were thus widely circulated and quoted by other writers up to the eighteenth century, it is possible but difficult to prove that others than Winthrop contributed to the texts, thus complicating the notion of authorship, as Hall argues (cf. 2008, 28, 65). Both works were not printed until later centuries, Winthrop's journal in 1790 by Noah Webster and Hull's in 1857.

order that implies a causal relationship between drinking and death, but only Hull makes this interpretation explicit.

Against his practice at other places of his journal, Winthrop does not label Cowper's story as a judgment but leaves this interpretation to the reader, as well as deciding whether the Sabbath breaking or the abuse of alcohol played a larger role in deciding the character's fate. Hull, by contrast, underscores the exemplary emplotment of his narrative with an interpretation as a providential judgment. Using the language of religious literature, he records the death of the tailor as a "sad warning," generally using his margin notes to indicate topics and interpretations where Winthrop only gives dates as an orientation. The exemplary quality of the narrative is directed at the reader who vicariously experiences the consequence of excessive drinking. With the details and names underscoring the factual basis of these accounts, Hull and Winthrop endow the narrative with the quality of a "warning" and the implicit demand to learn from other's mistakes as described by Mather's *Terribilia Dei* (cf. 14, 20).

By enacting patterns of sin and punishment, these narrative episodes reinforce the consensus about what constitutes sin and thus the authority of ministers and magistrates. "Concerned about the maintenance of clerical and magisterial authority, as his political writings attest, Winthrop primarily invokes history as the theater of God's judgments in order to monitor social order and stability" (Obenland 99). Winthrop does not recapitulate historical or biblical judgments. His journal, however, establishes a communal history of God and his people that is mirrored by each recorded event. Hull and Winthrop participate in the Puritan investigation of everyday occurrences as tokens of providential intervention. This search requires an epistemology and narrative structure that goes beyond recording the events themselves and constructs relationships of cause and effect on a spiritual rather than material level (cf. Egan 50-51). Richard Lovelace regards the aim of integrating outward and spiritual life as crucial to a number of writing practices and expressions. Surveying his devotional activities, he finds that Mather tends to "spiritualize outward occupations" by devising a number of metaphors, similes and parables that express human activity as a mirror for God's qualities, his relationship with humankind and Christian living, for example in Agricola, a pamphlet addressed at the farmers in his congregation (Lovelace 119, cf. 120). Similarly, based on this correlation of spiritual and material world, Mather aligns everyday events into causal connections that resemble a potential exemplary judgment plot: He wonders in his diary whether his tooth ache indicates a sin committed with his teeth (cf. (Lovelace 121). Lovelace argues that Puritan diaries become the "methodological" substitute for the Catholic

confession as a means for self-examination and points to a 1719 manual for this practice (Lovelace 139). Following the Antinomian debate, Puritan have become wary of internal signs of salvation, as claimed by Anne Hutchinson, and looked for external proof of their status of salvation (cf. Lovelace 11). Narratives, especially when portraying recognizable patterns in a credible and verifiable manner, are recorded as clues for the state of the individual's soul as much as they indicate the status of the community at large.

In New England journals and memoirs, the exemplary function and the search for evidence of divine communications coalesce in narrative episodes with the simple reporting of local news in the journals of John Hull and John Winthrop. The collections of Ward and Beard place local incidents within a providential interpretation and the sermons of the Mathers use them as arguments, the embedding in diaries, however, requires additional commentary, such as Hull's marginalia to establish this interpretative frame. Winthrop's journal emphasizes and explains an exemplary emplotment and thus interprets events as providences. However, other diaries, for example, Lawrence Hammond's, lack any reference to God or his judgments. Winthrop evaluates the death of two men collecting oysters that first seems like an accident as an "evident judgment of God upon them, for they were wicked persons." (*J* 55) Similar to the incident of the lewd servant in Mather's *Magnalia*, one of the men had been a servant dissatisfied with his master. Yet, other personal records lack this providential interpretation even though the events reported have been treated as such by religious writing.

The Boston fire of September 1690 was recorded by Samuel Sewall and Captain Lawrence Hammond, a soldier from Charlestown. Hammond states that the fire destroyed many houses, killed at least one child and threatened the nearby meetinghouse. Previous fires, in 1676 and 1679, had been accompanied by premonitions and providential interpretations. So, Increase Mather had a premonition of a judgment by fire and feared about his own home (cf. Silverman 20). When a fire broke out in a house opposite of his, "God … did so influence that I could not sleep that mourning," so that he was able to save his family and many of his possessions (letter by Increase Mather to John Cotton, qtd. in Silverman 20). In 1679, a great number of warehouses were consumed by fire and Cotton Mather read these "fiery characters" as demonstrating "the vanity of all worldly possessions" and his father sees the recent fires as judgments of God for the colony's loose behavior (cf. Cotton Mather 1698, 41; *WD* 24). By contrast, other diarists fail to endow the same events with a providential interpretation.

Though Captain Hammond ascribes the success of the quick intervention by neighbors to God's grace and mercy, he does not turn his narrative into an incident of divine punishment by elaborating on its cause. The diary only states that the father of the dead child probably caused the fire himself by leaving "a lightenend candle [stuck] against y clapboard" and going "folish to an Alehouse … & forgetting his Candle … till his house was on fire" (Hammond n.pag.). The carelessness of the man going out for a drink does not lead to any moral or religious argument whereas Increase Mather regards the very same fire as a general judgment on the excesses in the colony. The embedding in a chronological and personal record differs from the argumentative framing in sermons. Nevertheless, these texts relate similar events and, in Winthrop's case even endow them with the same plot patterns and providential interpretations. Their use of divine judgments shows how Hull and Winthrop rely on the communal understanding of providential judgments that is created or furthered by sermons like Ward's and the Mather's. Religious and personal writing become intertwined as journals take up emplotment patterns from sermons and religious texts draw on local events and relations from correspondents, diarists, and travelers. As far as the content is concerned, the way of transmission seems to be reversed. As the excerpts from Hull and Winthrop indicated, fires, storms, and eclipses were recorded as providences by diarists and later found their way into sermons and Cotton Mather's *Magnalia*, for example. According to Hall, this network of correspondents was critical for Increase and Cotton Mather and through it, the "New England stock of wonder stories" evolved (1995, 38).

Instead of religious arguments, the journals of Hull and Winthrop embed exemplary plots into a narrative of God's support and defense of New England, even against mockery. Hull's public memoir starts with two "Remarkable Judgments upon the churches' enemies" as the margin note reads (169). In 1634, the crew of a ship "derided the churches of Christ in our harbour" and even performed a mock service to ridicule the congregational church. Interspersed in the narrative is at this point the maxim which anticipates the turning point of the plot: "But, as the apostle saith, 'Be not deceived: God is not mocked.' They putting to sea, they were forced by tempest upon the shore among the more savage Indians, by whom they were slain" (169). The second example tells of a ship "whose seamen were very profane in deriding the country, who said they would cast their provisions into the sea rather than supply such Roundheads" (169). Again, Hull's narrative commentary establishes a causal relation between the crew's hostility towards the Puritan settlers and their demise, introducing God as acting to revenge New England: "it pleased the Lord to leave them to take so little care of themselves, as, whether in their drink or by other accident, I know not,

they blew up their ship with their own gunpowder. The ship was called the 'Marie Rose.' So was also another vessel, that behaved themselves much after the same manner" (Hull 169).

Hull endows his factual narrative with a providential interpretation that relies on the identification of New England as God's elected church and commonwealth. Based on the authority of the Bible and the Calvinist dogma that God is not actively punishing but rather withdrawing his sustaining grace from sinners, Hull's comments anticipate the major plot turn that marks the narratives as providential judgments. Next to the plot, the textual embedding of these narratives helps to establish their exemplary quality. Hull compiles a list of similar incidents, both elaborated and by reference, that mirror the practice of Beard and other ministers to provide an empirical footing for providential interventions. As the judgments collected in sermons, they establish a paradigm of divine vengeance on behalf of the colony. Whether loosely interspersed as in Winthrop or drawn together in a section by Hull, these narratives aim at validating the Puritans' colonial endeavor and warning potential abusers or enemies. They rely on the same conception of providence and New England's divine calling that means that God will intervene on behalf of his believers and punish their enemies but also purge any sinful behavior inside the colony. The strategies of emplotment and their cultural function remain stable in journals and the private records of public events. The emplotment of events as instances of divine punishment are pervasive in New England sermons and historical records as well. Even though there are exceptions to the rule, the concept of providence engenders a narrative logic and organization that produces highly structured and functionalized pieces of short narration.

Despite using the same patterns of emplotment, the providential interpretations in Winthrop's diary and the sermons by Ward and the Mather's are based on different temporal structures and purposes. While Beard, the Mathers, and Ward adhere to a catalogue of sins following the Ten Commandments and the rules of moderation and holy living, Hull and Winthrop record judgments against enemies of New England and its churches that are drawn together over an extended period of time. Some of the ships were still near the New England coast, but the ending of one of Winthrop's examples occurs at an unspecified time after their return to Europe, where the ship is captured by the Turks, a fact that reached Winthrop probably even later and only by hearsay.

Competing Providential Interpretations in Sectarian Strife

In narratives directed against other religious groups, both types of exemplary temporality exist: those that construct a direct cause and effect relationship in the chronology of events and those that do so retrospectively over a longer period of time. When Increase Mather collects judgments against "railing Quakers" in his *Essay on the Recording of Illustrious Providences* (1684), he forgoes some of the principles of earlier religious texts by including God as an actor in the stories and implying a close succession of events that actually happened over a longer period of time. While Cotton Mather focuses on confusions of doctrine and questionable behavior as "the Spirit of Quakerism," his father is convinced of the darker origins of the Quaker's spirit, likening it to a diabolical possession. "All wise men hat are acquainted therewith, observe the blasting rebukes of providence upon the late *Singing and Dancing Quakers*, in signal Instances, two or three of which may be here Recorded, that so others may hear and fear and do no more so wickedly" (*MC* vii, 25; *IP* 340-41). Calling them instances and warnings reiterates the exemplary character of the narratives and gives a frame of interpretation. In contrast to his earlier levity, Cotton Mather reprinted these judgments against Quakers in the *Magnalia*, stating that "I will give my Reader the Entertainment of Two or Three well attested Stories and then ask his leave to have done with a Generation which it can be no great Satisfaction to meddle with" (*MC* vii, 25). Mather reprints the events surrounding the death of Thomas Harris who had recently become a Quaker with slight changes of wording from his father's *Illustrious Providences*. Called a "Tragical Story" by Increase Mather, it was originally contained in a letter "by a good hand in these parts" from 1681 and is set in quotation marks. However, Cotton Mather deletes these references but lists the same first hand witness in Colonel Young to who hears the voice of Harris, calling for justice after his death. Apart from this ghostly apparition, the events are emplotted as an exemplary judgment that presents an indictment of Quakerism which is also established through the framing in both texts.

While Increase Mather quickly summarizes the story in the first paragraph, Cotton Mather develops events in a chronological manner, separating commentary from narrative and building up towards its climax. The main charge leveled in the characterization against the Quaker leader Thomas Casey is blasphemy and that their habit of dancing and singing is due to diabolical or devilish possession (cf. *IP* 341, *MC* vii, 25). Thomas Harris joins this group and "fell to Dancing and Singing like them," which Mather calls the sign for his conversion to Quakerism (*IP* 341-42). Accepted into their society, "one of them promised

him, *Henceforth thy Tongue shall be as the Pen of a ready Writer, to declare the Praises of our Lord*" (*MC* vii, 25, cf. *IP* 342). The next sentence depicts the transition from a young man "who was sober and composed before" to an agitator for the Quaker's cause: "called them Devils that in any way opposed him" including his own father (*MC* vii, 25). Mather adds an additional pun and commentary, stating that by cursing his own father a devil for his opposition against Quakerism, he unwittingly revealed "more than he intended" about the source of his behavior (*MC* vii, 25). "Quickly after" Harris stays for the night at another Quaker's house and leaves suddenly to return to his group and goes missing (*IP* 342, cf. *MC* vii, 25). He is found dead near the site where he first became part of the Quaker group, "with three holes like stabs in his throat, and no Tongue in his Head, nor the least sign of it … *such was the end of that Tongue which had the promise of being as the Pen of a ready Writer*" (*IP* 343, *MC* vii, 25). The final sentence shows the same exemplary emplotment as the judgment tales revolving around a curse or invocation of the devil. Taking the speech as a prefiguration of the outcome and relating the sin to the part of the body that committed it, establishes a causal relation between sin and punishment, citing the egregious offense against his own father and that Harris mainly committed blasphemy. In an inversion of the biblical version of prophecy, the promise by the other Quaker turns into a curse and his death appears supernatural. The emplotment is supported by the quick temporal succession of both event and the final remark that reiterates the connection between promise and disappearance of Harris's tongue.

In the ensuing controversy, both groups use strikingly similar narrative strategies to claim that the other is punished by God. Compiling various Quaker tracts against their persecution in New England, George Bishop's *New England Judged* in its 1703 edition uses Cotton Mather's understanding of a judgment to interpret recordings in the *Magnalia* as well as the deaths of the colonial leaders John Norton, John Endicott and Humphrey Adderton as punishments for their religious intolerance. After detailing how they persecuted Quakers in New England, Bishop relates their deaths in a succession of narratives that implies a pattern of divine punishment in the way Ward utilizes the death of drinkers. Bishop is even more explicit in his condemnation by assigning the judgment directly to God: "the Lord cut down Endicott," and George Keith's "Answer to Increase Mather" that is also printed in Bishop's collection relates a similar list of eminent persecutors who suddenly die, among them John Norton and Humphrey Adderton who, "being warned beforehand of the judgment of God, he made light of it" (322; 329). Both, Increase Mather and Bishop are careful to link the fate of the mad Quakers and their brutish persecutors, respectively, to marked passages of speech.

The established congruity between the speech and events highlight, for Quakers, the prophetic gift of their martyrs and for both groups, the providential punishment of the other (cf. Keith 328). Likewise, Bishop refers to the Indian wars as one of the judgments on New England that occurred in consequence of their killing of Quakers, reprinting parts of Cotton Mather's own account in the *Magnalia* in which he acknowledges this war to be a judgment on the colony (cf. 539). Using their dying speeches as prophecies, the text creates parallels between Quaker martyrs and Mather's wording, pointed out in footnotes accompanying quotes from the *Magnalia*. The wars were recognized by Mather and other Puritan historians as judgments as well, but rather for a lack of zeal and faith (cf. *HD* 47-49). According to Richard Dorson who collected these instances of a battle over the interpretative authority of providence, Puritans connected these admitted judgments to different causes (cf. Dorson 1973, 53). As prophesied by Williams and Stevenson, they were "drinking blood" over more than ten years and New Englander captives received whipping and other kinds of torture, much like they had earlier whipped Quakers (cf. Bishop 192, 557). This prefiguration and repetition of elements close the cycle of cause and effect and mark the narratives as providential judgments much like the earlier transatlantic examples; illustrating the various types of text-making and functions connected to judgment plots.

Chapter 2

The Transatlantic Exchange of Providential Plot Patterns and Personal Experience

The following chapter continues the analysis of transatlantic narrative patterns by focusing on complications of their exemplary function in stories of deliverance from shipwreck and captivity. As scholarship on the cultural dimension and implications of captivity and sea deliverance narratives has shown, the consensus necessary to uphold the exemplary function of narrative is dissolving. In response, new narrative strategies emerge that uphold emplotment patterns through commentary and by validating events as first-hand experience. Scholars like Weber, Hall, and Hartman regard tales of captivity and sea deliverance as typical providence tales that can be traced back to medieval exempla, much like the judgments discussed in the previous chapter. However, I argue that the very elements on which the exemplary function of judgments was based, disintegrate in the face of an epistemological and cultural crisis of the belief in providence.

So far, scholars have regarded accounts of shipwreck and captivity as frontier narratives of crossing the ocean or living at the border of settlement (cf. Wharton 4; Hebel 27; Toulouse 90-91). Critics have further highlighted the displacement of the New England Puritans and their exposure to religious influences, such as the Native myths and French Catholicism as subjects of captivity narratives (cf. Ebersole 6; Fitzpatrick 2). This displacement was only one outgrowth of a number of crises challenging New England's ministerial as well as governmental authority from the 1680s onwards. The revocation of the Massachusetts Bay colony's charter in 1684 combined with the pressure to tolerate other religious groups, like the Quakers, Anabaptists, and Anglicans, threatened the ideal of New England as a Puritan outpost and bearer of the Reformation.

Another challenge to that position arose with the spread of Pietistic awakenings from Germany into the Atlantic world. Only recently have scholars started to assess the cross-fertilization of Puritanism and Pietism in North America and the influence of Pietism, for example on the works and the theology of Cotton Mather who embraced Pietism as a

reinvigoration of his own faith and a powerful incentive to do good works (cf. Scheiding 2010, 148; Storm 3). Scholars agree that Pietism and Puritanism share an emphasis on the experiential quality of faith and on leading a holy and serviceable life (cf. Lovelace 37; Stöffler 29). However, Pietism stressed the individual and emotional relationship with God even more and had impressive achievements to recommend itself, from a variety of awakenings to the Moravian missions all across the world, or the center of learning and theology that August Herrmann Francke built in Halle, which Cotton Mather very much admired.[21] The Puritans' place in God's salvation history was further undermined by the insecurity of providential interpretations following the demise of the Puritan reign in England and the Restoration. At the same time, church membership declined even though the 1662 Half-Way Covenant retracted some of its requirements. The influence of the remaining Puritans was further reduced by the influx of secular settlers who did not identify with the particular identity and history as a Godly republic.

The captivity narrative echoes these crises as it revolves around the roles of women and the threat of Native American warfare. The bloody war with the Native American confederation lead by King Philip also undermined the earlier purpose of missionizing and led to a North American actualization of the captivity tale. While the sea deliverance has been traced back to the ancient voyages of the *Iliad,* the captivity echoes similar stories of warfare but also a contemporary phenomenon recorded by French Jesuits, Spanish explorers and British mariners held captive in the Mediterranean, the so called "Barbary captivity" (cf. Gould, see Baepler's anthology for examples). Other challenges to the patriarchal order of New England religious and political elites were also coming from within. Feminist criticism has focused on the roles of women in New England and among the Native Americans and how this reflects in relating the captivity experience (cf. Castiglia, Ulrich). As far as plot is concerned, both captivities and sea deliverance are based on the archetypal plot pattern of the ritual passage that entails a transformation of the character and can be extended into the tripartite structure of isolation, transformation and return or, voyage, near destruction and safe arrival, respectively and contain exemplary plot patterns to a lesser extent (cf. VanDerBeets xiv; Wharton 16).

At the core of both types of deliverances is the Calvinist belief in an omnipotent God who willingly acts on behalf of his people. Within the theological framework of

---

[21] For the other subjects of Mather's correspondence with August Hermann Francke, see Scheiding 2010.

predestination, the experience of divine deliverances is generally a token of believers, as in the biblical precedent of Israel. Using David's Psalm 107 as a blueprint and complementing his remarks on divine judgments, Calvin establishes a pattern of God's deliverance of his people, anticipating many of the incidents recorded by the colonists in theme and structure:

> God, in a wondrous manner, often brings sudden and unexpected succour to the miserable when almost on the brink of despair, whether in protecting them …, or supplying them with food when famishing for want, or delivering them when captive from iron fetters and foul dungeons, or conducting them safe into harbour after ship wreck … the Psalmist, after bringing forward examples of this description, infers that those things which men call fortuitous events, are so many proofs of divine providence. (Calvin i, 56)

The passage from the *Institutes of the Christian Religion* does not only describe a number of possible scenarios of divine intervention but also uses the Bible as a reference to interpret the believers' experience. By giving a range of possible scenarios that already entail captivity and the deliverance from dangers at sea, similar rescues in later ages can be more easily recognized as acts of divine providence.

Calvin's summary of the Bible passage already entails a narrative structure of the deliverance that is similar to the exemplary emplotment of judgments: they are "sudden and unexpected" and answer the respective need of the "miserable," drawing attention to the fact that God's action is motivated by sympathy and love. The quote not only establishes the theological basis for the recognition of providential patterns in human experience but also for the affirmation of the divine agency in the face of rival concepts, such as fortune (cf. also Calvin i, 172-73; Walsham 73). While these typological relationships can be expressed through a variety of means, biblical stories become models for relating experiences in the New World as providences.

Yet Calvin's model for deliverances encounters difficulties when the chosen emplotment is incongruent with the events recounted or not appropriate for their complexity. Through the focus on local events known to the majority of the audience, contesting interpretations and controversy over the meaning of providence can arise. My analysis will focus on how New English authors limit complexity and ambiguous meanings and clarify their intentions. Can emplotments adapt to ambiguity and in which contexts do they lose their explanatory function?

God's Universal History and Deliverance Narratives

While many of the exemplary judgments first appeared in religious texts, exempla of God's mercy and help towards believers can be mainly found in historical and personal records. Similar to judgments, favorable divine interventions are subject to political as well as religious interpretations. Nicholas Guyatt defines political providentialism as a link between the beliefs in God's continuing dispensation of justice, i.e. punishing sinners and rewarding saints, and his plan for the universal salvation of the world. In narrative, these two poles represent the individual and the community level, which could be a nation, such as England or a specific religious or social group, such as the Puritan Separatists or a specific colonial endeavor. "Between these two understanding of God's role in the world—the belief that he meted out justice in the lives of individuals and that he was choreographing a grader drama though the events of prophecy—lay national providentialism" (Guyatt 16). In this universal drama, commentators have often claimed a special role for their group or country, which Guyatt describes of one of the consequences of viewing history as providential. In England, the surprising victory of the Spanish armada gave rise to beliefs in a special role as chosen nation against the Catholic Anti-Christ.

Specific events and their interpretation as providential interventions played an important role in hinting at God's larger plan of universal salvation. The belief in providence as a "semiological system" to understand the universe and God's plan was further undermined by the failure of Cromwell's commonwealth in which so many providential interpretations and rhetoric had been invested. This experience lead to a more weary and cautious stance (cf. Obenland 87, 92). Nicholas Guyatt documents the skeptical stance towards the human ability to correctly interpret signs of providence especially in times of upheaval and with the limited reach of human perception for example in John Wilkins 1649 *Discourse on the Beauty of Providence* and Stephen Charnock's 1680 *Treatise of Divine Providence* that have called providence unfathomable and not easily to be interpreted (cf. 42). While this uncertainty has already been affirmed by Calvin, Increase Mather summarizes the paradoxical approach to providence in Puritanism, when he calls it on the one hand unfathomable and on the other hand as clear communications by God: "men are apt to misapply the unsearchable Judgments of God, … and wicket Papists have done the like …Nevertheless, a Judgment may be so circumstanced as that the displeasure of Heaven is plainly written upon it, in legible Characters" (*IP* 338-39, cf. 340-41). Mather is careful to distinguish between political applications, such as the Catholic use of the death of Zwingli

as a judgment against Protestants and the fact that God is punishing sins on earth and that these cases can be observed and recognized. While England witnessed a demise of providential rhetoric, New England continued its use and interpretation as colonists started to conceive God's involvement with the colonists separately from his dealings with England (cf. Guyatt 42).

The accounts in Edward Johnson's *A History of New England or Wonderworking Providence of Sion's Savior* (1654) and Cotton Mather's *Magnalia* seek to establish New England's place in God's universal history using the same understanding of providence spanning over fifty years. In contrast to England, New Englanders show an unfazed trust in providential communications as a sign of New England's status as a chosen people and a harbinger of world Reformation. What Reiner Smolinski summarizes as "cherished paradigms in the scholarship on American Puritanism" are expectations for a special role in bringing about the millennium and that New England would be the place of the New Jerusalem (1995, 6). Smolinski demonstrates how Cotton Mather's eschatological theories changed over the years and whereas he adhered to the prophetic role of New England laid out by his father, he was less determined in *Triparadisus* (1727) after Increase Mather's death (cf. 1995, 6). Despite this changeability, Johnson and Cotton Mather both document God's providential care towards New England for an English audience as they published their histories in London. By using providences as their main support, they also express faith in the epistemological possibility to discern God's plan through them and "anchored the meaning of historical events in the divine order of the universe" (Obenland 87).

Yet, Johnson and Mather both write at times of crisis or exterior criticism, defending New England's place in God's plan for salvation from criticism or oblivion, respectively. Johnson starts out with connecting specific events in New England history with providential care or specific interventions in response to prayer and consequently establishes a pattern of God's favor towards the settlers. The first paragraph of chapter 27, titled "Of the gratious Goodnesse of God" already summarizes the following narratives in Johnson's *History*:

> Here againe the admirable Providence of the Lord is to be noted, That whereas the Country is naturally subject to drought, even to the withering of their summers Fruits, the Lord was pleased, during these years of scarcity, to blesse that small quantity of Land they planted with seasonable showers, and that many times to the great admiration of the Heathen (*WP* 86)

Throughout his typological history of New England as a present-day Israel, Johnson calls attention to the "admirable Providence of the Lord" which is to be "noted" like the judgments discussed earlier. Johnson's opening emphasizes that the following narrative is

representative of the many times God has helped New Englanders. Contrary to exemplary judgments, these narratives show God as an actor who responds to the believers' prayer and intervenes on their behalf through special providences. So, while the land is "naturally subject to drought," God let it rain repeatedly to secure the food of the first generation of settlers (*WP* 86). At the same time, these narratives send this message to critics as well as English Nonconformists for whom New England is to be a model. For this purpose, Johnson's narrative operates on three levels to address New England's position and mission in God's universal plan. In this respect "To the great admiration of the Heathen" mirrors the biblical distinction between heathens and Israelites and more specifically the wonders performed by God in the desert that demonstrate his power to the various peoples of a different faith that Israel encounters during its wanderings.[22] At the same time, the parenthetical reference to the sun shining more constantly than in England implies an English readership to which the origin of a drought has to be made plausible (cf. *WP* 86).

Reminiscent of Israel in the desert, the deliverance shows the intimate relationship between God and the New Englanders through a dialogic pattern of action and reaction and temporal compression. As the first part in a series of causally connected events, the drought is perceived as an act of God: "Beholding the Hand of the Lord stretched out against them, like tender hearted Children, they fell down on their knees, begging mercy of the Lord" (*WP* 86). Contrary to the events interpreted as judgments, Johnson does not disclose what this act of God might signify nor do the colonists attempt to decipher the cause of it. Still, they react to it as if personally reproved, begging for mercy and thereby mirroring the basic relationship between the believer and God in Calvinism (cf. Calvin iii, 527). Predestination holds that salvation depends entirely on being elected by God, and puts God into an active role while rendering humans passive recipients of mercy or anger. Reacting to the drought as a sign of God's discipline, the colonists respond by praying, asking God to transform the punishment into mercy and thereby alter the narrative pattern.

> [They] fell down on their knees, begging mercy of the Lord, for their Saviours sake, urging this as a chiefe argument, that the malignant adversary would rejoyce in their destruction, and blaspheme the pure Ordinances of Christ, and in uttering these words, their eyes dropped down many teares, their affections prevailing so strong, that they could not refraine in the Church-Assembly. (*WP* 86)

Johnson portrays both, the rational argumentation of the prayer in indirect discourse and its

---

[22] See, for example, Leviticus 26:45 "But I will for their sakes remember the covenant of their ancestors, whom I brought forth out of the land of Egypt in the sight of the heathen, that I might be their God: I am the LORD"

emotional fervor through additional description. Citing the arguments of Moses' intercession for the Israelites in the dessert, Johnson creates a biblical parallel that is sustained through much of his history (cf. Exodus 32:12; cf. Arch 58). When God is short of forsaking the Israelites because of their repeated rebellion and disobedience, Moses reminds God of his promises and how Israel's enemies would revel in the downfall of his chosen people.[23] With this argument, Moses managed to avoid Israel's destruction in one of the many typological references, by which Johnson "revises" New England's history by aligning it to Israel's, exchanging the Egyptians with "the malignant adversary," either the devil himself or the opponents of the Reformation. The parallels are extended by the fact that God provides food for Israel when they pray for it and that during their wandering the manna fell each night together with the dew over their camp (cf. Numeri 11:9). Like Israel in the desert, the New England "Wilderness-People" are sustained by God's intervention and provision (*WP* 87). Yet, while Johnson relates the communal history of New England to God's dealing with his people Israel, he also focuses on the relationship between individual believers and God.

Accordingly, Johnson shows how God's general care for New England does not only extend to their provision but also their spiritual state. Here, the humble reaction to what is perceived as God's hand and the colonist's fervent prayer comply with the conventions of spiritual biographies and conversion narratives that show their intimate relationship with God. The "internal affectations" like contrition and repentance, again, are one of the hallmarks of salvation, from the experience of conversion to the remorse and fear of God when facing one's sins, as described in Calvin's *Institutes* and Mather's *Terribilia Dei* (cf. 17-19). This leads to the interpretation as a double deliverance which Johnson renders in indirect speech: "[B]ut at this these poore wormes were so exceedingly taken, that the Lord should show himselfe so neere unto their Prayers, that as the drops from Heaven fell thicker, and faster, so the teares from their eyes by reason of the sudden mixture of joy and sorrow" (*WP* 87). The rescue from potential starvation coincides with the development of a humble and devoted heart, for Puritans a sign of salvation (cf. Calvin iii, 527). The image of the believer's tears mingling with the rain further demonstrates the near simultaneity of prayer and answer. Metaphorically drawn together in the parallel movements of bowing and rising

---

[23] After returning with the tables of the law, Moses finds the Israelites worshiping a golden calf. Calling them "a stiffnecked people," the Lord talk to Moses about extinguishing them. "And Moses besought the LORD his God, and said, LORD, … Wherefore should the Egyptians speak, and say, For mischief did he bring them out, to slay them in the mountains, and to consume them from the face of the earth?" (Exodus 32:9-12) Reminding the Lord also of his previous promises to the forefathers, Moses manages to avert destruction from Israel and reminds them of this situation in Deuteronomy 9:13-14.

and crying and raining, prayer and deliverance form a dialogical sequence. Their presentation is reminiscent of the repeated formulations that show the congruity between sin and punishment in Cotton Mather's exemplary judgments (cf. *TD* 36).

The narrative compression of time and events continues as, in seemingly immediate reaction to their fervent and emotional prayers, God sends rain to alleviate the drought and ships that replenish their stocks and bring new settlers, among them, leading Puritan minsters. Though it is unlikely that the two occurred together, repeated formulations intimate the close temporal sequence and result in a compression of narrative time. The colonists, earlier identified as God's army, falling "down on their knees" to pray is taken up a few paragraphs later: "These people now rising from their knees to receive the rich mercies of Christ, in the refreshed fruits of the Earth, Behold the Sea also bringing in whole Ship-loads of mercies, more being filled with fresh forces, for furthering this wonderful worke of Christ." (*WP* 87). The passage follows the movement of the people bowing down to pray but literally, as they get up, they receive what they prayed for and more. The metaphor of movement connects prayer and answer, a device that is repeated in an address to his readers to "admire … the Grace of Christ … for as they poured out water before the Lord, so at that very instant, the Lord showred down water on their Gardens and Fields" (*WP* 86). In this sentence, water acquires two subsequent meanings that immediately follow upon each other in the same sentence and are symbolic of, first, the deep devotion and fervent prayers of the people and, secondly, the divine deliverance. The metaphorical conflation of tears being shed and rain falling culminates in that "very instant," rendering the rain an immediate reaction to prayer and even mingling with the people's tears and intimating a causal connection between the two.

In addition, the outward effect of the deliverance extends to the Native Americans as well as to Nonconformists in England, showing that New England is fulfilling its potential. Through the emplotment as an exemplary intervention and direct communication between God and his faithful, the narrative illustrates New England's special role, both as a divine envoy as well as a place where believers develop grace. Firstly, as Johnson's *History* was published in London, it was geared at a wider audience and addressees his readers directly: "Here admire and be strong in the Grace of Christ, all you that hopefully belong unto him" and uses the episode as a testimonial for God's power and response to his believers. At the same time, the deliverance is observed by the Native Americans and is, therefore, conducive to New England's efforts at converting them. The narrative demonstrates that God cares for New England and that it is fulfilling its prophetic potential both as a community that grows

in faith and as a beacon of God among 'heathen' Native populations and other Christians. Johnson thereby counters criticism of a lack of faith and purpose in the settlements. As a result, the narrative becomes exemplary in two ways, at once twisting the emplotment of earlier judgments to show God acting on behalf of his people and illustrating Johnson's argument that New England is fulfilling its calling as a harbinger of the Reformation and Christianity to both the Native Americans and the English.

The chapter contains two interpolated narratives that are triggered by the believers' prayers, starting with the one above and leading into an account of newly arriving settlers, among them eminent Puritan leaders from England. Its title "Of the gratious goodness of God" applies in three ways, to the personal sanctification of New Englanders as well as to their sustained provision with food and settlers who would later assume leadership roles. This train of thought is sustained by the narrative leading over to a new wave of immigration, among them notable Puritan divines. According to Johnson, the colonist's prayer results in a further act of God who "seeing his poor people's hearts were too narrow to beg, his bounty exceeds them at this time … not onely giving the full of their requests, but beyond all their thoughts, as witnesse his great worke in England of late, in which the prayers of Gods people in New England have had a great stroke" (*WP* 87). Johnson describes what William Hooke would later see as the "most effective weapon" of New England to further the "great worke in England of late," namely to pray (cf. Guyatt 31, *WP* 87). The arrivals of major Puritan figures from England fall together with the arrival of rain and combine to form the answer to the colonists' prayer. Closing the metaphorical circle of movement opened by the beginning of the chapter, the colonists rise and simultaneously harvest the "refreshed fruits of the Earth" that they have been praying for.

Johnson extends this causal relationship even further by stating that the colonists receive mercy in excess of what they asked for: rain as well as "Ship-loades of mercies" represented by the arrival of eminent Puritan ministers, "the famous servant of Christ, grave godly and judicious Hooker, … and also the Reverend and much desired Mr. John Cotton" (*WP* 87). For Johnson in 1633, "great worke in England of late", can only mean the rise of Puritanism in England despite its oppression by Anglican authorities that worsened with the ascension of Charles I and his restrictive religious policies (*WP* 87, cf. Guyatt 13-14). Thomas Hooker and John Cotton headed flourishing Puritan ministries and fled to New England to evade repression and persecution by Archbishop William Laud (cf. Guyatt 26-27). Along with other Puritan ministers mentioned by Johnson, they commit to living in New England as they were "coming with their young, and with their old, and with their whole

substance, to do … service in this Desart wildernesse" (*WP* 87-88). In a time when many still debated whether New England was the right place to settle as a Puritan and what its part in God's plan was, Johnson is eager to show the definite commitment of leading Puritans by interpreting their coming as an answer to the colonist's prayers and omitting the religious persecution in England. At the same time, the conflation of the "Desert-wilderness" metaphorically links New England to wandering Israel and the famous and numerous immigrants, arriving through divine action, show not only the close relationship between believers in New England and God but also the special purpose he intends for them (88). In Johnson's words, "The Lord was pleased to set such a broad Seale to their Commission … by his Providence in adding such able instruments for furthering his great worke of Reformation, and advancing the Kingdome of Christ" (*WP* 89). References to providence bracket the beginning and the end of the chapter and demonstrate that the narrative devices used in fact correlate with or describe the way God is acting.

The narrative structure of the deliverance that acts out a dialogue between the believers and God is continued from the specific instant in the beginning to the general issue of immigration and the return in thankfulness at the end of the section. While the borders of the narrative episode are fluent and it is interrupted, for example by Johnson's address to English believers or his explanations, it nevertheless provides the pattern that for the whole chapter through its various metaphorical reiterations and links the initial prayer to the arrival of rain as well as the "fresh forces" (*WP* 87). Especially in its use of metaphorical conflation of tears and rain, the movement of bowing and rising, Johnson's use of language underscores the temporal compression and causal link of prayer and answer and introduces God as an actor on behalf of New England believers.

William Hubbard's *General History of New England* (1677) likewise relates examples of God providing for New England but drops the dialogic relationship between the two and the spiritual dimension for the settlers. Instead of a deliverance from need, Hubbard stresses the direct intervention of God to supply his New England people with food in accordance with Old Testament examples. Describing the various supplies of nature in the sea and the woods, Hubbard concludes that "[t]hus were they fed immediately by the hand of Providence in a manner almost like as was Elijah by the ravens and Israel in the wilderness" (80). Using the same typological relations as Johnson, Hubbard establishes New England's position as a prophetic chosen people but drops the prayer and answer that mark exemplary deliverances in and Johnson's history. While Hubbard's account of King Philip's war in the same year, *Narrative of the Troubles with the Indians* (1677), "displays a growing

skeptical awareness" of providential interpretations, his history of New England still regards incidents like the above as a signs of the partiality of providence in the colonist's favor (Engler and Scheiding 18-19, cf. Winship 1996, 19-21).

Similarly, Cotton Mather's *Magnalia* uses a wide range of sources to compile examples of God's mercy that follow the reduction and emplotment of earlier exempla. Drawing on his father's *Illustrious Providences* and incidents circulating orally, the *Magnalia* is full of preservations from injuries, the dangers of war, captivity and the sea:

> An honest Carpenter being at work upon an House, when Eight Children were sitting in a Ring at some childish Play on the Floor below [as] he let fall accidentally from an upper Story, a bulky Piece of Timber just over these little Children. The Good Man, with inexpressible Agony, cry'd out, O Lord direct it, and the Lord did so direct it, that it fell on End in the Midst of the little Children, and then canted along on the Floor between two of the Children, without ever touching one of them all. But the Instances of Such Things would be numberless. And if I should with a most Religious Veracity, relate what Wounds many Persons have survive'd, I should puzzle Philosophy and make her some Recourse unto Divinity. (*MC* vi, 10)

The narrative characterizes the carpeter by his profession and as a good man, using the same type of allegorical epithets as the judgments against drunkards or swearers. The stark compression of time between accident, prayer and the preservation of the children, mark the latter as a work of God and establish a causal relation between the prayer of "a good man" and God's answer, stressing the direct and dialogic relationship to God by showing that he acts on the believer's petition. This adaptation of the exemplary judgment pattern is stressed by the introductory paragraph of the chapter in which Mather announces to relate how "[r]emarkable Answers of Prayer have been receiv'd" (*MC* vi, 9). This dialogic relationship between man and God replaces the mechanistic order of the judgment narrative. While the causality between sin and punishment as well as God's agency remains implicit in many of the judgment tales, God becomes an actor in the deliverance narrative as "the Lord did so direct" the wood (*MC* vi, 10). The deliverance narrative thereby remedies the portrayal of providence as a "precise mechanism" rather than divine initiative and rejects rival notions of fortune, fate or folkloric beliefs that still play a role in judgment tales (Walsham 80, cf. 20-23). While this pattern already constitutes an interpretation of events, the deliverance seeks to lay open how God reacts to prayer as other ways to account for it are not possible (cf. *MC* vi, 10). Instead of the clear relationship between sin and punishment established by the temporal or thematic congruity of the sentence, the narrative offers several reasons for God's intervention without highlighting a specific one.

While the events are reported by a third person omniscient voice, the commentary that follows the narrative switches to the first person. What Monika Fludernik calls "observational narrative" applies to the way the reader learns about the events in Mather's deliverance which concentrates on the external while emphasizing a few key emotional scenes (1996, 58). On the one hand, the narrative constructs a scene that invites emotional identification with the "Agony" of the carpenter who helplessly watches the timber drop on the "little Children" and can do nothing but pray (*MC* vi, 10). These instances highlight Cotton Mather's use of focalization as the third person narrative voice portrays events from the point of view of the carpenter along with his emotional reaction. On the other hand, the narrative speed slows only at this point of culmination and the carpenter's emotions, as well as the events themselves, are only summarized by the narrator to stress their typical and exemplary nature. In the sentences following the narrative, Mather quickly moves from the individual to the general qualities of this deliverance, emphasizing that there are numerous similar cases and also hinting at the purpose for relating them (cf. *MC* vi, 9).

As the "General Preface" indicates, Mather conceives the *Magnalia* as a collection of "the Wonders of Christian Religion" in New England (*MC* n.pag.). Through the use of exemplary plot patterns, his history relates each individual narrative to other instances of divine favor and transforms it into an emotional and spiritual experience of the reader. The embedding in a series of similar events, not quoted here, establishes this dialogic pattern as a typical way of God acting on behalf of his New England faithful. Like the biographies earlier in the *Magnalia*, the chapter carries a Latin motto which roughly translates: "to have been saved and sustained will always be the greatest part of my well-being."[24] Mather opens the chapter by emphasizing both, the exceptional quality of God's interventions and their number: "How many *Extraordinary Salvations*, have been granted unto particular Persons, among that good People, a small Volume could not enumerate" (*MC* vi, 9). The italicized 'extraordinary' is set off against the 'particular Persons' who belong to a larger group and are not further characterized, as for example the founding fathers whose life is represented as a string of providences or extraordinary events. Like the exemplary judgment, Mather's introductory remarks anticipate the narrative of the deliverance to establish a pattern that can be tested as if it were an empirical principle: "How many Thousands have upon very notable Experiments been able to say, This Poor Man cried, and the Lord heard and save'd

[24] Pars mihi semper erit, servari velle salutis Maxima (*MC* vi, 9), I owe the translation to Maximilian Meinhardt.

him!" *(MC* vi, 9). God's ability and willingness to help are illustrated through the dialogic relation of prayer and answer, as the man "cried" and God "heard and save'd". For Mather, however, "notable Experiments" refer to the personal experience of earnest prayer and communion with God, as described in Silverman's biography (cf. 30-31, 56-57). So, the narrative emerges not only as a causal connection of events but also as a rendering of religious experience, which means, according to Lovelace, to participate in God's life (Lovelace 147-48).

This experience is, on the one hand, personal and connected to prayer and the direct relationship with God and, on the other hand, empirically verified as a typical reaction by God to prayer. Yet, with their allegorical reduction and third person narration, the narratives disclose too little of the consciousness of the man to be called experiential according to Fludernik's definition that "[n]arrativity can emerge from the experiential portrayal of dynamic event sequences … but can also consist in the experiential depiction of human consciousness" (cf. Fludernik 1996, 22). Also, the portrayal of emotions, like "Agony," does not extend beyond their mentioning and mirrors how Erich Auerbach defined biblical narrative as excluding everything that is not necessitated by the plot (cf. 1953, 7). What remains is the stereotypical quality of the plot that establishes the providential pattern and induces reactions in the reader. While the judgment tale illustrated the authority of the Bible by quoting certain maxims or warnings from it, deliverances as recorded by Mather and other contemporary writers reverse this logic of authorization by establishing a narrative pattern from which they conclude God's acting in favor of New England. So, narratives of individual deliverances demonstrate God's continuing favor and plan for the colony, which Mather has established in the biographies of the founding fathers that stand at the beginning of the *Magnalia*. Dorothy Baker argues that Mather establishes the trajectory of a divine mission by linking the founding fathers with deliverances experienced by ordinary individuals of present-day New England (c f. 15-16).

The transmission of narratives from a providence collection into such a type of history can be observed in Cotton Mather's practice to adapt and combine narratives from different sources. He records the recovery of Abigail Eliot that first appeared in his father's collection *Illustrious Providences*. A young child from a well-known Puritan family, Abigail's skull was hurt so that her brain protruded. Yet she survives without any physical impairment and gives birth to multiple children, as the *Magnalia* underscores (cf. vi, 10). First recorded as a two-page long narrative in *Illustrious Providences*, Cotton Mather' summary places it in a list of similar events. Preserving the outlines of the case but omitting

the debate and details of the surgical treatment, Cotton Mather uses Abigail Eliot's case to show how possible harm is prevented without explicitly mentioning providence. While Increase Mather introduces his narrative as a "Remarkable … Preservation and Restauration which the gracious providence of God vouchsafed to Abigail Eliot;" the *Magnalia* focuses immediately on the accident (*IP* 33; cf. *MC* vi, 11). Again, while both end with similar statements about her continuous mental health and motherhood, Increase Mather includes a parenthetical comment that calls the preservation "marvelous" (*IP* 34; cf. *MC* vi, 11).

Outside of the New England use of providential narrative patterns, the *Jesuit Relations*, written between 1610 and 1791 by Catholic missionaries in the French colonies, follow a different narrative structure and interpretation of a 'remarkable' deliverance. During their missionary work among the Hurons and Iroquois, Jerome Lalement records in 1640 "an occurrence which many have considered remarkable" (69). A Native mother dies shortly after giving birth and her baby is taken up by its grandmother and breastfed. "This good old woman took the child, and offered it her withered breast. The child, by dint of pulling at it, caused the milk to return, so that the grandmother nourished it for more than a year" (Lalement 69). While the narrative has all the signs of a providence narrative, it omits all references to God's active intervention in nature's course. Contrary to the embedding in a providential frame or as a proof of God's support of their missionary work, Lalement interprets this incident only reluctantly as an act of God and does not connect it to the Jesuit activities. "Nature uses strange devices to preserve itself; or, rather, he who guides it is a great Master" (69). While the French Jesuits attribute a similar power of intervention to God and also trace several misfortunes back to his will, they represent these incidents in a less systematic and paradigmatic way than the emplotment types used by New England Puritans. In contrast to the Calvinist notion of special providence that can be used as an admonition or to document divine favor, this general notion of God as master of the universe lacks the emplotment that allows a direct application or spiritual reaction. Mirroring their different and less direct theological understanding of providence, the Jesuits record different kinds of curiosities without the added import of being divine communications that led Puritans to develop their own narrative strategies for patterning and using these instances in their personal life as well as in public history and preaching. In contrast to the use of judgment narratives in sermons, the plot pattern of divine deliverances has been developed in historical accounts from New England.

Journals like Hull's and Winthrop's already combine the plot of judgments with the function of illustrating God's acting on behalf of His elected community. As they also record

individual cases of preservation, both emplotment types mix in journals along with their functions. For example, in February 1641, John Winthrop records an accident on a Salem shipyard in his journal:

> The shipwright at Salem, through want of care of his tackle, etc. occasioned the death of one Baker, who was desired with five or six more to help hale up a piece of timber, which, the rope breaking, fell down upon them. The rest by special providence were saved. This Baker, going forth in the morning very well, after he had prayed, told his wife he should see her no more, though he could not foresee any danger towards him. (*J* 345)

In content similar to Mather's story and adding the aspect of the premonition, the narrative's different embedding also influences its function. At first glance, Winthrop's narrative continues the exemplary emplotment of a deliverance juxtaposing the accident with a divine preservation. The characters remain interchangeable except for God who assumes an active role and is named by the third person narrator. However, the closing sentence, as well as the embedding paragraph, introduce thematic contexts that go beyond the exemplary demonstration of divine preservation. As in other places throughout his journal, Winthrop embeds a short narration in a larger passage on some historical development in the colony that is stated in more general terms. The present paragraph deals with the consequences of the Puritan domination of the British Parliament and financial problems of the colony: "The general fear of want of foreign commodities, now our money was gone, and things were like to go well in England set us on work to provide shipping of our own" (*J* 345).

In the following, Winthrop describes shipbuilding efforts in Salem that proceed amidst financial difficulties when the accident related above happens. The divine preservation supports the encouraging sign of colonial entrepreneurship and service to the public. At the same time, God kindly warned Baker of what was going to happen in a likewise supernatural manner, as the phrase that "he could not foresee any danger towards him" indicates. So, the narrative is not a punishment for sin but an evidence for faith in the unseen hand of God who has an individual's life but also the community in his hand. Also, the shipwright's "want of care" is not continued as a plot line, for example through an investigation or as a divine punishment. Providence submerses those other plot lines or possibilities and appears as more of a mystery: while Winthrop affirms that God's will is manifest in everything that happens he does not offer any explanations or establishes causal links for Baker's death other than the neglected state of the rope. Winthrop's "special providence" therefore relates solely to the fact that God preserved five people and communicated his will to Baker beforehand, turning an accident into the occasion of a believer called home to heaven. In the context of the embedding paragraph, the outcome

encourages the work of shipbuilding, which was an entrepreneurial feat under difficult circumstances but for the good of the colony in Winthrop's view.

Simliar to Winthrop's communal history, other journals or memorials embed narratives of providential deliverances not into God's dealing with the community but into the context of an individual conversion plot. John Dane's "A declaration of remarkable providences in the Course of my lyfe" (1682) is a spiritual autobiography and personal memoir that retrospectively narrates Dane's conversion and move to New England through several stages that are given as narrative episodes. Among them is the following deliverance, in which Dane miraculously encounters a flock of geese that saves his family from starving.

> [Once] upon a time we were in some present want in the family, and my wife told me she had nothing for the children. She desired me to take my gun and see if I could get nothing. And I did go; … I thought the providence of God seemed to tell me that I should not go out today. So I returned back again with my pig; and when I came within less than forty rods of my house a company of great gray geese came over me, and I shot and brought down a gallant goose in the very nick of time. (Dane 18)

Dane reports of God's divine providence as leading his way back to the house where he encounters the fowl that he could not find in the forest. In contrast to Mather's listing of preservations in the *Magnalia*, God intervenes and communicates with Dane and becomes an actor in the narrative. Still, Dane is not supernaturally provided with food but merely guided to richer hunting grounds.

In relating a dangerous episode from his voyage to New England in his diary, the Puritan minister Thomas Shepard uses the theological concept of special providence to describe how God intervenes supernaturally and relates this to the salvation of the whole ship. When the ship is only a few miles out at sea, a contrary wind pushes it towards a sand bank. "The ship did grate upon the sands and was in great danger, but the Lord directed one man to cut some cable or rope in the ship, and so she [the ship] was turned about" (Shepard 60). Similar to Dane's narrative, the ship is saved by humans directed by God. Yet, Shepard also acknowledges that God intervenes directly in the following episode: "a wonderful, miraculous providence did appear to us, for one of the seamen, that he might save the vessel, fell in … and was given for dead and gone" (Shepard 60). Yet an hour later, "they came and found him floating upon the waters, never able to swim but supported by a divine hand all the while" (Shepard 60). Here, God's "hand" suspends natural law by keeping the mariner afloat against all odds until the ship's crew can rescue and resuscitate him. Like medieval exempla, this narrative does not characterize its characters and follows chronology and a simple trajectory of the plot with the usual reversal worked by divine help.

At the same time, Shepard relates this individual salvation to the ship at large. “And so the Lord showed us his great power, whereupon a godly man in the ship then said: This man’s danger and deliverance is a type of ours … the Lord’s power should be shown in saving us” (Shepard 60). While typology was a method for relating events from the New to the Old Testament, this use of the term extends the analogy from the Bible to the everyday experience of the believer. Thus, the relationship between a single story and a larger narrative pattern is made obvious in private as well as public histories. Still, all of these narratives deviate from the adaptation of the exemplary pattern used by Johnson and Mather as they drop the dialogical relationship between prayer and answer. Instead, the individual salvations become part of patterns peculiar to each record: John Dane demonstrates God’s provision as part of a pattern of continuing preservation, from sin as well as from starving, Thomas Shepard sees the hand of God in the deliverance of an individual and a ship and John Winthrop frames the relatively mild accident as a mark of God’s approval for the colony. While their functions are similar to patterns drawn from biblical and historical sources, for example in Thomas Beard’s *Theatre*, the short narratives from journals foreground personal experience as the source for their authentication rather than their exemplariness throughout history.

Perception and Narrative Mediation in Sea Deliverances

Shepard’s diary is exemplary for all historical, biographical and personal records that narrate the passage across the Atlantic that has been named the first frontier the settlers encountered on their way to the colonies (cf. Wharton 4). Donald P. Wharton emphasizes the unparalleled length and hazard of the Atlantic passage that transcends previous naval experience and required a new conceptualization of the relationship between colony and mother country. Contrary to navigation of European waters to reach the English territories in Malta or Ireland, Atlantic passages took at least six weeks and in addition to the hazards of weather and sea faring in largely unchartered waters in general, they involved the danger of attacks through pirates or Spanish and French ships due to the volatile relationships between these nations and their competing colonial endeavors (cf. Wharton 3). This is not only evident in many printed sea deliverances but also in their recourse to classical myths to find a precedent for this new experience. Starting with the journals of Christoph Columbus, the Atlantic voyage reverberates with allusions to the mythical travels of Ulysses or Jason and the Argonauts, as “individual’s fortitude and initiative might be pitted against great risks and

dangers in the quest of great rewards" (Wharton 3). At the same time, they are conceived through the eyes of contemporary culture and literature, which explains the religious references and interpretation of events as divine interventions (cf. Wharton 3). In New England sea deliverance narratives, this emphasis on individual action exists side by side with divine interventions and establishes part of the subjective qualities that these narratives possess and that sometimes overshadow their religious pragmatic function.

In *A History of New England*, Johnson devotes three chapters on the Atlantic passage and uses them to address New England's eschatological role. With his emphasis on God's agency "in carrying his People … through the largest Ocean in the World," Johnson details the preparations and costs of passage in chapter xiii, followed by a chapter devoted to the voyage and already hinting at the "wonderfull preservation of Christ" that deals with selected events of the passage in a climactic sequence. Johnson relates how the *Arbella* espies four boats, apparently in pursuit and prepares for a fight. Yet, the approaching ships turn out to be their countrymen and friends at which they greatly rejoiced, seeing the good hand of their God was upon them." This episode has interior effects as the Puritans are "further strengthened in Faith" and also demonstrates to their outward critics that God himself is taking them to New England as his "Armies," a reoccurring metaphor throughout Johnson's history (*WP* 56, 58). Accordingly, the next chapter interrupts the chronological account of the voyage to address "all People, Nations and Languages" to show how God has "hath done such admirable Acts for these poore shrubs" who are "advancing the Kingdome of Christ" (*WP* 58). Through a number of typological relations to Israel, the Puritan emigrants are described as "forerunners of Christs Army," stemming the tide of Godlessness and sin that has overtaken all other nations of the world (*WP* 60). Metaphorically identified as "poore shrubs" or "worms" in another case, Johnson characterizes the Puritans as passive and powerless (*WP* 60). Their prayers or desperation merely provide the background for God's acting, also highlighting the fact that it is his work and the Puritans merely possess the right attitude and faith to become his chosen instruments. Given the evidence of providential interventions in the following chapters, Johnson asks his readers to decide "whether the Lord hath not sent this people to Preach in the Wilderness and to proclaime to all Nations, the neere approach of the most wonderfull workes that ever the Sonnes of men saw" (61). The last chapter of the sequence, titled "Of the admirable Acts of Christs Providence, in delivering his people in their Voyages by Sea, from many foule dangers" Johnson's *Wonderworking Providence* presents individual sea deliverance narratives, intertwining communal and individual history.

Johnson blends the overwhelming number of ships that safely reached American shores with the dangers they faced individually in differently elaborated narratives. From his own experience of narrowly escaping a pirate attack, Johnson moves on to the general statement that none of the ships was ever shot at by a pirate (cf. *WP* 61). When enumerating other dangers, like leaks, unchartered waters, and impeded sight, Johnson reverses this pattern by introducing a particular situation with a general statement. "Their deliverance from leakes also hath been no lesse wonderfull, some so neare sinking, that the loving affection betweene Husband and Wife, hath caused them to fould each other in their Armes, with Resolution to die together, … yet not ceasing to call on the Lord, their present helpe in time of need" (*WP* 34-35). By focusing on the emotional reaction of the Puritans on board, Johnson heightens the danger as well as the ensuing deliverance. He subsequently emphasizes God's agency in not only preserving the ships but even steering them: "their Pilots missing ofttimes of their skill on those unwandered Coasts, but their Jehovah hee misses not to be an exact Pilot in the most thickest fogge and darkest nights, for thus it befell" (*WP* 61). Personified as the "exact Pilot" God performs what the captain cannot accomplish: steer the ship through unknown and dangerous waters with low visibility.

In the ensuing narrative, an intense fog impedes the vision and leads a ship's crew to believe they are meeting another ship when indeed they are surrounded by rocks. "With much terror and affrightment, they turned the Ship about, expecting every moment to be dasht in pieces against the Rocks. But he whose providence brought them in. Piloted them out againe, without any danger" (*WP* 61). Johnson emphasizes the fright and subjectivity of the people with the steady presence of God by describing the emotions from despair to rejoicing. As in the initial example, the deliverance not only effects a renewed faith in God and their mission but also their surroundings. As a result, "many Masters of Ships left their Sea-imployment for a time, and chose rather to suffer the wants of a Wildernesse with the people of God, than to increase their estates in a full-fed Land" (*WP* 61). The converted mariners serve as an additional indicator of the "great worke" for which God has singled out the New England Puritans. In contrast to the Mather's, Johnson presents mercies and deliverances as working on three levels of exterior but also the interior, strengthening the faith of the Puritans as well as outsiders who are able to receive grace as a result of witnessing them. In the same vein, Johnson's text interacts with his readers, asking them to verify the information given or to acknowledge the work of God and follow the example or spiritual model of the Puritans. "Gentle Reader make use of this memorable Providence of Christ for his New England Churches" (55). In narrating these instances, Johnson preserves

at times the plot pattern of prayer and divine answer, at others, he simply enumerates the various dangers from which God preserved the Puritans on their transatlantic journey.

In chapter sixteen, the dangers of the sea voyage are portrayed in a conflation of melodramatic scenes, short narratives of a particular situation and general comments on the effects of God's help. While *A History of New England* functions as a promotional tract for readers abroad and as a reassuring of God's calling to the people living in New England alike, Johnson leaves out occasions for story-telling by simply talking of a "memorable providence" that enabled the Pilgrims to start their voyage instead of detailing how they gained the monetary means to do so. In the second part of the chapter these instances are arranged like testimonies in a climactic order, using rhetorical devices such as contrast and parallelism. With the final address to the readers that "every one … will tell you of some Remarkable Providence of God shewed toward them in their Voyage, by which you may see the Worke of Christ, is not to bee laid aside because of difficulties," the chapter ends on a note that could conclude and contain a sermon's doctrine equally well.

The relation of Anthony Thacher's shipwreck and deliverance, first printed in Increase Mather's *Illustrious Providences* is an example of the various ways in which narratives migrated between Europe and British North America. Originally, Thacher included the relation of his 1635 shipwreck in a letter to his brother Peter, an English minister, sent in the same year and preserved in copy in the papers of Simon Bradstreet and the Mather family (cf. Hall 2008, 38). At the same time, the events described in it have been entered into colonial diaries, for example, Winthrop's *Journal* (cf. 152). This circulation in manuscript precedes the publication as the opening narrative of Increase Mather's section on sea deliverances in *Illustrious Providences* by nearly fifty years. According to Hall, the modern distinction of public and private does not apply to seventeenth century letters that were used to exchange information and circulated between England and New England as well as friends and neighbors. Consequently, a narrative could be put to different uses and aligned with intentions other than the author's (cf. Hall 2008, 38). As far as Anthony Thacher's relation of his experience is concerned, Wharton argues that apart from promotional purposes, many wrote to justify their behavior or cope with their losses, as Thacher blames himself for the death of his children (cf. *IP* 13; Wharton 47).

As Thacher chronicles his own experience, the first-person narrator is at the same time protagonist and focalizer of the narrative with implications for its style and structure. While most of the narrative is written from Thacher's point of view, it involves several characters whose relationships are clarified in the beginning and whose fate is rendered

through simultaneous strands of action. This leads to interruptions of the chronological sequence and —through the retrospective recording of experience—narrative commentary that has so far been absent from exemplary plots. In contrast to exempla that start in mid-action, Thacher first summarizes the events leading up to the shipwreck, from his arrival in America to the friendship with his cousin whose appointment to Marblehead was the reason for their journey. In addition, he foregrounds the fact that he mediates and experiences all the events himself. This happens through parenthetical remarks, "(if I may so term it without offence)," by addressing the reader, "Now look with me upon our distress, and consider of my misery," or through guiding remarks, such as "[b]ut I must go on to an end of this woeful Relation" (*IP* 6).

Even though the letter was sent to a close relative, addressing the reader carries the same function when the letter is published in print: they plead for empathy and to follow Thacher's emotions when relating this incident. Towards the ending, the narrative also indicates that Thacher has shared his story with other people before writing the letter: "Thus the Lord sent us some clothes to put on, and food to sustain our new lives which we had lately given to us; and means also to make fire, for in an Horn I had some Gun-powder, which to mine own (and since to other mens) admiration was dry" (*IP* 14). God again acts on behalf of Thacher and his wife by literally providing them with clothes and the ability to make fire. Despite being washed ashore, the gun powder stayed dry, a miracle that is also recognized by those who hear Thacher's story. As a consequence, Thacher's relation participates in both, oral storytelling and the practice of circulating letters and other handwritten documents as a way of scribal publication common in the seventeenth century and especially places like New England with its limited access to a printing press (cf. Love; Hall 2008, 31). The surviving copies of Thacher's letter are indicative of this practice much as the passage of the audience's reaction implies that Thacher must have shared his story before he wrote it down. This is also evident from Winthrop's recording who must have received his information from yet another channel. Through these interruptions and comments, the narrator draws attention to himself and his own reaction to the events, endowing them with a subjective dimension that is missing from the rigid emplotment and distanced third narrative voice of exemplary judgments and deliverances.

The many references to sensory perception, mostly 'seeing,' document that the narrative revolves around Thacher's perception and experience as a way of remembering

and authenticating.[25] So, when Thacher is flung overboard, he relates his preservation with explicit reference to the acuteness of his perception: "note, I had my senses remaining perfect with me all the time that I was under and in the water, who [God] at that instant lifted my head above the top of the water, that so I might breath without any hindrance" (*IP* 10). To ascertain that he acutely felt God lifting himself out of the water, Thacher assures his reader that he was alert and perceptive at the moment of his rescue. The subjective perception also extends to the description of nature and the other characters in the narrative. In the beginning, Thacher identifies God as the cause of events: "the Lord suddenly turned our chearfulenss into mourning and lamentations … it pleased the Lord to send so mighty a storm as the like was never known in New England" (*IP* 4-5). The storm thrusts the ship on a rock where it is smashed to pieces by the waves. They become the metaphorical antagonists, as the waves are "merciless," and "came furiously and "violently over us" to destroy the boat (5). Likewise, the divine presence to which the characters have "recommended [them] selves" is juxtaposed by the "ghastly death" who "stared us in the face and sat triumphing upon each ones Forehead" (5). In the face of these overpowering agencies, the two families are compared to "sheep" that "were contently resolved to die together lovingly" (7). The narrator uses many metaphorical descriptions that personify the struggle between life and death and assigns an active role to nature in contrast to the passive humans. The dramatic juxtaposition of the small vessel and the raging sea is continued by the sudden 'visibility' and presence of death. By consequence, the changing roles and agencies in the narrative complicate its reading as a providential punishment or deliverance as these emplotments imply stable roles that function as parts of the plot.

The narrative commentary often introduces a shift of time levels as it blends narration with memories that are rendered as the progression of strikingly visual scenes that are described in detail and mix the emotions of the writer with his perception. When he asks his reader to "look with me upon our distress and consider of my misery," Thacher presents a sweeping view of the desolation the water has caused to the stranded ship: "[I] beheld the ship broken, the water in her, and violently overwhelming us, my Goods, and Provisions swimming in the Seas, my Friends almost drowned, and mine own poor Children so

[25] Explicit references to the act of seeing occur in a number of passages, for example: "His speech made me look forth. And looking towards the Sea and seeing how we were, I turned myself to my Cousin … It has pleased god to cast us here between two Rocks, the shoar not far from us, for I saw the Tops of the Trees when I looked forth. Whereupon the Master of the Pinnace looking up to the Scuttle hole of the quarter deck, went out at it, but I never saw him afterwards" (*IP* 7). This emphasis on visual perception is typical for the genre as it reoccurs in Major Gibbon's deliverance and even modern short stories, like Stephen Crane's "The Open Boat," of the same theme, see Scheiding (2011, 209).

untimely … before mine eyes drowned, ready to be dashed to pieces" (*IP* 12-13). Together, both references to seeing fuse different time levels, one of the present, the other of futurity. The narrative mimics the way Thacher's eyes wander from the ship to the water, from the loss of security and possessions to the loss of his friends and family that he anticipates and that is sadly affirmed in the rest of the narrative as only he and his wife survive. As a tableau of their miserable situation, the scene stops the narrative time, leaving the strand of action surrounding Thacher's wife suspended and offering also space for reflection in the shape of narrative commentary.

Triggered by this visual scene, Thacher recriminates himself for the death of his children immediately following their mentioning: "poor Souls whom I had occasioned to such an end in their tender years" (*IP* 10). A similar passage occurs after Thacher and his wife find themselves on shore but cannot find any other survivors. The perspective changes from the outside to the inside, combined with an address to the reader to follow Thacher's train of thought with empathy: "You condole with me my miseries, who now began to consider of my losses" (*IP* 12). In Thacher's memory, the last view that he had of his children is recreated:

> Now came to my remembrance the time and manner, how and when I last saw and left my Children and Friends. One was severed from me sitting on the Rock at my feet, the other three in the Pinnace: my little Babe (Ah poor Peter) sitting in his sister Ediths arms, who to the uttermost of her power sheltred him from the waters, my poor William standing close unto them, all three of them looking ruefully on me on the Rock; their very Countenances calling me to help them, whom I could not … Oh I yet see their cheeks, poor silent Lambs, pleading pity and help at my hands (*IP* 12-13)

The narrative follows not only the fate of the different characters but renders them particularly through the eyes of Thacher who is both, the narrator and focalizer of the narration. As such, the visual data are combined with his memory, thoughts and emotional reactions in the narrative. It is especially to the latter that the narrator draws repeatedly the attention of the reader and underscores them by presenting visually striking scenes as the one above. The helpless situation of their children is doubled in their emotional impact by the reaction of the father who reads in "their Countenances" their cry and expectation of help from him but is unable to render it. Interspersed exclamations like "Ah" and "Oh" express the subjective reaction of the father that is tightly connected to the visual impressions. The fate of Thacher's wife that is summed up while the rest of the characters are still on the rocks or the boat and cannot not possibly know that she was washed ashore "where she was cast safely, but her Legs were something bruised" because she found herself

in the midst of planks and other materials from the ship (*IP* 9). The state of affairs surrounding Thacher's wife is taken up at exactly the point when her husband also reaches the shore and suddenly "saw my Wife a Butt length from me getting herself forth from amongst the timber of the broken Barque" (*IP* 11). So, the narrative presents two strands of action that are separated and joined according to the movement of his wife out of the boat and onto the shore where Thacher finds her. The combination of first person narration with hindsight knowledge allows for occasional shifts into an omniscient perspective and zero focalization. Through its motivation, emplotment and narrator, Thacher's account is not so much an interchangeable event of providence or actualization of a biblical type than an individual's story. From the use of personification to the interspersed dialogue, reader addresses, and detailed descriptions, the narrative renders the drama of the two families from a personal viewpoint by stressing Thacher's perception.

The variety of perspectives, layers of time and narrative intrusions complicate the emplotment as a divine deliverance. Instead of emerging through the plot, God's agency has become a matter of personal perception and interpretation as the narrator moves from relating the traumatic memory of his children shortly before their death to the divine intervention on his behalf: "But I must let this pass, and will proceed on in the Relation of Gods goodness unto me" (*IP* 13). In the end, God is also directly intervening to rescue Thacher but until then, insecurity about the interpretation of his will persists. Rather than a specific maxim or emplotment type, the narrative foregrounds the inscrutability of the divine will. The doctrinal essence of the narrative is presented as a dialogue between Thacher and his cousin. Firstly, Thacher affirms his willingness "here to die with you and my poor Children" but adds that "the Lord is able to help and deliver us" (8). His cousin answers: "what his pleasure is we know not; I fear we have been unthankful for former deliverances, but he hath promised to deliver us from sin and condemnation and to bring us safe to heaven … To which I replaying said, that this is all the deliverance I now desire" (8). Parallel to the loss of explanation patterns for the storm and the suddenly looming destruction, the narrative develops the relationship between the two layers of deliverance that are constitutive for the development of the genre: spiritual and physical salvation. According to Thacher's cousin, both are not necessarily connected and the believers have to wait patiently to see whether God choses to rescue them or not.

The narrative commentary, as well as its embedding in Mather's *Illustrious Providences*, show that Thacher's survival was deemed a miracle and attributed to providence. The narrator cites specific instances like the dry gunpowder and the

"admiration" of every one hearing about it as a clear instance of divine intervention that Increase Mather professes to collect. The narrative also indicates how recent events circulated through letters and were regarded as specimens of providential interventions. That Increase Mather begins his collection with Thacher's relation should dispel any doubt regarding its status as a providence or of being representative of the genre. In contrast to the shorter exempla in sermons, Thacher's shipwreck shows how providential narrative develops to portray both, divine acts as well as human perception and subjectivity.

Dealing with the passage from Great Britain to New England, sea deliverance narratives are generally set in a shared space and have been read and written with great interest on both sides of the Atlantic.[26] To demonstrate the transatlantic nature of these texts, I will compare the narrative features of the story of Major Gibbons that, as Julie Sievers shows, travels from New England to England and back (cf. 2006). Instead of a "rewriting" as James Hartman suggests, Increase and Cotton Mather incorporate Janeway's version in their own providence collections by using similar emplotment types (1999, 90). Yet, subtle shifts of characterization and narrative perspective show the New England narratives more geared towards entertaining than instructing the readership. In contrast to Janeway, Increase Mather's drops the allusions to biblical names and passages that frame the mariner's experience and intertwine narration with homiletic elements. As a consequence, the providential interventions on behalf of the sailors are balanced by Gibbon's own actions that secure the final deliverance through another ship.

In 1637, John Winthrop records in his journal that Mr. Gibbons' ship "went to the Bermuda, but by continual tempests was kept from thence, and forced to bear up for the West Indies, and, [...] not daring to go into any inhabited place there, but to go ashore in obscure places, and lived of turtles and hogs, etc" (*J* 222). Sievers identifies several elements that link Winthrop's entry with sea providence narratives then popular in England and cites for the "Bermudian tempest" and a diet of sea turtles as examples (2006, 762). A popular exponent of that genre was for example William Strachey's *A true reportory of the wracke and redemption of Sir Thomas Gates*, which also made its way from a long and elegantly written letter to a "noble Lady" into print (cf. Vaughn 288). As a passenger of the *Sea Venture*, flagship of the Virginia Company, Strachey witnessed its destruction by a storm near Bermuda, the survival of the remaining crew on the island and their escape in 1609.

---

[26] See the variety and frequent reprints of collections such as Janeway's, along with the debate about the sinking of the *Sea Venture* from the Virginia Colony that sparked a number of competing print publications, which were read on both sides of the Atlantic.

His letter of the same year, rather than the 1625 print, probably served as inspiration for the opening scene of Shakespeare's 1611 play *The Tempest* (cf. Vaughn 287). While the individual members of the crew and their experience remain unnamed until the very end, providence becomes an actor in enabling their deliverance:

> At last they were forced into a harbor, where lay a French man-of-war with his prize, and had surely made prize of them also, but that the providence of God so disposed, as the captain [...] knew the merchant of our bark, one Mr. Gibbons. Whereupon he treated them courteously [...] and sent home with her his prize. (*J* 222)

As Winthrop's journal was not published until 1790 but circulated among his friends, it must have been through word of mouth or letters that the incident became known in England (cf. Sievers 748). As mentioned above, Winthrop's journal was circulated in the colony and its contents might have reached England via notes taken by one of its readers.[27] These notes, letters, and personal reports were a prime source for news from the American colonies that were further removed from England than all its other dominions, which explains their wide circulation and the large demand that fueled their passage into print. Gibbon's story subsequently appeared first in print as a part of James Janeway's *Legacy* of 1680, a collection of "famous instances of Gods providences in and about sea dangers and deliverances" with an attached sermon. Apart from the figure of major Gibbons, the danger of starvation, and some details of the rescue, the story, as recorded by Janeway, contains none of the tropic setting and sensationalist stock elements contained in Winthrop's journal entry.

Instead, Janeway constructs Major Gibbon's sea deliverance as an exemplary tale full of allegorical and biblical allusions as well as narrative commentaries that offer religious interpretations and exhortations to the reader. Similar to the pattern of a divine deliverance used by Cotton Mather, Janeway's narrative opens with a characterization of its main character Major Gibbons, as "a Gentleman of good education … and of good Conversation" but at the same time forgoes any hint to his character or religiosity that earlier exempla would have provided to place him in a typology of good or evil (*JL* 1). Janeway shortly touches upon the commercial background of the voyage before mentioning the "contrary winds" that keep the boat out of port and threaten its crew with starvation. The narrator uses imagery and metaphor, for example when bread becomes the missing "Staff of life," and contrasts the "devouring" ocean as the lesser danger to starvation next to structural parallelism (*JL* 2).

---

[27] Another instance in which contents of Winthrop's Journal appear in print in England before its first publication in 1790 is the monstrous birth by Mary Dyer. Sometimes attributed to Winthrop, Thomas Weld's pamphlet *A Short Story of the Rise and Reign of Antinomians* (1692), which bears only the printer's name and appeared in two editions probably uses Winthrop's journal entry as its textual basis (cf. Hall 2008, 65-66).

Similarly, the starving crew and their subsequent actions are related to biblical passages, which are identified in the margins, through quotes, similes or adaptations or a combination of them. The first extensive quote from the Bible is at the same time integrated into the structure of the preceding and following sentences and introduced by a simile. "They look on every side, (as David says) *I looked on my right hand, but there was no man that would know me; Refuge failed me*; or perished from me. They look downward, there seeing nothing but the Belly of destruction opening for them; they look upward, the only and last refuge" (*JL* 2). The psalm mirrors and prefigures at the same time the movement of the surrounding sentences that use the verb as a metaphor for considering the situation and praying rather than related to any object of vision. In the margin, the passage is listed and through the reference to David, the mariner's "looking" becomes a simile to his and thus a typological parallel in addition to the structural one. While the narrator first compares their looking for help to David's, the crew then does "as *Noah* did" by sending out a "Dove of Prayer" and "they are like the Prophet's [Elijah's] servant" in waiting for an answer (*JL* 2, 3).[28] When their initial petition fails, the crew adapts the practice of casting lots that Jonah recommends when his ship is threatened by a storm.

Contrary to the prophet who runs away from God's ordinances, all the mariners on Major Gibbons's ship are considered innocent and no divine judgment as the cause of their trouble. Instead, Janeway portrays the mariners as desperate and thrown back on their own resources when they perceive no divine help and their provisions are gone. They forward "the sorrowful motion" that one man should be chosen by lot and killed to serve as food for the rest. The succession of similes in which the actions of the crew are compared to biblical figures culminates in likening the "Sacrifice" of the man to be killed to that of Christ. This typological parallel is heightened in a rephrasing of John 11:50 "one man should die for the People and that the whole Ships Company perish not" (*JL* 3). By taking over its very wording, the experience and decisions of the mariners can be justified or comprehended through the biblical precedent. Janeway inscribes the crew's situation into a biblical frame work, establishing at once the blamelessness of the crew and the relevance of his text as an actualization of the word of God in the present. While resigning to the will of God and believing that he will cast the lot, Major Gibbons emerges as an active figure in reflecting on the procedure and in calling his crew to prayers once more (cf. *JL* 4).

---

[28] Elijah instructs his servant seven times to go and look until the first cloud appears to announce the promised rain after a three year drought (cf. 1 Kings 18:43).

Janeway stresses the urgency and fervor of these prayers and temporally connects them to the first deliverance: "O sure these Prayers must melt hearts of Adamant! And behold, while they are at it, God doth send a visible commentary on that Scripture: *Then shalt thou call, and the Lord shall answer*" (*JL* 4). The sentence not only echoes the previous theme of looking but also presents from an omniscient third person perspective what the crew at this point cannot yet know. The narrator allows the reader to glimpse of God's activity and to emphasize the dialogic link between prayer and answer laid out in the Bible passage. He draws together the two time levels, earthly and heavenly in one sentence. The compression of time and shifting perspective is repeated, as the mariners renew their prayers after the fish is eaten and Janeway exhorts: "O it is not in vain to seek the Lord, for lo, while they are seeking to him, he is sending to them" (*JL* 6). Two times, the seamen, after casting the lot, however, shrink from the deed and renew their prayers that are subsequently answered by the arrival of a fish and later a bird. However, this cycle repeats itself three times before the final rescue through a French pirate. Janeway interpolates his narrative with passages from the Bible that give scriptural precedents for the crew's actions and emplots them along biblical patterns, especially the story of Jonah that provides with its subject matter a fitting biblical precedent and is frequently adapted by the narrative (Janeway 1680, 3, 4).

Yet in spite of this biblical perspective, Janeway's version lacks the spiritual dimension of a transformative voyage claimed by Wharton and Hebel as one of the main characteristics of the sea deliverance. Instead of a conversion experience or a transforming voyage, the mariners return again and again, to what Sievers defines as a barbaric custom that at the time was associated with the Natives of newly explored islands but not European Christians (cf. Sievers 760-61). According to Sievers, the practice of cannibalism was associated with African and American indigenous peoples and "figured as one of the most horrifying potential results of a European's transformation by American influences" (761). No longer the "innocent colonists of Winthrop's version," the mariners are willing to sacrifice one of them and compromise their "humanity, … innocence, or [their] identity" as Englishmen (Sievers 761). The application of a conversion plot on the experience of the sea deliverance is complicated by the shift from Winthrop to Janeway's version that includes more sensationalist details to evoke the reader's horror.

While the mariners' struggle of conscience at murdering an innocent is documented, the emotions described in the narrative often remain conventional as they are framed by Bible quotations and references. The narrative equates spiritual and bodily life in using spirit often as a metonymy for both and instead of a witnessed change, the mariners promise

transformation if they will be saved: "if God will save them out of their distress, O what manner of persons they will become! What manners of lives they will live!" (*JL* 7). The lesson to "rely on God rather than their own means" is intricately connected to the sensationalist details and the emotional reaction they will evoke: three times, they return to their human means for salvation and invoke the barbarism of man-eating (Sievers 763). As Sievers points out, only after they continue to wait after their third prayer instead of casting another lot, does the French ship appear (cf 763). Thus, the narrative mirrors the plot structure of a humiliation followed by deliverance that is, according to Parker H. Johnson, the basic trope of underlying captivities and sea narratives in the *Magnalia* (cf Sievers 763; Johnson 240-42).

All in all, Janeway's rendition very much conforms to the exhortative use of narrative to illustrate a biblical principle; in this case that God rewards perseverance in prayer. Janeway's *Legacy* presents the dialogic principle of deliverance in a compression of time and shifting viewpoint that allows the reader to witness God's immediate response to the earnest believer's prayer. Major Gibbon's story becomes a typological expression of biblical sea deliverances as well as answers to prayer in general and consequently timeless as well as topical. At the same time, the narrative undercuts the exemplary structure by interrupting it through exhortations, Bible quotations and a final rescue that depends as much on human agency as God's. The cyclical structure heightens suspense as well as conforming to biblical trials of Jesus and Peter, but it also questions the turn of Major Gibbons from a passive receiver of God's help to an active ensurer of the deliverance through his previous behavior and renewed call to prayer. The loosening of a providential plot pattern goes hand in hand with a description of the sailor's emotions, swinging back and forth between despair and hope. The drama of salvation that culminates after three trials offers can be followed by the readers and offers possibilities of identification that earlier exemplary plots of deliverance and judgment lack.

In New England, the deliverance plot of Janeway's story is emphasized as it is taken over and shortened by Increase Mather for his Essay for the Recording of Remarkable Providences (cf. 15-17). In the *Magnalia*, Cotton Mather publishes Gibbon's story with minor stylistic alterations, thus continuing his father's collection (cf. *MC* vi, 4).[29] Tightening the narrative, Increase Mather removes all biblical references, but retains key features, like

[29] William R. Manierre compares the style of Cotton Mather's changes of his father's narratives and concludes that they mostly introduce parallelisms and symmetric sentence structures (cf. 497-500).

Janeway's rhetorical questions and the three cycles of prayer and deliverance (cf. Hartmann 1999, 90). By emplotting the story less according to biblical parallels, the seamen were engaging in pagan practices by drawing lots and attempting cannibalism rather than following the example of Jonah. Also, the periodic prayers and answers from God read more like a dialogue and the allusions to overarching patterns of salvation history appear more nuanced. In Winthrop's exempla-like journal entry, the ship is saved because it stems from New England. From Janeway's version onwards, though, the crew's and Gibbon's individual actions play a much more pronounced role. As their initial prayers have been ineffectual, the crew "once more went to their Prayers" before sacrificing one of them, "and behold, while they were calling upon God, he answered them: For there leaped a mighty fish into their boat, which [...] not only quieted their outrageous hunger, but also gave them some token of a further deliverance." This kind of dialogue contains the basic structure of the exempla-like providence tale: supplications are answered immediately in a stark compression of narrative time, and God's answer, who is only mentioned as a character in the *Magnalia*, carries a double significance: it satisfies the bodily needs and, through typological interpretation and emplotment, provides a sign of God's intention to save body and soul in this world and the next (cf. Sievers 762; cf. Scheiding 2003, 86).

Yet the complete deliverance is only achieved after three "symbolic trials" and remains based on an earlier act of goodwill on Gibbon's part (cf. Weber 1985, 55-70). According to Janeway and the Mathers, Major Gibbons had shown the French commander "some signal kindness" and Janeway elaborates that Gibbons saved the Frenchmen from a similar predicament as "his life was in danger in Boston" (Janeway 1680, 9; *IP* 17, *MC* vi, 4).[30] By presenting human and divine factors as equal causes for the deliverance, Major Gibbons acquires a more active role starting with Janeway's text. In Janeway's *Legacy*, he talks with the potential first victim and states that, in contrast to Jonah or the typical judgment plot, the sailor has done nothing wrong to deserve death. Consequently, Gibbons spurns his men to renew their prayer and similar to what Mather expostulated and Johnson demonstrated about earnest and heartfelt prayer, the mariners receive the first token of their deliverance and relief for their hunger. This spiritual and bodily nourishment, however, does not prevent their being thrown back again on their own resources in a repeated cycle of

[30] The exact nature of the relationship between Gibbons and the French Pirate goes unmentioned in all of the texts. Winthrop's journal only states that they knew each other and calls Gibbons a merchant, without the military rank bestowed to him by the Mathers (cf. 222). However, Winthrop also mentions a Captain Edward Gibbons who sided with the French Lieutenant La Tour, head of a group of French military men and traders, which might render the Gibbons of the story a privateer himself (cf. 440-41).

desperation, prayer, and deliverance.

The final deliverance on the hands of the French pirate, again, is linked causally to the previous kind act of Major Gibbons, who, as only Janeway has it, saves him from death in Boston. While the earnest and emotional prayer is the turning point that prepares a divine deliverance, saving another human being is rewarded with the same coin, an analogy stressed by Janeway but also present in the versions by Increase and Cotton Mather. In Illustrious Providences and the *Magnalia*, the perspective does not include the view from above that characterizes Janeway's conflation of perspective and time to show the divine reaction to prayer. While the first instant is repeated by Increase Mather, he presents the rest of the narrative from the perspective of the mariners and relates their anxiety directly to the reader, mirroring the crew's feeling of being thrown back on their own resources in the face of danger. The third person narrator summarizes the feelings of the crew rather than demonstrating them through the various instances of reported speech in Janeway's account. Also, Cotton Mather phrases the reaction of the mariners after the fish is eaten in a climactic order and parallel syntactic structure: "the horrible Famine returns, the horrible Distress is renew'd; a black Despair against seizes their Spirits" (*MC* vi, 4). 'Famine' and 'Distress' are highlighted through italicization and become actors in the drama. In response, the appearance of the fish and the bird are ascribed to God in the narrative commentary.

Even with a shared understanding of God's ability and willingness to answer prayer, Increase Mather's providential message has to be construed from the events—more particularly the ending—and allows for more than one interpretation. According to Sievers, sea wonders as in Winthrop's original narrative not only have a long tradition in religious literature and biblical precedents but also a political function: emplotted as exempla, they demonstrate God's approval of New England's imperial activities at sea, also in contrast to the recent loss of the Sea Venture from Virginia (cf. Sievers 2006, 760-62). While Winthrop emphasizes that God supports the colony and consequently saves individual New Englanders and their property, both Mathers use a different emplotment to warn against a regress in piety. They take over Janeway's cycle of trials that teaches the reader a lesson in perseverance but also stress man's contribution to the rescue. As Weber observes, the narrative constructs a double causality as the ship is rescued in part by providence and in part because of Gibbons' benevolence towards the French captain who subsequently saves them (cf. Weber 1985, 62). For both purposes, the authors drew on popular themes, such as shipwrecks and remarkable deliverances that were reported by word of mouth, entered into

diaries, and subsequently into anthologies and sermons.[31]

Beyond the similarities in content and genre description, the variations of Gibbon's story are evidence of a transatlantic exchange of Protestant texts in which the same story can move back and forth, acquiring different forms and functions. As transatlantic texts, these versions not only include locations like the Bermuda islands alongside New England but also 'barbaric' and 'heathen' practices such as casting lots and cannibalism. New England narratives thus transmit a large amount of cultural information and adapt their emplotment accordingly. Contrary to Janeway's sermon-like insertion of biblical quotations and explanations, Increase and Cotton Mather tighten the narrative by emphasizing its repetitive structure as well as installing a climatic order and suspense. Popular on both sides of the Atlantic, the sea deliverance demonstrates God's providential care for the believers and the power of persistent prayer and good works clothed in a harrowing adventure. The introduction of new plot details, such as the meditated cannibalism, at once put the narrative in a larger context of exploration writing and the discovery of the American continent along with the supposed customs of their Native inhabitants (cf. Klarer 391).[32] Especially in narratives of shipwrecks and captivity, the threat of cannibalism appears as a stereotypical element of shipwreck tales that heightens the suspense and contrasts the civilized and the barbaric.

Narratives as Objects for Contemplation and Agents of Change

Apart from their setting and theme, Thacher's and Gibbon's story both foreground the characters' perception and emotional experience. While the content and much of the wording remain, Cotton Mather's rendition of Gibbon's deliverance contains rhetorical devices that appear throughout the *Magnalia* to enhance the emotional appeal and dramatic quality of events. For instance, Mather adds modifiers to achieve a parallel structure and amplification, making "a doleful and fearful Debate" out of a "sad debate" (*MC* vi, 4). William Reid Manierre regards this as a typical Mather 'redaction' that leaves the content untouched while adding "rhythmical phrases and sound patterns" (498). Additionally, Mather's use of

---

31 Increase and Cotton Mather drew on a large correspondence with other ministers and friends who furnished them with narratives from their surroundings. For examples, see Sievers 240.

32 As Mario Klarer states, cannibalism was at once an "exotic motif" and ethnographic term applied to the New World, evolving from "the people of Caniba" which Columbus mentions and connects with the practice of what was then called "anthropophagy" without actual evidence (Klarer 391). Cannibalism replaced the earlier term for man-eating and also became a general designation for America and its indigenous inhabitants, leading to many literary and artistic representations of cannibalism (cf. Klarer 391).

metaphor underscores the dramatic potential of the story, hunger "pinches" the ship's crew and becomes the opposite of God, their "friend in adversity." At other places, Mather tightens the sentences and works with simple contrasts as in "This was a second life from the dead," but generally he opts for "amplification over concision" (Manierre 489-89, cf. Stievermann 2004, 263). When the crew decides to draw lots on who is to be killed and eaten by the others, both Mathers take over the rhetorical question employed by Janeway to mark the turning point between barbarity and Godly deliverance: "where is the Executioner be found to act this bloody Office on a poor Innocent?" (*IP* 15). By transferring the action of killing a man out of hunger to the rational weighing of punishment as practice in court, the sailor is necessarily declared innocent which brings the procedure to a halt as none of the crew wants to be liable for his death. The rendering of this situation along with the return of the pinching hunger mark a shift from the reporting style of Winthrop's journal that is more in line with the narrative style of the preceding exempla that concentrates on the plot and forgoes description or rhetorical elements that portray and heighten emotions. Neither the exempla in sermons nor Winthrop's Journal disclose any emotional reaction to the punishment or salvation worked by God. In these narratives, rhetorical elements like direct speech and duplications are structural means to indicate the turning points of the plot. An example is the repeated "stir no more" around which the plot evolves as it indicates first the curse uttered by the liar and secondly his death in *Terriblia Dei*.

In contrast to the mechanistic workings of justice, sea deliverance narratives establish a heightened sense of immediacy as the audience is to live through the same drama of despair and salvation as Gibbon's crew. While the exemplary character resides in the pattern of judgment and deliverance from biblical to present times, sea deliverances establish a relation of shared emotions and the experience of salvation, both personal and spiritual. Sievers emphasizes the sensational quality of the presentation that introduces the subjective perspective of the sailors into the story, especially in comparison with Winthrop's earlier version (764). As the third person narrative mostly mirror's the sailors' perspective, Siever's places the narratives from Janeway onwards into the development of a subjective style of portraying individual experience in travel writing (Sievers 765).

Every New Englander knew first-hand the potential hardships connected to the Atlantic passage and the embedding of providential deliverances allows for a vicarious experience of danger, faith, and deliverance by the audience. Monika Fludernik, again, regards this integration of experience as a major criterion for the definition of narrative as it allows for experientiality. This "quasi-mimetic evocation of real-life experience"

distinguishes narrative from a mere report of events (1996, 12). In contrast to a merely factual account, this style also projects an increased credibility as it drew on the law code for testimonies from which the standards of scientific descriptions of the Royal Society were derived. What Sievers terms "first hand experience" trumped over book knowledge and rendered the empirical recording of sense impressions all the more important (Sievers 765). Consequently, Gibbon's story as reported by the Mathers contains frequent references to visual perception. The reader is asked to "[b]ehold" the arrival of the bird. Then, "[o]ne of the Men spies it" but still, "they can see no land" (*MC* vi, 4). Instead, they feel that "Hunger … pinches them" and after their third round of prayer, they "look, and look again … and nothing appears (*MC* vi, 4). Their eventual deliverance is again predicated on seeing: "At last one of'em espies a Ship" (*MC* vi, 4). While Janeway uses a similar amount of verbs of perception, they are integrated into the references and quotations of Bible passages. Increase and Cotton Mather, however, dissociate 'seeing' from the biblical figures quoted by Janeway. In their versions, 'seeing' becomes the complement to prayer that is followed by perceiving and experiencing God's answer. Instead of merely stating its arrival, God's answer is rendered from the perspective of the sailors, foregrounding their role as experiencers and witnesses of this divine intervention.

Yet while Janeway develops his very wording out of biblical passages that emphasize the waiting for divine deliverance, Increase, and Cotton Mather both drop this context while retaining the sensory verbs. From a biblical analogy to a perceptive process, "looking" is central to the empirical but also providential dimension of the story. By subtracting the religious origins that identify 'looking' as 'waiting' for God's answer, the Mathers present the perceptions and the situation of the mariners rather than a timeless parable of waiting and deliverance echoing the biblical tradition. Instead, through their use of perspective and fewer interruptions of the narrative, they stress the mariners' "direct experience of the divine" as the story is more condensed and effectual in evoking an emotional response from the readers (Sievers 775-76). Accordingly, both Hebel and Wharton also see the sea deliverances in the *Magnalia* as a realm of struggle between the providential patterns of religious experience and empirical means for realistic descriptions (cf. 17; 4-9). Wharton argues that the two are tied together to make sea deliverances appeal not only to the emotions but all human faculties and effect an "affectation of the will" (13). Releasing their descriptions of emotions and actions from the biblical precedent, Increase and Cotton Mather attempt to create a realistic setting in which the desperation of the mariners is as plausible as the providential intervention. Rather than a conflation of prayer and answer, the

Mathers represent the believer's life as a struggle full of setbacks and with realistic details, such as the circumstances of the voyage, the emotions of the sailors and the well attested content of the story indicated by the references to its previous publications.

Through these elements, the drama of deliverance can be vicariously experienced by the readers and their will affected. First, the narrative recreates the "drama and terror" of a firsthand experience and aims at moving the audience not by emotional force alone but also by appealing to the intellect. According to Richard Baxter, "affectations of the will were aroused after the subject of the meditation, the doctrine, is supplied by the memory and then analyzed by the understanding" (qtd. in Wharton 13). Mathew Brown argues that this practice of meditation was also applied to the reading of devotional literature, such as sermons and meditations (cf. 2006, 68; 2010, 18). What Warner has called "internalization" is performed through a slow, deliberate reading that is compared to digestion (1992, 19). This process includes interacting with the text and the activation of the personal experience of the reader by thinking and meditation on the text, making annotations and endowing the text with additional levels of experience and meaning. As texts actively invite these interactions, Brown contrasts the common perception of the Puritan plain style with this "thick" style of devotional texts (2006, 75).

Richard Baxter's *The Saints Everlasting Rest* was the most popular text on Puritan meditation, running through various editions even after his lifetime.[33] Yet, while Baxter posits in the beginning that he does not believe in a separation of the soul into entities like the will and the understanding, his explanation of the practice of meditation states that an object of meditation passes from the memory to the judgment and then results in emotions and resolutions. All of these faculties of the soul are encompassed and activated by meditation, a point that Baxter repeatedly underscores when he defines it as "[t]he set and solemn acting of all the powers of the soul" (691). In the first place, memory provides the subject for the meditation, for example, the glory of heaven. Next, the judgment is called upon to test and verify the doctrines and beliefs connected to this subject by establishing, for example, the truth of scripture and its reliability (Baxter 727). Both form and affirm the understanding of the subject, "prepare them for the will, and command them for the Affections" (Baxter 691-92). Comparing meditation to digestion, the truth has to sink deeper

[33] Mathew Brown regards the number of editions as the primary criterion for assessing the popularity and impact of a publication (cf. 2006, 68). Baxter's *The Saint's Everlasting Rest* was reissued continually each year from 1650-1659 and has remained in print ever since, with extant editions from 1758, 1824, 1831 until today.

into the soul and be transformed into emotions that reside, according to Baxter, at "the bottome of the soul," and are more complex than mere thinking about a truth (692). The soul reacts to this newly grasped truth with emotions like happiness, love towards God and hope for the future. These emotions, in turn, lead to action and resolutions of the will: "The next Affection to be acted, is Courage or Boldness; which leadeth to Resolution, and concludeth in Action" (Baxter 742). Rather than a passive process, Baxter conceives of meditation as a joint effort of the understanding and the emotions that lead to a better knowledge and communion with God: "So much as thy Understanding and Affection are Sincerely acted upon God, so much doth thou enjoy him" (692). Thus, the most popular text of Puritan meditation defines it as a joint activity of the various faculties of the soul that result in an internalization of the subject of meditation accompanied by emotions, resolutions and a general approximation to God.

In *Compassions Called for* (1711), Cotton Mather develops a similar practice of meditation that revolves around narratives. Throughout the sermon, he carefully elaborates how a vicarious reading translates into a renewed or matured faith. Much like the invocations of the fear of God in *Terribilia Dei* or its prefiguration of the appropriate reception of exemplary judgments in the frame of the second sermon, *Compassions Called for* outlines a number of acceptable emotions when faced with "sad spectacle[s]" and "*Heartbreaking Objects*" (2, 59). While only hinting at specific sins and the situation in England and New England in the main body, Mather appends exemplary narratives to the sermon. The first appendix addresses "The Drinking and Swearing Atheist" with "certain Modern, and very Remarkable Occurrences" that should show the "Quick Desolations" through divine judgments against debauchery and profanity (*CC* 45). In four narratives, one in verse, from different European sources, Mather shows God's judgments on drunkenness and Sabbath breaking in a narrative structure that hinges on the imprecations or blasphemy of the sinners, much like earlier Puritan exempla. The second appendix, "The Mariner Call'd upon" contains John Dean's first person narrative of his shipwreck and deliverance that is appended to the sermon and published in America for the first time. The prefacing and closing paragraph interpret the events as a "sad Spectacle" and "*Affecting* Story" that should inspire thankfulness for God's protection, repentance from sin and a conversion to him, respectively (*CC* 49, 58, cf. 59).

Rather than a purely cognitive approach to Christian behavior, Baxter and Mather delineate a spirituality that is based on a cognition in combination with emotions and their effects. Instead of individual experience, though, they formulate appropriate emotional

reactions by way of an ideal audience. This reader or hearer is not only following a sermon for its informative or doctrinal content but is interested in the narratives at its center. Emotions thus become cultural constructs as they are aligned with steps of religious practice like repentance or the fear of God. These practices are shared by a transatlantic Protestant community, as Baxter's meditation manual is mirrored in the use of books that Brown analyzes as evidence for a "thick" or layered style of devotional literature (cf. 2006, 70-75, 81). Creating an ideal reader and an ideal reader response, Mather transfers this from scripture reading to narrative in his sermons. The emotional quality of vicarious experience is paramount to evoking the empathy and identification that can lead to a sustained resolution and behavioral change.

In the preface of *Compassions Called for*, Mather describes the relationship between the readers' or hearers' perception and their emotional response as if they were meditating on the examples presented to them. "*Heartbreaking Objects* are in this Essay brought unto the Readers" (*CC* 2). With this statement, Mather presents stories or historical events as subjects for meditation. By contrast, medieval devotional literature, of which "The Parson's Tale" in Chaucer's *Canterbury Tales* would be an example, focus on qualities of Christ or situations from his life, such as the crucifixion (cf. Bestul 612). While Catholics meditated on stations in Jesus' life, the rosary, or divine qualities like God's love, his grace, and majesty, Puritans especially focused on the latter and scriptural meditation, which was also practiced among Roman Catholics. In contrast to fiction and poetry, which are charged with arousing 'false' emotions, Catholic devotional literature sought to supply images and impressions that endow the object of contemplation with emotional depth. Imagining and elaborating biblical scenes led to an emotional reaction to topoi such as the blood coming forth from the nails in Jesus' hands (cf. Bestul 608, 612). Consequently, "The affective potentiality of devotional literature is underscored in nearly every prologue, colophon, or rubric of such work … the emotions thus aroused lead to remorse and then to communion with God in prayer" (Bestul 615). Even as it enriches biblical narratives with additional images and hints for visualization, the reader's use of the imagination is "regarded as a concession to human weakness," and as an aid for exploring the mystery of Christ rather than an end in its own (Bestul 616). Filling the mind with a specific subject and concentrating on it in meditation begins with the help of the imagination but finds its highest achievement in the intellectual perception of "the essence of God" (Bestul 617).

As devotional texts were primarily reading material, Bestul argues that the meditation in Chaucer's the Parson's tale "marks a transition in the *Canterbury Tales* from

the public, oral, fictional mode of the tales to the private realm of the treatise" (Bestul 614). Interestingly, Mather shifts the focus back to the public and oral by recommending narratives for meditation in his sermon. However, as sensationalist and popular stories, these narratives have probably been circulating orally, in folk ballads or pamphlets for a long time, as Hall and Walsham demonstrate (cf. 1995, 31; 74). As a print product that Mather handed out during his visits, his essay would have been read aloud in the family probably but could also be read in quiet and as devotional literature as it clearly addresses readers rather than hearers (cf. *CC* 2). The use of narrative also acquires the function to evoke emotion and to persuade through "figures and images" rather than scholastic logic that medieval genre theory so far ascribed to poetry (Payne 45).

In *Manuductio ad Ministerium*, a manual for ministers in training, Mather stresses the importance of being "suitable touched" by a Bible passage as a condition for preaching powerfully and convincingly, moving the audience and stirring their faith (Mather 1726, 103, cf. 106). He endorses an emotional appeal in religious texts as they represent the power of God's spirit moving the audience. Mather accentuates that emotions are caused by perception and repeatedly recurs to visual metaphors for hearing and being moved by a sermon. The central verse interpreted by the sermon is Jeremiah's outcry at the sight of Israel destroyed by the Babylonians. When the Babylonians ransacked Israel's towns and led their leaders away into captivity, Jeremiah says: "Mine Eye Affecteth mine Heart" (*CC* 3; Lam 3:51). Mather relates Jeremiah's situation to that of contemporary New England when he argues that the colonists should also be affected by their perception. As Jeremiah has a "Heart-affecting Sight before his Eyes," the listeners' hearts should be affected by the sin they see around them and its effects as in examples of God's judgments in New England, out of which follows the doctrine "When we have Heart-affecting Spectacles before our Eyes, we should be Heartily affected by them" (*CC* 4, 6).

Yet while Jeremiah exemplifies the right affectation from the senses to the heart, Mather compares the colonists' hearts to a stone. In analogy to Moses' bringing out water out of a rock on the Lord's command, his sermon intends to "Smite the Rock" by presenting miserable objects: water shall flow, "Tears of Repentance for thy own Miscarriages" and "Tears of Compassion for the Miscarriages and Miseries of Other Men" (*CC* 2). Hereby, Mather integrates two processes of identification and empathy into the pragmatic dimension of his sermon: His hearers or readers should recognize how they resemble the sinners portrayed and feel for those who are in despair and trouble. In order to bring about this change, Mather reiterates the primacy of sensory perceptions that is contained in his guiding

verse "Mine Eye Affecteth mine Heart" and applies them to the ear. Even in print and in a publication called an essay, though it is clearly structured as a sermon, Mather invokes the immediacy of hearing and feeling. He implies that it also works in reading as the contents cannot but evoke an "*Affectionate Notice*" except when the audience would "shut their ears and eyes" (*CC* 3). As the gospels record many instances of Jesus grieving, weeping and feeling compassion, Mather's sermon outlines the appropriate emotional reaction to witnessing sin and punishment: anger, indignation, fear, and thankfulness (cf. *CC* 8, 10). To fetch "Good out of Evil Spectacles," the believer, through self-examination and resolution, has to effect an inward change. Thereby, the emotional reactions lead to resolutions that are in turn held up and strengthened by these feelings: "Our Affections must produce Affectionate Resolutions to Do all the *Good* that we can" like a sinner who becomes afraid of the judgments he witnesses and mends his ways (*CC* 9). This introspection and self-examination is likewise an emotional reaction inspired by perceiving the situation of others through identification: "The *sight* of sin in *Others*, must affect us with a *Fear of our Selves*" (*CC* 21). To visualize sin, Mather cites different situations and types that echo earlier sermons, like *Terribilia Dei* without developing fully fleshed out narratives. Rather, the danger of drunkenness, for example, whose treatment in Puritan sermons is outlined in chapter two, is paraphrased by word from revelations as a "Flood of *Rum* and *Ruine*, Vomited out of the Mouth of the Dragon" (*CC* 18). To initiate this change of heart, Mather closes with a prayer of commitment in which he asks his listeners to join, bringing the interactive quality of the sermon full circle (cf. *CC* 23).

In the second appendix, "The Mariner Called Upon," Mather makes clear what he expects his audience to feel when hearing or reading a sea deliverance. In response to the "*Affecting* Story," they are exhorted to be "thankful" either because they have never experienced a similar situation or have been equally helped out of it through divine intervention (*CC* 58-59). At the same time, the mariners should fear the calamities that could overcome them if they do not have God on their side as a "friend" and are instead punished for their sins: "The Great GOD … can Pursue you with His Horrible *Tempest*. He can *Starve* you to Death … He can smite you with Spiritual Plagues, and give you up to such *Blindneß* of Mind, and such *Hardneß* of Heart" (*CC* 59-60). Mather's enumeration of these multiple bodily and spiritual dangers ends in the exclamation: "Oh! That upon the Consideration of these things, our *Mariners* would come into the *Right Mind*!" (*CC* 60). This paragraph closes the sermon with another prayer and frames the narrative with a possible application and outline of its right reception similar to the judgments in *Terriblia Dei*. As in Baxter's manual

for meditation, Mather addresses both, the emotional and the rational and hopes that the first has implications on the second. By feeling the relief and thankfulness or fearing future calamities, the mariners are called to "consider" and then decide their stance towards God.

While Baxter envisioned a logical analysis of the components of each object, similar to the Ramist logic applied in Puritan sermons, the sea deliverance nevertheless offers "enough detail" to engage the understanding and emotional interest to focus the attention of the reader. Viable means to achieve this are the emotional import of the descriptions, heightening the suspense by delaying the solution through the three-part cycle as well as the low degree of interference by the narrative voice and shortness, compared to Janeway's version. An affectation of the will to perceive the workings of divine providence and apply this lesson to one's life are the effect of such an undivided attention that serves to "unify the faculties of the reader" and move his whole soul and intellect, as described above (Wharton 13).

While the simple plots of earlier exempla become more complex and their interpretation through the context or narrative commentary less pronounced, the story of Major Gibbons transports a providential message on a variety of levels through its various actualizations. The factual report of Winthrop that seeks to prove God's favor for New England in comparison to other colonies becomes a providential drama through the insertion of various actors, such as God and the famine in the editions by Janeway and the Mathers. While the narrative is very much viewed through a perspective of biblical parallels in Janeway, the Mathers foreground its narrative qualities by erasing references and narrative comments and fashioning the story as an individual and direct experience of God that should inspire its audience into greater perseverance in faith. Similarly, the Mathers' renditions of Gibbon's shipwreck are not integrated into a sermon or framed by interpretative passages interspersed in the story, as in Janeway's version, or before and after it, as with Dean's narrative in *Compassions Called for*.

On the level of the narration, the individuation and highlighting of experience happen only by degree as the third person narrator summarizes many of the feelings and developments to foreground the repetitive structure of the narrative. While the first person narrative is well known from dairies and conversion narratives, Cotton Mather employs a third person narrator who comments from hindsight and summarizes the recurring pattern of prayer and partial deliverance. This becomes obvious in formulations such as the "renewed" distress, counting the deliverance and using similar sentence patterns for the returning situations of increasing hunger, lot casting and prayer: "The Fish is soon eaten,

and their former Exigencies come upon them …[t]o Lot they go again the second time … but still none can be found to Sacrifice him (*IP* 16); "For another *Morsel*, they come to a second Lot; … but still they cannot find an Executioner: They once again fall to their importunate prayer" (*MC* vi, 4). The distance between narrating and experiencing is also obvious in the narrative's polished style so that the rhetorical questions and symmetrical pairings of emotions are revealed as not so much recorded expressions of the characters but rather as belonging to the narrative voice. Monika Fludernik regards this as a general trait of transforming oral stories into written accounts. Edited with a view to ideological considerations, these stories have ceased to recount the direct experience of the teller but represent a community's values and experiences. By way of example, Fludernik states that criminal biographies in Elizabethan England may be written in the first person but simply relate incidents in a dispassionate and distanced manner that would better fit a third person account (Fludernik 1996, 79). Consequently, Janeway's and the Mathers' versions of the Gibbons story exemplify the narrative strategies used to form the stock elements of orally transmitted wonder tales into providential, didactic narratives. Yet while their content is very similar, they use different means to achieve a providential narrative. Janeway emphasizes the situation of the story in a continuum of biblical history by deriving events as well as specific formulations from biblical passages. These analogies are dropped by the Mathers who tighten the narrative and use narrative commentary only to refer to the structural principle of the three trials that at once heighten suspense and express a theological point. While individual feelings are not represented by the third person narrator, the personification of their enemy hunger and God as their friend add new actors to the providential drama. While all the versions present the deliverance in three cycles, the shortness of the New England texts foregrounds the emplotment as a series of prayers and answers, stressing the direct relationship with God and his favor for New England, to which the crew returns safely.

The providential message of Gibbons' story becomes more ambiguous as it is expressed through the cyclical pattern of prayer and answer but complicated by the individuation of experience. Embedded in a series of divine deliverances from dangers at sea, Gibbon's story emerges as an individual case rather than a simple reiteration of a general pattern through the Major's contribution to the final deliverance as well as the experience of the sailors. As Sievers argues, the providential message, its relation to biblical passages or doctrines is less apparent in the narrative as told by Increase and Cotton Mather as is its possible application or intended emotional effect even though the latter is more pronounced.

Negotiating Personal Experience and Providential Interventions in the Captivity Narratives of Hannah Swarton and Hannah Dustan

Similar to sea deliverances, narratives of captivity experiences among Native Americans have appeared in sermons, providence collections and individual publications. Most extant accounts of Indian captivity narratives are published individually with a variety of purposes and contextual framings. In addition to the experience of the captives, many narratives also offer observations of Native American life and reflections on the writer's own community. Among them are a letter by the Jesuit Isaac Jogues (1643), Mary Rowlandson's *The Sovereignty and Goodness of God* (1682), John Williams' *Redeemed Captive* (1707) (cf. Sayre 1997, 22-23; Toulouse 92). Conversely, other captivity narratives have first been published as part of religious texts, for example, Hannah Swarton's account that was appended by Cotton Mather to his sermon *Humiliations follow'd by Deliverances* (1697), and Hannah Dustan's story in the same sermon. Both have never been published individually but were reprinted in the *Magnalia* and, in Dustan's case, also in *Decennium Luctuosum* (1699), Mather's history of King Philip's War. Their brevity could in part be attributed to limitations of space and time in a sermon that usually lasted between one and a half to two hours and were published as small books. Hannah Dustan's captivity and flight seem to have been part of the original sermon, as it was delivered in her presence and the events are followed by an "Improvement." Because of its length and status as the "most extensive" captivity narrative published by Cotton Mather, Swarton's story may have been added to the print version of the sermon and is further extended for the *Magnalia* (cf. Vaughan and Clark 148; Toulouse 192).

Mired in a long exchange of hostilities, starting with King Philip's War (1675-78) and continuing with King William's war from 1688 to 1697, New England considered itself under attack from outside as well as from within. Hannah Swarton's narrative first appeared as an appendix to Mather's sermon *Humiliation Follow'd by Deliverances*, given at the start of a week of fasting and in response to the threat of Native Americans during King William's war in 1697. Scholars agree that Swarton's account was most likely written down by Mather himself because of its style and allusions to theological debates and Bible verses. Also, there are no extant copies or other traces of an original document penned by Swarton (cf. Vaughan and Clark 148). Like *Compassions Called for*, *Humiliation Follow'd by Deliverances* seeks to evoke a spiritual reaction from the hearers and readers through the combination of theological argument and narrative. Mather expounds humiliation and confession as the

steps towards receiving a divine deliverance. By mirroring how his congregation should act, the narratives become an "instrument" for causing emotional reactions that lead to a change of behavior. The narratives outline the two steps of humiliation and confession that lead to a deliverance and ask Mather's hearers to do the same, applying and completing the narrative's plot line to their situation. In Johnson's words, Swarton's experience "symbolizes" that of the colony in 1697 and exhorts "for humiliation that precedes a deliverance" (Johnson244).

Initially, *Humiliation Follow'd by Deliverances* compares the situation in New England to Israel after the settlement of the Promised Land. Both have begun to "*Forsake the Law of the Lord*" and are "thus under... Punishment" (*HD* 5). To support his claims, Mather provides a list of the sins of New England, most of them connected to a neglect of religious duty, and the resulting punishments. Like a devotional text, Mather leads his listeners and readers through a process of repentance and humiliation that should affect reform and deliverance. In a first step, Mather asks his congregation to acknowledge that they are at the moment subject to divine punishment by confessing their sins. While *Terribilia Dei* addresses individuals, *Compassions Called for* aims at the community as a whole as Mather complains about the declining holy lifestyle by addressing sins such as excessive drinking, swearing, cursing and Sabbath-breaking but also sorcery and vanity (cf. *HD* 8-9).

Like a liturgical prayer that is to be joined by the audience, numbered paragraphs open by repeating "Let us Humbly Confess" and then naming the sin and some of its consequences (*HD* 8-11). Yet, Mather also asks his fellow New Englanders to confess to their difficulties as "we have seen many *Troubles*" (*HD* 11). If they "Humbly Confess" their sins, New Englanders, as a first step towards humiliation, have to admit that they deserve the calamities that have recently occurred. Most notably, Mather lists the war with the Native tribes who have "Captived and Butchered multitudes of our Beloved Neighbours," but also economic losses through shipwrecks and bad harvests (*HD* 12). This humiliation, again, constitutes for Mather the first step towards reformation (cf. *HD* 12). As in the earlier sermons that develop a doctrine out of the narrative logic of exemplary sin and punishment, Mather here presents a plot type of humiliation and deliverance that is mirrored by the appended narratives. As Johnson argues, the humiliating difficulties facing the colonist and God's intervention to save them form a recurring pattern throughout the *Magnalia* (cf. 240). Yet, this narrative pattern is introduced as a doctrine in *Humiliations Follow'd by Deliverances*, showing that Mather generally thought of ways to combine providential

theology with a type of plot that could be used both for the explication as well as the demonstration of that doctrine. Consequently, the sermon embeds the story of Hannah Dustan at its very ending and appends Swarton's narrative as a further example.

Hannah Swarton was taken captive in a raid on Casco Fort in 1690 which only two of her four children survived who remained in Canada after their mother's return. Separated from them, she was assigned to an Indian family with whom she travelled from New England to Canada where she becomes the servant of a French family until she was ransomed and brought back to Boston in 1695. The narrative has a four-part structure, as Weber observes, that occurs in many captivities of that time (cf. 1985, 62). They start with the attack and then relate the strenuous journey into captivity in great detail. Followed by a section in life with the Native Americans or in Canada, the narration then closes with the flight or ransom and the return to New England (Weber 1985, 62).

In line with many narratives of the same theme, Swarton's account describes two deliverances, a physical and spiritual. While the first part of the narrative elaborates Swarton's hardships while travelling the Indians, her more comfortable position in Canada also exposes her to the French Catholics' attempts at proselytization. Accordingly, the first person narrator renders outer and inner events of the character and brings them into a relationship. Scholars have drawn attention to the fact that this is the only first person captivity recorded by Mather and other scholars have remarked on the closeness between spiritual autobiography and captivity accounts (cf. Weber 1985, 62; Kestler xxvi). So, when Swarton suffers from hunger, cold, and the exertion of traveling with a heavy burden, she remembers David's psalms, identifies herself with Job's laments and "was … instructed, directed and comforted by these Bible passages. While Swarton underscores the brutality of and dependency on the Natives, a little narrative passage illustrates the common want for food and shows Swarton active in the procuring of it: "on the Saturday, I was sent by my Mistress to that part of the Island most likely to see some Canoe … to invite some Indians … to come to relieve us" (*HD* 54, cf. 58). By making a fire, Swarton succeeds in obtaining food for herself and her mistress while the rest of the war party was on a fishing trip. While the first part of the narrative revolves around the strenuous and dangerous voyage into captivity, the second paragraph deals with the emotional impact of being separated from home, family and religious community.

In analogy to the identification of New England as under divine punishment, Swarton recognizes her situation as such and begins to confess and repent of her sins. Using the same words as in the sermon, the community addressed by Mather could identify with Swarton or

vice versa through the immediate presentation of Swarton's hardships. This emphatic reaction, in turn, reinforces the theological points of the sermon so that the audience applies them to their own life. Triggered by a remark of her Indian Mistress, who was originally English and converted to Catholicism with her Native husband, Swarton perceives her situation as a divine punishment and "Humiliation," taking up the sermon's leading metaphor. "[S]he would say, *That God delivered us into their Hands to punish us for our Sins*; And, this I knew was true for myself" (*HD* 58). Swarton applies the general sinfulness of New England that Mather regards as the cause for the Indian wars and to herself, showing the close relationship between community and individual. The relationship between Swarton and the community is mirrored by the position of her narrative in the text of the sermon. Her individual humiliation and deliverance correspond to the plot outline of Mather's doctrine that applies again to the community. Thus, like medieval exempla Swarton's narrative offers a tangible illustration of the embedding argument. Taking over the exact wording, Swarton's narrative could also serve as a guide for putting into practice what Mather demands in his sermon: confessing one's sins, receiving and being open for God's guidance, waiting for and receiving a divine deliverance. At the same time, the reader is drawn into the plot by the immediacy that a first person narrative evokes. According to Gary Ebersole, identifying with the captive is necessary for the "emotional and intellectual improvement of these stories" (cf. 68). Through identification, the readers can connect Mather's diagnosis of New England's wrongs with Swarton's confession of her own neglect of religious duty and enter into the same exercise with the promise of deliverance that Swarton has already received. But Mather also directly addresses his audience and conflates the audience and the captive's sins when, as Ebersole puts it, he "wonders out loud whether it would be possible to exterminate the Indians, if only the community humbled itself before God" and states that all mankind is held captive through sin by the devil (66). Consequently, Swarton's act of self-humiliation prefigures what New England has to do be redeemed from, that captivity to sin as Swarton is from the hands of the Natives and the French.

Swarton's narrative functions as an analogy or exemplary illustration of the sermon's doctrine, it deviates from the patterns set out as exemplary in previous writing. Yet while its function remains exemplary as in previous centuries, the emplotment pattern is not as straightforward as in the examples discussed earlier. Originally, the deliverance pattern has a smaller scope with its limited cast of characters as well as an action that revolves around a central turning point in quick temporal succession. All of these elements are missing from Swarton's account that instead introduces elements that can also be found in the shipwreck

narratives discussed above. In contrast to mechanistic plots of punishment and deliverance that did not disclose the reaction of any of the characters to their fate, first person narratives, such as Anthony Thacher's letter but also the story of Major Gibbons related by a third person heterodiegetic narrator, offer descriptions of the inner workings of the characters as well. Also, contrary to exemplary emplotment, they understand deliverance both as a salvation of the body and the soul. This discourse is especially present in Swarton's narrative, but typical for first-person captivity accounts, such as Rowlandson's and Williams'. As the structure of repeated removes also marks Rowlandson's spiritual journey, Swarton's account interrupts the narration of her journey with reflections on her status and self-examination. Similar to Rowlandson, she notices the tendency to leave her religious community in pursuing material gain, "depriving our selves and our Children of so great a Benefit for our Souls; and all this for Worldly Advantages" (*HD* 68). In the following, Swarton relates how different passages of the Bible have strengthened her in reaction to what happened to her outwardly and have in turn influenced her behavior.[34]

Remembering specific biblical passages gives Swarton the confidence to hold on to Protestantism, first by evoking emotions and then resolutions, as outlined by Baxter in *The Saints Everlasting Rest* and Cotton Mather's *Compassions Called for*. In the first part, dealing with the dangers and deprivations of captivity, Bible passages serve to express the emotions that Swarton feels and offer her comfort through the similar situation that the characters found themselves in. In addition, Swarton experiences divine help and preservation that enables her to walk onward despite the extreme hunger, coldness and strain while many others from her village were killed by the Indians when they grew too weak to continue. (*HD* 54). "[T]he Lord renewed my strength … kept me from any Sickness, or such Weakness as to disenable me from Travelling" (*HD* 53, 55). While her physical condition improves in Quebec, Swarton's spiritual trials emerge as a new threat as she faces aggressive attempts at converting her to Catholicism. Again, Bible passages from Swarton's memory offer support and strengthen her resolution. So, under pressure to turn Catholic, Swarton "was kept from turning, by that Scripture, Mat 10: 32, 33. *Whosoever shall confess me before Men, him will I confess before my Father which is in Heaven*" (*HD* 65). Following the exhortation of that passage, Swarton repeatedly resists conversion but attends Catholic

[34] Carroll argues that Mather imitated the way his father prefaced and influenced the narrative of Mary Rowlandson by using similar themes and formulations and critics speculate that the Bible references were inserted by him, hinting at the multiple intentions that have shaped New England texts and short narratives in particular (cf. 58; Toulouse 92).

services occasionally.

> And once when I was at their [Catholic] Worship, that Scripture 2 Cor. 6. 14 to the End, came into my mind: *What Communion hath Light with Darkness! … Wherefore come out from among them, and be ye separate, and touch not the unclean thing, and I will receive you, and I will be a Father unto you and ye shall be my Sons and Daughters, saith the Lord Almighty*. This Scripture was so strong upon my Spirit, that I thought I was out of my way to be present at the *Idolatrous Worship*, and I resolv'd never to move unto it again … and accordingly I never went more, and they did not force me to it. (*HD* 65-66)

Similar to the practice of meditation described by Baxter, Swarton summons a Bible passage from her memory that proceeds to affect her. As she is emotionally moved by the passage its internalization furthers the resolution not to attend a Catholic service again, which she puts to practice without any negative repercussions (cf. *HD* 66). So, Hannah Swarton's narrative offers different ways of using Bible passages, other than typology or mere analogy. In fact, her narrative follows the steps outlined by the two sermons of Cotton Mather discussed in this chapter: they lead her through a process of humiliation and deliverance and demonstrate the impact of Bible passages on the soul that further resolutions and a renewal of godly living. As Carroll argues, Swarton's narrative continues the argument of the sermon with different means. While the sermon, including Hannah Dustan's story, offers only an incomplete demonstration of the principle of humiliation and deliverance, Swarton's narrative completes the storyline and ends in thanksgiving for God's continuous grace (cf. Carroll 53).

These elements complicate the overall plot of humiliation and deliverance that applies to the beginning and the end of each section but leaves little room for the emotional experience and the integration of Bible passages. Hence, the plot pattern of the deliverance with its structure of removal, hardships of travel and living among a foreign culture collide with a simple analogy of humiliation and deliverance. The use of biblical analogies is transferred from prefiguring the plot, as it did with exempla of divine punishment or preservation, to mirroring or guiding the interior life of the character through its emotional and spiritual upheavals. From elements of the plot, interspersed biblical references turn into intrusions that bring the narrated time to a halt and break open the tight temporal and plot structure of the exemplum while still fulfilling the same exemplary function in the embedding sermon. Their relocation coincides with a change of function: while Bible references provided earlier exempla with an authentication or model for their plot, they now mirror or shape the character's experience either through analogy or a meditative internalization that triggers action. What Wharton states about the use of Bible quotations in

sea deliverances is true for the first person captivity narrative as well: as a new way of using typology they "connect scriptural type and providential event" through the likeness of experience (Wharton 16, 17). At the same time, they also go beyond the event in mirroring or shaping experience and emotions. The centrality of affectations of the mind and the will to live a holy life is more pronounced in the narration than in Mather's sermon. The practice of piety under such circumstances comes closer to Baxter's description of meditation on which Mather's Confessions Called for is based upon.

While earlier sermons relied on the reproduction of plots found in the Bible and in history to show their relevance and dogmatic truth, Mather now uses or adapts accounts of personal experience to show the beneficial effects of self-examination, meditation and affective responses to scripture. If they can be used as exemplary illustrations of the narrative structure that Mather endows his doctrines with, he often recurs to first person accounts that are authenticated not by biblical means but by the credibility of the writer and experiencer of the events. Yet, if the exemplary relationship to the embedding sermon or doctrine is not so clear, different narrative devices are needed as the following section will show.

The captivity of Hannah Dustan shows the ambiguities of oral material and Cotton Mather's difficulties of emplotting it as a providential narrative. As with the shipwreck of John Dean, Mather uses topical and much talked about events with close local ties to his congregation.[35] Mather even gave the sermon in Dustan's presence, which, together with its prominence, also limited his freedom in editing the narrative (cf. Kolodny 26). A later version appeared in *Decennium Luctuosum* (1699), which was then also included in the *Magnalia* and provides more of the context that was irrelevant for contemporary listeners. Though a captivity narrative by subject, Hannah Dustan's story differs in narrative structure and outcome from the usual conventions of the form. Since Mary Rowlandson's *The Sovereignty and Goodness of God*, many captivity narratives have been written in first person and included many personal reflections that have been linked to other forms of Puritan writing such as the jeremiad and the spiritual autobiography. By contrast, the story of Hannah Dustan is told from a third person omniscient narrator who overlooks, arranges and comments. Yet even so, the narrative revolves around the singular case of a woman who

---

[35] Laurel Thatcher Ulrich calls Hannah Dustan, whose name is spelled differently depending on the source, "by 1698 the most famous woman in New England," and even before its first publication in *Humiliations Follow'd by Deliverances*, the story had reached, for example, John Pike, minister in New Hampshire, who recorded it in his "Observable Providences" for March 15, 1697. When Dustan traveled to Boston, she was entertained by Samuel Sewall, interviewed by Cotton Mather and received the bounty for her scalpings from the governor (cf. Ulrich 167-69).

killed her Native captors and returned to the British settlements, resisting any emplotment as a providential rescue.[36]

In the beginning of the narrative, Mather uses narrative techniques that highlight the dramatic quality of events and follows parallel strands of action. Especially in the *Magnalia*, Mather opens the narrative with a quick succession of shifting perspectives. The first sentence juxtaposes Hannah Dustan, who is recovering after the birth of her last child in her house, with the approaching Native American war party. In the midst of the attack, the perspective focuses shortly on Hannah Dustan "In this Broil, one Hannah Dustan... a Body of Terrible Indians drew near unto the House were she lay" whereas the narrative in *Humiliations Follow'd by Deliverances* omits the war scene before continuing with the second part of the same sentence (*HD* 41; *MC* vii, 90). Leaving Hannah Dustan at the very moment of this threatening approach, the narrative shifts to her husband and back in time. So, Mr. Dustan arrives before the Native Americans but resolves to leave to gather and save some of their children, realizing that his wife is unable to move quickly enough to flee. From then on, Mr. Dustan's dilemma and choices are rendered in interior focalization though his thoughts are summarized by the narrator. He was "utterly despairing to do her any Service" and resolved "that on the Horse which he had with him, he would Ride away with That [child] which he should in this Extremity find his Affection most pitched upon, and leave the rest unto the Care of Divine Providence" (*HD* 41-42).

The pace of the narrative slows down considerably while focusing on Mr. Dustan's dilemma and the narrative voice shifts between describing with interior focalization and commenting on Mr. Dustan's decisions from a distance. Having found his children, "such was the Agony of his Parental Affections that he found it impossible … wherefore he took up a Courageous Resolution to Live and Die with them all" (*HD* 42). The narrator lauds his resolution and emphasizes how "manfully" Dustan keeps the Native attackers in check while following the slowly moving train of his children, though it is only through a "Singular Providence" that he and his children safely reach the garrison "about a Mile from his House" (*HD* 42). At this point, the narrative shifts back to the Dustan home and the capturing of Hannah Dustan and her nurse who unsuccessfully tried to escape with the baby (cf. *HD* 42). "But this House must in the mean Time have more dismal Tragedies acted at it" (*HD* 42). The perspective moves back and forth between the simultaneous strands of the plot and

[36] Hartman sees the similarities between Puritan providence tales and captivity narratives in their use similar methods of authentication and demonstrate God's intervention on behalf of the saints (cf. 137-38, 16-17, 122).

creates the drama of the Indian attack as acted out between different locations. Each change of location, mostly by contrasting the inside and outside of the house, also signifies a switch back in time to recapitulate what has happened and then relate the following developments. While the captivity narratives are generally structured as a sequence of places, moving from the English settlement to the various stages of the journey and into captivity at a Native town or even New France, as in Swarton's example, the Dustan narrative is singular in its presentation of the capture at the beginning through two intersecting and simultaneous strands of action. Together with the change of focalization, the dichotomy of the inside and outside of the house between which the narrative shifts back and forth allows portraying Mr. Dustan's dilemma and providential salvation whereas other narratives concentrate solely on the captive.

Through its use of a third person narrator, Hannah Dustan's story differs from the majority of captivity stories that center on the captive's point and their use of characterization. In contrast to the dual layers of the captivity plot in Swarton's and Rowlandson's narrations that parallel the deliverance of the body with a spiritual one, Hannah Dustan's emotional reactions or possible spiritual struggles are missing due to the shift in narrative voice. Mather's narrator describes the hardships of travel and the brutal killing of Dustan's child:

> [E]re thay had gone many Steps, they dash'd out the Brains of the Infant, against a Tree, and several other *Captives* … [Christians, A Joshua would have rent his Clothes … and have Humbled himself Exceedingly upon the falling out of such doleful Ruines upon his Neighbours!] However, Dustan (with her Nurse,) notwithstanding her present condition, Travelled that Night, about a Dozen Miles; and then kept up with their New Masters … without any sensible Damage, in their Health, from the Hardships, of their *Tavel*, their *Lodging*, their *Diet*, and their many other Difficulties. (*HD* 43)

Rather than relating the practice of humiliation and deliverance on the present narrative, as exemplified by Swarton, Mather re-creates a dialogic relationship between God and Dustan to cast his story as a deliverance and at the same time addresses the audience to evoke the emotional reaction that is in other cases rendered through focalizing on the captive. While Dustan has appeared "full of Astonishment and … with a heart full of the most fearful Expectation" at her capture, the narrator omits any emotional reaction to her child's murder (*HD* 42, 43, cf. Burnham 1997, 53). Instead, the narrator intersperses an address to the reader in brackets that exemplifies the appropriate reaction to hearing and reading the above through the biblical parallel of Joshua in a simile. Putting the exhortation of his sermon into practice, the narrative should evoke humiliation even through the fate of one's Neighbor and

the recognition that the sinfulness of New England rather than individual mistakes are the cause of this judgment through Native American violence. The Native Americans, by contrast, are characterized by stereotypical violence as they "dashed out the brains against a tree" in an oxymoron as "those whose Tender Mercies are Cruelties," both reminiscent of Rowlandson's wording (cf. Ebersole 25). Yet, Mather differentiates between the ravaging war party of the initial capture and the Native family with whom Dustan travels. Introducing plot elements of the deliverance, God intervenes on Dustan's behalf and "gave them to find unexpected favor, from the *Master*" who is heading an "Indian Family" of twelve persons, mostly children, who are devout Catholics and convene regularly for prayer (*HD* 45). Emphasizing the authenticity of this information, Mather states that "I must now publish what these poor women assure me" (*HD* 45). The oral account becomes part of a written exhortation of the English lack of piety, "for the shame of many a *Prayerless Family* among our *English*" (*HD* 45). According to his purpose to exhort New England's backsliding tendencies and present a model of humiliation and repentance for its betterment, Mather uses biblical figures, such as Jonah, and even Native Americans.

At the same time, Dustan's story employs biblical parallels as a justification strategy for Hannah Dustan's violent escape. During her captivity, Hannah Dustan's name is related through a Bible paraphrase to the mother of the prophet Samuel. "[L]ike another *Hannah*, [the English captives were] pouring out their soul before the Lord: Nor did their Praying Friends among our selves forbear to *pour out* Supplications for them" (*HD* 45). For Puritans, names are significant and invite associations that indicate a person's character or spiritual potential.[37] In Dustan's narrative, Mather draws parallels to the actions of biblical figures, connecting Hannah Dustan's prayer with the biblical Hannah and her actions with the murder of Sisera by Jael, both fellow women. Similarly, Hannah Dustan's turning the Native American arms against themselves, the killing of the Native family that she accompanied is phrased in biblical terms. Intimating that Dustan was drawing her counsel from scripture, the narrator states that Dustan "took up a Resolution to Imitate the Action of Jael upon Sisera." Down to his choice of words, Mather's account mirrors the Bible passage from Judges 4:17-22 and the song of Deborah (cf. Ulrich 196). When Sisera, the commander of Israel's enemy flees, Jael invites him to her tent where she drives a peg it through the temple of the sleeping man. Read in the analogical manner that marks *Humiliation Follow'd by*

[37] See, for example, Urian Oakes' explanation of Cotton Mather's name at his graduation (cf. Silverman 23).

Deliverances in general, this passage implies also the situation of the English in North America at large, who, like the Israelites, were suffering from raiding parties and a continuous war with neighboring people. In Deborah's song of triumph, this female leader of Israel exclaims about Sisera: "bow'd, fell down, lay down'," a wording that is mirrored in Mather's text.

As a result, Mather "turns from simply reporting her captivity to his own sermonic engagement with its meanings" by interpreting her violent escape as an "act of divine restoration" that occurs in answer to her humiliation as a captive and the persistent prayer of Dustan and Mather's congregation (Toulouse 88-91, 88; cf. *HD* 45). Even the legalistic argument that is ascribed to Hannah Dustan and used as an additional justification for her murderous escape can be subjugated to the logic of the sermon as Ulrich demonstrates. Rendered as free indirect discourse, the passage comes as close as possible to reporting Dustan's thoughts by stating: "being where she had not her *own* life secured by any law unto her, she thought she was not forbidden by any law to take away the life of the murderers by whom her child had been butchered" *(HD* 46) Rendered as narrative commentary, these allusions to biblical plots replace the conventional providential emplotment that the narrative resists. In both cases, Mrs. Dustan and her husband seem to save their children and their own lives through their undaunted action and strength, with providence only in a supporting role. Even the image of the Native American shifts from a devilish envoy of destruction and violence to devout Catholics whose devotion to prayer Mather cannot help but praise and commend to his audience.

While Hannah Swarton recognizes the similarities between her experience and biblical figures and phrases her grief with words from scripture, Mather uses biblical parallels for Dustan's actions, quoting from first Samuel where Hannah, the prophet's mother states that she "poured out my soul before the LORD" (cf. *HD* 58; 1. Sam 1:10-17). The analogy is continued when, like the biblical Hannah through the priest Eli, Hannah Dustan receives a prophetic confirmation that their prayer has been heard. "Their Indian Master, sometimes when he saw them Dejected, would say … *What need you Trouble your self? If your God will have you Delivered, you shall be so*! And it seems, our God would have it so to be!" (*HD* 45). By turning this provocation into a statement, Mather anticipates the outcome of the narrative and at the same time re-frames the Native's direct speech as prophesy. At the same time, the scene is reminiscent of King Darius telling Daniel that his God will deliver him out of the lion pit. While the Native's prophesy again establishes another parallel situation of Israel in the Babylonian captivity and the topos of 'Judea Capta'

that Toulouse regards as central to the sermon and its attached narratives, it also shows how the power of God becomes visible to the captors when God saves his people.

So far, scholars have not mentioned this reference as well as the name analogy to the biblical Hannah and have rather focused on the implications of likening Hannah Dustan to the biblical Jael. Yet of the providential interpretation of the narrative, picking up the wording of the Native American's prophesy is instrumental to establishing a causality between Dustan "pouring out her soul" and her successful flight. So, the prophetic anticipation "Our God would have it so" is repeated when the narrator highlights that the metaphorical "*Dead Sleep*" of the Natives anticipates their literal death in an aside to the reader, that again fuses different time layers and focalizations: "the whole Crew, was in a Dead Sleep, ('twill presently prove so!)" (*HD* 46). Mather thereby alludes to an emplotment pattern that previously characterized his exemplary judgments and deliverances: a direct speech becomes the turning point of the plot and anticipates its ending. While Toulouse and Thatcher focus on the framing of the story by the sermon and its 'Improvement', Mather already introduces cues for understanding Hannah Dustan's narrative as a providence tale by alluding to exemplary emplotments that provide a teleological trajectory as well as a cause and effect relationship between Dustan's imitation of the biblical Hannah and Jael.

At the same time, these emplotments are no longer the basic structure of the narrative but rather an additional layer to the well-known story introduced and mediated by the narrator. The excerpts above also illustrate how narrative commentary interrupts the story and affects a shift in perspective: the biblical paraphrase of Hannah's supplication is first connected to Dustan and, in a second step, to her friends among Mather's congregation. Likewise, the prophesy of the deliverance by the Native American is echoed by Mather's appropriation of "your God" to "our God" that changes the focalization from Dustan to the congregation that listens to or reads his sermon and establishes a prolepsis that at the same time continues a biblical parallel. Anticipating the ending of the narrative, Mather then has to switch back to Dustan and the Native Americans, the narrative present, by using "now" as a temporal marker. So, Mather not only renders the capture as a succession of different viewpoints and time levels but extends this practice throughout the second part of the narrative. Employing narrative commentaries and temporal markers, Mather fuses biblical, present and narrative time to demonstrate a divine hand in Dustan's deliverance. At the same time, the prophetic insertions anticipate the narrative's ending, portraying events that neither Dustan nor the Native American can know but that allow Mather in his retrospective telling to establish a providential pattern.

While the insertions connect the main theme of the sermon with Hannah Dustan's story, its lack of providential emplotment patterns complicate a direct application and emotional reaction. Instead, the affective involvement of the audience rests on the narrator's descriptions and handling of focalization that differs at the two turning points of the story: while Mr. Dustan's feelings are summarized for the audience, the narrative rests on external focalization and is even interrupted by narratorial commentary at Mrs. Dustan's killing of the Natives and flight. In contrast to the plot-driven shorter examples, Mr. Dustan's dilemma offers a view of a character's feelings and guides the reader's sympathy, whereas the brutal Native Americans and, tellingly, Hannah Dustan are focalized from the exterior. This leads to what Michele Burnham has called a "gap" between the reader's identification with the "image of the innocent English mother and her incredible act of 'Indianized aggression'" (Burnham 53).

While Mather uses the biblical parallel of Hannah to link Dustan with the theme of humiliation broached by the sermon, a narrative analysis demonstrates that Mather is not so much interested in creating an affective identification with Dustan than to establish narrative emplotments that justify her violent act and interpret it as a divine deliverance. Instead of enlisting the sympathy of the reader, the narrator aims at justifying Mrs. Dustan's actions through the biblical parallel and the deliberations about her legal status that Mather possibly quotes from Dustan's own account.[38] Working with the limited space available and a plot that did not allow for a straight forward interpretation as a providential, Mather's narrator tightly controls the narrative through different perspectives and focalization and commentary that adds a biblical perspective and references to the prayers of Dustan and the community to mark the deliverance as a divine answer, indicating that these emplotment patterns were still available and shared by his congregation. In Dustan's story, a providential rescue plot is superimposed on the events through interventions of the narrator. As Mather could not change the basic plot in front of an audience that included Dustan herself and many who had heard her story before, the intention to show how God reacts to prayer and humiliation is borne out by the narrative commentary.

This incongruity between what is narrated and its interpretation as a providence, along with the essential subject of survival in captivity and justification of the revengeful female figure have inspired many subsequent treatments of Hannah Dustan's story in local

---

[38] While Kathrin Whitford ascribes the "legalistic" justification of the Natives' deaths to Hannah Dustan, the biblical pattern conforms to Mather's strategy of overlaying events with biblical parallels, as Ulrich argues (cf. 311; Ulrich 169).

histories as well as in works by Whittier, Thoreau and a story in the *American Magazine of Useful and Entertaining Knowledge* ascribed to Nathaniel Hawthorne, which are all based on Mather's text. While some narratives celebrated Dustan as a mother to the colony and heroine, others "decidedly turned the father into the hero of the story, despite Dustan's abandonment of his wife" (Weis 57).[39] Still, most of the narratives not only draw on Mather's story but also his formal devices.

Like the historical accounts by George Bancroft and Charles Mirick, Hawthorne renders the narrative from Mr. Dustan's point of view until his arrival at the family's home. Hence, both, original and later adaptations work with parallel strands of action but only Mather switches several times between them and fractures the temporal continuum of the narrative. Further echoing Mather's devices, Hawthorne's narrator frequently comments on the action and refers to Mather directly to point out his different interpretation of the Native Americans and subsequently of their killing by the hands of Dustan: "Mather like an old hard-hearted, pedantic bigot, as he was, seems trebly to exult in the destruction of these poor wretches" (Hawthorne 396). By transferring the attribute "poor" from the captive to the captors, the narrator stresses the different interpretation of Dustan's deed outside of a typological framework. The two versions differ not so much in their use of narrative devices but how they deal with the ambiguity of the events in the story. When narrative treatment allows for two different effects and interpretations of the same story, the reader witnesses how the simple allegorical mode of earlier providences gives way to a complex storytelling in which the narrator and the psychology of the individual character move to the foreground. While Mather's narrative is far from consistent in these aspects, its superficial use of emplotment patterns provided an opportunity for further development and contrary interpretations as in Hawthorne's treatment. Starting with the contradictory elements of Cotton Mather's rendition, Hannah Dustan's story acquires to some degree the ambiguity and openness that separates simples narratives from the complexity of the later short story, to use Mary Rohrberger's distinction (cf. 106-12).[40] From a story meant to illustrate providential deliverance, the story turns into an indictment of Dustan's actions and sentimentalizes the image of the Native Americans. Their behavior also establishes a

---

[39] For heroic portrayals see for example Robert B. Caverly's *Heroism of Hannah Dustan*: *Together with the Indian Wars of New England* (1874) and others listed by Burnham (55).

[40] Mary Rohrberger defines a simple story as lacking the "deep structure" and symbolism that allows for ambiguity and complexity (106, cf. 107). Instead of using a teleological literary history that sees the simple story as one step towards the later and more complex short story, Rohrberger argues that nineteenth century writers have written simple stories and short stories alike, quoting the stories of O'Henry as examples (cf. 116).

religious contrast, as the Natives' generosity extends beyond boundaries of race whereas "the three prisoners prayed apart." They separate themselves before their murderous escape kills the whole Native family, even its most innocent members. In vain, the narrator implores: "Oh, the children! Their skins are red, yet spare them, Hannah Dustan." The sight that moved the affectionate father to venture his life for the sake of his family rather hardens the resolve of the mother whose fury is directed against the different skin, of "the copper colored babes" (397). Instead of the nurturing qualities of a mother that Caverley and other portrayals enunciate, Hannah Dustan becomes a harbinger of death.[41] The thought of her own children rather encourages than restrains her, which has led Ann-Marie Weis to argue that Hawthorne portrays Dustan as a potential murderer of her own children as well (cf. Weis 55). Likewise, the narrator uses animal metaphors to describe Hannah Dustan as a "raging tigress" who is slaughtering and scalping the civilized and religious Natives, also implying that she is not acting human. The narrator is clear in his judgment of Mather who "seems to exalt in the destruction of these poor wretches" that he regards as a divine deliverance from captivity (396). Contrary to most sentimental stories, in Hawthorne's rendition, it is the male figure of Mr. Dustan that is "emotional and protective" towards his children but also "far from an ineffectual sentimental character" in his courageous and fierce rebuttal of the attacking Native Americans (Baker 100). According to Dorothy Z. Baker, Hawthorne uses Mr. Dustan to point towards the future of the newly founded United States that, contrary to the antagonism that marks much of Mather's portrayal and Hannah Dustan's actions, needs to establish a sympathetic bond between all its citizens and demands for "sympathetic historical narratives" (100).

While *Compassions Called for* endorses sympathy with those under the wrath of God and *Humiliations Follow'd by Deliverances* asks the congregation to react to their own situation with humility and contrition, the affective reaction to writing through a feeling heart is nowhere more pronounced than in the sentimental short fiction of the eighteenth century magazines. Humanism as well as Catholics and Reformed Protestants emphasized the role of emotions in guiding towards and sustaining virtue, as in the example of Jesus who is moved by and weeps about the misery he encounters and accordingly relieves it. While Puritans saw sympathy as first of all directed towards their fellow Christians in order to form a unified body of the church, civic applications date back to Thomas Hobbes'

---

41 Lineage is theme that runs through the various adaptations of the Dustan story. Either Mr. Dustan is portrayed as saving the next generation or Hannah Dustan's motherhood is foregrounded by quoting the number of her children (cf. Baker 100).

Leviathan (1651) who regards 'fellow-feeling' as the basis of the social contract that underlies a state (cf. (Calvin i, 56; Gaston 135). Similar to efforts to counter the loss of familiar structures and hierarchies after the founding of the United States, Protestants have used a "human sensitivity of perception" to overcome the sense of alienation or dislocation in a society dominated less by the communal practice of religion than by economic demands (Knott 1). Among the societal elements that are lost is the waning belief in providentialism and New England's mission as political turmoil grew and church membership dwindled. By consequence, the narratives analyzed in this chapter cannot build on a joined understanding or knowledge of exemplary plot types and the doctrines they express. Rather, deliverances from sea danger and captivity represent providential interpretations through individual perspectives or narrative commentary. When they aim at certain actions or behavioral changes on behalf of the audience, the captivities and sea deliverances in this chapter acquire such a function only in context of the embedding in sermons or historical texts as they appeal to the readers' emotions, as Mather does in *Compassions Called for* and the *Magnalia*.

Chapter 3

Empirical Accounts of the Strange and Supernatural

As providential judgments and deliverances, supernatural phenomena and curiosities become part of the transatlantic "culture of wonder" in which the European settlers relate their experiences of the new continent (cf. Winship 1996, 29; Hall 1995, 29-30). While Spanish exploration accounts have existed for more than a century, Captain John Smith published *A Description of New England* (1616) about his travels around modern-day Plymouth 1616 and *A Relation or Journall of the Beginning and Proceedings of the English Plantation* (1622) relates the experience of the first settlers, whereas the religious interpretation of their experience can be traced through Edward Johnson's *Wonderworking Providence* (1653) and the journals by Bradford and Winthrop that have long remained and been circulated in manuscript. John Josselyn's *Account of Two Voyages to New England*, however, combines a travel guide with the most complete contemporary description of New England's flora and fauna and narrative passages that often resemble the later tall tales (cf. Stearns 141).

An English traveler and botanist, Josselyn published *New England's Rarities, discovered in Birds, Beasts, Fishes, Serpents, and Plants of that Country* (1672) and *An Account of Two Voyages to New England* (1674), both of which ran through at least two editions. Among his descriptions of New England's natural wonders, Josselyn includes a meeting with three settlers who tell stories of their encounters with dangerous animals, Native ghosts, and mythic figures. The opening frame already establishes New England as extraordinary: On that day, Josselyn heard "two of the greatest and fearfullest thunderclaps that ever were heard" (Josselyn 228). Anticipating the literary representations of tall tales, Josselyn recreates a situation of oral storytelling: "At this time, we had some neighbouring Gentlemen in our house, who came to welcome me into the Countrey; where amongst variety of discourse they told me of a young Lyon (not long before) killed at Piscataway bay an Indian; of a Sea-Serpent or Snake" (Josselyn 228; cf. Brown 1987, 63).[42] Yet the Natives

[42] Tall tales are humorous and exaggerated accounts of their protagonist's heroic deeds or character that have been shared orally and become part of American writing in the nineteenth century. They revolve around settling, exploring and surviving in North America and often describe the landscape, flora and fauna

also know that this snake is too dangerous to shoot at: "a boat passing by with English aboard and two Indians, they would have shot the serpent but the Indians dissuaded them, saying that if he were not killed outright they would be all in danger of their lives" (Josselyn 228). The next story relates the encounter with a "Triton or merman" that grabs Mr. Mittin's boat but is fend off and dyes the water with "his purple blood" (Josselyn 228). In Greek and Roman mythology, *triton* refers to the son of the sea god or a minor deity of the sea that is shaped half human half fish (cf. "Triton"). Searching for a way to describe the new continent, Mr. Mittin uses a mythological figure that links it to ancient European heritage. At the same time, the triton could be an example of the strange creatures that later furnish the content of tall tales that equally sprung up in frontier communities (cf. Dorson 1967, 43-44).

The last story relates how Mr. Foxwell stayed at night in his boat and witnessed an Indian ceremony from afar and heard a voice calling him ashore. Going along the New England coast, Foxwell stayed at night in his boat and "[a]bout midnight they were wakened with a loud voice from the shore, calling upon 'Foxwell, Foxwell, come ashore,' two or three times. Upon the sands, they saw a great fire and men and women hand in hand dancing round about it in a ring" (Josselyn 229). On the next day, Foxwell discovers the traces of many people and the remnants of a fire on the deserted beach. With this supernatural encounter, the story cycle reaches its climax after proceeding in a rising degree of strangeness. Dorson views this as an essential quality of folklore: a cycle of story tellers eager to surpass the previous narrator with their own yarn which is preserved in writing. They represent, on the one hand, the potential for strange encounters in the new continent as a trigger for storytelling and, on the other hand, the wit and bravery of their tellers and protagonists, all of them represent themselves as calm in the face of danger but "wise enough" to avoid Indian ghosts (Dorson 1967, 9).

While Josselyn narrates and summarizes the stories in his own narrative voice and renders speech indirectly—with the exception of the luring of Mr. Foxwell—his evaluation of them remains ambiguous. In the closing frame, Josselyn's narrator is reluctant to comment on the authenticity of the tales he has just retold: "These along with other stories they told me, the credit whereof I will neither impeach nor inforce, but shall satisfy myself and the reader hereof, with the saying of a wise, learned, and honorable knight, *that there are many stranger things in the world than are to be seen between London and Stanes*" (Josselyn 229). As in other travel narratives, Josselyn compares New England to the known quantity of

in great detail (cf. Ahrends 44; Brown 1987).

England to give his readers a guide to their interpretation. “Strange”, the word most often used for these phenomena, refers to something ‘belonging to another country,’ i.e. ‘foreign’ or ‘alien,’ in a contemporary but now obsolete usage. This geographical reference derives from its Latin word of origin *extraneus*, meaning “external” and is applied to everything that is “difficult to understand and explain” in modern English (“strange”). While the stories are related with the authority of the scientific explorer of the new colonies, this geographical logic implies that strangeness increases with distance, which might cater to the interest and expectations of Josselyn’s audience but ignores, however, the ‘strange news’ current in England at the time.

Contrary to the general principles drawn from biblical precedents and exemplary narratives, Josselyn’s collection of tales foregrounds individual experience and observation. The narrator careful reasons why, for example, Foxwell stayed close to shore but did not land at night or Mr. Mittin pursued this particular route that set the stage for the strange encounters that should be regarded as no less credible (cf. Josselyn 228). All of the narratives revolve around a specific place, naming Cape Ann, or Casco Bay that are common knowledge and make their way from shared experience into the individual accounts of marvelous encounters. As God is no longer the final cause motivating the action, he also loses his status as ‘primary’ cause for the existence of the extraordinary natural and supernatural phenomena witnessed by the tellers who instead refer to classical myths or Native American witchcraft. As Cotton Mather believes that the wilderness of North America was inhabited by the devil, Native Americans were widely believed to worship the devil and interact with ghosts, validating Josselyn’s comparison that assigns strange things to a distant and foreign country.

Like Josselyn’s tales, the testimonies of the witchcraft trials can be read as story-cycles that transfer local folklore into written narrative. Most of New England’s witchcraft records have been published by ministers and as part of religious writings, yet similar to Josselyn’s account, they lack a basis in biblical storytelling the way judgment and deliverances do. Still, emplotment patterns emerge out of the records of the Salem trials presented in *Wonders of the Invisible World* (1693) that are linked to their function as evidence in court. For example, Benjamin Abbot’s testimony against Martha Carrier establishes not only such a pattern but also some of the main themes that will reoccur during the trials. Starting with the specifics of character and time, the narrative quickly outlines the conflict with the Carrier family to focus on Martha Carrier’s threat.

> Carrier was very Angry with him upon laying out some Land near her Husbands: Her Expressions in this Anger were, That she would stick as close to Abbot, as the Bark stuck to a Tree, and that he should Repent of it, afore seven years came to an end, so as Doctor Prescott should never cure him. These words were heard by others, besides Abbot himself (*IW* 134)

As in other cases, Mather indents the reported speech of the suspect directly and her words are decisive for the outcome as well as their role in testifying towards Carrier's uncanny powers. While the punishment for sin in exempla corresponded to Bible passages, the words in this instant do not relate to any exterior source of authority. As in a judgment narrative, though, the words of the curse are complemented by the ensuing events that are related in a compressed manner that render them prophetic: Abbot is "exceedingly Tormented" by a swollen foot and an ulcer that spreads from his hip onwards to the groin. The aforementioned Doctor Prescott attempts his relief with the common methods of puncture but without success as Abbot "was brought unto Deaths Door, and so remained until Carrier was taken, and carried away by the Constaple; from which day, he began to mend, and so grew better … and is well ever since" (*IW* 134) The parallels established between Carrier's threat, the illness—specifically the mentioning of Dr. Prescott—and the mending after her arrest turn the story into evidence. Structurally, the narrative assigns agency to Carrier by suggesting a probable cause and effect relationships that then comes to bear on the legal function of the narrative by asserting her status as a witch. In contrast to the wonder lore and tall tales about the new continent, the story cycles told at witchcraft trials not only establish narrative patterns that link them to the former use of exempla but also have a different pragmatic dimension. Similar to the extraordinary natural phenomena recorded by colonial settlers, Peter Rushton argues that the court trials presented a self-authenticating logic in which popular beliefs about witches entered into the testimonies that were, in turn, regarded as true based on these very elements (cf. 25). Their acceptance as evidence and the resulting judgments, conversely, affirmed the truth of the witchcraft accounts (cf. Rushton 24).

To argue for a preternatural agency behind the reported event, the narratives not only weigh alternatives but use emplotment patterns that remained constant across temporal and spatial boundaries and link New England witchcraft with European folklore and witchcraft trials. Already in sixteenth century England, the pattern exemplified by the excerpt from Susanna Martins trial presents one of the typical elements that were validated by many narratives (cf. Gibson 2001, 45-46).

> Samuel Preston testify'd, that about two years ago, having some Difference with Martha Carrier, he lost a Cow in a strange Preternatural unusual manner; and about

> a month after this, the said Carrier, having again some Difference with him, she told him, He had lately lost a Cow, and it should not be long before he Lost another! which accordingly came to Pass; for he had a Thriving and well-kept Cow, which without any known cause quickly fell down and Dy'd (*IW* 136)

Preston's arguing triggers the wrath of the suspected witch and accordingly the death of his cattle, placing quarrel and the loss of the animals in a causal relationship that is also explicitly affirmed by Carrier. While the cause of the argument remains unstated, the narrative is related to a pattern that Marion Gibson describes as the denial narrative, in which family members or livestock suffer because of they did not follow the suspected witches' will (cf. 2001, 45-46). This narrative pattern was so common and representative of witchcraft stories that it has been satirized by contemporary critics of the witchcraft trials like Reginald Scot. His *Discoverie of Witchcraft* (1584) was among the first books that denied the existence of witchcraft and criticized the methods of its persecutors; it was frequently reprinted throughout the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. It contains a letter in which Scot warns his relative and witchcraft judge Thomas Scot Knight against considering accusations that are "frivolous, &... consisting of ghesse, presumptions, & and impossibilities contrarie to reason, scripture and nature" and cites the pattern of the denied witch and her revenge as a typical example:

> She was at my house of late, she would have had a pot of milke, she departed in a chafe bicause she had it not, she railed, she curssed... and finallie she said she would be even with me: and soon after my child, my cow, my sow or my pullet died, or was strangelie taken. (n.pag.)

The typical elements of request, denial, and subsequent misery are present, however, Scot claims that no causal connection exists between them and that no magic happened. Instead, he suggests "that their stories are stereotyped" and conform to the expectations and conventions surrounding witchcraft relations more than the truth (cf. Gibson 2001, 45). This skeptic attitude towards the statement of causal links was shared amongst others by Joseph Glanvill, who argues that causality cannot be observed empirically and has to be carefully construed only after eliminating all alternative explanations. Gibson credits narrative's ability to influence perception and validate themselves in arguing that people may have not been lying but structuring their narrative according to what they thought was taking place, even if it meant implying a magic that they could not observe but knew from other narratives or folklore (cf. Gibson 2001, 46). Still, the final word on the case was the ruling of the court to which the narratives only represented testimonies. According to Rushton, "judicial decisions resulted from the public performance of narrative accounts, which, by being

accepted, became authoritative versions of reality" (cf. 23-24).

In the report of Susanna Martin's trial in *Wonders of the Invisible World*, each witness relates uncanny encounters that testify to Martin's extraordinary abilities (*IW* 87-99). As an example of the detailed descriptions used in the testimonies, even the soles of her shoes stayed dry after traveling through rainy weather (cf. *IW* 91-92). Among them is also the belief that witches are able to kill or hurt cattle if the owners deny them a favor.[43] John Atkinson testified that when Susanna Martin was unwilling to let him exchange cows with her son, his animal subsequently turned mad and was not to be restrained while another witness claimed: "the Bewitching of Cattle to Death, upon Martins Discontents" (*IW* 87-89). While these accounts are matter of fact and additive in their style, as in the list of devices to restrain the cow, their character changes when going beyond simple folkloric motifs. Bernard Peache recounts that Martin appeared to him at night during and "could neither speak nor stir" and felt threatened by her and her companion (*IW* 88). However, he was able to put the specters to flight by hitting at them and later heard rumors that Martin had sustained corresponding injuries, similar instances were used as evidence in the Salem court more than once (cf. *IW* 88-89, cf. Dorson 1973, 45). As the trial of Susanna Martin shows, the New England witchcraft crisis shared many of the beliefs and sociological backgrounds of its European precursors (cf. Gibson 2003). Alleged witches were usually stereotyped and gossiped about as 'weird' over a long time, fortifying a reputation that would end in an accusation of witchcraft.[44]

While it is the purpose of these narratives to allow only for a single causal connection to be made, Josselyn's tales offer less structural continuities and leave the agency behind the events open, thereby combining different types of causality. Brian Richardson's distinction between "supernatural, naturalistic, chance and metafictional systems of causation" has been developed for narrative fiction, but at least the first two categories can be applied to the accounts analyzed here as well (Richardson 15). The tellers carefully explain why and how they come to observe the supernatural or marvelous occurrence. For example, Mr. Mittin's story features a naturalistic causality that explains how he came to the spot where he encountered the triton, namely by "fetching a compass about a small island … for the

---

[43] Cattle was an important source for income and a frequent aim of witchcraft, as Julian Goodare collection demonstrates by citing sources from Scotland and George L. Kittredge by collecting English and American accounts in a chapter on "The Witch and the Dairy." Because of the prevalence of household duties, Diane Purkiss has argued that witchcraft "constituted a powerful *fantasy* which enabled women to negotiate their fears and anxieties of housekeeping or motherhood" (93).

[44] The sociological background of witchcraft accusations has been examined, for example, by Paul Boyer and Stephen Nissenbaum.

advantage of the shot" and Mr. Foxwell's meticulously traces his journey to the enchanted beach (Josselyn 228). The snake, the merman, and the ghostly voice suddenly break into stories that are up to this point characterized by causal connections and detailed descriptions of everyday activities of the settlers. This intrusion bridges European heritage and New World experience, as well as oral and written storytelling, as it travels back to England in Josselyn's report. Similarly, the witchcraft trials establish a preternatural causation for Martin's dry feet as well as the sudden madness and death of a cow by retrospectively linking them—specifically—to a prior argument with Martin or—generally—to her practice of witchcraft. As part of court trials and a written natural history, the oral testimony and the settlers' stories progress from rumors to evidence in court and parts of the scientific description of the new continent. As with judgment tales, the aggregate weight of the narratives establishes this pattern of causation.

The recurring elements, like the strange encounters or the patterns of causations, as well as their basis in the situation of oral storytelling with a number of tellers taking turns, link Josselyn's and Mather's narratives with story cycles, which also play an important part in the development of the modern short story. In his survey of short story cycles, James Nagel argues that the cycle is an old form that has been practiced first in ancient Greek poetry and Renaissance drama, based on the timeless appeal of oral storytelling (cf. Nagel 12-13). In agreement with Ian Reid, Nagel argues that the coordination of stories responded to the teller's intention to place them into a larger context and make connections, and to coordinate knowledge (cf. Reid 46; Nagel 12-13). Story cycles are linked, for example, through a common setting, which is expressed in the explicit references to places in Josselyn's text and the neighborhood of Salem in the testimonies (cf. Nagel 16-17). Each narrator is located in a part of New England and the country seems to be the condition for the appearance of strange animals, mythic figures and ghosts, as Dorson states (cf. 1967, 8). Contributing either to a natural history of New England or a court trial, the tellers act as primary witnesses. Thus, their process of perception is foregrounded in the narratives along with the reactions to what they see and hear. While Dorson regards Josselyn's narratives as early examples of the tall tale that magnify the courage and wit of their teller, this implicit characterization of the teller foregrounds the narrator's perspective which is also typical of short story cycles (cf. Ahrends 44; Nagel 17). Through a series of different narrators, they emphasize the "personalized modes of perceiving and registering the events and feelings of the stories" (Nagel 17).

Both the settler's tales and the evidence given in Martha Carrier's trial revolve around the sensory perception of the narrators. Each story contributes to the image of the marvelous new continent in which the supernatural and strange can be encountered. In contrast to collections of providence tales, the cyclical narratives are framed as part of a natural history, oral storytelling or court procedure that provide the story cycles with cohesion along with the shared setting. While they replace the dogmatic or biblical emplotment patterns with new ones, they uphold the pragmatic function of the earlier exempla by using narrative as a means to ascertain the reality of strange and supernatural phenomena. Yet, as these phenomena lack clear points of reference, for example in Bible or on shared beliefs, their presentation relies more on credible witnesses and individual sensory evidence that is rendered in greater detail, as the descriptions of the strange phenomena in Josselyn's text and of Susanna Martin's extraordinary ability to stay dry in bad weather in the witchcraft trial demonstrate.

While individual experience in deliverance narratives remains tied to biblical precedents, as the example of Hannah Swarton illustrates, the individual's perception and reaction to what they see that is central to accounts of the strange and the supernatural invites ambiguity and questions of authenticity. Likewise, both oral and written narrative cycles have a tendency to multiply the narrative material. Each strange encounter contains a story that is not told, i.e. a previous experience with the dangerous snake or how the merman came to America, or encourages other narrators to tell similar stories, as in the courtroom procedure or the contest in the folklore setting of Josselyn's text. As they pass from oral to written narratives, stories of the strange and supernatural recur to folklore and mythic elements to reach this common ground, but also anticipate later story cycles in their characterization of each teller, a common setting and theme as well the use of a narrative frame.

Prodigious Natural Events in Diaries and Collections

Similar to the daily events that become providential judgments and deliverances, observations of natural phenomena entered the diaries of contemporary New Englanders. While they are not evidence of scientific observation and inquiry, John Pike's, Peter Thacher's, and John Winthrop's journals carefully monitor the seasons and record storms and other natural catastrophes. Pike, for example, divides every page of his diary into "Observable Seasons," and "Observable Providences." Apart from extreme conditions, such as storms and floods, Thacher and Winthrop also frequently record the daily weather and

reflect upon the seasons. For example, Winthrop describes a fierce storm in 1641, which was followed "by the highest tide he had since our arrival here" and dwells on the implications of a severely cold spring for farming in 1638 (*J* 368, 257). In conjunction with Increase Mather's *Illustrious Providence*, journal entries about thunderstorms show how a natural event could become subject to providential interpretation but also resist it. As a result, natural events emerge as "observable" but not always interpretable as divine deliverances or punishments, the plot patterns that have emerged so far.

Following a sudden rise of deaths caused by lightning, Increase Mather collects these "solemn works of Providence," thus linking them with other interventions and their function. Mather observes that while thunderstorms have always been frequent in New England, they have now claimed numerous victims as opposed to none in earlier times (cf. *IP* 72). Before the background of recent troubles and a decline in piety, Dorson regards Mather's allusion to the biblical destruction of Sodom and Gomorrah through lightning as a warning sign for New England as a whole (cf. 1973, 19; *IP* 73). Yet Mather also points out that deadly strikes of lightening often combine warning and deliverance: "Many who have … been as Brands plucked out of the burning, when the Lord hath overthrown others as God overthrew *Sodom and Gomorrah*" (*IP* 73). As "fatal and fearful slaughters" these deaths should evoke the same emotions that Cotton Mather describes as appropriate for any Christian who witnesses a divine judgment against a neighbor (*IP* 72, cf. *TD* 17). However, while some people are killed, others are saved like "Brands plucked out of the burning" (*IP* 73). As an effect, deadly strokes of lightning often simultaneously appear as providential judgments of some and deliverances of others, without any clear relationship between their lifestyle and death that would result in an exemplary emplotment.

As the warnings issued by strokes of lightening are not causally related to individual sins or sinners, they appear to be meant for the community as a whole. In Mather's first example, ten people are struck by lightning and "lay for dead" but all survive save one man whose death is not explained (*IP* 73). Mather's next example "confute[s] the vulgar error" of Plutarch who held that sleeping humans cannot be killed by lightning (*IP* 73). His reference to Plutarch shows the range of sources that providence collections draw on and how easily the same narratives can shift between illustrating religious or historical arguments, depending on their emplotment. Throughout the section, it remains unclear why a specific people were struck by lightning as they are usually surrounded by others, neither in a particularly endangered spot nor singled out for their moral deficiencies. Mathew Cole, the brother of Ann Cole, for example, was sitting at a table, bowing his head in prayer

together with a large group of people when he died without any conspicuous movement or torment. “He did not stir or groan after he was smitten, but continued standing as before, bearing upon the Table. There was no visible impression on his body or clothes, on the sole of one of his shoes was rent from the upper Leathers. There were about twelve persons in the Room; none else received any harm” (*IP* 75). No specific doctrine or theory of judgment or selection is connected to these episodes though there are reoccurring references to providential deliverance as “it pleased God to revive” some people while others “through the Providence of God received no hurt” (cf. *IP* 73, 78, 74). Its influence is echoed in formulations like “God mercifully spared and restored” Mr. Cotton’s granddaughter who has been struck with lightening but leaves unexplained why Mrs. Smith, called “a gracious Woman” or Josiah Walton, “a hopeful” and pious young man, die (*IP* 85-86, 84).

In the whole chapter, only one narrative is endowed with a providential interpretation that goes beyond a general notion of deliverance and warning. Contrary to the linear plots of judgments—and most deliverance tales—Increase Mather extends his narrative into the past to show the sinful life and conversion of Richard Goldsmith. In a next step, Mather relates these events to the details of his death by lightening in a third-person narrative. As usual, Mather dates this section and quickly introduces those gathered at Mr. Newman’s house after a service. In consecutive sentences, the narrator then juxtaposes “discourse … about the word and works of God” with the thunderstorm that arose and hits the house with “a smart Clap of Thunder” (*IP* 81). Common to all narratives, the stroke of lightening has olfactory, visible and audible effects: “It did for the present deafen them all, filling the Room with smoke, and a strong smell of Brimstone” (*IP* 81). The sensory description of this phenomenon is accompanied with comparisons that aid the imagination and comprehension of the reader: a “Ball of Fire, as big as the Bullet of a great Gun” accompanies the thunder and “was seen at the feet of Richard Goldsmith,” who is mentioned here for the first time (*IP* 81). The order of events is slightly altered as the fireball and the smoke have already vanished again when the narrative proceeds to render their effects on Richard Goldsmith, who sat near the chimney, falls off his chair and was “found … dead” immediately afterwards, along with the dog that lay under his chair (*IP* 81).

In the following paragraph, Mather unveils a disparity between Goldsmith’s expressions of piety and his practice along with his recent reconversion “half a year before his Death” (*IP* 82). Goldsmith, who was “reputed a good Man,” was “forward in engaging but backward in performing” his Christian lifestyle. Yet, corresponding to the Puritan concept of conversion, “God gave him a deep sense of his Evils” and Goldsmith repented

and mended his ways (*IP* 82). To show the effects of Goldsmith's conversion and link them to the circumstances of his death, Mather especially mentions his promotion of "holy and edifying Discourses," a use of speech that stands in contrast to his habit of breaking promises (*IP* 82). Goldsmith died in the midst of "speaking of some passages in the Sermon" and "his last words were, *blessed be the Lord*," showing his pious state of mind and hopeful death (*IP* 82).

While no other narrative contains such a lengthy explanation of the background of the deceased, its providential message is less pronounced than in the references to Sodom and Gomorrah, as well as the specific sins and biblical cases that Mather cites at the end of the chapter. The narratives quoted from Theodor Zwinger's encyclopedia *Theatrum Vitae Humanae* (1565) and the allusions to biblical stories clearly indicate death by lightening as a judgment for sin (cf. *IP* 97-98). However, a contrast emerges between Zwinger's group of drinking and playing men in a tavern that "were found in the very posture that the Lightening surprised them in: one with the Meat in his Mouth, another … Drinking" and Goldsmith who is taken in the midst of pious conversation (*IP* 98, cf. 82). Rather than through explicit argumentation, the temporal structure of the narratives enforces the simultaneity of these activities and the sudden stroke of lightening. This structure becomes visible when comparing the deaths of Mathew Cole and Richard Goldsmith, occurring when they prayed or talked about a sermon, with those of the group of drunkards and players at the inn and the biblical examples. In sum, Increase Mather's treatment of the "Remarkables of Thunder" defies narrative categories of providential mercies or judgments but foregrounds the importance of observing extreme weather conditions—also in the empirical sense of a historian like Plutarch—and regards their effects as a reminder to lead a pious life and prepare for an unexpected death.

In *Brontologia Sacra*: *the Voice of the Glorious God in Thunder*, a sermon delivered in 1694 and reprinted in the *Magnalia*, Cotton Mather takes up this very argument when he states that thunder should remind believers of God's law, their sins and to "make … Peace with God immediately" (*MC* vi, 18). While the sermon does not contain any narrative examples, its argument revolves around the basic structure that evolves out of Increase Mather's narratives in *Illustrious Providences*: lightning strikes sudden and unexpected, it does not stop at believers and reaches them in the middle of their occupations, whether sinful or holy. Mather underscores this fact by interspersing a message that he received while composing the sermon that is indicated in the print: "There is, -- [The Author being arriv'd hereabouts in his Discourse, a Messenger interrupted him, with Tidings that a Thunder-Clap

had just now fallen upon his own House" (*MC* vi, 16). Translating narrative time into space on the page, the punctuation indicates when Mather was interrupted and, along with the use of temporal markers, emphasizes the unexpected and sudden appearance of lightening. Mather affirms that the thunder is God's voice, as it calls to repentance and readiness for the Day of Judgment (cf. *MC* vi, 18). It foreshadows "*the future Coming of the* Glorious God *in the Thunder, and in great Glory*" and warns "*Make your Peace with God immediately, lest by the* Stroke *of his Thunder he take you away in his Wrath*" (*MC* vi, 18). While the passage introduces a narrative element into the sermon that illustrates this argument, Mather does not regard the stroke of lightening as a personal judgment but rather a reminder to Christians in general.

For Increase and Cotton Mather, thunder equals "the voice of God," a conception that, according to Dorson and Hall, is shared among many cultures (cf. *MC* vi, 16; *IP* 99, Dorson 1973, 19; Hall 1995, 37). While both affirm that God is the prime mover of the universe and responsible for the thunder, however, Increase Mather assumes that good as well as bad Angles could cause the thunder, citing the Jewish tradition as well as evidence from New England (cf. *MC* vi, 16; *IP* 128). According to the received opinion among Jewish Rabbis, "all great and sudden Destruction are from Satan, the Angel of Death" and the "*Deamons* which disturbed [Mathew Cole's] sister *Ann* ... [were] intimidating their concurrence in that terrible accident" (*IP* 128). Baker summarizes the contemporary opinion that due to their sudden appearance and unknown origin, thunder and lightning existed outside of natural laws but still directed by God and sees their recording as "attempts to decode God's message" (21-23). The tendency to observe strokes of lightening and describe their effects is already visible in Increase Mather's *Illustrious Providences* and lead to a dissolution of providential interpretations that were difficult to establish in the first place. The twelfth letter of Cotton Mather's "Curiosa Americana," deals with "Odd Effects of Thunder" (c. 1724) but forgoes any providential interpretation, even that of a general warning, when relating incidents from *Illustrious Providences* (cf. Beall 1961, 365, 371; Parrish 40).[45] Instead, the narratives revolve around a quasi-scientific report of how the audible, visible and olfactory effects of lightening and examine the dead for signs of singing (cf. *IP* 74-84). Only through conjunction and comparison, the narratives in *Illustrious*

[45] Susan Parrish argues the "Curiosa Americana" contained many natural wonders dismissed by the Royal Society and that Cotton Mather was regarding them less as indications of God's will, accommodating to shifting opinions inside the scientific community at the late seventeenth century (cf. 40). For more information on the "Curiosa Americana" and Mather's scientific interests, see Solberg and Beall (1979).

Providence emit the providential warning that Cotton Mather both lays out and illustrates in his sermon.

In addition to thunderstorms, diaries, almanacs and religious texts frequently report astronomical phenomena, such as eclipses, shooting stars, comets and cloud formations that are summarized as 'apparitions in the sky.' Among New England ministers and learned people, a number of astronomical treatises have been published, including Samuel Danforth's *Astronomical Description of a Late Comet* (1665) or Increase Mather's *A Discourse Concerning Comets* (1682) that regard these phenomena as worth of description as well as signs by linking them with historical events.[46] Noadiah Russel's diary for the year 1682 demonstrates how the lines between 'signs in the sky' blur as the minister, a tutor at Harvard college, reports how after a storm, a dark cloud gives way to the apparition of a man and then a ship. For January 26, 1682, Russell records a quick succession of high and low temperatures that lead to a thunderstorm "wherein was a great Storm of hail, ye hail stones were nearly ye bigness of a bullet, they broke several squares of glass at [Harvard College]" and in other cities like Lynn to the north and Roxbury to the south (1853, 52-3). With the change in temperature, his diary offers a meteorological explanation for the thunderstorm and enhances the visual quality of its descriptions through comparisons. After detailing the effects of the storm on the various communities, including information he must have received from other sources than as well, Russell includes the apparition as detailed by a letter to Margaret Mitchell sent by the minister Jeremiah Shepard from Lynn (cf. 1853, 54):

> [A]n honest old man Mr. Handford went out to look for a new moon thinking the moon had changed when in the west he espied a strange black cloud in which after some space he saw a man in arms complete standing with his legs straddling and having a pike in his hands which he held across his breast—which sight ye man with his wife saw and many others; After a while ye man vanished in whose room appeared a spacious ship seeming under sail though she kept the same station. (Russell 1853, 53)

While the short narratives of judgment and deliverance often started with a characterization of the main character's sinfulness or piety, the narrative introduces the witness of the apparition as "honest" and trustworthy, given the additional testimony of his "wife … and many others" that corroborate his account. As Russell does not attempt any providential interpretation that could, in turn, validate the strange appearance as a clear sign from God in

---

[46] Most Puritan accounts were based on Aristotle's meteorology that was transmitted by Pliny in the second book of the *Natural History*, a work which ran through various editions in fifteen to sixteen century Europe and was also quoted by Increase and Cotton Mather (cf. Hall 1995, 34; Hartman 50).

line with biblical precedents, the exact description, and authentication of the phenomena acquire additional importance. The passage further illustrates the practices of sharing information and that letters not so much contained personal interaction as local news and oddities that were read publicly and copied into diaries or further letters.

Adam Mckeown explains how seventeenth- and eighteenth-century writers distinguished between light apparitions on earth and in the sky. While the first were called 'marsh lights' and appeared under certain natural conditions described in Thomas Hill's treatise *Contemplation of Mysteries Contayning the Rare Effectes and Significations of Certain Comets* (1571), the second belonged to the spiritual world and thus required a providential interpretation (Mckeown 228). In 1665, Samuel Danforth's *An Astronomical Description of the Late Comet or Blazing Star* described a comet that was seen world-wide and which he described according to its movement through various constellations along with conjectures about its make-up, velocity and distance (cf. Danforth 1665, 6-12). Appended is a "Brief Theological Application" in which comets are regarded as "Portentous and Signal of great and notable Changes" (cf. Danforth 1665, 12). As evidence, Danforth cites biblical passages that treat comets as indicators of the second coming and lists a number of historical events that coincided with the appearance of comets (1665, 16-18). Similar to Beard's progression from historical to biblical and then contemporary examples of judgments on drunkards, Danforth's list of comets culminates in the conclusion and application that "This Blazing Star being in conjunction with diverse other awful Providences and Tokens of Wrath, calls upon us to awake out of security, and to bring forth fruits meet for Repentance" (1665, 19).

This theological application in a so far scientific document shows the mutual illumination of science and theology that was pursued by New England ministers in combination with a providential interpretation. Before this background, Cotton Mather's ambivalent reaction to Danforth's treatise in the *Magnalia* becomes understandable: On the one hand, he warns against reading too much into natural phenomena through a theological perspective, but is, on the other hand, unwilling to dismiss them completely (cf. Winship 1994, 100; Cotton Mather 1726, 50-55). Using a Latin phrase, Mather maintains that he is wary of the uncertainties of divination, but especially as "many *Learned Men* have made Laborious collections of Remarkable Events … to render *Comets* ominous, I cannot reproach the *Essays* of *Pious Men*" to consider them as potential signs of God (*MC* vii, 156). According to Giles, this contradictory evaluation corresponds to Mather's aim to include as much material as possible in his *Magnalia* and his reluctance to discard what may be even

remotely useful for religious improvement (cf. Giles 47). This synthesis of sometimes contradictory sources and materials is founded in the rhetorical principle of *copia* that Stievermann identifies as the core strategy of Mather's history of New England (cf. 2004, 280-81). While the incorporation of previous knowledge from different sources leads to a vision of New England as the synthesis of both pagan and Christian traditions, Danforth's text demonstrates the combination of quasi-scientific observation, ominous interpretation and theological application. However, the causal relation between these elements, for example, the list of historical comets and events, appears more contrived than the immediate correspondence between sin and punishment in exemplary emplotments, which may have inspired Mather's reluctance to embrace this interpretation of astronomical phenomena as divine communications. For him, they rival the conception of providence and are closer to divination, the use of signs and magical practices to foretell future events, which remains tied to the human capacity for interpretation. However, while Stievermann argues that Mather's theological view of New England allows him to integrate paradoxical material and diverse sources into a synthesis, his interest in storytelling as a way to illustrate and even express dogmatic and biblical principles and reach a broad audience offers a similar incitement for collecting them.

In spite of his refusal to regard comets as portentous and warnings against divination, Cotton Mather freely compiles audible and visual omens of King Philip's War and includes a long letter detailing the apparition of a ship in New Haven that can also be found in John Winthrop's journal and later magazine reprints. In Mather's times, divination could either mean a magical practice for telling the future or a lucky guess (cf. "divination"). In an earlier part of the *Magnalia* detailing the arrival of the Puritans in New England, divination is associated with Native American sorcery aimed against the colonists and the devil's powers to foretell both true and false things. Yet, in a biblical parallel to the Israelites coming to their promised country, "there was no *Enchantment* or *Divination* against such a People," which also shows in governor William Phips' refusal to believe in astrological warnings (*MC* i, 9; cf. *MC* ii, 69). Mather illustrates his critique of the "*Paganish* Practice of *Judicial Astrology*" by a narrative episode interspersed in his biography of Phips. Long before the later governor received his title and post, "an Old *Astrologer*" sent him a letter with astrological predictions of Phips' life (*MC* ii, 69). Though, over the years, the predictions have proven accurate, Phips continued to reject the paper with "a most *Pious Neglect*" out of the conviction that "*Satan might have leave to foretell many things … to lay me asleep about such things as are to follow*" (*MC* ii, 69).

In *Manuductio ad Ministerium*, Mather warns against judicial astrology, the "art of foretelling or counseling" on the basis of celestial constellations and movements of planets and stars (1727, 54-55; cf. "judicial astrology"). A year later, Ephraim Chambers' *Cyclopædia; or, an Universal Dictionary of Arts and Sciences* claims that astrology "pretends to foretell moral Events, *i. e.* such as have a Dependence on the Will and Agency of Man; as if that were directed by the Stars" and a later edition from 1778 adds that it "is now universally exploded by the intelligent part of mankind." Consequently, Mather renounces "having any Superstitious Fancies upon *Eclipses* and the like Occurrences," and states that there is "nothing *Portentous* in *Blazing Stars*" (1727, 54-55). Yet Chamber's *Cyclopædia* also documents that the practice of judicial astrology was alive and well in in the eighteenth century and Winship argues "that prodigies largely served as a marker of the boundary between genuine knowledge and superstition, between the educated classes and the vulgar masses" (1994, 100). Facing sectarianism as well as political dissent, Winship even states that "Puritans were no less concerned than Anglicans about 'enthusiasts,'" and tried to base their interpretations and observations of prodigies on the scientific discourse of the times and establish a middle ground by affirming the existence of prodigies while delineating them against practices like astrology and being generally cautious in their political interpretation (Winship 1994, 97-98).

Similarly, Mather was careful to evade the charge of enthusiasm or superstition that has been leveled against radical Protestant groups by Anglicans who had become increasingly wary of providentialism following the English Civil War (cf. Guyatt 42-44). While he freely attaches meaning to the apparitions of soldiers and shots preceding King Philip's War, he leaves the recording and of other prodigious events or apparitions to other writers and documents inserted in the *Magnalia*. Likewise, Mather's relation of John Sausaman's murder reiterates the old belief in supernatural justice that exposes the murderer, expressed in the formula 'murder will out,' which forms the basis of many English providence tales (cf. Dorson 1973, 16; Hall 1995, 31-37). Preceding King Philip's War, John Sausaman was killed by Native Americans who feared that he will betray their plans to the colonists. Yet, his murderer is revealed as the corpse starts to bleed anew in their presence. As part of Cotton Mather's account of Native American wars in the *Magnalia*, the Sausaman episode receives extensive treatment in contrast to the concise examples in *Terribilia Dei* that illustrate a similar concept. The murderer is revealed when Sausaman's body bleeds anew in his presence, a motif that appears from German as English medieval legends and epics like the German *Nibelungenlied* to Shakespeare's Richard III (cf. Dorson 1973, 32).

From this point onward, Mather continues

> [t]hings began to have an *Ominous* Aspect. Yea speaking of Omens we may add, … divers Persons in *Maldon* who heard in the Air … a Great Gun go off, and presently thereupon the Report of *Small Guns* … very thick discharging, as if there had been a *Battel* … on the same Day, in Plymouth Colony in Several Places, invisible Troops of Horses were heard Riding to and fro. Now, Reader, prepare for the Event of these Prodigies, but count me not struck with a *Livian* superstition in Reporting *Prodigies*, for which I have such Incontestable Assurance (*MC* vii, 46)

In the retrospective view of the historian, the visual and audible signs of battle point towards the immanent outbreak of King Philip's War. Mather emphasizes the accumulation of similar cases and the matching reports of several witnesses that attest each apparition to make an argument that they were indeed signs of future events. Gordon Sayre remarks that, while Native American religious practices were called superstitious by the English colonists, both groups equally recorded omens predicting King Philips' War that can be found not only in the *Magnalia* but also in William Hubbard's 1677 *Narrative of the Trouble with the Indians of New England* (cf. 2005, 56). The fact that Hubbard and Mather record different omens indicates the amount of these phenomena and their importance to historical accounts in general. At the same time, Mather distances himself from the tradition of classical historiographers like Livy whose history of Rome, *Ab Urbe Condita*, mentions numerous omens that play an important role in contemporary culture. Livy serves as both a point of reference and of contrast, as Mather establishes the criteria on which his history relies. Calling himself an "*Impartial Historian*," Mather states that odd phenomena are only reported if they are supported by a number of reliable witnesses (*MC* n.pag.). This empirical approach is mirrored by the rhetorical strategy of *copia* that both demand to neutrally record everything that has been perceived by others without evaluation or alteration. As a result, the *Magnalia* is full of quotes and different voices that not always result in a unified providential interpretation (cf. Giles 53).

Rather than reporting and interpreting ominous apparitions in the sky directly, Mather distances himself from their truth value as well as providential interpretation. In the case of a ship that appeared in New Haven in 1647, noted for example in John Winthrop's journal, he includes the letter of a local minister, for example, who in turn quotes other witnesses and another minister who provides an interpretation of the event as an omen. Asked to investigate the incident, the minister James Pierpont transmits what he, in turn, received from the "most credible judicious, and curious surviving observers," creating a chain of witnesses that each vouch for their sources (*MC* i, 25). Their account links the

apparition and links the circumstances of the building of the ship, its setting out and disappearance to interpret the apparition as a divine indication of what happened to it. As James Pierpont reports, a large ship is built in 1647 but its captain, as well as the minister John Davenport, insinuate that it could become the grave of the seamen even before it departs. As the ship heads out for its first voyage, Davenport prays "Lord, if it be thy pleasure to bury these our friends in the bottom of the sea, they are thine: save them" and the captain is uneasy that the built of the ship might endanger the crew (*MC* i, 25). In the next spring it does not return as expected yet in June, the apparition of a ship in the sky performs what people perceive as a divine communication about its destiny: a cloud that resembles the lost ship is seen to depart from New Haven and sails until its appearance changes and after the mast is destroyed it keels over and vanishes (cf. *MC* i, 25). According to Pierpont, Davenport called the apparition God's answer to the prayers of the community "that the Lord would (if it was his pleasure) let them hear what he had done with their dear friends, and prepare them with a suitable submission to his Holy Will" (*MC* i, 25). To show that the apparition was a sign from God and answer to prayer, Pierpont relates Davenport's initial statement, the community's prayer and the apparition in a dialogical manner that is summarized by another direct quotation from Davenport: "That God had condescended, for the quieting of their afflicted spirits, this extraordinary account of his sovereign disposal of those for whom so many fervent prayers were made continually" (*MC* i, 26).

The veracity of his record is established by the large number of witnesses who were drawn by the spectacle and their ability to closely see it as they were "so near... as that they imagined a man might hurl a stone on board her." Accordingly, these witnesses were able to recognize the similarities between the original ship and its apparition as well as the import of what was presented: "the admiring spectators could distinguish the several colours of each part, the principal rigging, and such proportions, as caused not only the generality of persons to say, 'This was the mould of their ship, and thus was her tragick end'" (*MC* i, 26). The inserted letter also demonstrates the necessity to interpret apparitions to endow them with meaning. In contrast to Noadiah Russell's diary entry of the apparition following a storm, the letter sent to Cotton Mather includes a clear providential interpretation based on causal links that also show in many tales of deliverance: While John Davenport and the captain prophetically indicated the fate of the ship, the apparition answers the prayers for certainty and illustrates the sailor's death out of a myriad of possible fates like a pirate attack or Barbary captivity. While equally showing a ship, the apparition in Russell's diary is not interpreted or enriched with a context but demonstrates that the narrative Cotton Mather

collects in the *Magnalia* was widely available and collected in colonial letters and diaries. This case also illustrates that in order to acquire the status of a divine communication, an apparition narrative needs to couple the observation, which appeared in letters and diaries, with the necessary context to explain it. Then, the observation can be integrated into a providential emplotment pattern, linking the prayer as a cause with the answer given by the apparition in Mather's history.

Reversals of Order in Narratives of Witchcraft and Hauntings

As the recordings of strange events are informed by a notion of place, New England religious and personal texts associate the existence of witchcraft with the status of North America as a 'wilderness' but also with the rituals of its Native American inhabitants. In the seventeenth century, a fear evolves that witches have been aboard the settlers' ships to subvert the Congregational colonies and destroy the unity of their churches (cf. Dorson 1967, 35; *IW* xi). Colonial journals like Laurence Hammond's and Josselyn's *Voyages to New England* already mention the fear that witches cause among the settlers arriving in New England (cf. Dorson 1967, 35-36). Similarly, Cotton Mather identifies the "wilderness" of North American as the dwelling place of the devils that "felt a more than ordinary vexation from the arrival of those Christians" (*MC* vi, 66; cf. *IW* xi). Yet, as Mather's *Memorable Providences Relating to Witchcrafts and Possessions* (1689) affirms, "New-England has had Examples of their Existence and Operation; and that no only the Wigwams of Indians, where the pagan Powaws often raise their masters, in the shapes of Bears and Snakes and Fires, but the House of Christians, where our God has had his constant Worship, have undergone the Annoyance of Evil spirits" (n. pag.). In *Wonders of the Invisible World*, Mather links the various types of demonic attacks that New England has suffered to its status in providential history: "I believe, that never were more *Satanical Devices* used for the Unsettling of any People under the Sun, than what have been Employ'd for the Extirpation of the *Vine* which God has here Planted" (*IW* xii).

Yet in response to the new science and materialist philosophy, English and New England theologians show an increased interest not only in persecuting but also documenting witchcraft as tangible evidence of the activities of the spiritual world. For example, the English philosopher and minister Joseph Glanvill responds to witchcraft skeptics that they lose sight of spiritual phenomena altogether and question Christian dogma like the resurrection and eternal life. In *A Blow at Modern Sadducism* (1668), he argues that "if they

believe either *Angel*, or *Spirit*, *Resurrection* of the *Body*, or *Immortality* of Souls. These things hang together in a chain of connexion... and 'tis but a happy chance if he that hath lost *one link*, holds another" (4). Atheism in the seventeenth century rarely meant a denial of the existence of God but served as a general epithet in religious works from the late sixteenth century onwards (cf. Hunter 1985, 140). Protestant texts called those *atheists* that disregarded church doctrine and the importance of a holy lifestyle, but also those who believed that the world operated according to natural laws rather than through God's continual involvement. Thus, "antiprovidentialism" was regarded "as a preliminary step to outright 'atheism,'" according to Michael Hunter, as it challenged the existence of a spiritual world and its power to influence human affairs (Hunter 1985, 143-44). Glanvill objects to this type of narrow-minded empiricism that only accepts what it can perceive and comprehend at the risk of excluding everything else. Instead, he sees the need for a philosophical discourse of witchcraft at a time "*in which* Atheism *is begun in* Sadducism" (1668, n.pag.).

Like Glanvill's belief that questioning one element of the spiritual world lead to questioning all of them, ministers presumed a "circular connection" between the materialist denial of the spiritual world and an increase in "wickedness" (Hunter 1985, 142). Not only God's supervision of the world is at stake but also his ability to punish and reward in the afterlife which eliminates any incentive for moral behavior, as Thomas Beard's depiction of an atheist as given to "sensual pleasures" and "swearing" indicates (cf. Hunter 1985, 141, 144). John Henry sees Glanvill and Henry More's writings as part of a "major philosophical effort to prove the immortality of the soul and the reality of life after death on purely rational or commonsensical grounds, in order to persuade or remind the atheist ... that he must face a future reckoning for his present misdeeds" (Henry 172). While most of the period was concerned with problems of exegeses and how to interpret specific Bible passages, they aimed at combatting atheism through apologetic writing that demonstrated the existence of spiritual entities such as the soul by collecting apparitions of ghosts.

The charge of being given to "sensual pleasures" derives from a moral interpretation of Hobbes' materialist philosophy that posits only those things as real that can be perceived and verified by the senses, ruling out the existence of a spiritual world and thereby also God as a moral authority. This skepticism towards the spiritual world is also found within the Jewish religious groups of Sadducees that did not believe in the afterlife and consequently also negated the soul's immortality and judgment (cf. "Saduzäer"). At the time of Christ, they were among the three major Jewish sects along with Pharisees and Essenes and are

mentioned several times in the Bible in debates about the existence and nature of eternal life (cf. Mk 12:18; Lk 20:27; Acts 23:8).[47] Seventeenth-century religious works use both terms interchangeably and apply "empirical techniques to the spiritual world in order to prove its reality and confute" what they perceive as atheism and sadducism their own terms (Burns 2002b, 162). In the preface "To the Reader" of *Memorable Providences*, Cotton Mather's ministerial colleagues warn against "[*t*]*he old Heresy of the sensual Sadducees, denying the Being of Angels either good or evil died not with them, nor will it, whiles men (abandoning both Faith & Reason) count it their wisdom to credit nothing but what they see & feel*" (*MP* n.pag.). The group headed by Samuel Willard and Joshua Moodey, describes sadducism, as the first step towards Atheism not only as a misguided reliance on sense impressions but also as a loss of faith, indicative of a "debauched Age" (*MP* n.pag.). Similarly, Mather's "Discourse on Witchcraft," explains the links between biblical Sadducees and contemporary Atheists that both deny angels and spirits by relaying on sense impressions alone (cf. *MP* 14). In the minister's view, witchcraft was allowed by God to demonstrate the effects of the invisible world to those who deny its existence: "*God is therefore pleased (besides the witneß born to the truth in Sacred Writ) to suffer Devils sometime to do such things in the world as shall stop the mouth of gainsayers, and extort a Confession from them*" (*MP* n. pag.). Thus, Cotton Mather's investigation of the Goodwin children's alleged bewitchment through observation and experiment acts as "Confirmation, *That*, There is both a GOD, and a Devil, and Witchcraft" that should even convince atheists because it uses the same empirical basis that underlies their philosophy and the new science (*MP* n.pag.).

In his "Epistle Dedicatory," Mather consequently affirms that his "little History of … astonishing *Witchcrafts and Possessions*" is based on "partly my own *Ocular Observation*, & partly my *undoubted Information*" (*MP n. pag.)*. While he is adamant on the reliability of what he records, Mather feigns humility by mentioning the obvious defects" in both his writing and himself and states that he only published his observations due to the large public interest: "It must be the Subject, and not the *Manner* or the *Author* … that has made any people desire its publication" (*MP* n. pag.). Dedicating his book to Wait Winthrop, a grandson of the first governor, colonial magistrate of Massachusetts Bay colony and judge in the Salem trials, Mather regards him as the ideal reader of his book, who can "judge" for

[47] In Mark 12:18-25, a group of Sadducees asks Jesus about a theoretical case in which a woman has more than one husband whom would she belong to in eternity (cf. also Lk 20:27-38). In *Acts*, the conflicting opinions about the afterlife among Sadducees and Pharisees allow Paul to incite a derisive debate among the body of scholars that had originally joined to condemn him (cf. Acts 23:6-8).

himself as he is versed in "*Scriptural Divinity*", and "*Rational Philosophy*" to weigh these two sides of the question of witchcraft. This circumspection is necessary, in Mather's words, in order not to regard "every dubious Accident, or unwanted Effect of Providence" as witchcraft and while its existence affirmed by the Bible, Scripture offers little information to understand and detect witchcraft but warns that the devil is the father of lies and the reports of witches themselves cannot be trusted (cf. *MP* n. pag.). For example, as Mather demonstrates in the appended "Discourse on Witchcraft," Jesus drives out bad angels, which are "Spiritual and rational substances full of all Wickedness against God, and Enmity against Man" (*MP* 14).

Mather further explains that witches—in a perversion of covenant theology—enter a "Contract or Explicit Covenant with the Devil... to the doing of things strange in themselves and besides the natural Course" (*MP* n. pag.). At the same time, he acknowledges that witchcraft can affect believers and unbelievers and that the molestations of saints, as in the case of the pious Goodwin family, "are part of His Judgments that are unsearchable" (*MP* n. pag.). Yet, they could be working for the good of the believers as "*Their Graces are hereby* tried, t*heir Uprighteousneß is made* known, *their Faith and Patience* have their perfect work" (*MP* n.pag.). In an extension of covenant theology, witches and Indians are associated with the devil as the saints are with God (Dorson 1973, 32-33). The Puritan theological framework consequently also included the figures of "folk supernaturalism" and the newly encountered inhabitants of America (cf. Dorson 1973, 14). Dorson distinguishes between the sophisticated black magic as well as the many helpers and kinds of ghosts and demons that are known in Europe and the reduction to witches and demons in New England (cf. 1973, 13). While the European tradition started out with a host of mischievous spirits, imps, and fairies, they became absorbed into the "stranger figures" of devils and witches, a trend that continued in New England. In the fourteenth century, for example, Geoffrey Chaucer still attributed haunted houses to fairies whereas similar instances in New England were said to be demonic visitations and Cotton Mather assigns the various acts of witchcrafts collected in book six of the *Magnalia* to the "devils" that formerly inhabited the "wilderness" of North America (*MC* vi, 66; cf. Dorson 1973, 14-15).

Other phenomena, such as rumbling spirits or poltergeister, occur on both sides of the Atlantic, as the comparison of accounts in Joseph Glanvill's *Saducisumus Triumphatus* and Increase Mather's *Illustrious Providences* shows. Conceived as a definite proof of the existence of witchcraft *Saducismus Triumphatus* was published posthumously from Glanvill's notes by the philosopher and theologian Henry More and ran through five editions

until 1725. In his time and after, "Glanvill has received considerable attention as a philosopher, a theologian, a propagandist of the new science, a believer in witchcraft, and a forerunner of psychical research" (Parsons xii). Together with More, he was a member of the Royal Society and, according to Wise, "created a model for documenting" apparitions, ghosts and other supernatural events using empirical methodology (cf. 233-34).

The cases of William Morse, Nicholas Desborough or George Walton (cf. *MC* vii, 68-69) resemble the European poltergeists that cause mischief but no serious harm (cf. Dorson 1973, 26). 'Poltergeist' or rumbling spirits can be found in European folklore, and Bob Curran even links them to the ubiquity of fairies and disembodied forces in Celtic mythology (cf. Curran 221). In German folklore, the poltergeist is a mischievous but not necessary evil spirit that performs pranks, causes noises and visible phenomena though remaining invisible itself. Jacob and Wilhelm Grimm's German dictionary connects 'poltergeist' to the Roman 'lemures,' restless spirits of the dead that perform mischief among the living, and cite Martin Luther's *Tischreden* as an early use in which the Reformer relates anecdotes of such encounters (Neuber 1). Up to that point, Wolfgang Neuber argues, only clergy with their knowledge and attention to the spiritual world had witnessed supernatural phenomena. Yet during the Middle Ages, poltergeists became part of popular culture and empirical phenomena that could be heard or seen in their effects (cf. Neuber 2). Yet, their recording was structured by a number of theological choices and social functions that poltergeists were the object of, depending on the denomination of the writer.

The events of "The Drummer of Tedworth," were well known in England and had actually taken place between 1662 and 1663 but, at the behest of Mr. Mompesson, were not published until Glanvill's *A Blow at Modern Sadducism... To which is added, The Relation of the Fam'd Disturbance by the Drummer, in the House of Mr. John Mompesson* (1668) appeared and the account was enlarged and reprinted in *Saducismus Triumphatus* (1681). While most contemporary and later accounts are based on Glanvill, two newspaper reports and a ballad from 1663 precede his publication (cf. Hunter 2005, 312-33). The story was re-published by Increase Mather's *Illustrious Providences* in New England and George Sinclair's *Satan's Invisible World Discovered* (1685) in Scotland, but also satirized on stage and in verse. Apart from these prints, Michael Hunter has tracked a number of manuscript records of the case that possibly served as Glanvill's sources. Hunter shows that Glanvill largely relies on copies of letters sent by John Mompesson to his relative William Creed, a professor of theology at Oxford University whose archives hold the manuscripts, but also additional oral sources (cf. Hunter 2005, 313-14; *ST* n.pag.).

In both works, the story forms the first relation of a chapter titled "*Proof of* Apparitions, Spirits *and* Witches, *from a choice* Collection *of modern* Relations." As proof, these narratives fulfill similar functions as the story cycles told at a witchcraft trial. Yet the plot, instead of causation, offers merely chronological links that then have to be investigated in a second step. It starts with a vagabond whose drum is confiscated and kept at the house of Mr. Mompesson. A few days later, the latter heard a "very great knocking at his Doors … [w]hen he was got back to Bed, the noise was a Thumping an Drumming on the top of his House, which continued a good space and then by degrees went off into the Air" (*ST* 322). The drumming continues and is accompanied with apparitions and other noises during the night. Many paragraphs deal with the events of specific days or indicate a temporal sequence. The first disturbance occurs "About the midst of *April,*" and the next paragraph, starting with "After this," describes the pattern in which the drumming reoccurs over the ensuing months (*ST* 322). While the narrative covers the beginning and probable cause of the disturbances until their ending, most elements are simply connected via chronology rather than by any cause and effect relationship. Attempts to understand and control the phenomena are frustrated by Mompesson's futile efforts to escape or fight off the apparitions. Though ministers are present, their prayers only interrupt but do not end the disturbances and no pattern is recognizable in their behavior (cf. *ST* 324).

Similar to Mather's emphasis on "Ocular Observation," Glanvill's application of experimental natural philosophy is based on what can be perceived with the senses whereas causality is a hidden link between two things or events is "*insensible*" (*IW* n.pag.; Glanvill 1661, 190). In *The Vanity of Dogmatizing* (1661), Glanvill argues that causality does not confirm to empirical principles but rather stems from deductive reasoning that underpins rival philosophies of nature, such as Aristotle's or Descartes.' As Glanvill demonstrates with reference to the Cartesian model of the solar system, it becomes difficult to "infallibly assure our selves of the truth of the causes that most obviously occur; and therefore the foundation of scientifical procedure" (192, cf. 194). "[T]o argue from a concomitancy to a causality, is not infallible conclusive" as this causality cannot be observed but could also be imposed upon two simply concurrent events (Glanvill 1661, 190). In *The Vanity of Dogmatizing* (1661), Glanvill seeks to show that principles or scientific dogma may be easily assumed and difficult to falsify, but result in a deceptive type of science that does not describe natural phenomena correctly. Instead, Glanvill maintains that knowledge can only come from experience and sense impressions. Anticipating Locke's theory of knowledge and causation, Glanvill compares the generation of knowledge to the way human beings find their way in

the world: "we see, we hear, and outward objects affect our other senses" (n.pag.; cf. Burns 2002b, 158).

In *Saducismus Triumphatus*, the recording and evaluation of sense impressions are not only realized in third-person narration but by the introduction of a first person narrator. While the events and their background are recounted by a heterodiegetic third-person narrator, Glanvill personally arrives on the scene as a first person narrator to investigate the incidents as well as presents the subsequent evaluations and defends them against criticism. Glanvill's own statements, as well as historical records, confirm his visit to the Mompesson family, probably following Henry More's suggestion, and Burns states that Glanvill also investigated other supernatural incidents (cf. Hunter 2005, 315-16; Burns 2002b, 161).

> About this time I went to the House, on purpose to inquire the truth of those passages, of which there was so loud a report ... I perceived it was just behind the bolster of the Childrens Bed... It was as loud a scratching, as one with long Nails could make upon a Bolster... I saw their [the childrens'] hands out on the Cloaths, and they could not contribute to the noise that was behind their heads (*ST* 101)

The narrator also acts on behalf of the reader, investigating the origin of the noise and recording what can be seen and heard. First, the narrator uses descriptions like the "long Nails" that make the noise easier to imagine for the readers. Next, he investigates possible sources of the noises and narrows down the options by looking at the children's' hands.

> I had been told that it would imitate noises, and made trial … I searched under and behind the Bed … sounded the Wall behind, and made all the search that I possibly could to find it there was any trick, contrivance, or common cause of it … So that I was then verily perswaded, and am so still, that the noise was made by some Daemon [sic] or Spirit (*ST* 102)

The passage shows the various tests that Glanvill performs, from trying to elicit specific noises to examining the various surfaces under which the scratching seems to hide. The references to perception are combined with the representation of thought processes that draw conclusions from what is perceived by the senses. After eliminating possible sources of the noises and even conducting simple tests based on previously known qualities of poltergeists, the narrator concludes that a supernatural force is at work (cf. *ST* n.pag, 329).

As these conclusions could only be drawn by a first person witness and investigator of the scene, demonic disturbances and apparitions also mark a shift from external events to the interior of the character or narrator. While the plots of exemplary judgments or deliverances, related by third-person heterodiegetic narrators, linked a character's piety and prayer to external effects, such as the survival or death of the character, the reason behind the intervention of invisible agents remains obscure and their workings can only be

observed, thus requiring the mediation and evaluation of a first person narrator who is actively involved as a witness and investigator. In Glanvill's apparition account, the narrator-character links exterior and interior aspects: he draws conclusions and is convinced on the basis of what he sees, hears and feels; likewise, he operates on the premise that it could be a supernatural disturbance and performs a test. While the plot is not based on a causal principle and its episodes are loosely joined in chronological order, individual actions or conclusions are motivated and interior processes of thinking and evaluation are laid open in contrast to the rather schematic judgments and deliverance plots.

To underscore his authenticity and application of empiricist principles, Glanvill's first person narrator asserts that his perception has not been impeded by emotions or guided by the imagination. In *A Blow at Modern Sadducism*, Glanvill concludes his investigation: "I am sure there was nothing of *fear*, or *imagination* in the case; for I was no more concern'd than I am at the Writing of this Relation" (Glanvill 1668, 112). In *Saducismus Triumphatus*, this statement anticipates allegations "that my Friend and I were under some affright and fancied Noises and sights that were not" (*ST* 56, 1632, 103). As Glanvill elaborates in *The Vanity of Dogmatizing*, he believes that emotions can induce mental activities that in turn influence the senses or evoke the impression of sensual data that is not based on reality (cf. 1661, 198). Glanvill explicitly denies this charge through a comparison that draws attention to the temporal gap between experience and writing, declaring himself as composed at the Mompessons as he is now upon writing. The first person investigation is part of both texts, but in *Saducismus Triumphatus*, Glanvill adds further observations as additional proof that he had previously omitted because "it depended upon my single Testimony" (*ST* 103). During the "panting" that the first person narrator witnesses, he sees "something moving in a Linnen-Bag" which he later tests but finds nothing in it but also no other cause for its movement (*ST* 203). Going beyond individual experience that would not act as sufficient proof for such a phenomenon, Glanvill lists the other witnesses that have seen the same as himself, i.e. the neighbors, friends and servants of the Mompesson household. The last pages of the relation are taken up by an appraisal of Mr. Mompesson, on whose letters much of Glanvill's report draws, as a credible witness (*ST* 111-12). Instead of merely a first-person account as a single testimony, Glanvill establishes "converging perspectives" that assert the existence of the strange events by listing numerous witnesses (Capoferro 110).

First person accounts were already used in many captivity narratives, yet Glanvill introduces a homodiegetic narrator who acts as an investigator on behalf of the reader, anticipating the central device of the personal essay as well as many short stories (cf. Pitcher

2000, 7-9). So far, the use of first person narrative in Protestant writing was most prevalent in autobiographical texts and captivity narratives. Some effects of the use of narrative voice still apply to both forms, for example, the increase of immediacy, as readers can follow Glanvill's or the captive's thought process and the narrative time approaches narrated time, giving the illusion of following the action as it happens. Approaching 'real-time' in the portrayal of the first-person narrator's investigation also serves, according to Pitcher, to align the narrator's thinking with that of the readers, suggesting that they take over his conclusions (cf. 2000, 7). Yet the conventions of spiritual autobiography or conversion narrative record experience according to biblical patterns rather than observation and sense impressions only. Narratives of captivity and personal deliverance, for example, correlate external events with the state or progress of one's soul towards salvation, or use biblical parallels for emotional states, as in Hannah Swarton's first person captivity narrative. Conversely, in Glanvill's account, the switch in narrative perspective could indicate the fulfillment of the Royal Society's conditions for the recording of natural and supernatural phenomena: It presents the closest to a first-hand account and details a thorough investigation and elimination of all possible alternatives before calling the movements and sounds supernatural. While the narrator emerges as the focalizer of events in contrast to a seemingly objective third-person narrative voice, the aim to record as many details possible and test different hypotheses shows Glanvill's narrator as a scientific recorder. By consequence, the narrator figure combines the necessities of scientific recording with what Capoferro calls a "virtual experience" for readers (112). As they share in with the experience through the portrayal of sense impression, Capoferro argues, readers also emotionally respond to it and Glanvill's tools for persuasion become at the same time the basis for the literary value and popularity of his collection.

Rather than basing his analysis on narrative voice, Capoferro argues that Glanvill intended his narratives to convince atheists and Sadducees of the existence of ghost and apparitions by endowing them with a narrative that conjures up a life-like impression of them (cf. 112). According to Capoferro, Glanvill downplays the emotional and literary quality of his narratives as less dramatic or tragic than others but paradoxically states that "[n]othing rouzes them so out of the dull Lethargy of Atheism and Sadducism, as Narrations of this kind … this sort of sensible Experiments" (*ST* 12; cf. Capoferro 112). Yet Capoferro imprecisely ascribes the above quote to Glanvill while it, in fact, stems from a letter of Henry More to Joseph Glanvill. More includes the letter that congratulates Glanvill on his first publication of the Tedworth Drummer, attacks John Webster's *Displaying of Supposed*

Witchcraft and relates additional narratives in his post-humus edition of Glanvill's collection of 1632. Endorsing both, the scientific and emotional quality of Glanvill's investigation, the letter emphasizes the different purposes involved in the use of empirical methods and apparition narratives. While Glanvill denies that he aims at an emotional response or anything else than a scientifically convincing argument for the existence of witchcraft and apparitions, his collection as published by More aims to rouse atheists from their denial of the spiritual world, which is most effectively done by an emotional appeal and the presentation of first-hand experience (Capoferro 112).

Due to their popularity and lasting influence, Glanvill's narratives have not only been regarded as important steps in the development of the short story but also for the literature of the fantastic. While the fantastic is mostly associated with the Romantic period as a counter-movement to the rationalism of the Enlightenment, scholars like David Sandner have argued that its elements were already common in eighteenth-century literature (cf. 1). Capoferro detects the use of the imagination common in fantastic literature even earlier when he compares the investigation of Glanvill's narrator with the hesitation that is part of Tzvetan Todorov's definition of the fantastic in *The Fantastic: A Structural Approach to a Literary Genre* (cf. Capoferro 111). According to Todorov, "the fantastic occupies the duration of this uncertainty," or hesitation when the reader confronts an "apparently supernatural event" in the midst of an otherwise realistic story (Todorov 25). If the narrative does not uphold this insecurity or the reader chooses one answer, "we leave the fantastic for a neighboring genre, the uncanny or the marvelous" (Todorov 25). In the "Drummer of Tedworth," Capoferro argues, Glanvill's narrator impersonates this hesitation, as he investigates possible causes of the noise and movements in the children's chamber, leaving "room for doubt" in a supernatural explanation. Capoferro defines this "implied hesitation" as part of the narrative's appeal and relevance to the development of the fantastic or short fiction as other commentators have already argued (Capoferro 110; cf. Parsons xiv-xv). Likewise, Coleman Parsons sees Glanvill's *Sadducismus Triumphatus*, as marking the "transition from dogmatic to literary use of the supernatural tale" (Parsons xiv-xv). Yet, whereas the fantastic requires a suspension of judgment, this intention is not sustained by the character and narrator-investigator and the intention to prove the existence of the supernatural announced in the preface to the Glanvill's collection (cf. *ST* 5-6). Yet in contrast to the use of the imagination that is implied by fantastic literature, Glanvill and More emphasize the factuality of the collection that also applies to the use of supernatural accounts in court trials.

In *A Blow at Modern Sadducism*, Glanvill contrasts different genres of fictional and historical writing and argues that his accounts of supernatural events belong to the latter category by stating that they are 'strange, therefore true.' Listing and refuting possible objections against witchcraft and apparitions, Glanvill attacks what he perceives as prejudices in dialogic sections of "objection" and "answer" which are followed by the relation of the "Drummer of Tedworth" through two letters dealing with his investigation of this phenomenon to Henry More and William Berenton (cf. Glanvill 1668, 91). At the end of the Tedworth relation, the double use of validation, based on being both empirical and outside of empirical methodology play out when Glanvill stresses that his relation derives from his own investigation and reports from reliable witnesses, on the one hand, but also emphasizes that it contains events that are so removed from natural causes and explanations, on the other hand, that they must be attributed to invisible powers. In *Saducismus Triumphatus*, Glanvill differentiates his report from others of more literary character, presumably romances, by conceding that "the passages recited are not so dreadful, Tragical and amazing, as there are some in Story [sic] of the same kind" (*ST* 116). On the other hand, they are "strange enough to prove themselves effects of some *invisible extraordinary Agent*, and so demonstrate that there are *Spirits*" (*ST* 116). He explains this logic earlier on in *A Blow at Modern Sadducism* in response to the objection that apparition narratives often contain "actions …, *which are* ridiculous *and* impossible *in the* nature *of* things" (Glanvill 1668, 12). Glanvill answers that the very impossibility of these account shows that they are not products of romance or fiction that would better disguise its invention. "For the *contrivers* of *Fictions* use to form the as near as they can conformably to the most *unsuspected realities*, endeavouring to make them look as *like truth* as is possible" (Glanvill 1668, 12). Instead, "[t]he more *absurd* and *unaccountable* these actions seem, the greater *confirmation* are they to me of the *truth* of those *Relations*, and the *reality* of what the *Objectors* would destroy... being exceedingly *unlikely*, t'is the greater probability they are not *fictitious*" (Glanvill 1668, 12).

Glanvill argues that if he were to disguise his invention as fact, it would be irrational to include such strange and supernatural incidents as rumbling spirits and apparitions together with the dates and places of their occurrence. Any writer wanting his fiction to be recognized as fact would have to closer adhere to the realm of ordinary experience rather that include descriptions of flying witches, monstrous births, and ghosts as they are in danger of being proven false upon investigation (cf. Glanvill 1668, 13). As a result, those who question the factuality of his relations may also "believe all *Histories* are *Romances*" first,

because they are so strange and removed from ordinary experience as the supernatural necessarily is and, second, because they are assembled according to the best empirical methods and based on "the sound senses of multitudes together" (Glanvill 1668, 6).

Glanvill also cautions that not the witches themselves, but the forces behind them, perform these incredible actions and that humans' restricted knowledge makes it impossible for them to decide what is likely and what is unlikely in the invisible world. During this time, according to McKeon, the "old claim that a story is 'strange but true' subtly modulates into something more like the paradoxical formula 'strange, therefore true'" (47). Based on the logic that factuality is still the standard and that writers would carefully disguise any kind of fiction by staying close to nature, 'strange, therefore true' becomes a typical formula for authenticating accounts of the supernatural in seventeenth-century England, as McKeon and Walsham state in their surveys (cf. 47; 2003, 40). In McKeon's view, the formula reacts to "the latent tension between the claim to truth and the nature of the material whose truth is claimed" by establishing the very remoteness to empirical validation as a means to authenticate events (47). As spirits are by nature invisible, their existence remains impossible to determine through empirical methods, events could simply be sold as fact on the basis of their strangeness in what could also become a "posture" for authors and a way to conform to the expectations of a genre, as the existence of satirical accounts from the same period indicates (Walsham 40).

Especially the English literary critic and Anglican bishop William Warburton criticizes the "danger to historical accuracy," and "intellectual laziness" of historical writings that rely too much on prodigies and the invisible world rather than investigating actual causes and effects (Burns 2002a 167-68, Warburton 1727, 65). Instead of reconstructing causes and effects, histories since antiquity have simply recurred to divine will. The recording of prodigies has been supported by a strong admiration or enthusiasm for "lying wonders" stretching from Catholic hagiography to Reformation histories the strange, therefore true logic contributed to their emotional appeal. In *A Critical and Philosophical Inquiry into the Causes of Prodigies and Miracle, as Related by Historians* (1727), he dismisses prodigies and their logic of strange, therefore true from an empiricist vantage point: "Prodigies and Portents have infected the best writings of Antiquity [until now]… while the other Sciences are daily Purging and Refining themselves from the Pollutions of superstitious Error" (Warburton 1727, 1-2). In historiography, however, these efforts have been thwarted in Warburton's opinion by the popular audience's admiration, or love, for prodigies: "Admiration, we experience to be one of the most bewitching, enthusiastic

Passions of the Mind: … [I]t arises from Novelty and Surprize, the inseparable Attendants of Imposture" (1727, 12). From this quote, William Burns deduces that Warburton links admiration to religious enthusiasm, a frequent charge leveled against radical Protestant sects like the Quakers, and sees its main danger in clouding the rational faculties so that prodigies are received as truth because of the emotional response to their strangeness (cf. 2002a, 168). Rather than strange, therefore true, Warburton sees prodigious events as dangerous, to which the apparition of ghosts undoubtedly belongs to as they also feature in historical works.
Still, the interest supernatural accounts like Glanvill's prevailed across social boundaries and prints on that subject enjoyed universal popularity and scholars like Riccardo Capoferro and Michael Hunter have consequently regarded Glanvill's impact as more literary than scientific (cf. Capoferro 112; Hunter 2005, 312-13). Similar to providential judgments and deliverances, Glanvill's apparition narratives circulated among Protestants on both sides of the Atlantic, have sparked numerous reprints or the recording of similar stories. A case in point is Increase Mather's *Illustrious Providences* that includes the "Drummer of Tedworth" together with similar cases from New England. The chapter is dedicated to "*things preternatural which have hapned [sic] in New England*" including accounts of "witches in that Colony," possessions, houses "*troubled with a Demon … or disquieted by Evil Spirits*" and people molested by apparitions or "*tormented by Invisible Agents*" (*IP* 135). Similar to the intertextual relations and transmissions of emplotment patterns that can be seen in the case of judgment or deliverance narratives in James Janeway's as well as Increase and Cotton Mather's sermons and collections, Mather here combines English and New England narratives of like content and form. The chapter applies the argument for collecting divine providences to supernatural events that are not so easily assigned good or evil forces, namely that "they should be observed" and told as accurately as possible (*IP* 135). Though Mather must have been aware of how controversial the Tedworth case was debated, he cites it as a "parallel story" and models his own narratives after Glanvill's model. Like Glanvill, Mather uses narrative as evidence of the supernatural (cf. Hall 1995, 43-44).

The most elaborate narrative cases concern similar invisible assaults to those of Nicholas Desborough's and William Morse's house, whereas only the latter was mostly attacked inside his house. Increase Mather's record of the disturbances of the Morse household provides a chronological account of events combined with an evaluation and inquiry into possible causes similar to Glanvill's model. Starting out with the date and place, Mather introduces William Morse's own account of the "troubles" that he wrote down "by the Advice of Friends" (*IP* 142). The account is not set apart by apostrophes as other directly

quoted sources, like Anthony Thacher's letter of his shipwreck. Resembling entries in a diary, the account is ordered by chronology and each paragraph dedicated to a particular date or become part of a temporal sequence through introductions like "[o]n another day" (*IP* 143). Morse records how the disturbances become audible in their effects yet their cause remains invisible: he and his wife "heard a noise upon the roof of their House, as if Sticks and Stones had been thrown against it with great violence … but could see nothing" (*IP* 142). Through the locked doors, however, a hog enters the house and awakes the Morses with "a great noise" before being chased away (*IP* 142).

During the next days, a progression from the inexplicable appearance of the animal to invisible hands throwing stones to the sudden movement of inanimate objects takes place. Now the effects of the "*invisible hand*" can be seen and quantified as "five great stones and bricks" as well as the staff that "danced up and down the chimney" (*IP* 143). As John Demons observes in his classic study of New England Witchcraft, demonic forces "disrupt the physical arrangements of ordinary households" (Demos 132). From obstructing daily chores like making the bed or milking cows to interfering with meals, sleeping and writing, much of the mischief attributed to demons could also be regarded as harmless pranks or humorous teasing (cf. *IP* 143). Yet, they also wreck general havoc in the house, whirling around chairs, household items and break the glass of windows with sticks and large iron objects (cf. *IP* 143). This topsy-turvy image of the household turned upside down, food thrown around reminds of a reversal motif in which household objects become animate, as they "danced up and down the chimney," fly or leap or frustrate their original purposes as keys cling together, doors are locked and food flies from the plate (*IP* 143, cf. 144). The empirical nature of the account is underscored by the repetition, enumeration and detailed description of each event while at the same time avoiding conclusions and evaluations. The narrative relates all of these episodes side by side in a third-person narrative perspective, treating the trifling episodes with the same length and detail as the personal attacks on Morse. Midway through, however, the narrative turns from the disturbances in the house to a case of possession or bewitchment of the Morses' grandson John Stiles. First, he is subject to the mischief of the devilish force like his parents but then becomes the focus of the attacks: "The Boy was violently thrown to and fro," was pricked by various sharp devices and finally loses control over his body (*IP* 149; cf. *IP* 150-53). He "barked like a dog, and clock't like a hen" and, when able to control his speech again, claims that "*Powel*" identified as Caleb Powell by Jonathan Burr and Demos, was behind his afflictions (*IP* 151-2; cf. Demos 133).

These reversals of order in the household foreshadow the goal ascribed to witchcraft at large: to undermine the order of the church and create a perversion of Christian worship (cf. *IW* xii-iii). According to Cotton Mather, these disturbances of the household represent only a first wave of the devil's attack on New England and its church: "An Army of *Devils* is horribly broke in,... and the Houses of the Good People there, are fill'd with the doleful Shrieks of their Children and Servants, Tormented by Invisible Hands, with Tortures altogether preternatural" (*IW* xii). In *Wonders of the Invisible World*, Mather describes this as a first step in a progression of demonic attacks that from household disturbances to possessions of individuals and culminate in the witchcraft crisis of Salem in which twenty New Englanders have been convicted of a covenant with the devil and have "Engaged in his Hellish Design of *Bewitching*, and *Ruining* our Land" (*IW* xiii). Notably, while the rumbling spirits or poltergeister that perform pranks and mischief in the house have been not necessarily regarded as evil in European folklore, Mather calls them "An Army of *Devils*" (*IW* xii). Dorson describes this as typical of New England folklore that eliminates the various lower orders of supernatural beings such as imps or fairies, which remained tied to their locality in Europe, and instead attributes their workings to "stranger figures" of devils and daemons (cf. Dorson 1973, 14-15).

George Blair St. George argues that this progression is already foreshadowed through the common seventeenth-century analogy between a house and the body that also extends to the abstract body of the church and state as the targets of witchcraft. St. George finds this "metaphoric equivalency drawn between the dwelling house and the human body" in various contexts of seventeenth century England and New England (cf. 2001, 14). By analyzing contemporary imagery in poetry, for example that of Anne Bradstreet, Edward Taylor and most notably Robert Underwood's *A New Anatomy, Wherein the Body of a Man is very fit and aptly (two wayes) compared: 1 To a House. 2 to a Citie* published in London in 1605, St. George detects descriptions of the body in terms of a house. Bible passages, diaries, sermons and everyday objects, in turn, apply the same analogy to the church and the state (cf. St. George 2001, 15). For example, the apostle Paul asks believers to remember that their bodies "are the temple of the living God" and describes the church as a body of which all of them are members (2 Cor 6:16; cf. 1 Cor 12:18-25). When applying the analogies of the body-house metaphor to the narratives by Glanvill and Mather, "[w]itches attacked precisely the crucial bodily openings in the house -the door (mouth), window (eyes), chimney and hearth (heart)" to hurt the family or little commonwealth assembled inside (St. George 1998, 185; cf. St. George 2001, 13-15). As the devils break windows or throw stones

through doors, scatter ashes from the hearth and throw objects into the fire, they ultimately attack what the body also symbolizes, namely the government and the church.

While this relationship corresponds to the progression outlined by Mather, St. George, however, regards the various architectural elements as gendered, describing the house as a manifestation of the patriarchal order and the demonic attacks as the fear of its subversion. While the head of the household and his interaction with the community is represented by the public facade with its doors and windows directed to the street, the female areas of the womb and heart, associated with the chimney and hearth, are relegated to the interior but at the same time become the most expensive and foundational features of the house (cf. St. George 2001, 18). Corresponding to the dominance of women over the household, St. George's detects a feminization of the religious realm to which both, the emotional dependence on salvation as well as the rhetoric of the church as a bride of Christ and the language of devotion contributes (cf. St. George 2001, 18). Yet these elements can be found in other Protestant groups as well and the question arises why both, the male and female connoted parts of the house are attacked. While the house may be a female domain, protecting it has always been regarded a male task, hence their noted absence in the captivity narratives discussed in an earlier chapter (cf. Hartman 1999, 135; Anderson 346). Conversely, men assume an active role in investigating the disturbances as both Mompesson and Morse carry weapons to brace for intruders, look for the source of the troubles and document them and the sailor Caleb Powell is one of the first men to be accused of witchcraft in the unresolved case of the Morse house, similar to George Borrows who was accused of being the ring leader of the Salem witches (cf. Demos 133-37). Also, the similarities between Glanvill's and Mather's accounts show that the theme and treatment of domestic disturbances go well beyond the problem of an eroding male superiority or feminized discourses in New England. Instead of a gendered discourse in New England, a continuity emerges that is supported by the use of similar narrative devices and contents that do not allow to trace different backgrounds such as an eroding patriarchal order and feminization of discourses that St. George characterizes as particular to Puritan New England.

Like Glanvill, Increase Mather is reluctant to provide a clear reason or culprit for the happenings in the Morse household. While the events have been reconstructed in more detail by John Demos and George Lincoln Burr, drawing on contemporary records, Mather only hints at the possibility that Caleb Powell or Mrs. Morse are witchcraft suspects: "The true Reason of these strange disturbances is as yet not certainly known: Some … did suspect *Morse's* Wife to be guilty of Witchcraft" (*IP* 155; cf. Demos 148-49). The mere

chronological order of events precludes any teleological or causal motivation of the plot. As an effect, the narrative lacks closure even as the diabolical mischief ceases, especially in comparison to the argumentative patterns in the witchcraft testimonies that often lead to a conviction.[48] Rather, the reader participates in an ongoing process of investigation in which evidence has been collected and options have been weighed. Together, the two narratives recorded by Glanvill and Increase Mather demonstrate a shift away from plots that perpetuate biblical stories and providential history.

Consequently, both Glanvill's and Mather's narratives received a sustained interest also from secular publishers like Nathaniel Crouch who includes the Morse case without alteration in his collection *Kingdom of Darkness* (London, 1688). Crouch was a seventeenth century English publisher, who assembled historical writings as well as chapbooks by reusing and combining existing material, catering to the popular demand for the sensational and supernatural. For his collections, he "culled prodigy tales from existing collections and reissued them in inexpensive formats" using pseudonymous and "shifts the balance perceptibly from religious indoctrination to secular entertainment" (Walsham 144, cf. Hall 1989, 52). This was noticed by Cotton Mather who denounced Crouch as a "sham scribbler," presenting the same dangers as 'romances' and 'novels,' the genres that Glanvill distanced himself from, that distracted the mind from engaging with religious truth and life (qtd. in Hall 1989, 55, cf. 54). Still, Capoferro argues that Crouch upholds the truth of the providences he defends against a "skeptical audience" (Capoferro 118). Yet these objections against unbelief and Crouch's use of empirical formulations rather reminds of other sensationalist hack writers who had before employed religious commonplaces to lend their products an air of relevance and dignity and indicate a cultural shift away from religious to scientific paradigms that even popular texts have to accommodate to (cf. For example the religious formulation in Strange News out of Kent).

By comparing the title page of *Kingdom of Darkness* and *A Blow at Modern Sadducism*, Capoferro argues that Crouch has a "focus on superstition rather than legitimate theology" (119). Instead of references to particular or well known cases such as Glanvill's reference to the drummer in Tedworth, Crouch's title page is at the same time vague and all-encompassing by claiming to narrate "*The History of Daemons, Specters, Witches, Apparitions, Possessions, Disturbances, and other wonderful and supernatural Delusions,*

[48] Demos states that Mrs. Morse underwent a trial for witchcraft from which her husband was able to extract her but the case remained undecided despite of Caleb Powell's testimony against her (cf. 133).

Mischievous Feats, and Malicious Impostures of the Devil." Calling it the "History" of such a large range of subjects brings his work closer to the sensational rather than scientific, as it even embraces opposites, the "real" and the "Delusions," as well as strings of modifiers that enforce the same meaning over and over "Credible Evidences … asserted by Authors of Undoubted Verity" (cf. Capoferro 119). Hall also remarks on the high amount of reprinted material, citing a number of stories from Mather's *Remarkable Providences* and abbreviations from Alexander Robert's *Treatise on Witchcraft* that concentrate on the narrative essence and omit explanations and commentary (1989, 113). In addition, Crouch forgoes any of the conclusions that relations of witchcraft often incited in analogy to providential judgments, for example, the call for reformation that is appended to many of Cotton Mather's apparition and witchcraft narratives in the *Magnalia* (cf. Hall 1989, 114).

Combining empirical language of the learned cycles with what has been termed the 'wonder craze' in contemporary English popular culture through a number of collections of the strange and supernatural, Crouch's reuse of the Morse relation closes the circle in bringing the narrative and its pattern back to England (cf. Hall 1989, 112-14). It also indicates the different uses that a single narrative can be put to in a different framework. Glanvill narrates the Tedworth Demon as an example for the working of invisible forces that he investigated himself and puts it to the use of his theological argument. In *Remarkable Providences*, the story serves as a backdrop for the Increase Mather's narration of the William Morse case in a more general collection of providences that are not geared to a specific group of opponents as well as a specific type of supernatural phenomena. Lastly, Crouch takes up a number of Mather's cases without preserving their categorization or order. While the account of William Morse opens the collection, Nicholas Desborough's similar troubles are printed twenty pages later after a series of witchcraft and ghost stories (cf. Crouch 1, 29). With the missing of frames that place the narratives into specific arguments or as evidence of divine providence, the reprint in Crouch's *Kingdom of Darkness* is not part of an argumentative or empirical endeavor. The long list of supernatural cases cited on the title also demonstrates that 'strange' becomes a marketing term rather than a means for religious teaching or scientific description. This change is accompanied and can be connected to a shift in narrative form that forgoes causality and instead relates observations and incidents in detailed accounts. These are as open ended as the method employed in gathering them and do not lead to preformed conclusions or applications. In contrast to exemplary emplotments, accounts of the supernatural are no longer linked to a communal religious experience or belief, indicated by the skepticism addressed by the ministers

Glanvill and Mather, and—rhetorically—also by Crouch. While the causal relations and maxims of exempla are expressions or reinforcements of a shared culture and faith, the fragmentation of narrative also mirrors a different reception that is less concerned with truth value than with what Warburton terms the "admiration" or emotional fascination with the strange and supernatural.

Upon their reuse in New England, however, Cotton Mather's *Magnalia* removes the chronological structure of the original report and focuses on the large scope and variety of mischief caused by the demon and ends upon its cessation in a way that resembles a deliverance plot. Instead of a chronological report, Mather's paragraphs highlight the respective objects that are animated and the agency of the "*invisible hand*" with italics. While the causal link is not openly stated, the prayer of the family is directly followed by a disembodied voice announcing that "*we knock no more!* And there was an End of all" (*MC* vi, 69). This ending differs from Increase Mather's version and omits the ongoing investigation as well as the empirical structure of the report. Instead, Mather applies the logic of a divine deliverance on supernatural phenomena that have before been regarded as inexplicable and only accessible through observation.

The progression of devilish attacks from the household to individuals can also be found in, the chapter of *Illustrious Providences* as it proceeds from the cases of Morse and Desborough to the relation of Ann Cole, which Increase Mather calls a "Remarkable … Providence," that deals with the paradoxical situation that Christians can also be bewitched by demonic forces by demonstrating that God allows it to uncover a group of witches in the colony and end their activities (*IP* 135). Throughout the narrative, two parties are juxtaposed as Increase Mather establishes the "Piety and Integrity" of Ann Cole and her father as beyond doubt, according to public opinion, and Ms. Greensmith is later characterized as "lewd and ignorant" and arrested as a suspected witch (*IP* 137). Cole was repeatedly "taken with very strange Fits, wherein her Tongue was improved by a *Daemon* to express things which she her self knew nothing of" (*IP* 136). In these fits, Cole named people who could be heard speaking about "mischievous designs against her and several others" but she also utters "matters unintelligible" or speaks in a strong Dutch accent (*IP* 136). When a written record of Cole's speech is presented to Ms. Greensmith, the suspected witch confesses and is executed as a witch (cf. *IP* 137-38). As a result, all of the persons mentioned by Cole are either convicted or flee and her fits cease.

Similar to the disturbances in the household, possessions undermine a person's control over her or his behavior, in Cole's case her speech. Unlike the judgment plots,

controlled by God, in which the tongue is affected as punishment for lying or cursing, a stark and incontrollable convulsion of the tongue is a frequent motif in narratives of possession or bewitchment. For example, John Stiles' tongue "hung out of his mouth" and he was unable to speak or eat and in the subsequent narrative, Elizabeth Knap's tongue was "drawn to the roof of her Mouth" and locked amongst the various "motions and agitations of her body" (*IP* 151, 140). Other tongues are "improved" to tell of the future, make strange outcries or, as in Ann Cole's case, channel the very dialogue of the demons at work in the community, first in English, then in Dutch (*IP* 136). The tongue is the transmitter of "tales," as the demons call them about their work but also as a means to discredit Cole (*IP* 136). Cole's speech inspired by the demon acquires a dual function of laying out the workings of supernatural forces and, in using another meaning of 'tale,' producing and structuring a number of narratives in the chapter.

On the one hand, the fact that Cole's speech is beyond her control and knowledge forms the basis for an argument for a demonic agency and the distinction between natural and supernatural causes. Parallel to Rushton's analysis of testimonies in English witchcraft trials, the narrative serves as an argument for a deviation from what is explicable under natural conditions. As a first instance, Mather quotes direct discourse of the demons: "Let us confound her Language, that she may tell no more tales" (*IP* 136). Subsequently, Cole's utterances became "unintelligble … [a]nd then … passed into a *Dutch-tone*" (*IP* 136). Mather cites the "Reverend Mr. *Stone*" as a witness who claims that "he thought it impossible for one not familiarly acquainted with the *Dutch* (which *Ann Cole* had not in the least been) should so exactly imitate the Dutch-tone in the pronunciation of *English*" (*IP* 137). In combination, the voices talking about diabolical agencies in New England first in plain English and then with a Dutch accent both show that Cole is not acting or simulating out of her own knowledge and ability. To reach that conclusion, Mather interrupts the demons' conversation to include the details of this investigation. He cites Mr. Stone as a witness and also the various people that have put it to writing. Contrary to the emplotment of exemplary judgments, Cole's uncontrolled discourse and 'improved' tongue are thus not a punishment for previous sins but rather a preternatural occurrence, as the title of the chapter indicates.

On the other hand, the loose narrative structure and lack of a specific emplotment give way to a myriad of other narratives that are linked to Cole's discourse or triggered by it. In the beginning, her speech seems to represent a conversation among witches, whose names Mather omits, about their "mischievous designs" against Cole and other members of

the community. What Cole unwittingly discloses about the practices and structures of witchcraft conforms to what had been revealed during the Salem and earlier witchcraft trials, linking her discourse to the confessions and testimonies discussed above. Similarly, her shift into a Dutch accent continues with "afflictions" that neighbors of a Dutch family have suffered. These "tales," as the demons call them, are transferred into writing by "Several Worthy Persons" and become evidence in the trial of a witchcraft suspect, Ms. Greensmith (*IP* 137).

The empirical collection of data that supports a supernatural influence on Ann Cole disrupts any narrative plot. In fact, the narrative is a composite of Ann Cole's case, the people and events mentioned in her speech, and what happens afterwards. Written down by John Whiting, Samuel Hooker and Joseph Hains, the "intelligible sayings expressed by *Ann Cole*" become evidence in an ongoing witchcraft case. When Whiting and Hains' accounts are read to Greensmith, she is "astonished" and confesses "those things to be true, and that she and other persons named in the preternatural Discourse, had had familiarity with the Devil" (*IP* 137). From oral to written and again to oral discourse, Ann Cole's words trigger the confession of Ms. Greensmith who adds additional narrative sentences of her encounters with the devil, a "merry Meeting" to be taking place at Christmas. Accordingly, links are established to various narrative genres from folklore to confessions. The emotional effects of the preternatural revelations received by Cole become the starting point for further narratives: Greensmith is astonished and when she denies her guilt, a further reading elicits an enormous "rage" and later on a feeling "as if her flesh had been pulled from her bones" (*IP* 138). The power of narrative resides in the spoken word that, similar to the curses or prophecies of exemplary judgments and deliverances, is connected to or triggers a specific emotional response, formerly the fear of God or thankfulness towards him, now a rage and pains that demonstrate the outside world the diabolical influences working in Greensmith.

While the main narrative does not construct a chain of causality that links events, it merges into different stories through a staggering of narrative layers. Cole is neither a victim nor part of the group of witches and her narrative only serves as a frame for the uncovering of the witches' identity and activity in the ensuing trial. This layered narrative structure centers around the embedded speech of Ann Cole that is only summarized by the narrator but expands into further narratives through references and the emotional effect its telling has on Greensmith, not unlike the circles of folkloric storytelling that revolve around a common theme or pattern and build upon each other. The speech is vital in producing other parts of the overall narrative, leading from the Dutch accent the demonic discourse voiced through

Cole assumes to the afflictions of the Dutch family's neighbors. In addition, when recorded and read, the embedded "tale" as it is termed by the demons serves to overwhelm Greensmith and elicit her confession, seemingly against her will (*IP* 137-38). Such is the power attributed to narrative and the spoken word. The frame opens with the account of Cole and her preternatural speech and then shifts to the interspersed narration of the afflicted neighbors of the Dutch family that is triggered by the changing accent and the fact that there is only one Dutch family in the region (*IP* 137). Instead of continuing Cole's story, the next paragraph describes how her discourse is evaluated and put into writing and establishes the connection to Greensmith who is mentioned in it. Greensmith's confession introduces a new level and conceptual frame for the narrative as a whole, turning it, first in oral performance and then in writing into a testimony given in court (*IP* 138). This opens up the narrative for the inclusion of references that resemble folkloric conceptions of witchcraft. As in the testimonies and confessions at the Salem trials, the Dutch family's neighbors have been "afflicted" and "strangely pinched in the night" and Greensmith admits "familiarity" and sexual intercourse with the devil who had first appeared to her as "a Dear or Fawn, skipping about her" (*IP* 136-38). The subversion of Christian worship that Mather laments is also represented by the devil's intention that their covenant was to be "Subscribed" at a "merry Meeting" on Christmas (*IP* 138). Cole's story is taken up at the very ending of the story and closes the frame as well as well as the different narrative strands opened by it. By emphasizing the temporal succession, Mather highlights the different outcomes for the accused witches and Ann Cole to conclude that she was merely bewitched but not punished by God: "[t]hus doth the Devil use to serve his Clients, After the suspected Witches were either executed or fled, *Ann Cole* was restored to health, and has continued well for many years, approving her self as a serious Christian" (*IP* 139).

Conversely, Cotton Mather's re-working of the case in the *Magnalia* concentrates on a conventional exemplary plot that focuses on Cole and Greensmith. While the narrative opens and ends similar to his father's version, Mather implies causal connections where his father employed a merely temporal order. Cotton Mather omits the witnesses that his father cites to validate his evaluation of Cole's discourse as supernatural. Likewise, the other witchcraft suspects are only named in passing and Greensmith's execution is directly related to Cole's betterment: "Upon this Confession … the Woman [Greensmith] was Executed, and other Persons accused, made their Escape: Whereupon *Ann Cole* was happily deliver'd from the extraordinary Troubles wherewith she had been exercis'd" (*MC* vi, 67). In contrast to his father, Mather's texts become less a document of diabolical influences in the colony or the

ways of uncovering them than a narrative of deliverance. The two strands, Cole's affliction and Greensmith's witchcraft case, are first narrated in sequence as in *Illustrious Providences*. Yet with this final sentence, both strands of action are drawn together, causally related and concluded.

Similarly, the narrative of Mary Johnson who confesses and is executed for witchcraft carries elements of both, judgment and deliverance, as God's power for salvation, aided by the New England ministry, triumphs above the seductive lure of the devil. As in one of the judgments related earlier in the *Magnalia* as part of Mather's sermon *Terribilia Dei*, Johnson's "familiarity with the Devil, came through discontent, and wishing the *Devil* to take this and that, and the Devil to do that" what was required of her as a maid in the house. The Devil appears in direct answer to her invocation as in the judgment plots and "did for her many services" (*MC* vi, 71). Defying the order of her master, Mather lists many examples without any chronological order in which the devil took over Johnson's tasks but also the stereotypical sins of witchcraft committed by Johnson: "She confess'd that she had murdered a child, and committed uncleanness both with *men* and with *devils*" (*MC* vi, 71).

The invocation of the devil and Johnson's confession become turning points of the plot, giving it the ending of a deliverance rather than a judgment tale but also showing the continuous importance of speech for narrative structure. A confession presents "sufficient" evidence in a witchcraft trial, as Cotton Mather quotes from Mathew Perkins *A Discourse of the Damned Art of Witchcraft* (1608) in *Wonders of the Invisible World*, and Johnson's confession "was attended with such convictive circumstances, that it could not be slighted" (cf. *IW* xxvi-ii; *MC* vi, 71). In seventeenth-century New England, public executions were "elaborately staged ritual drama" in which the convict played the role of warning the audience against rebelling against social and religious authority (Williams x). This authority is represented in Johnson's history by the clergy who attempted to "promote her conversion from the *Devil* to *God*" (*MC* vi, 71). Through her full confession and behavior since the sentence was pronounced, Johnson "was by the best observers judged very penitent … and she died in a frame extremely to the satisfaction of them that were spectators of it" (*MC* vi, 71)." From Mather's point of view, the authority that Johnson rebelled against with the help of the devil has been reinstated through her submission under human and divine justice, indicated in her adherence to the minister's. Throughout the variety of the supernatural events attributed to witchcraft reported in the *Magnalia*, Cotton Mather aims to interpret them according to the patterns of deliverance and judgment.

Empirical Evidence of the Supernatural

Apart from strange natural phenomena and ominous signs, apparitions of ghosts, people presumed dead, and specters, apparitions of living people with malicious intent, received the most sustained interest throughout the seventeenth and subsequent centuries and were collected, for example, in Joseph Glanvill's *Saducismus Triumphatus* whose title page promised to give "[f]ull and plain evidence concerning witchcraft and apparitions." Historians of the genre cite the appearance of Caesar's ghosts to Brutus in various Roman histories as well as examples from Shakespeare's plays though the majority of instances probably remained unrecorded as oral tales (cf. Baine 1962, 336). Contrary to the established providential plots of judgment and deliverances, apparitions were much more difficult to fathom in terms of agency as well as purpose and the question surrounding their existence both in reality and in the Bible.

In *Wonders of the Invisible World* already, Cotton Mather refers to the precedent of the "apparition of a slain party" in a murder trial when arguing against spectral evidence in the Salem court and provides an example as well (cf. *IW* n.pag, 145-46). According to Mather, God is the prime mover of visible and invisible forces alike and apparitions are to be regarded as communications that have to be interpreted and analyzed, just like providential events: "[W]hen God Almighty permits any Spirits from the unseen Regions, to visit us with surprizing Informations, there is then something to be *Enquired* after; we are then to enquire of one another, What cause there is for such things?" (*IW* n.pag.). While God holds the "[g]overnment … over the unbodied Intelligences," deceptions might still be possible as (*IW* n.pag.). Mather argues for using the same standard for apparitions of alleged witches as for apparitions of ghost trying to bring justice to their murderer. "When there has been a Murder committed, an Apparition of the slain Party, accusing of any Man, altho' such Apparitions have oftner spoke true than false, is not enough to Convict the Man as guilty of that Murder; but yet it is a sufficient occasion for Magistrates to make a particular Enquiry" (*IW* n.pag.). This tangible evidence will only be provided by God, however, if the accused is really guilty (cf. *IW* n.pag.). An example of this practice is appended to the records of the trials, as Mather relates a number of "Curiosities" of witchcraft, one of which details the apparition that charges one of the alleged witches with a murder.

In a letter to Samuel Sewell, one of the judges in the Salem trials, Thomas Putnam relates how his daughter suffered from witchcraft and had the apparition of a man accusing Giles Cory, whom she deemed responsible for her suffering, with murdering him long ago.

Ann Putnam is threatened "that she should be Pressed to Death, before Giles Cory" by witches at night and when her suffering is eased "through the Goodness of a Gracious God," she witnesses the apparition of a man. The man "told her that *Giles Cory* had Murdered him, by Pressing him to Death with his Feet; but that the Devil there appeared unto him, and Covenanted with him, and promised him, *He should not be Hanged*" (*IW* 145). To bring justice to his case, the ghost claims that Corey will be executed for witchcraft as "It must be done to him as he has done to me" (*IW* 146). The account of the apparition is found to correspond to seventeen year old case against Corey in which he was charged with the murder of a handicapped man living in his house but not evaded conviction. Like his records of providential interventions, Mather introduces the letter as an instant of the various means by which God effects justice and that "Some of those … are the frequent Apparitions of Ghosts" (*IW* 145).

In *The Displaying of Supposed Witchcraft*, the English clergyman, physician and witchcraft skeptic John Webster argues that "these apparitions that discover murther and murtherers and brings them to condign punishment, cannot be the evil Angles, because they are only the Ministers of torture, sin, horror, and punishment, but are not Authors of any good …. So that it must of necessity be lest either to be acted by a Divine Power … or mediate by the ministry of good Angels, which is hard to prove, there being no one instance … in all the Scriptures" (312). Webster refers to Paracelsus theory of the astral spirit as a possible explanation but concedes that it likewise lacks a basis in scripture (cf. 312-13). Yet, contrary to his rejection of witchcraft as a delusion, Webster asserts the existence of such apparitions through a number of narratives which he terms convincing and, with the reservation that they cannot be assessed with the absolute certainty, assigns them to either divine power or the astral spirit of the deceased (cf. Webster 300). One of them, also quoted in a letter printed in *Saducismus Triumphatus*, deals with a young woman who is murdered after becoming pregnant from her employer (cf. 2-3). She repeatedly appears to a miller, names the murderer and the circumstances and asks him to reveal them (cf. Webster 299). The apparition finally so "threatened and affrighted him" that the man informs the magistrate and the corpse is found with exactly the wounds that the miller saw on the apparition, leading to the arrest and execution of her murderers (cf. Webster 299; *ST* 2-3).

A similar case has been reported by Cotton Mather with the apparition of Joseph Beacon's brother that he published in three different contexts over a period of thirty years. While it is merely interspersed in *Wonders of the Invisible World*, it is integrated into the argument of the *Magnalia* and *Triparadisus* (1727). Unlike the combination of argument

and narration in his sermons, the division of *Wonders of the Invisible World* into different sections mirrors a separation between theological argument and narrative. Similar to the chapter structure in Illustrious Providences, for example, the recapitulation of knowledge on witches, in the first part "Enchantments Encountered," and theological argument, the sermon-like "Discourse on Wonders of the Invisible World," are separated from the narratives of the witchcraft trials in Salem that constitute the third part of the book, which then closes with "The Devil Discovered," summarizing the previous findings and warning against the temptation of witchcraft. However, Increase Mather's concludes his account of Ann Cole by calling into question the use of witchcraft tests through an inconclusive example whereas a similar argument is only quoted by his son from John Gaule's *Select Cases of Conscience touching Witches and Witchcraft* (1646) without such narrative illustration (cf. *IP* 139; WI xxvii).

Mather's division shows also a clear sense of what themes are high in demand and that short narratives of them are ideally geared for the combination of the supernatural, edification and entertainment. Addressing his readers directly, Mather promises to proceed from the abstract to the specific: "Having thus discourse on the *Wonders of the Invisible World*, I shall now … relate some Remarkable and Memorable Instances of *Wonders* which that *World* ha's given to ourselves" (*IW* 79). In his introductory statement, Mather combines the genre of "True History" with the "Wonders" and the "Remarkable and Memorable Instances" that populate collections of providential accounts (*IW* 79). Calling his records of the witchcraft cases "True History" distinguishes them from the tales or romances that imply fancy and superstition. Yet, this distinction has been perceived to be one of degree rather than kind as many supernatural and strange events were recorded as true histories (*IW* 79; cf. McKeon 88, 119). However, Mather invites his readers to test the veracity of his narratives and the signatures of Samuel Sewall and William Stoughton attest the accuracy of his representation of the trials (cf. *IW* 138-39, 147). In his history of the Royal Society, Thomas Spratt criticizes a lack of veracity in previous natural science as well as a lack of relevance and complexity: he denounces the "pretty Tale, and fine monstrous Stories" of the works by Pliny as well as with the interest in curiosities only. Instead, Sprat calls for a natural history that exhibits the "pleasure of *Reason*" by investigating ordinary and plain things in their full variety (Sprat 91). In detailing the evidence for witchcraft in the colony, Mather claims to combine entertainment and exactitude, as his choice of generic labeling suggests.

While Mather upholds the status of the trial records as a "True History," *Wonders of the Invisible World* addresses not only witchcraft skeptics but is highly aware of the general

reader's interests in entertaining and uncanny stories. Firstly, *Wonders of the Invisible World* simply translates a highly popular and current topic for oral storytelling into print, as its closeness to folklore and story cycles indicate. Secondly, Mather regards the narratives of the trials rather than the theological argumentation that frames them as the centerpiece of his book and calls the repeatedly "the chief Entertainment which my Readers do Expect, and shall Receive" (*IW* 79). Mather demonstrates an awareness of his audience's taste and that narratives are integral to satisfying it. His statement hints at the pervasive use of strange and supernatural narratives in secular and religious prints and places his own work within that culture of wonder on which it also draws on by including excerpts from English and European witchcraft manuals as well as letters and sermons. Likewise, Mather pressed Stephen Sewall, the court clerk, to swiftly send him the court records for a timely publication of the narratives (cf. Silverman 115). In contrast to his sermons *Terribilia Dei* or *Compassions Called for*, however, the narratives and their form do not serve as expression or illustrations of a theological argument or doctrine.

Throughout the trial records, Mather uses the word apparition for the specters of the alleged witches as well as the murdered brother, not distinguishing between evil and good angels or agency as Glanvill and Webster do. Similarly, Mather does not explain the relationship between Beacon's case and the trials or their theological status. In the *Magnalia* and *Triparadisus*, the narrative has no particular heading and is aligned with other accounts of the supernatural or apparitions. Joseph Beacon's story is mentioned in the *Magnalia* as part of the chapter "*Thaumatographia Pneumatica* [wonders of the spirit]: Relating the Wonders of the invisible World in Preternatural Occurrences." Its motto reads "Miranda cano, set sund credenda," indicating that what is sung, or told, is marvelous yet true in a variation of the motto for much of contemporary strange and supernatural writing that has been labeled "strange but true". This rather broad category comprises all of the narratives types analyzed in this chapter and ranges from William Morse's poltergeists, the voices heard from Ann Cole, both abridged from his father's collection to a reprint of Cotton Mather's own investigation of the Goodwin children's bewitchment in *Memorable Providences* but excludes the records of the witchcraft trials except for Beacon's account that was also first printed in *Wonders of the Invisible World*.

In *Triparadisus*, Mather allows for some sham reports of apparitions but emphasizes the "unquestionable" reports, "delivered unto us in the most undoubted Histories" as "*Matters of Fact*," citing John Webster among others as one of the reliable historians of apparitions (*TP* 114). Similar to his father's collection in *Illustrious Providences*, Mather

quotes ministers whom he regards as beyond reproach and historical events in London and other places in England before moving to his "own Vicinity" (*TP* 115). Comparing England to New England and the relation of Joseph Beacon to Defoe's *True Relation*, which had in the meantime appeared as part of Drelincourt's treatise, Mather states that these "will not be found more worthy of Consideration, than these, which we shall now proceed unto" (*TP* 115). To be equally trustworthy, New England relations are based on empirical evidence of "*Spirits*, who have been *seen* and *heard* asserting themselves to be the Souls of Persons departed; and my own most *Critical Enquiries* have putt [sic] it out of all Doubt" (*TP* 155). The markers that Mather applies to judge the truth of an account are the sense impressions of reliable witnesses and the personal inquiry of the author, which in turn inform the narrative mediation. Secondly, while similar reports from England corroborate the apparitions of spirits, their existence in New England can be proven through the biblical principle of "*Two or Three Witnesses*," meaning converging reports, that are needed to lawfully condemn a person according to the Old Testament (*TP* 115; Deut. 17:6, 19,15).

In contrast to this combination of empirical methodology and biblical principles, the narratives in the *Magnalia* are introduced by Mather's argument why the devil is especially active in New England. Rather than citing New England's eschatological status as the possible seat of the New Jerusalem or its role in advancing the Reformation, Mather refers to the particularity of place and the fact that "the sovereignty of Heaven has permitted them [the devils] still to remain in the wilderness for our vexation, as well as their own" (*MC* vi, 66). In order to identify them as the cause of mischief and ghostly apparitions, Mather first claims that "the devils" are often drawn to "the Wilderness" and secondly that they were angered by the arrival of the Christian Englanders (*MC* vi, 66). Mather supports these arguments with quotes from a popular narration, *The Devil of Mascon* and Alexander of Hales' *de Magicis* and Lucian's remark about "the famous magician Mithrobarzanes," extending his synthesis of old world and Christian learning to this very subject (vi, 66; cf. Stievermann 2004, 272). In calling and numbering his narratives as examples, Mather's *Magnalia* establishes a correlation and treats them as incidents of devilish malice independent of whether they report a possession, a bewitchment or a ghost, which is not necessarily associated with the devil by Glanvill and Defoe, for example. Yet, no reference is made to the method of collecting and verifying the accounts as well as to their original sources and the *Magnalia* chapter resembles more a collection of wonder than true history, even though the narrative of Beacon is unaltered. Rather, its complex form accommodates to the different functions that the Beacon narrative assumes in each embedding text, serving

as a general example of the supernatural and its lore, as in *Wonders of the Invisible World* and the *Magnalia*, to evidence in a theological argumentation in *Triparadisus*.

In contrast to the stories of natural phenomena or witchcraft, the apparition narrative turns inward and the events are not portrayed by a host of witnesses but by the authority of subjective experience. The narrative further develops and combines narrative devices from previous texts, such as switching between interior and exterior focalization, a first person investigator, characterization and various levels of time that further verify the original account. The narrative starts out with situating the events in time and characterizing Beacon, two elements that will prove of greater importance in the context of an apparition narrative and its verification.

> On the Second of *May,* in the Year, 1687 that a most ingenious, accomplished, and well-disposed young Gentleman, Mr. *Joseph Beacon*, by name, about Five a clock in the Morning, as he lay, whether Sleeping or Waking, he could not say, (but judged the Latter of them,) had a View of his Brother then at *London,* although he was now himself at our *Boston,* distanced from him a thousand Leagues. (*IW* 79-80)

Like Glanvill and Ward and other collectors of providences before him, Mather's narrator gives the particulars of time and place as if to invite the readers to make their own inquiries. The difference is that Glanvill's narrative of the Tedworth Drummer, or the Increase Mather's story of Ann Cole revolve around visible and audible phenomena affirmed by a number of witnesses, in Glanvill's case including the writer himself. Cotton Mather, however, relates a phenomenon only visible to Beacon and structures his narrative accordingly. As in exemplary short narratives, characterization is an important means to establish the qualities of the protagonist or experiencer necessary for the development of the narrative plot. While judgments mostly start by indicating a particular sin and deliverance plots with the general goodness and piety of the main character, Joseph Beacon is first and foremost characterized as a credible witness and by his ability to be an acute observer. Characterized as "accomplished" and "well-disposed," Beacon appears unlikely to risk or act against his reputation for inventing his story. Switching from an exterior to an interior focalization, the narrative voice reports Beacon's own though process as he "judged" that he was awake while seeing his brother (*IW* 79). While this cautionary remark could emphasize his honesty and deliberate weighing of sensory evidence, it also characterizes his ability to perceive and make sense of his sense impression, as the narrator has already described Beacon as intelligent and discerning ("ingenious"). Before the backdrop of diverging theological and philosophical theories of the existence and nature of apparitions, it seems important that Beacon was most likely awake and his senses thus unimpaired.

Having established Beacon's credibility and perceptiveness, the narrator first portrays the apparition through his focalization, detailing how its clothes and also the visible wound. In contrast to previous providence tales that were told from a non-focalized perspective and by an omniscient narrator, Joseph Beacon acts in the beginning as the focalizer of the narrative. Instead of the experiences visible to others as well, Mather records a subjective impression that cannot be verified other than by describing it in detail for verification. When the narrator reports Mr. Beacon's insecurity whether he witnessed the apparition while sleeping or lying awake, this information seems to be reworked from either an oral or written account and may contain Beacon's original wording as free indirect discourse. Further, the apparition wears the Bengale Gown, "which [Beacon's brother] usually wore" and that serves as an identification that again draws on Beacon's knowledge. The dialogue between Beacon and his brother's ghost is rendered in direct discourse as if to recreate the audible experience. Mather uses italics and verbs like "said" to mark the speaker and spoken language. At the same time, the apparition is straight away identified as Beacon's brother. Both, the direct discourse and the description of the brother establish the accuracy of the account against the odds of seeing a ghost or a person that lives "a Thousand Leagues" away (*IW* 80). At the same time, the narrative combines precise observation with the stereo-typical conception of a ghost. His "Pale, Ghastly, Deadly" features identify Beacon's brother as a ghost that carries its cause of death visibly in the still "Bloody Wound" (*IW* 80). The co-existence of personal observation and convention to interpret and ascertain that the apparition of Beacon's brother was really his ghost, i.e. a supernatural phenomenon, bears resemblance to the testimonies in the Salem trials that equally drew on conventions to be recognized as true and in turn reinforced these conventions in the empirical and legal process of ascertaining the existence of witchcraft.

Similarly, the narrative conforms to the earlier ghost stories collected by Glanvill that justify the apparition with unresolved legal or monetary issues, or, as in Shakespeare's Hamlet, with the quest to avenge their murder. The sensual evidence that the apparition was really Beacon's brother is also supported by Mather's inclusion of dialogue and the following verification of the apparition's speech. Again mixing different narrative voices and perspectives, the description of the crime is full of rhetorical devices typical of Mather's style, like parallel sound and sentence structures (cf. Manierre 98-99). So, the brother claims that he has been "*most Barbarously and Injuriously Butchered, by a Debauch'd, Drunken Fellow*" (*IW* 70). The modifiers attached to verb and noun from "rhythmical phrases and sound patterns" and the characterization of the murderer is emphasized through the use of

alliteration (Manierre 497-500). Mather employs stock vocabulary that place the murder and the murderer outside of civilized society and religious morality where debauchery as well drunkenness is considered a sin. This impression is heightened by the apparition's assertion that he "never did any wrong" to the murderer, marking the deed as an unjust and unprovoked act. Thus, the ghost requests Beacon to apprehend the murder at his arrival in New England and bring him to court, claiming "*I'l stand by you and prove the Indictment*" (*IW* 80). Similar to the renewed flow of blood when the murderers of John Sausaman approach his corpse, the ghost of Beacon's brother promises to repeat the testimony that he has just given, evoking the ancient folklore motif "murder will out" once more (Dorson 1973, 16). This type of supernatural justice is not based on divine agency and not recorded in the colonies even though witchcraft trails allowed for supernatural evidence, i.e. spectral apparitions, the reactions of the possessed to the glance of the alleged witches.

While the apparition conforms to folk wisdom about ghosts and when they appear, it also overcomes the hesitation and uncertainty of the ghosts' status with a parallel narrative strand that verifies its existence. First, the visual and audible impressions of the apparition are paralleled with a second report of the murder of Beacons Brother that Beacon receives about two months later "by common ways of communication" (*IW* 80). The matching facts along with the temporal coincidence that the ghost appeared to Beacon at the time of his brother's death demonstrate that it consisted of an instant of supernatural communication. Secondly, the emotional impact of the apparition registered by Beacon's household is instrumental in proving that Beacon did not make up the apparition after the fact: "the Family where he sojourned, not only observed an Extraordinary Alteration upon him, for a week following, but also gave me under their hands a full Testimony ready to be disposed by Oath, that he then gave them an Account of his Apparition" (*IW* 81). With his astonishment, Beacon exhibits the emotion usually connected to strange and supernatural events. As the apparition was only witnessed by Beacon in contrast to the apparitions in the sky or the disturbances and possessions discussed earlier, Mather emphasizes its emotional effect and integrates it into the narrative. "[W]hat [Beacon] had seen and heard" is externalized through his emotional reaction that can be observed by the family (*IW* 81). Their account becomes additional evidence—given to Mather under oath—that Beacon knew of his brother's murder through a vision long before its report arrives from overseas.

In contrast to judgment and deliverance plots that are meant to evoke fear and thankfulness in the audience while the figures involved in the narratives show no such reaction, emotional reactions are crucial to the empirical recording of apparitions and other

supernatural events. Showing signs of astonishment or other emotions is regarded as evidence that the character has witnessed something extraordinary. Similarly, the witnesses in the Salem trials describe the fear and astonishment they experience in the presence of the suspects and these emotions also elicit Ms. Greensmith's confession. The strange and supernatural events contained in these narratives become more credible to the readers as they participate in the astonishment of the witnesses but they achieve no further religious goals, like the renewal of piety and thankfulness through the exemplary plots of judgments or deliverances. While these plots were geared at emotional reactions that result in specific actions, the pragmatic effect of the apparition narrative remains tied to a specific attitude towards its content. By contrast, the credibility of exemplary plots is never questioned, as their purpose and precedents are drawn from biblical sources and theological arguments.

Like Glanvill, Mather adds a final paragraph in which he switches to a first person narrator and evaluates his source and its truthfulness. As direct access and evaluation of the material were important qualities, Mather claims to have received "This History from Mr. Joseph *Beacon* himself," the only first-hand witness (*IW* 81). Mather further adds that Beacon died shortly after, implying that no man would burden his conscience or gain anything by writing a false report on such an important matter shortly before his death. This death was apparently not unexpected but "Pious&Hopeful," two adjectives that endow Beacon with signs of grace and a certainty of his salvation and render it even more unlikely that he forged an apparition account. Mather supports the credibility of Beacon's account both by narrative means and by complying with the prerequisites of empirical natural science: reliable witnesses and detailed accounts. At the same time, Mather's endorsement of Beacon as a credible witness shows both, religious elements, as in the reference to his pious death, and those geared at an empiricist audience, for example by citing other witnesses and by underscoring Beacon's perceptibility and the fact that he was awake rather than dreaming of the apparition.

Scholars agree that Mather uses the theory of the "Nishmath-Chajim," or breath of life, which he first explained *The Angel of Bethesda* (1722) and reiterated in *Triparadisus* (1727) as an explanation that for apparitions and can be linked to narratives like Beacon's (cf. Wise 232). Yet, while some scholars have explored Menasseh ben Israel's influence on Glanvill's and Mather's theories of the spiritual world separately, no study has so far investigated this communality and its effect on narrative. Both, Mather and Glanvill base their thinking about the relationship between spirit and body on the work of Menasseh Ben Israel, a Jewish Rabbi and printer in Amsterdam. Ben Israel recapitulates the Jewish

scholarship on demons and the soul to show that is was conceived as eternal and can wander after the death of the body containing it (cf. Reisner 52-53). Mather builds on Ben Israel's and the Cambridge Platonist's attempt to bridge the gap between "between matter and spirit opened up by the Enlightenment" by emphasizing the eternal existence of the soul and the Nishmath chajim as a middle nature between the two (Wise 242).

Mather's theory of the Nishmath chajim echoes the belief in the pre-existence of souls and is based on Manasseh Ben Israel's *Nishmath Hayyim* (1651) who was also read by the Cambridge Platonists. For example, *Lux Orientalis* (1662), published anonymously but ascribed to Joseph Glanvill, follows Henry More's *The Immortality of the Soul* (1659) by arguing that souls were initially part of creation and then assigned to heavenly or human bodies, leaving the possibility of their appearance on earth after the death of the body and before they return to heaven (cf. Lewis 276). Already in *The Vanity of Dogmatizing*, Glanvill recognizes that this question "had been a 'ball of contention'" (qtd. in Lewis 277) and divides the Cambridge Platonists from materialists, for example. Though not a member, Glanvill popularized the ideas of the Cambridge Platonists, a group of seventeenth century thinkers that argued for a rational approach to religion, directed against the enthusiasm of radical sects, while at the same time propagating a specific mysticism devolved from Platonic concept of the soul as part of the world of ideas (cf. Burns 2002b, 158; Patrides 16).

To explain the apparition of dead people, Mather postulates a spirit that exists in between the material and the immaterial world, i.e. between what can be observed and what belongs to the invisible and supernatural (cf. 1722, 11). Calling him the breath of life, the Nishmath-chajim, operates as a "Plastick Spirit" that contains all the information for forming the body upon its creation and can also leave the body after death and project its likeness. Mather develops the concept of the Nishmath-chajim through Scripture, according to which humans consist of spirit, soul, and body, and historical sources, citing the "Astral Spirit" that has been acknowledged in different schools of thought throughout history and combines it with the biblical image of humans as consisting of soul, body, mind (Mather 1722, 1-2). In the *Angel of Bethesda*, published in 1722, Mather proposes that the Nishmath chajim "may be of a *Middle Nature*, between the *Rational Soul*, and the *Corporeal Mass*; But may be the *Medium of Communication*, by which they work, upon one another. It … receives *Impressions* from Both of them; And Perhaps it is the *Vital Ty* between them" (1722, 1).

Before that, the Cambridge Platonist Henry More had already speculated about the material condition of the soul, he regarded it for example as a fluid in the brain or part of nervous system and Mather sees the Nishmath chajim as half material half spiritual as it

connects these two halves of the body (cf. Henry 172). While the body is alive, the Nishmath chajim coordinates the working of the organs and muscles (cf. Mather 1722, 9). In his medical treatise *Angel of Bethesda*, Mather ascribes any illness to a weakening of this spirit and hence also requires a spiritual not only a natural cure (1722, 11-12). Conversely, the visible appearance of the Nishmath chajim in the shape of a terminally ill or recently deceased person results from an influence of the rational soul on the spirit (cf. Reisner 52). According to Mather these "Spectres", which can be found in the Bible as "spirits", result from the "strong Desire to Visit or Behold some Objects a Distance" of people shortly before their death. As the Nishmath chajim departs their body, the fatally ill are "thrown into a *Trance*," but upon it return, they are able to account for what they have seen while out of their body in front of unspecified witnesses that have remained with their body (1722, 11).

What Kenneth Silverman calls Mather's "own unified field theory," is first and foremost an attempt to harmonize the empirical and biblical world view. Secondly, it should also account for the empirical effects of invisible beings, i.e. apparitions of the dead or specters called up by witchcraft, and other unresolved questions of nature, like the origin of muscular motion (Silverman 408-9; cf. Wise 242). That these and other questions persist demonstrates the limits of empirical description and allows Mather to develop his theory of a spirit that controls and shapes the body. Wise even regards Mather's unique blend of supernatural theories and rational natural philosophy as interrupting "linear narratives of secularization" (Wise 242). Instead of rational principles supplanting residues of religious conceptions, their combination in Cotton Mather's approach anticipates a host of "new movements in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries" (Wise 241). Mesmerism and Spiritualism, for example, built on the belief that the invisible interacts with the visible and that observing the material world only discloses a fraction of its causes and connections as the sustained interest in apparitions and life after death demonstrates (cf. Wise 240-42).

Yet Mather's integration of scientific methods and biblical supernaturalism results in different applications of the Beacon account that depend on the context of publication rather than progressing towards a rational and secular explanation of the supernatural. While Beacon's account remains unchanged over the course of three publications, it is embedded as a diversion, as part of a chain of evidence or thrown together with all kinds of observations in "Curiosa Americana." In 1717, Mather includes Joseph Beacon's account in one of his letters to the Royal Society together with the "an affidavit signed by two gentlewomen of the house where Beacon lived," referring to the declaration that Beacon told them of his vision in May before receiving notice of his brother's death in June (Beall 1961, 370).

According to Beall, Mather's reuse of this and other narratives from the *Magnalia* shows that he "regarded them as a legitimate phase of scientific investigation" even though they were recorded as "divine providences" (Beall 1961, 382).

In *Triparadisus*, by contrast, Mather strings together arguments for the pre-existence and immortality of souls, the Nishmath chajim and Mather's theory of a second paradise in which souls reside before being reunited with the body on the Day of Judgment. Firstly, the pre-existence of souls implies that the souls of the deceased exist even after their body has died; a belief shared, according to Mather, "even by the rudest *Pagans*" (*TP* 114). In his introduction to *Triparadisus*, Reiner Smolinski points out that towards the end of the seventeenth century, the immortality of souls has become a topic for debate even among Protestant denominations. While Roman Catholics believe purgatory to be an intermediate stage where souls are cleansed and prepared for heaven, Protestants argued that all souls are caught up in a middle ground between heaven and earth until the resurrection when they will be reunited with their bodies, judged and entering afterlife (cf. Smolinski 1995, 9). Protestant sects like the Anabaptists, adhere to psychopannychism, which holds that souls would lie dormant in the second paradise until they are awakened for Judgment Day. Mather follows Calvin's rejection of the psychopannychists by emphasizing how the souls of the deceased interact with the visible world through the Nishmath chajim that projects their likeness to other places. (cf. Smolinski 1995, 10). On the other end of the spectrum, Mather opposes materialists like Hobbes who deny the existence of spiritual beings outside of the body or after death. The accounts alluded to and collected in the second part of *Triparadisus* participate in this contemporary debate and oppose both Protestant sects and materialists while they could have also been part of a witchcraft tract, as the example of Joseph Beacon's account illustrates. Their integration into a theological treatise demonstrates the continuity of Mather's approach to the invisible world as well as the universal appeal and applicability of apparition narratives.

As a consequence, apparitions of these souls are possible and not to be disregarded because "a few *Impostures* [have] been detected" and Mather continues by summarizing a few examples from England before proceeding to Joseph Beacon and other New England cases (*TP* 114). Secondly, *Triparadisus* offers the Nishmath Chajim as a possible explanation for apparitions of the soul and the second paradise as its dwelling (*TP* 126-32). Smolinski also sees Mather's reprint of Joseph Beacon's story as a direct rebuttal of Hobbes's rationalist dismissal of apparitions but also of the Deists' belief that the visible world is not influenced by the invisible (1995, 9-10, 47; cf. *TP* 368). According to Castle, the eighteenth

century saw the shift from a belief system shared in tight communities that included supernatural beings to their existence solely in the mind, "figments, or phantasmata, produced by a disordered or overwrought brain" (170). Instead of being mere illusions and void of meaning, Mather foregrounds their "impact on the visible world" by showing the link between the death and the apparition as well as Beacon's emotional reaction that is widely registered (cf. *TP* 368). The two other narratives repeat the core elements of Beacon's story: apparitions of dead people, one of a friend, the other of a sister, appear and are empirically registered through the noise they make and through tests that show that the poltergeist of Mary Johnson finds Mehetabel Warner even if she moves to a different house (cf. *TP* 116). Reversing the transatlantic direction of Beacon's vision, John Watts, a friend of Mather's, sees in London an apparition of his sister who tells him that she died and "encourage[s] him to a Life of Serious Piety" (*TP* 117). Like Beacon, Watts only retrospectively learns that his sister appeared to him only a few hours after her actual death. Repeating the apparition's very wording, the narrative further establishes a causal relationship between the impression left by the apparition and Watts' lifestyle that was indeed marked by a "*Serious Piety*, which he afterwards maintained, unto the End of his Days," as Mather observes as a first-hand witness who also vouches for his friend's credibility (*TP* 117).

When Mather promises in the following passage to move on from these narratives, he equates them with arguments that show the existence of spirits and their interaction with the visible world: "I am lothe to grow tedious upon the Argument. I will only add this: Tis no Rare thing among us,... to have Apparitions of their Friends, as Drown'd or otherwise Dead" (*TP* 117). Hinting at the number of "well-attested" cases not included here, Mather also explains his method in collecting and investigating them: When an apparition has occurred and talked about in the neighborhood, Mather has "at the Time, enquired into them, and made a Record of them, and concurr'd with the Neighbours in expecting the Event" (*TP* 117). Thus, the narrative strategy of paralleling the apparition of the ghost with the news of the person's death mirrors the order of Mather's first recording and then comparing this information with the actual events, as well as his use of additional witnesses, some of them "Sworn before the Magistrate" (*TP* 117). As arguments in the contemporary debate about the immortality of souls, Mather combines references to events on the Continent with full-length narratives of cases from his neighborhood that have been talked about and recorded by himself with regard to ensuring their credibility and matching of empirical standards. Establishing the reputation of his witness beyond all doubts, Mather switches to first person

narration. This closing frame is reminiscent of oral storytelling and simply relocates the question of the credibility instead of solving it: if the narrator vouches for his witness, who does so for the narrator? (cf. Pitcher 2000, 7). At the same time, it links Mather's account with Joseph Glanvill's use of a first person investigator and anticipates its use in Daniel Defoe's *True Relation of the Apparition of Mrs. Veal* (1706).

For Mather as for Glanvill, narratives serve as evidence of supernatural events and have to be carefully authenticated: "But the Relations of such Apparitions, have been many of them as unquestionable as the Matters of Fact which have been delivered unto us in the most undoubted Histories, and such as no body can make any Question of" (*TP* 114). They were recorded for others, especially skeptics as the figure of the Sadducee alluded to in Glanvill's title and numerous times in Mather's works shows. To both, negating the supernatural equaled atheism as it also meant to deny God's existence in the invisible world. Wise argues that Mather uses the narration as proof for the existence of a middling realm between earth and heaven in which ghost, demons, and angels operate. An interesting instance of transatlantic intertextuality is the reference in the frame introducing Beacon's story in *Triparadisus*. Mather stresses that the following occurrences have happened close by and would be considered as worthy examples of apparitions as the "Story which the Publishers & Praefacers of M. *Drelincourts* often reprinted Book about, *The Fear of Death,* have thought worth telling to the World" (115). Whether or not he knew the author, Mather refers to Defoe's "Relation of the Apparition of Mrs. Veal," which explicitly mentions Drelincourt's book and serves as its preface from the fourth edition onwards. However, there is no indication that Mather adapted his use of narrative devices after Defoe as his narrative in *Triparadisus* differs only in minor word choices to the version published 30 years earlier in *Wonders of the Invisible World*. Rather, the two narratives hint at the conventions surrounding the recording of apparitions and how they can be used in Protestant texts, ranging from a mere digression in *Wonders of the Invisible World* to specific theological arguments as forwarded by *Triparadisus* and Drelincourts *The Christian's Defence against Fears of Death*.

Defoe's *True Relation* has been called "one of the most popular early eighteenth-century apparition narratives" and also one of the first short stories, marking "another stage in the development of short-fiction" (Capoferro 129; Current-García 10). It represents the most successful journalistic account of an incident that has been widely talked about (Capoferro 130). After a first individual publication in London in 1706, it was attached to Charles Drelincourt's *The Christian's Defence against Fears of Death*, translated from

French, from 1707 onwards that ran through multiple English editions until the nineteenth century. The first extant copy in America is an abridgment from 1744 that also includes a shortened version of *A True Relation* as the reader would have expected it, as the abridger J. Spavan notes and advertises it on the title page, showing the popularity of Defoe's narrative as well as Drelincourt's book (Drelincourt 1744, ii). Since then, Drelincourt's *Defence against Fears of Death*, as well as *True Relation* individually, have been reprinted until the early nineteenth century and the apparition of Mrs. Veal has entered a number of anthologies. While the debate over the authenticity of the case and Defoe's authorship has been settled, *A True Relation* has been related to multiple cultural phenomena of the time.[49] For instance, Lisa Cohen examines Defoe's relation as an example of a heightened visibility of women outside of the domestic sphere whereas Terry Castle reads the narrative as a lesbian relationship that is erased and suppressed by literary means.

The truth and factuality of the narrative are established through the first person narrator's investigation, who is most likely Mrs. Bargrave's neighbor, as well as a chain of witnesses and transmitters who confirm the credibility of each other. The preface states that the report has been written down by a Justice of Peace, who in turn forwards it a friend—probably Defoe—to be published in London. The Justice's story is attested by a relative of his and the narrator believes his "Kinswoman to be of so discerning a Spirit, as not to be put upon by any Fallacy … and … She her self had in the same Words … from Mrs. Bargraves own Mouth," who is, "a Woman of much Honesty and Virtue, and her whole Life a Course as it were of Piety" (*TR* n.pag.). The preface also suggests that an instructive use can be made of the narrative, namely "to consider, That there is a Life to come after this" in which humans will be judged according to their behavior and "[t]hat our Time is Short and Uncertain" (*TR* n.pag.). Although Defoe's narrative is not embedded in a treatise to prove the existence of spirits or other theological arguments comparable to Glanvill's or Mather's, Novak finds that Defoe voices his ideas through Mrs. Veal's and her behavior reveals her to be a ghost even though Mrs. Bargrave realizes this only by hindsight (cf. Novak 273).

In spite of the critical opinion that elevates *A True Relation* into the status of a predecessor of the realism and narrative structure of the short story, the comparison with

---

[49] Some critics, like George Starr, have argued that "The Apparition of Mrs. Veal" was originally not written by Defoe or that its publishing as a part of Drelincourt's *The Christian's Defence against the Fears of Death* was an inaccurate assumption on the part of Walter Scott who passed it on and popularized it. While it evidently became part of Drelincourt's English edition from 1707 onwards, the preface assigned to Walter Scott is a hoax perpetuated by Defoe's first biographer and has appeared in some editions of Defoe's works instead of the original preface and Defoe's authorship has been affirmed by Furbank and Owens' *Critical Bibliography* of his works (cf. Novak 274).

Joseph Beacon's account shows that these elements have already existed in the works of Cotton Mather and earlier apparition accounts. The first person narrative account switches focalization when it seamlessly integrates Mrs. Bargrave's account of the events from a third-person perspective. At twelve o'clock on the eighth of September 1705, Mrs. Bargrave is visited by Mrs. Veal whom she has not seen for more than two years. The narrative abounds with details connected to the sensory perception of Mrs. Veal, for example, the exact location in which Mrs. Bargrave first heard her knocking at the door, almost touched her upon their greeting and "took hold of her gown-sleeve several times" (cf. *TR* 3-5). Similar to Beacon'd account, Mrs. Bargrave and the apparition engage into a longer dialogue and Mrs. Veal "spake in that Pathetical and Heavenly manner, that Mrs. Bargrave wept several times, she was so deeply affected by it" (*TR* 4). Yet contrary to Joseph Beacon who knew that he was not seeing his actual brother, Mrs. Bargrave's emotionally reacts primarily to what Mrs. Veal is saying, believing her to be real. In the section reported from Mrs. Bargrave's perspective, there is no cue, other than Mrs. Veal's faintness and that she talks about heaven, death and her testament that indicates that she is, in fact, an apparition. Capoferro argues that Defoe "stages Mrs. Veal's exceptionality by building up an absolutely natural setting," through an account that mentions, in Baine's words many "minute, sometimes inconsequential details" that contribute to the suspense (cf. Capoferro 132; Baine 340).

Contrary to the reader who is guided by the title of the narrative and a switch of focalization that occurs immediately after Mrs. Veal leaves, Mrs. Bargrave only realizes that Mrs. Veal appeared to her after her death upon her inquiries at her former place of residence. Similar to the letter received by Joseph Beacon, this visit brings forward the information about Mrs. Veal death that can be used to verify the authenticity of the apparition as perceived by Mrs. Bargrave. Here, the tactile impression of Mrs. Veal's garment becomes significant as well as the information about Mrs. Veal's will that Mrs. Bargrave could not have otherwise known. Mrs. Weston, the wife of Mrs. Veal's cousin, exclaims "*you have seen her indeed, for none knew but Mrs. Veal and my self, that the gown was scowr'd*" (*TR* 6). Similar to Joseph Beacon's brother, clothes details help to identify the apparition, as well as the voices of additional witnesses.

The narrative integrates Mrs. Bargrave's account of the apparition of Mrs. Veal in a first person account that also summarizes previous events, the reports of other witnesses, and the controversy that springs up after the case becomes public. In a mise en abyme, Mrs. Bargrave is portrayed as she tells her recollections of the meeting with the apparition to the

first person narrator (cf. *TR* 7). This change of focalization allows the narrator to enumerate what underscores the authenticity of Mrs. Bargrave's account: "All the time I sat with Mrs. Bargrave, which was some Hours, she recollected fresh sayings of Mrs. Veal," yet "Mrs. *Bargrave* never varies in her Story," which she had told to some neighbors immediately after, and some of the things that the apparition told her were "a secret, and unknown to Mrs. Bargrave" (*TR* 7). By enumerating specific instances, comparing the apparition account with information from other witnesses and demonstrating the disinterestedness of Mrs. Bargrave and her credibility, the narrator "provides a barrage of specific data, each item of which adds a bit more to the credibility of her story," as Current-García notes (10).

Despite their religious framing and scientific methods, supernatural accounts draw on older sources like folklore motifs for information about witches and how they typically act. Folkloric beliefs and motifs play a role in the witchcraft testimonies as well as in Beacon's and Bargrave's accounts, in which the ghost returns to rectify a wrong or seek justice against his murderer, as Richard Dorson points out (cf. 1973, 26). In contrast to exemplary plots, folklore motifs do not supply a causality or overarching and explanatory plot pattern in witchcraft episodes and hauntings but rather enumerative and interchangeable elements, for example in the accounts of poltergeists in Glanvill and Increase Mather's. Apparitions became messages that had to be verified and decoded and did not fit into the available providential plot patterns. For example, Cotton Mather builds his own theory of a second paradise as a middle ground between heaven and earth, inhabited by the souls of the deceased using the apparition and deathbed narratives in *Triparadisus* as evidence (cf. Wise 231). To be convincing, they apply empirical methods relying on sense data and a narrative structure that mirrors the steps of uncovering and interpreting the evidence for apparitions. Though the narrator's credibility cannot be ascertained, the reader is able to see what he sees and follow his investigation.

McKeon traces the devices used by Mather and Defoe to Glanvill's conviction that supernatural phenomena could only be proven by "authority and sense" (McKeon 85). Authority is established through quoting of reliable witnesses. In Glanvill's collection for example,

> [t]he great and tireless argument of a supernatural reality is maintained within the succession of narrative frames and articulated there by a complex pattern of circumstantial and authenticating details—names, places, dates, events, eye- and earwitnesses … confirmations of good character, denials of special bias—all of which subserve the crucial claim to a natural existence, that is, to historicity. (McKeon 85)

The narrator steps in as the authority of the narrative is no longer established through its

relation to the overall plot of God's universal history as in previous providence tales. The bitter and polemical dispute between Cotton Mather and Robert Calef for example, as well as the different opinions on the use of spectral evidence in court, demonstrate that the existence of and the adequate reaction to witchcraft was not common theological ground even among New Englanders.[50]

Rather than by appealing to a higher authority or patterns of divine history, the accumulation of similar narratives mediated by a trustworthy narrator lends authority to their claims. The emotional use of narrative and intended effect on the reader remains similar to the experimental structure of the exemplum. As the narratives corroborate the existence of spirits, they should induce fear of God in the readers as they face the existence of the supernatural world. For that purpose, the emotional reaction that is part of the pragmatic dimension of the judgment is integrated into the apparition accounts. As the characters exhibit their reaction, they show that is was a real cause to which they react. With the reporting of interior events and reactions, the narrative devices used by Cotton Mather foreshadow the conditions of fantastic literature and the subject matter of ghost and apparition tales in the eighteenth- and nineteenth centuries.

Consequently, Current-García regards Defoe's "pseudojournalistic technique" and the investigation through a first-person investigator as stepping stones for the development of modern short fiction, he neglects the previous use of these devices in Glanvill's *Saducismus Triumphatus* and Samuel Ward's *Woe to Drunkards* (9). Hartman summarizes this concern "with the reliability of narrators, [and] witnesses" as a general marker of providence tales, of which, in his view, apparition accounts form only one subgenre (1999, 108). While Hartman's analysis is more generally directed at the development of American literature, Weber sees providence tales as forerunners of the short story and thereby expands its generic pre-history that has so far started in the nineteenth century or with Defoe's *True Relation* at its earliest (cf. Weber 1985, 60-65, 68). Instead of constructing a new genealogy, my analysis reveals the similarities of narrative devices across temporal and spatial boundaries.

Next to genealogical approaches to genre, scholars have persistently applied modern distinctions of fact and fiction as well as between functional and artistic literature to

---

[50] Calef wrote a biting critique of Mather's treatment of witchcraft cases in his *More Wonders of the Invisible World*. Aiming to engage Mather in a debate on the subject, he published their exchange of letters and other things that threw a bad light on Mather. A Baptist and therefore outside of the Puritan community, Calef's questions nevertheless revolve around the biblical passages on witchcraft and less on denominational differences (cf. Silverman 101, 133-4).

seventeenth- and eighteenth-century narratives despite their different perception by contemporary audiences. While Current-García praises Defoe's "deliberate effort to authenticate within the story the validity of his fictional illusion," he neglects that the claim to factuality has been a feature of providential and apparition narratives of all ages and often not much more than a stereo-type or formula, as the notion of 'strange, therefore true' used by Glanvill implies (cf. 9). While exemplary judgments and deliverances derive their effect not so much from the credibility of the events reported as from their relation to biblical precedents, Mather's introduction of witchcraft testimonies as "entertainments" shows how versatile and widespread these forms have been, as also their publication history in religious and cheap popular prints indicates. His unaltered use of Beacon's account in three different publications, one theological, one scientific and another a history of witchcraft shows that the use of a first person narrator and investigator, the matching of facts from the apparition account and information on the actual death, along with the emphasis on sensory perception and additional witnesses not only results from an interest in the new science but also in storytelling and the various uses of narrative. Having been marked as ushering in a new phase of short fiction, these formal devices result from the interplay of these cultural forces rather than from an individual author's innovation. While they can be used in a Protestant reaction against the rising skepticism and materialism, they are in fact deeply rooted in the exchange of wonder stories through manuscripts and prints across the Atlantic in which religious and entertaining intentions intermingle.

Conclusion

As part of the ongoing reassessment of early American texts through a transatlantic perspective, this study outlines the various sources and movements of short narratives and their formal devices in Protestant writing. In delineating the ways in which narratives were adapted and shaped by religious doctrines and intentions as well as personal experience and scientific methods, *Godly Tales* demonstrates their relevance and adaptability. The variety of narrative forms and intentions also represent the heterogeneous practices that many critics see at the core of transatlantic Protestantism, ranging from exemplary narratives that sought to create social cohesion to the recording of personal experience and empirical observation. While theologians like Cotton Mather have been regarded as part of a disappearing theological tradition, their writings combine narrative traditions from medieval Catholicism, Humanism, and the emerging new sciences and develop their motifs and forms. Instead of renewing a Puritan paradigm, this study focuses on British North America as a place in which the transatlantic exchange between Protestants and its influence on the development of narrative form become manifest.

Throughout the seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries, short narratives occupy a central role in religious texts as well as in the recording New England colonial experience. Drawing on personal records, theological and scientific treatises, collections, histories and sermons, this study shows how narratives propagate Calvinist providentialism and attempt to reconcile it with Enlightenment scientific thought and empirical methodologies. Over the course of a hundred years, shifts in the emplotment, temporal structure, mediation, and framing of short narratives emerge that correspond to the changing perceptions of providence and nature. New England Protestants attempted to create and further social cohesion through narrative form as exemplary judgments and deliverances show God's mercy and interaction with the community a punishment of its enemies. From a narratological perspective, the significance of New England sermons, essays and collections extends beyond documenting theological debates or colonial history and into the popular prints and magazines of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

Protestant texts are vital in transmitting the formal patterns of exemplary narratives from medieval preaching that are frequently used, alluded to or satirized in later short fiction.

Calvin's theology and the sermons by Increase and Cotton Mather outline a pattern of divine judgment and mercy that derives from medieval exempla collections. During the eighteenth century, a host of didactic forms supplanted Protestant texts and their public function, from pieces of advice like Benjamin Franklin's *Poor Richard's Almanac* to tracts for the promotion of virtue and the exemplary lessons contained in fables, essays and other short pieces of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century magazines. Even fictional stories like William Austin's "Peter Rugg, the Missing Man" and Washington Irving's "The Devil and Tom Walker," both published in 1824, pursue the exemplary pattern of a curse the protagonists bring upon themselves that Beard and Mather describe in their collections of judgments. Both protagonists invoke evil upon themselves, Peter Rugg through his rash speech and Tom Walker when he abnegates his bargain with the devil. Both stories combine folklore motifs, like the pact with the devil, with exemplary plot elements to establish a legendary past for New England. Later on, exemplary plot patterns and the belief in providence are satirized, for example, in Benjamin Franklin's "Speech of Polly Baker" and Mark Twain's *Huckleberry Finn*. As a consequence, studies of nineteenth-century narrative need to account for the continuation of formal patterns, subjects, and narrative devices through Protestant texts and explore the ways in which American writers of short fiction, in particular, draw on this printed archive along with fictionalized versions of oral storytelling.

The pervasive use of short narratives in theological, historical and personal writing shows how easily they travel and adapt to different purposes and contexts of publications. Protestants applied exemplary plot patterns to daily events of the colony in collections, histories but also personal records in which they establish a community of faith and delimit it against dissenters, critics, and skeptics. Simple exemplary patterns give way to theories of emotional effect, as Cotton Mather constructs a direct relationship between sensory impressions, especially those transmitted by narratives, and the readers' feelings that are in turn able to awake or renew their faith. By evoking sympathy with those in danger of death, relations of captivity and shipwreck strengthen the believer's faith and thankfulness towards God. While these subjects have remained popular in religious and popular magazines and even extend to the modern short story, they also anticipate the eighteenth-century sentimentalist notion that the ability to feel and show emotions like sympathy is instrumental to the moral formation, showing the influence of Pietism on Protestant thought and writing. Defending the existence of God against materialists and Deists, the collections by Joseph Glanvill and the Mathers combine empirical recordings of sensory impressions with Protestant doctrine. Instead of a radical break coinciding with the onset of the

Enlightenment, a diachronic perspective reveals how seventeenth-century Protestant narratives relate both to the medieval tradition of storytelling and anticipate devices of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century short fiction. This study traces how formal choices are influenced by theological and scientific notions as well as the intentions of the embedding text and its publication history. For example, Glanvill and Cotton Mather use first person narrators to investigate and evaluate supernatural events according to the rules for scientific reports laid down by the Royal Society. On the one hand, this strategy bridges the belief in the existence of an invisible world with empirical methods and, on the other hand, indicates a shift from verification through the Bible to personal experience. Consequently, these adaptations of narrative form support the current re-evaluation of seventeenth-century Protestants as participating in the scientific revolution of their time and as transmitters of Enlightenment thought and empirical methodology.

However, the scholarly focus on the early American novel as well as the retrojection of nineteenth-century definitions of artistic merit and the short story have obscured the variety and formal development of short narratives in the centuries before (cf. Killick 7; Levy 2004, 10-11; Scheiding and Seidl 2011, 67). The attention to the novel and its artistic rank has led critics to forget that, in their time, the more vibrant and popular narratives were actually short forms published in magazines, newspapers and other cheap prints (cf. Brosch 9; Killick 1, May 1995, 118). According to the dominant critical opinion, the short story originates in the nineteenth-century, and previous narrative forms are often discounted as inconsequential for its development because of their formless simplicity, didacticism and lack of literary merit (cf. Bendixen and Nagel 3; Reid 28; Voss 3).[51] While some critics have recently started to include eighteenth-century short fiction into histories and studies of the modern short story, this study shows that seventeen-century narratives already anticipate many of the devices that have later been subsumed into the emergence of the short story. Instead of a Romantic recreation of oral storytelling and the use of folklore, the emergence of the American short story has to be considered in the context of the various short forms circulating in print, either as part of Protestant publications or newspapers and magazines (cf. Scheiding 2016). Subsequent studies of early American short fiction should address the significance of the highly popular narratives in religious and secular prints, magazines and collections of the seventeenth to nineteenth centuries whose popularity and wide

[51] See Basseler "A Brief Survey" for a summary of this position (cf. 21). See the anthologies by Hochbruck et al. (2008), Nagel (2008) and Scheiding and Seidl (2015) that collect short narratives published prior to the nineteenth century and so far excluded from the history and collections of the short story.

dissemination far exceeds that of early American novels and short stories.

Godly Tales consequently argues for a new framework of analyzing early American short fiction by studying their form along with their production, circulation, and adaptation. Previous literary and generic histories have obscured the wealth and particular material conditions of storytelling in the colonial and early National America by measuring them against nineteenth century notions of aesthetic merit and normative short story definitions. As the quintessential American genre, the periodization and definition of the short story have also been predicated by the national paradigm that has marginalized the movements of narratives, as well as their multi-lingual backgrounds, motifs and formal tradition in critical discussion. To overcome these restrictions and give a fuller account of the forms and functions of narrative, this study proposes to study short narratives through their form, the conditions of their production, dissemination, and consumption, as well as the way they are integrated and function within texts. Describing formal aspects of early American short narratives not only highlights interrelations with contemporary or previous European traditions but also allows to study texts and their complexity on their own terms apart from mere historical interest or critical paradigms, like the search for a national identity or generic origins. However, the study of the transatlantic development of short narrative forms in the seventeenth and eighteenth century is still at an early stage as the various connections between magazine stories, European sources, and Protestant prints are only beginning to emerge. Like their seventeenth-century counterparts, eighteenth-century narratives developed in a constant exchange of stories and devices across the Atlantic. Protestant sermons and collections as well as the literary magazines adapted and published narratives through a network of writers, editors, translators and publishers that defy the nineteenth-century conceptions of authorship and art. From the colonial to the early National period, the devices and subjects of short narratives are best characterized by their mobility across time, geographical and language boundaries. Extending the analysis of formal developments as the adaptation and circulation of short narratives into the eighteenth- and nineteenth-century could lead to a remapping of early American literature through the reassessment of its most mobile, adaptable, and—at the time—most popular forms that also provide the background for the emerging of the modern short story.

A narratological and descriptive approach also rectifies critical commonplaces that have so far dominated the discussion of early American short narration. Far from formless and didactic, this study demonstrates how Protestant texts develop formal patterns for religious teaching but also to record personal experience and scientific inquiries. Through a

transatlantic and diachronic perspective, a canonical Puritan writer like Cotton Mather emerges as participating in a constant exchange of ideas and narratives across the Atlantic whose subject matter, like captivity and apparitions, were taken up in the following centuries by a variety of narrative forms. Like the editors of eighteenth-century magazines, Mather and his ministerial colleagues were constantly re-editing materials that circulated orally or through letters, collections and diaries from both sides of the Atlantic, often combining incongruous materials and intentions. Their adaptation of different sources, both written and oral, demonstrates how Protestants relied on narrative as an instrument for religious teaching and to participate in European learned discourse. Along with the current reappraisal of Mather as a transatlantic theologian-scholar, this study helps to revise the image of New England Protestants from pedantic and narrow-minded scripturalists to important mediators of narrative traditions and devices that make their texts relevant for a reappraisal of short narrative forms in the subsequent centuries.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Baxter, Richard. *The Saints Everlasting Rest: Or, a Treatise of the Blessed State of the Saints in the Enjoyment of God in Glory. Wherein is Shewed Its Excellency and Certainty; the Misery of Those that Loose it, the way to Attain It, and the Assurance of It; and How to Live in the Continual Delightful Forecasts of It, by the Help of Meditation*. London, 1649. Print.

Beard, Thomas. *The Theatre of Gods Iudgements; or, a Collection of Histories out of Sacred, Ecclesiastical, and Prophane Authors, concerning the admirable iudgements of God upon the transgressours of his commandements. Translated out of French, and avgmented by more than three hundred Examples, by Th. Beard.* London, 1597. Print.

Beard, Thomas, and Thomas Taylor. *The Theatre of Gods Judgements: Wherein is represented the admirable Justice of God against all notorious sinners, great and small, specially against the most eminent Persons in the world, whose exorbitant power had broke through the barres of Divine and Humane law.* London: 1648. Print.

Bishop, George. *New England Judged by the Spirit of the Lord: In Two Parts.* Abridged ed. London: 1703. Print.

Calvin, John. *Institutes of the Christian Religion*. Transl. Henry Beveridge. [1536] 1989. Grand Rapids: Eardmans, 2001. Print.

Chassanion, Jean. *Des grands and et redoutables jugements et punitions de Dieu, advenus au monde, principalement sur les grands, à cause de leurs meffaits, contrevenans aux Commandemens de la loy de Dieu*. Morges, 1581. Print.

Chaucer, Geoffrey. *The Canterbury Tales*. The Electronic Literature Foundation. 2009. Web. 11 Feb. 2014.

Dane, John. "A Declaration of Remarkable Providences in the Course of My Life." 1682. MS Sbd-103. Massachusetts Historical Society, Boston. Manuscript.

Danforth, Samuel. *An Astronomical Description of a Late Comet or Blazing Start, As it appeared in New England in the 9th, 10th, 11th and in the beginning of the 12th Moneth, 1664. Together with a brief Theological Application thereof.* Cambridge, 1665. Print.

Defoe, Daniel. *A True Relation of the Apparition of one Mrs. Veal, The next Day after Her*

Death to one Mrs. Bargrave At Canterbury. London, 1706. Print.

Drelincourt, Charles. *The Christian's Defence Against the Fears of Death. With Seasonable Directions How To Prepare our selves to Die well. Written originally in French, by Charles Drelincourt. Written Originally in French … Translated into English by Marius D'Assigny, B.D*. London: 1707. Print.

---. *The Christian's defence against the fears of death. With directions how to Dye well. Written originally in French, by Charles Drelincourt. Abridg'd from the last French edition, by J. Spavan, M.A. With an account of Mrs. Veal's apparition to Mrs. Bargrave*. Boston, 1744. Print.

Forde, Thomas. *Theatre of Wits, Ancient and Modern. Represented in a Collection of Apothegmes. Pleasant and Profitable*. London, 1660. Print.

Glanvill, Joseph. *A Blow at Modern Sadducism in Some Philosophical Considerations About Witchcraft. To which is added the Relation of the Fam'd Disturbance by the Drummer in the House of Mr. John Mompesson: with some Reflections on Drollery and Atheisme*. London, 1668. Print.

---. *Saducismus Triumphatus: Or, Full and Plain Evidence Voncerning Witches and Apparitions. In Two Parts. The First Treating of their Possibility, The Second of their Real Existence*. London, 1681. Print.

---. *The Vanity of Dogmatizing, or, Confidence in opinions manifested in a discourse of the shortness and uncertainty of our knowledge, and its causes. with some reflexions on peripateticism, and an apology for philosophy*. London, 1661. Print.

Hammond, Lawrence. *Lawrence Hammond Diary, 1677-1694.* MS SBd-98. Massachusetts Historical Society, Boston. Manuscript.

Hawthorne, Nathaniel. "The Duston Family." *The American Magazine of Useful and Entertaining Knowledge* 2.9 (1836): 395-97. Print.

Hondorff, Andreas. *Promptuarium Exemplorum. Das ist: Historien und Exempelbuch, nach Ordnung und Dispostion der heiligen zehen Gebott Gottes auß heiliger Schrift und anderen Bewerten und glaubwirdigen Geistlichen und Weltlichen Schriften gezogen. Zum Spielge der wahrhafftigen Christlichen Buss* …. Leipzig, 1568. Print.

Hubbard, William. *A Narrative of the troubles with the Indians in New-England, from the first Planting thereof in the Year 1607. To this present year 1677. But chiefly of the late Troubles in the Two last Years, 1675. and 1676. To which is added a Discourse about the Warre with the Pequods in the year 1637*. Boston, 1677. Print.

Hull, John. "Some Passages of Providence about Myself and in Relation to Myself." *The*

Transactions and Collections of the American Antiquarian Society 3 (1857): 108-316. Print.

Janeway, James. *Mr James Janeway's Legacy to His Friends: Containing Twenty Seven Famous Instances of Gods Providences in and about Sea-Dangers an Deliverances; with the Names of Several that were Eye-witnesses to many of them. Whereonto is added a Sermon on the same Subject*. London, 1674. Print.

Johnson, Edward. *A History of New England. From the English planting in the yeere 1628. untill the yeere 1652. Declaring the form of their government, civill, military, and ecclesiastique. Their wars with the Indians, their troubles with the Gortonists, and other heretiques. Their manner of gathering of churches, the commodities of the country, and description of the principall towns and havens, with the great encouragements to increase trade betwixt them and old England.* London, 1654. Print.

Johnson, Edward. *Johnson's Wonder-Working Providence, 1628-1651*. Ed. J. Franklin Jameson. New York: Scribner's, 1910. Print.

Jones, David. *A Theatre of the Wars between England and France in all the Kings Reigns, from the Time of William the Conqueror to the Conclusion of the Peace, on the 10th of September.* London, 1697. Print.

Josselyn, John. *John Josselyn, Colonial Traveler: A critical Edition of Two Voyages to New-England*. Ed. Paul J. Lindholdt. Hanover: UP of New England, 1988. Print.

Keith, George. "G. Keith's Account of the Just Judgments of God on them, in *Answer to Increase Mather."* Bishop, George. *New England Judged by the Spirit of the Lord: In Two Parts.* Abridged ed. London: 1703. 328-35. Print.

Lalemant, Jerome. "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en La Novelle France, en l'année 1647 [Isaac Jogues Captivity]*." The Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents: Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France, 1610-1791.* Ed. Ruben Gold Thwaites. Vol. 31. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898. Print.

Lalemant, Jerome. "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en La Novelle France, en l'année 1640*." The Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents: Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France, 1610-1791.* Ed. Ruben Gold Thwaites. Vol. 19. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898. Print.

Looking-Glass for Drunkards. Or, The Good-Fellows Folly. Moderately Deproving all such as practise the Beastly Sin of Inordinate and Excessive Tippling: With an Admonition for the future to forbear the same. n.p., 1674-1679. Print.

Mather, Cotton. *The Bostonian Ebenezer. Some Historical Remarks, on the State of Boston,*

the Chief Town of New England, and of English America with Some, Agreeable Methods, for Preserving and Promoting, the Good State of that, as well as any other Town …. Boston, 1698. Print.

---. *Brontologia Sacra: The voice of the glorious God in the thunder: explained and applyed in a sermon uttered by a minister of the Gospel in a lecture unto an assembly of Christians abroad, at the very same time when the thunder was by the permission and providence of God falling upon his own house at home. Whereto are added some reflections formed on the Lords-Day following by the voices of thunders upon the great things which the great God is now doing in the world. A discourse useful for all men at all times, but especially intended for an entertainment in the hours of thunder*. London, 1695. Print.

---. *The Christian Philosopher: A Collection of the Best Discoveries in Nature with Religious Improvements*. London, 1721. Print.

---. *Compassions Called for: An Essay of Profitable Reflections on Miserable Spectacles. To which is added, a Faithful Relation of Some Late, but Strange Occurrences that call for an awful and useful Consideration. Especially, the Surprising Distresses and Deliverances, of a Company lately Shipwreck'd on a Desolate Rock, on the Coast of New-England*. Boston, 1711. Print.

---. "Curiosa Americana." A collection of 23 letters to the Royal Society in London that has never been published together. All excerpts refer to: Beall, Otho T. "Cotton Mather's Early 'Curiosa Americana' and the Boston Philosophical Society of 1683." *The William and Mary Quarterly* 18.3 (1961): 360-72. Print.

---. *Decennium Luctuosum. An History of the Remarkable Occurences in the Long War which New-England hath had with the Indian Salbages, From the Year, 1688. To the Year, 1698. Faithfully Composed and Improved*. Boston, 1699. Print.

---. *Humiliations follow'd with Deliverances: A Brief Discourse On the Matter and Method, Of that Humiliation which would be an Hopeful Symptom of our Deliverance from Calamity. Accompanied and Accommodated with a Narrative, of a Notable Deliverance lately received by some English Captives, from the Hands of Cruel Indians. And some improvement of that narrative. Whereto is added A Narrative of Hannah Swarton, containing a great many wonderful passages, relating to her Captivity and Deliverance*. Boston, 1697. Print.

---. *Magnalia Christi Americana: Or, the Ecclesiastical History of New-England, from Its First Planting in the Year 1620. unto the Year of our Lord, 1698*. London, 1702. Print.

---. *Manuductio ad Ministerium: Directions for a candidate of the ministry. Wherein, First,*

a Right Foundation is laid for his Future Improvement; And, Then, Rules are Offered for such a Management of his Academical & Preparatory Studies; And thereupon, For such a Conduct after his Appearance in the World; as may Render him a Skilful and Useful Minister of the Gospel. Boston, 1726. Print.

---. *Memorable Providences Relating to Witchcrafts and Possessions: A Faithful Account of many Wonderful and Surprising Things, that have befallen several Bewitched and Possessed Persons in New-England* …. Boston, 1689. Print.

---. *Terribilia Dei: Remarkable Judgements of God, on several sorts of Offenders, in several Scores of Instances; among the People of New-England. Observed, Collected, Related, and Improved; in Two Sermons, at Boston-lecture in the Month of July 1697*. Boston, 1697. Print.

---. *The Threefold Paradise of Cotton Mather: An Edition of "Triparadisus."* 1727. Ed. Reiner Smolinski. Athens: U of Georgia P, 1995. Print.

---. *Winter-Meditations: Directions how to Employ the Liesure of the Winter for the Glory of God. Accompanied with Reflections, as well Historical, as Theological, Not Only Upon the Circumstances of the Winter, But Also, Upon the Notable Works of God, Both in, Creation, and Providence: Especially Those, which More Immediately Concern Every Particular Man, in the Whole Course of His Life: and upon the Religious Works, Wherewith Every Man Should Acknowledge God, in and from the Accidents of the Winter*. Boston, 1693. Print.

---. *The Wonders of the Invisible World: Observations as well Historical as Theological, upon the Nature, the Number, and the Operations of the Devils. Accompany'd with, Some Accounts of the Grievous Molestations, by Daemons and Witchcrafts, which have lately Anoy'd the Countrey, and the Trials of some eminent Malefactors Executed upon occasion thereof: with several Remarkable Curiosities therein occurring* …. Boston, 1693. Print.

Mather, Increase. *An Essay for the Recording of Illustrious Providences, Wherein an Account is given of many Remarkable and very Memorable Events, which have happened in this last Age; Especially in New-England.* Boston, 1684. Print.

---. *The Doctrine of Divine Providence Opened and Applyed: Also Sundry Sermons on Several other Subjects*. Boston, 1684. Print.

---. *Wo to Drunkards. Two Sermons Testifying against the Sin of Drunkenness: Wherein the Wofulness of that Evil, and the Misery of all that are addicted to it, is discovered from the Word of God*. Cambridge, 1673. Print.

Pike, John. "John Pike diary, 1673-1716." MS SBd-106. Massachusetts Historical Society, Boston. Manuscript.

R.B. [Nathaniel Crouch]. *The Kingdom of Darkness: or The History of Dæmons, Specters, Witches, Apparitions, Possessions, Disturbances, and other wonderful and supernatural Delusions, Mischievous Feats, and Malicious Impostures of the Devil. Containing near Fourscore memorable Relations, Forreign and Domestick, both Antient and Modern. Collected from Authentick Records, Real Attestations, Credible Evidences, and asserted by Authors of Undoubted Verity. Together with a Preface obviating the common Objections and Allegations of the Sadduces and Atheists of the Age … With Pictures of several memorable Accidents*. London, 1688. Print.

Rowlandson, Mary. *The Sovereignty and Goodness of God, Together, With the Faithfulness of His Promises Displayed; Being a Narrative of the Captivity and Restauration of Mrs. Mary Rowlandson.* Cambridge, 1682. Print.

Russell, Noahdiah. "Copy of the Diary of Noahdiah Russell, Tutor at Harvard College, Beginning Anno Dom. 1682." *The New England Historical and Genealogical Register* 7 (1853): 53-59. Print.

Scot, Reginald. *The discoverie of witchcraft, Where the Lewde dealing of Witches and Witchmongers is notablie detected* …. London, 1584. Print.

Shepard, Thomas. *God's Plot: Puritan Spirituality in Thomas Shepard's Cambridge*. Ed. Michael MacGiffert. Amherst: Univ. of Massachusetts Press, 1994. Print.

Sprat, Thomas. *The History of the Royal-Society of London, For the Improving of Natural Knowledge*. London, 1667. Print.

Strachey, William. "A true reportory of the wracke and redemption of Sir Thomas Gates Knight; upon, and from the Ilands of the Bermudas: his coming to Virginia, and the estate of that Colonie then, and after, under the government of the Lord La Warre." *Hakluytus posthumus; or, Purchas his pilgrimes.* Vol. 4. Ed. Samuel Purchas. London, 1625. 4 vols. Print.

Warburton, William. *A Critical and Philosophical Enquiry into the Causes of Prodigies and Miracles, as Related by Historians, with an Essay towards Restoring a Method and Purity in History. In Which, the Characters of the Most Celebrated Writers of Every Age, and of the Several Stages and Species of History, Are Occasionally Criticized and Explained.* London, 1727. Print.

Ward, Samuel. *Woe to Drunkards*. London, 1622. Print.

Webster, John. *The Displaying of Supposed Witchcraft, wherein is Affirmed that there are*

many Sorts of Deceivers and Impostors …. London, 1677.

Weld, Thomas. *A short story of the rise, reign, and ruin of the Antinomians, Familists, and libertines that infected the churches of New-England and how they were confuted by the assembly of ministers there as also of the magistrates proceedings in court against them: together with God's strange remarkable judgements from heaven upon some of the chief fomenters of these opinions* …. London, 1692. Print.

Winthrop, John. *The Journal of John Winthrop, 1630-1649*. Ed. Richard S. Dunn, James Savage, and Laetitia Yeandle. Cambridge: Belknap, 1996. Print.

Secondary Sources

Ahrends, Günter. *Die amerikanische Kurzgeschichte*. 5th ed. Trier: WVT, 2008. Print.

Alber, Jan and Monika Fludernik, Ed. *Postclassical Narratology: Approaches and Analyses*. Columbus: Ohio State UP, 2010. Print.

Anderson, Eric G. "Captivity and Freedom: Ann Eliza Bleecker, Harriet Prescott Spofford, and Washington Irving's 'Rip Van Winkle.'" *A Companion to American Fiction 1780-1865*. Ed. Shirley Samuels. Oxford: Blackwell, 2004. 342-52. Print.

Arch, Stephen C. *Authorizing the Past: The Rhetoric of History in Seventeenth-Century New England.* DeKalb: Northern Illinois UP, 1994. Print.

Armstrong, Catherine. Writing North America in the Seventeenth Century. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007. Print.

Auerbach, Erich. *Mimesis: The Representation of Reality in Western Literature.* Trans. Willard R. Trask. 1953. Princeton: Princeton UP, 2013. Print.

Baepler, Paul, ed. *White Slaves, African Masters: An Anthology of American Barbary Captivity Narratives*. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1999. Print.

Baine, Rodney M. "Daniel Defoe and 'The History and Reality of Apparitions'." *Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society* 106.4 (1962): 335-47. Print.

Baker, Dorothy Z. *America's Gothic Fiction: The Legacy of Magnalia Christi Americana*. Columbus, Ohio: Ohio State UP, 2007. Print.

Basseler, Michael. "A Brief Survey of this *History of the American Short Story*." *A History of the American Short Story: Genres—Developments—Model Interpretations*. Ed. Michael Basseler, and Ansgar Nünning. Trier: WVT, 2011. 21-40. Print.

---."Theories and Typologies of the Short Story." *A History of the American Short Story: Genres—Developments—Model Interpretations*. Ed. Michael Basseler, and Ansgar

Nünning. Trier: WVT, 2011. 41-64. Print.

Beall, Otho T. "Cotton Mather's Early 'Curiosa Americana' and the Boston Philosophical Society of 1683." *The William and Mary Quarterly* 18.3 (1961): 360-72. Print.

Beall, Otho T., and Richard H. Shryock. *Cotton Mather: First Significant Figure in American Medicine*. 1954. New York: Arno P, 1979. Print.

Beevers, John. "The Short Story: What Is It Exactly, What Do We Want." *The Short Story*. Ed. Alisa Cox. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars, 2008. 11-26.

Bendixen, Alfred, and James Nagel, Ed. *A Companion to the American Short Story*. Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2010. Print.

Bertsch, Janet. *Storytelling in the Works of Bunyan, Grimmelshausen, Defoe, and Schnabel*. Rochester: Camden House, 2004.

Bestul, Thomas H. "Chaucer's Parson's Tale and the Late-Medieval Tradition of Religious Meditation." *Speculum* 64.3 (1989): 600-19.

Boyer, Paul, and Stephen Nissenbaum. *Salem Possessed: The Social Origins of Witchcraft*. 4th ed. Cambridge: Harvard UP, 1976. Print.

Brosch, Renate. *Short Story: Textsorte und Leseerfahrung*. Trier: WVT Wiss. Verlag Trier, 2007. Print.

Brown, Carolyn S. *The Tall Tale in American Folklore and Literature*. Knoxville: U of Tennessee P, 1987. Print.

Brown, Matthew P. "Hand Piety; or, Operating a Book in Early New England." *Cultural Narratives. Textuality and Performance in American Culture before 1900*. Ed. Sandra M. Gustafson and Caroline Sloat. Notre Dame: U of Notre Dame P, 2010. Print.

---. *The Pilgrim and the Bee: Reading Rituals and Book Culture in Early New England*. Philadelphia Pa: U of Pennsylvania P, 2007. Print.

---. "The Thick Style: Steady Sellers, Textual Aesthetics, and Early Modern Devotional Reading." *PMLA* 121.1 (2006): 67-86. Print.

Budra, Paul V. "The Mirror for Magistrates and the Shape of De Casibus Tragedy." *English Studies* 69.4 (1988): 303-12. Print.

Burnham, Michelle. *Captivity and Sentiment: Cultural Exchange in American Literature, 1682-1861*. Hanover: UP of New England, 1997. Print.

---. *Folded Selves: Colonial New England Writing in the World System*. Hanover: Dartmouth College P, 2007. Print.

Burns, William E. *An Age of Wonders: Prodigies, Politics and Providence in England, 1657-1727*. Manchester: Manchester UP, 2002a. Print.

---. “Joseph Glanvill.” *British Philosophers, 1500-1799*. Ed. Philip B. Dematteis and Peter S. Fosl. Detroit: Gale, 2002b. 157-63. Print.

Cahill, Edward. “Formalism.” *Early American Literature* 46.3 (2011): 611-15. Print.

Cambers, Andrew. *Godly Reading: Print, Manuscript and Puritanism in England, 1580-1720*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2011. Print.

Capoferro, Riccardo. *Empirical Wonder: Historicizing the Fantastic, 1660-1760*. Bern: Peter Lang, 2010. Print.

Carroll, Lorrayne. “‘My Outward Man:’ The Curious Case of Hannah Swarton.” *EAL* 31.1 (1996): 45-73. Print.

Castiglia, Christopher. *Bound and Determined: Captivity, Culture-Crossing, and White Womanhood from Mary Rowlandson to Patty Hearst*. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1996. Print.

Castle, Terry. *The Female Thermometer: Eighteenth-century Culture and the Invention of the Uncanny*. New York: Oxford UP, 1995. Print.

Coleman, Dawn. *Preaching and the Rise of the American Novel*. Columbus: Ohio State UP, 2013. Print.

Crane, Thomas F. Introduction. *The Exempla or Illustrative Stories from the Sermones Vulgares of Jacques de Vitry*. Ed. Crane. London: Nutt, 1890. xv-cxvi. Print.

Curran, Bob. *Mysterious Celtic America: Ancient Enigmas in the New World*. Gretna: Pelican, 2010. Print.

Current-García, Eugene. *The American Short Story before 1850: A Critical History*. Boston, Mass. Twayne, 1985. Print.

“Curse.” *Oxford English Dictionary.* 2nd ed. 2013. Web. 11 Feb. 2014.

D’Agata D’Ottavi, Stefania. “The English Dream Poem as Short Story: Theory and Practice.” *Tale, Novella, Short story: Currents in Short Fiction*. Ed. Wolfgang Görtschacher. Tübingen: Stauffenburg, 2004. 17-26. Print.

Daniels, Bruce Colin. *Puritans at Play. Leisure and Recreation in Colonial New England*. New York: St. Martin’s Griffin, 1996. Print.

Demos, John. *Entertaining Satan: Witchcraft and the Culture of Early New England*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Print.

“Divination.” *Oxford English Dictionary.* 2nd ed. 2013. Web. 11 Feb. 2014.

Dorson, Richard M. *American Folklore*. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1967. Print.

---. *America in Legend: Folklore from the Colonial Period to the Present*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1973. Print.

Dunn, Richard S., Yeandle, Laetitia. Introduction. *The Journal of John Winthrop, 1630-1649*. Ed. Richard S. Dunn, and Laetitia Yeandle. Cambridge: Belknap P, 1996. Print.

Dunn, Richard S. "John Winthrop Writes His Journal." *The William and Mary Quarterly* 41.2 (1984): 185-212. Print.

Duplessis, Rachel Blau. "Social Texts and Poetic Texts: Poetry and Cultural Studies." *The Oxford Handbook of Modern and Contemporary American Poetry*. Ed. Cary Nelson. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2012. 53-70. Print.

Ebersole, Gary L. *Captured by Texts: Puritan to Postmodern Images of Indian Captivity*. Charlottesville: UP of Virginia, 1995. Print.

Egan Jim. "Tales of Wonder, Spiritual Autobiographies, and Providence Tales." *Transatlantic Literary Studies, 1660-1830*. Ed. Eve T. Bannet, and Susan Manning. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2012. 46-59. Print.

Engler, Bernd, and Kurt Müller. Introduction. *Exempla: Studien zur Bedeutung und Funktion Exemplarischen Erzählens*. Ed. Bernd Engler, and Kurt Müller. Berlin: Duncker & Humblot, 1995. 9-20. Print.

Engler, Bernd, and Oliver Scheiding. "Re-Visioning the Past: The Historical Imagination in American Historiography and Short Fiction." *Re-Visioning the Past: Historical Self-Reflexivity in American Short Fiction*. Ed. Bernd Engler, and Oliver Scheiding. Trier: WVT, 1998. 11-37. Print.

Erll, Astrid. "Cultural Studies Approach to Narrative." *Routledge Encyclopedia of Narrative theory*. Ed. David Herman. London: Routledge, 2010. 88-92. Print.

Ezell, Margaret J. M. "Looking Glass Histories." *Journal of British Studies* 43.3 (2004): 317-38. Print.

Fitzpatrick, Tara. "The Figure of Captivity: The Cultural Work of the Puritan Captivity Narrative." *American Literary History* 3.1 (1991): 1-26. Print.

Fludernik, Monika. *Towards a 'Natural' Narratology*. London: Routledge, 1996. Print.

Fox, Adam, and Daniel R. Woolf. Introduction. *The Spoken Word. Oral Culture in Britain, 1500-1850*. Ed. Fox, and Woolf. Manchester, New York: Manchester UP, 2002. 1-51. Print.

Gelley, Alexander. Introduction. *Unruly Examples. On the Rhetoric of Exemplarity*. Ed. Gelley. Stanford: Stanford UP, 1995. 1-26. Print.

Genette, Gérard. *Narrative Discourse: An Essay in Method*. Transl. Jane Levin. Ithaka: Cornell UP, 1980. Print.

Gibson, Marion. "Understanding Witchcraft? Accusers' Stories in Print in Early Modern

England." *Languages of Witchcraft: Narrative, Ideology and Meaning in Early Modern Culture*. Ed. Stuart Clark. Houndmills: Macmillan, 2001. 41-54. Print.

---, ed. *Witchcraft and Society in England and America, 1550-1750*. London: Continuum, 2003. Print.

Giles, Paul. *The Global Remapping of American Literature*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 2011. Print.

Gillman, Susan, and Kirsten S. Gruesz. "Worlding America: The Hemispheric Text-Network." *A Companion to American Literary Studies*. Ed. Caroline F. Levander and Robert S. Levine. Chichester: Wiley, 2011. 228-47. Print. Blackwell Companions to Literature and Culture 78.

Goodare, Julian, ed. *Scottish Witches and Witch-Hunters*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013. Print.

Gould, Eliga H. "Atlantic History and the Literary Turn." *Early American Literature* 43.1 (2008): 197. Print.

Grubmüller, Klaus. "Exemplarisches Erzählen—im exemplum, im Märe, im Fabliau?" Tradition des roverbes et des exempla dans Occident médiéval: colloque fribourgeois 2007. Ed. Hugo Oskar Bizzari, and Martin Rohde. Berlin: de Gruyter, 2009. 67-80. Print.

Gura, Philip F. "Early American Literature at the New Century." *WMQ* 57.3 (2000): 599-620. Print.

Guyatt, Nicholas. *Providence and the Invention of the United States, 1607-1876*. New York: Cambridge UP, 2007. Print.

Hall, David D. *Ways of Writing: The Practice and Politics of Text-Making in Seventeenth-Century New England*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania P, 2008. Print.

---. *Worlds of Wonder, Days of Judgment: Popular Religious Belief in Early New England*. New York: Knopf, 1989. Print.

---. "Worlds of Wonders: The Mentality of the Supernatural in Seventeenth-Century New England." *Religion and American Culture: A Reader*. Ed. David G. Hackett. New York, NY: Routledge, 1995. 29-52. Print.

Haller, William. *The Rise of Puritanism: Or, the Way to the New Jerusalem as Set Forth in Pulpit and P from Thomas Cartwright to John Lilburne and John Milton, 1570-1643*. New York: Columbia UP. 1957.

Hambrick-Stowe, Charles E. *The Practice of Piety*: Puritan Devotional Disciplines in Seventeenth-Century New England. Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1982. Print.

Hartman, James D. *Providence Tales and the Birth of American Literature*. Baltimore: Johns

Hopkins UP, 1999. Print.

---. "Providence Tales and the Indian Captivity Narrative: Some Transatlantic Influences on Colonial Puritan Discourse." *Early American Literature* 32.1 (1997): 66-81. Print.

Haug, Walter. "Entwurf zu einer Theorie der mittelalterlichen Kurzerzählung." *Kleinere Erzählformen des 15. und 16. Jahrhunderts*. Ed. Walter Haug, and Burghart Wachinger. Tübingen: Niemeyer, 1993. 1-36. Print.

Hebel, Udo J. "Survival Without Seasickness: Cotton Mather's Minature Anthology of Sea Deliverance Narratives in *Magnalia Christi Americana*." *The Sea and the American Imagination*. Ed. Klaus Benesch, Jon-K Adams, and Kerstin Schmidt. Tübingen: Stauffenburg, 2004. 15-36. Print.

Helms, Gabriele. *Challenging Canada: Dialogism and Narrative Techniques in Canadian Novels*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's UP, 2003.

Henry, John. "A Cambridge Platonist's Materialism: Henry More and the Concept of Soul." *JWCI* 49 (1986): 172-95. Print.

Herman, David. "Genette Meets Vygotsky: Narrative Embedding and Distributed Intelligence." *Language&Literature* 15.4 (2006): 357-80. Print.

Hochbruck, Wolfgang et al., eds. *Origins of the American Short Story*. Los Gatos, CA: Slack Water Press, 2008. Print.

Holifield, Elmer B. *Era of Persuasion: American Thought and Culture, 1521-1680*. Boston: Twayne, 1989. Print.

Hughes, Geoffrey. *An Encyclopedia of Swearing: The Social History of Oaths, Profanity, Foul Language, and Ethnic Slurs in the English-speaking World*. Armonk: M.E. Sharpe, 2006. Print.

Hunter, Michael. "New Light on the 'Drummer of Tedworth:' Conflicting Narratives of Witchcraft in Restoration England." *Historical Research* 78.201 (2005): 311-53.

---. "The Problem of 'Atheism' in Early Modern England." *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society* 35 (1985): 135-57. Print.

"Ingenious." *Oxford English Dictionary.* 2nd ed. 2013. Web. 11 Feb. 2014.

Jameson, Frederic. *The Political Unconscious: Narrative as a Socially Symbolic Act*. 1982. London: Routledge, 2009. Print.

Jay, Timothy. *Cursing in America: A Psycholinguistic Study of Dirty language in the Courts, in the Movies, in the Schoolyards, and on the Streets*. Philadelphia: J. Benjamins, 1992. Print.

Johnson, Parker H. “Humiliation Followed by Deliverance: Metaphor and Plot in Cotton Mather’s *Magnalia*.” *Early American Literature* 15.3 (1981): 237-46. Print.

Jolles, André. *Einfache Formen: Legende, Sage, Mythe, Rätsel, Spruch, Kasus, Memorabilie, Märchen, Witz*. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1958. Print.

“Judicial astrology.” *Oxford English Dictionary.* 2nd ed. 2013. Web. 11 Feb. 2014.

“Judiciary, or judicial Astrology.” *Cyclopædia: or, an Universal Dictionary of Arts and Sciences*. Ed. Ephraim Chambers. Vol. 1. London, 1778.

Kemmler, Fritz. *“Exempla” in Context. A Historical and Critical Study of Robert Mannyng of Brunne’s “Handlyng Synne.”* Tübingen: Narr, 1984.

Kestler, Frances R. *The Indian Captivity Narrative: A Womans’ View*. New York: Garland, 1990. Print.

Killick, Tim. *British Short Fiction in the Early Nineteenth Century. The Rise of the Tale.* Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008. Print.

Kittredge, George L. *Witchcraft in Old and New England.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1929.

Klarer, Mario. “Cannibalism and Carnivalesque: Incorporation as Utopia in the Early Image of America.” *New Literary History* 30.2 (1999): 389-410. Print.

Knott, Sarah. *Sensibility and the American Revolution*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina P, 2009. Print.

Koch, Walter A., ed. *Simple forms: An Encyclopaedia of Simple Text-Types in Lore and Literature*. Bochum: Brockmeyer, 1994. Print.

Kolodny, Annette. *The Land before Her: Fantasy an Experience of the American Frontiers, 1630-1860*. Chapel Hill: U North Carolina P, 1984. Print.

Lanser, Susan S. “Toward a Feminist Narratology.” *Style* 20.3 (1986): 341-63. Print.

Lawless, Elaine J. “Narrative in the Pulpit. Persistent Use of Exempla in Vernacular Religious Contexts.” *The Journal of the Midwest Modern Language Association* 21.1 (1998). 48-64. Print.

Levy, Andrew. The Culture and Commerce of the American Short Story. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2004. Print.

Levy, Barry. *Town Born: The Political Economy of New England from its Founding to the Revolution.* Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2009. Print.

Lewis, Rhodri. “Of ‘Origenian Platonisme:’ Joseph Glanvill on the Pre-existence of Souls.” *HLQ* 69.2 (2006): 267-89. Print.

Link, Franz H. “‘Tale’, ‘Sketch’, ‘Essay’ und ‘Short Story’.” *Die Neueren Sprachen* 6

(1957): 345-352. Print.

Lohafer, Susan and Jo Ellyn Carey, Ed. *Short Story Theory at a Crossroads*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State UP, 1989. Print.

Love, Herold. *Scribal Publication in Seventeenth Century England*. Oxford: Clarendon P, 1993. Print.

Lovelace, Richard F. *The American Pietism of Cotton Mather: Origins of American Evangelicalism*. Grand Rapids: Christian UP, 1979. Print.

Manierre, William R. "Some Characteristic Mather Redactions." *NEQ* 31.4 (1958): 496-505. Print.

March-Russell, Paul. *The Short Story: An Introduction*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2009. Print.

Marler, Robert F. Rev. of *The American Short Story before 1950: A Critical History*, by Eugene Current-García. *American Literature* 58.3 (1986): 433-35. Print.

May, Charles E., ed. *The New Short Story Theories.* 1994. Athens: Ohio UP, 1997. Print.

---. *The Short Story: The Reality of Artifice*. New York: Twayne, 1995. Print.

McKeon, Michael. *The Origins of the English Novel: 1600-1740*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins UP, 1987. Print.

Mckeown, Adam N. "Light Apparitions and the Shaping of Community in Winthrop's *History of New England." Early American Literature* 47.2 (2012): 293-319. Print.

Mosher, Joseph Albert. *The Exemplum in the Early Religious and Didactic Literature of England.* New York: Columbia UP, 1911. Print.

Nagel, James. *Anthology of the American Short Story*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 2008.

---. *The Contemporary American Short-Story Cycle: The Ethnic Resonance of Genre*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State UP, 2004. Print.

Narváez, Peter. "Increase Mather's *Illustrious Providences*: The First American Folklore Collection." *Fields of Folklore: Essays in Honor of Kenneth S. Goldstein*. Ed. Roger D. Abrahams. Bloomington: Trickster P, 1995. 198-213. Print.

Neuber, Wolfgang. "Poltergeist the Prequel: Aspects of Otherworldly Disturbances in Early Modern Times." *Spirits Unseen: The Representation of Subtle Bodies in Early Modern European Culture*. Ed. Christine Göttler, and Wolfgang Neuber. Leiden: Brill, 2008. 1–17. Print.

Neuman, Meredith Marie. *Jeremiah's Scribes: Creating Sermon Literature in Puritan New England*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2013. Print.

Novak, Maximillian E. *Daniel Defoe: Master of Fictions; his Life and Ideas*. Oxford: Oxford

UP, 2001. Print.

Nünning, Ansgar. "Towards a Cultural and Historical Narratology: A Survey of Diachronic Approaches, Concepts and Research Projects." *Anglistentag 1999 Mainz: Proceedings*. Ed. Bernhard and Sigrid Rieuwerts. Reitz. Trier: WVT, 2000. 345–74. Print.

---. "Where Historiographic Metafiction and Narratology Meet: Towards an Applied Cultural Narratology." *Style* 38.3 (2004): 352–75. Print.

Nünning, Vera, ed. *New approaches to Narrative: Cognition—Culture—History*. Trier: WVT, 2013. Print.

Obenland, Frank. "Providential Thought in the Puritan Historiography of New England." *A Companion to American Cultural History: From the Colonial Period to the End of the 19th Century*. Ed. Bernd Engler, and Oliver Scheiding. Trier: WVT, 2009. 87–120. Print.

Parrish, Susan S. *American Curiosity: Cultures of Natural History in the Colonial British Atlantic World*. Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 2006. Print.

Parsons, Coleman O. Introduction. Joseph Glanvill. *Saducismus Triumphatus*: *Or, Full and Plain Evidence concerning Witches and Apparitions*. Ed. Parsons. Gainesville: Scholar's Facs & Repr. 1966. vii–xxiii. Print.

Patrides, Constantinos A. *The Cambridge Platonists*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1980. Print.

Pattee, Fred L. *The Development of the American Short Story: An Historical Survey*. New York: Biblio and Tannen, 1966. Print.

Payne, Robert. "Chaucer and the Art of Rhetoric." *Companion to Chaucer Studies*. Ed. Beryl Rowland. 2nd ed. New York: Oxford UP, 1979. Print.

Pitcher, Edward W. R. Introduction. *An Anthology of the Short Story in 18th and 19th Century America*. Vol. 1. Ed. Pitcher. Lewiston: Mellen, 2000. 1-47. 2 vols. Print.

Poe, Edgar Allan. "Nathaniel Hawthorne. Twice-Told Tales." *Die amerikanische Short Story. Theorie und Entwicklung*. Ed. Hans Bungert. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1972. 1-8. Print.

Purkiss, Diane. *The Witch in History: Early Modern and Twentieth Century Representations*. London: Routledge 1996. Print.

Reid, Ian. *The Short Story*. London: Methuen, 1977. Print.

Reisner, Philipp. *Cotton Mather als Aufklärer: Glaube und Gesellschaft im Neuengland der Frühen Neuzeit*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2012. Print.

Richardson, Brian. *Unlikely Stories: Causality and the Nature of Modern Narrative*. Newark: U of Delaware P, 1997. Print.

Ricoeur, Paul. *Time and Narrative*. Vol 1. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1984. 3 vols.

Rivett, Sarah. *The Science of the Soul in Colonial New England*. Chapel Hill: U of Carolina P. 2011. Print.

Rohrberger, Mary. *Hawthorne and the Modern Short Story: A Study in Genre*. The Hague: Mouton, 1966. Print.

Round, Phillip H. *By Nature and by Custom Cursed: Transatlantic Civil Discourse and New England Cultural Production, 1620-1660*. Hanover: UP of New England, 1999.

Rushton, Peter. "Texts of Authority: Witchcraft Accusations and the Demonstration of Truth in Early Modern England." *Languages of Witchcraft: Narrative, Ideology and Meaning in Early Modern Culture*. Ed. Stuart Clark. Houndmills: Macmillan, 2001. 21-40. Print.

Ryan, Marie-Laure, ed. *Narrative Across Media: The Languages of Storytelling*. Lincoln: U of Nebraska P, 2004. Print.

---. "Tellability." *Routledge Encyclopedia of Narrative theory*. Ed. David Herman. Repr. London: Routledge, 2010. 589-90. Print.

"Sadduzäer." *Die Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart*. 3rd ed. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1961.

Sandner, David. *Critical Discourses of the Fantastic, 1712-1831*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2011. Print.

Sayre, Gordon M. *The Indian Chief as Tragic Hero: Native Resistance and the Literatures of America, from Moctezuma to Tecumseh*. Chapel Hill : U of North Carolina P, 2005. Print.

---. *Les Sauvages Américains: Representations of Native Americans in French and English Colonial literature*. Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1997. Print.

Scheiding, Oliver. "The American Short Story." *Handbook of Transatlantic North American Studies*. Ed. Julia Straub. Berlin: de Gruyter Mouton, 2016. 234-250. Print.

---. *Geschichte und Fiktion: Zum Funktionswandel des frühen amerikanischen Romans*. Paderborn: Schöningh, 2003. Print.

---. "Naturalistic Short Stories: Stephen Crane's 'The Open Boat' and John Steinbeck's 'The Crysanthemus'." *A History of the American Short Story. Genres—Developments—Model Interpretations*. Ed. Michael Basseler and Ansgar Nünning. Trier: WVT, 2011. 205-17. Print.

---. "The World as Parish: Cotton Mather, August Hermann Francke, and Transatlantic Religious Networks." *Cotton Mather and "Biblia Americana:" America's First Bible Commentary; Essays in Reappraisal*. Ed. Reiner Smolinski and Jan Stievermann.

Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2010. 131-66. Print.

Scheiding, Oliver and Martin Seidl. "Early American Short Narratives: The Art of Story-Telling Prior to Washington Irving." *A History of the American Short Story: Genres-Developments-Model Interpretations*. Ed. Michael Basseler, and Ansgar Nünning. 67-80.Trier: WVT, 2011. Print.

---, eds. *Worlding America*. *A Transnational Anthology of Short Narratives before 1800*. Stanford: Stanford UP, 2015. Print.

Schlauch, Margaret. *Antecedents of the English Novel, 1400-1600*. Warszawa: Polish Scientific Publishers, 1963. Print.

---. "English Short Fiction in the 15th and 16th centuries." *Studies in Short Fiction* 3.4 (1966): 393-434. Print.

Schock, Flemming. "Introduction. Knowledge and The Worlds of Theatres in Early Modern Times." *metaphorik.de* 14 (2008). xix-xxvii. Web.

Schweitzer, Ivy. "Salutary Decouplings: The Newest New England Studies." *American Literary History* 13.3 (2001): 578-91. Print.

Scofield, Martin. *The Cambridge Introduction to the American Short Story*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2006. Print.

Sievers, Julie. "Drowned Pens and Shaking Hands: Sea Providence Narratives in Seventeenth-Century New England." *William & Mary Quarterly* 63.4 (2006): 743-76. Print.

Silverman, Kenneth. *The Life and Times of Cotton Mather*. New York: Columbia UP, 1985. Print.

Sleeper, Stephanie. "Ramist Logic." *Puritans and Puritanism in Europe and America: a Comprehensive Encyclopedia*. Ed. Francis J. Bremer and Tom Webster. Vol. 2. Santa Barbara: ABC-CLIO, 2006. 517-18. 2 vols. Print.

Smolinski, Reiner. Introduction. *Biblia Americana: America's First Bible Commentary, A Synoptic Commentary on the Old and New Testaments. Vol. 1: Genesis*, by Cotton Mather. Ed. Smolinski. Mohr Siebeck and Baker Academic, 2010. 3-191. Print.

---. Introduction. *The Threefold Paradise of Cotton Mather: An Edition of Triparadisus*. By Cotton Mather. Ed. Smolinski. Athens: U of Georgia P, 1995. 3-60. Print.

---. Introduction. *The Wonders of the Invisible World: Observations as Well Historical as Theological, upon the Nature, the Number, and the Operations of the Devils*, by Cotton Mather. Ed. Smolinski. Lincoln: DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska, 2007. i-ix. Web. 11 February 2014.

---. “Israel Redivivus: The Eschatological Limits of Puritan Typology in New England.” *The New England Quarterly* 63.3 (1990): 357-95. Print.

Solberg, Winton U. “Cotton Mather, the “Biblia Americana,” and the Enlightenment.” *Cotton Mather and “Biblia Americana:” America’s First Bible Commentary; Essays in Reappraisal*. Ed. Reiner Smolinski and Jan Stievermann. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2010. 183-201. Print.

St. George, Robert B. *Conversing by Signs: Poetics of Implication in Colonial New England Culture*. Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1998. Print.

---. “Witchcraft Bodily Affliction and Domestic Space in Seventeenth-Century New England.” *A Centre of Wonders: The Body in Early America*. Ed. Janet M. Lindman, and Michele L. Tarter. Ithaca, NY: Cornell UP, 2001. 13-28. Print.

Stearns, Raymond P. *Science in the British Colonies of America*. Urbana: U of Illinois P, 1970. Print.

Stievermann, Jan. “Writing ‘To Conquer All Things:’ Cotton Mather’s ‘Magnalia Christi Americana’ and the Quandary of ‘Copia’.” *Early American Literature* 39.2 (2004): 263-97. Print.

---. Introduction. *Cotton Mather and “Biblia Americana:” America’s First Bible Commentary; Essays in Reappraisal*. Ed. Reiner Smolinski, and Jan Stievermann. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2010. 1-54. Print.

Stöffler, Fred E. *The Rise of Evangelical Pietism*. Leiden: Brill, 1965. Print.

“Strange.” *Oxford English Dictionary.* 2nd ed. 2013. Web. 11 Feb. 2014.

Strom, Jonathan. Introduction. Pietism in Two Worlds. *Pietism in Germany and North America 1680-1820*. Ed. Jonathan Strom, Hartmut Lehmann und James Horn van Melton. Farnham, Burlington: Ashgate, 2009. 1–11. Print.

“Tale.” *Oxford English Dictionary.* 2nd ed. 2013. Web. 11 Feb. 2014.

“Theatre.” *Oxford English Dictionary.* 2nd ed. 2013. Web. 11 Feb. 2014.

Thomas, Keith. *Religion and the Decline of Magic: Studies in Popular Beliefs in Sixteenth and Seventeenth Century England*. Oxford: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 1971. Print.

Todorov, Tzvetan. *The Fantastic: A Structural Approach to a Literary Genre*. 6th ed. Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1995. Print.

Toulouse, Teresa. *The Captive’s Position: Female Narrative, Male Identity, and Royal Authority in Colonial New England*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2007. Print.

Traister, Bryce. “Nation.” *Early American Literature* 46.3 (2011): 606-12. Print.

“Triton.” *Oxford English Dictionary.* 2nd ed. 2013. Web. 11 Feb. 2014.

Ulrich, Laurel T. *Good Wives: Image and Reality in the Lives of Women in Northern New England, 1650–1750*. New York: Knopf, 1982. Print.

Van Engen, Abram. "Puritanism and the Power of Sympathy." *Early American Literature* 45.3 (2010): 533–64. Print.

VanDerBeets, Richard. *The Indian Captivity Narrative: An American Genre*. Lanham: UP of America, 1984. Print.

Vaughan, Alden T., and Edward W. Clark, Ed. *Puritans among the Indians: Accounts of Captivity and Redemption, 1676–1724*. Cambridge: Belknap, 1981. Print.

Vaughn, Alden T. "Appendix 1: Sources" *The Tempest,* by William Shakespeare. Ed. Virgina Mason Vaughn and Alden T. Vaughn. Oxford: 2003. 287–315.Print.

Von Moos, Peter. *Gesammelte Schriften zum Mittelalter. Vol. 2: Rhetorik, Kommunikation und Medialität*. Ed. Gert Melville. Münster: Lit, 2006. Print.

Voss, Arthur. *The American Short Story: A Critical Survey*. Norman: U of Oklahoma P, 1973. Print.

Walsham, Alexandra. *Providence in Early Modern England*. 2001. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2003. Print.

Warner, Michael. "Publics and Counterpublics." *Quarterly Journal of Speech* 88.4 (2002): 413–25. Print.

Warner, Michael. The Letters of the Repbulic. Publication and the Public Sphere in Eighteenth-Century America. Harvard UP, 1992. Print.

Weber, Alfred. "Die Anfänge des kurzen Erzählens in Amerika des 17. und 18. Jahrhunderts: Die 'Providences' der Amerikanischen Puritaner." *Mythos und Aufklärung in der amerikanischen Literatur: Zu Ehren von Hans-Joachim Lang*. Ed. Dieter Meindl. Erlangen: U-Bund Erlangen-Nürnberg, 1985. 55-70. Print.

Weber, Alfred. Introduction. *Somnambulism and Other Stories*, by Charles Brockden Brown. Ed. Alfred Weber. Frankfurt am Main: Lang, 1987. Print. vii-xxi.

Weis, Ann-Marie. "The Murderous Mother and the Solicitous Father: Violence, Jacksonian Family Values, and Hannah Duston's Captivity." *American Studies International* 36.1 (1998): 46-65. Print.

West, William N. "Knowledge and Performance in Early Modern Theatrum Mundi." *metaphorik.de* 14 (2008). 1-20. Print.

Wharton, Donald P. Introduction. *In the Trough of the Sea: Selected American Sea-Deliverance Narratives, 1610-1766*. Ed. Wharton. Westport: Greenwood P, 1979. 3-27. Print.

White, Ed and Michael J. Drexler. “The Theory Gap.” *American Literary History* 22.2 (2010): 404-94. Print.

White, Hayden. *Metahistory: The Historical Imagination in Nineteenth-Century Europe*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins UP, 1975. Print.

Whitford, Kathryn. “Hannah Dustin: The Judgement of History.” *Essex Institute Historical Collections* 108.4 (1972): 304-25. Print.

Winship, Michael P. “Prodigies, Puritanism, and the Perils of Natural Philosophy: The Example of Cotton Mather.” *William & Mary Quarterly* 51.1 (1994): 92-105. Print.

Winship, Michael P. *Seers of God: Puritan Providentialism in the Restoration and Early Enlightenment*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins UP, 1996. Print.

Winship, Michael. *Godly Republicanism: Puritans, Pilgrims, and a City on a Hill*. Cambridge: Harvard UP, 2012. Print.

Wise, Paul. “Cotton Mather and the Invisible World.” *Cotton Mather and “Biblia Americana:” America’s First Bible commentary; Essays in Reappraisal*. Ed. Reiner Smolinski and Jan Stievermann. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2010. 227-61. Print.